SLOVAK ACADEMY OF SCIENCES
INSTITUTE OF LITERARY SCIENCES
DEPARTMENT OF ORIENTAL STUDIES

EDITORS
JOZEF GENZOR
VIKTOR KRUPA

ASIAN AND AFRICAN STUDIES

CONTENTS

6

ARTICLES

LEXICAL METAPHORS IN THE MALAY LANGUAGE

VIKTOR KRUPA, Bratislava

Metaphor has long been recognized as an important cognitive device. Malay is one of those languages in which figurative extension of the vocabulary is fairly frequent. The author describes basic semantic types of Malay lexical metaphor in terms of its topic and vehicle and discusses recent extensive literature on the subject of metaphor in general.

Scholars have been interested in figurative language and specifically in metaphor since Aristotle but increasingly so in the course of the last decades. W. A. Shibles' bibliography lists well over 3,000 works (Shibles, 1971), and quite a few books — not to mention papers — have been published in the seventies and early eighties of the 20th century. The interest in metaphor has been growing since we have become aware that this trope cannot be done away with as a mere poetic decoration. Quite the contrary, we are more and more aware that metaphor is a complex interdisciplinary phenomenon that is of vital importance for psychology, literary science, ethnography, linguistics, philosophy, and for science in general.

Hundreds of years of research invested in the pursuit of the subject have resulted in a mass of various definitions of metaphor. For the purposes of this paper we may content ourselves with distinguishing wide and narrow interpretations of metaphor. As J. R. Searle puts it, it becomes a matter of terminology whether we want to construe metonymy and synecdoche as special cases of metaphor or as independent tropes (Searle, 1979, p. 119).

As far as the study of Malay in this paper is concerned, our attention has been confined to metaphor exclusive of both metonymy and synecdoche. However, a wide interpretation of metaphor differs from its narrow counterpart in other respects as well. Some scholars tend to define metaphor so as to include only living metaphors, i.e. those metaphors that aim at surprising, shocking the addressee, metaphors that are individual, original and creative. Such a definition does not suit our aims since it restricts the domain of metaphor to poetry and syntactically to sentence. Such a metaphor may be characterized as a diaphor (cf. Wheelwright, 1964, p. 78). The diaphor is more suggestive than expressive of analogy while, on the other hand, its opposite, an epiphor, is a metaphor which is confirmed in human experience and therefore inclined to occur in non-poetic styles. It seems that in word derivation both basic types of metaphor occur. Thus *bunga api* sparks may be quoted from Malay as

9

an example of a diaphor (*bunga* flower, *api* fire) while *ibu kota* capital, from the same language, illustrates an epiphor (*ibu* mother, *kota* town, city). However, the repeated use of lexical metaphors inevitably leads to their conventionalization and a definite loss of vividness.

In the wide sense of the word, metaphor is regarded as characteristic of all human behaviour and cognition (Hinman, 1982, p. 198), as a fundamental non-linguistic mode of perception (Fearing, 1954, p. 71).

The interpretation of metaphor as a figurative device contrasts it with the literal expression of meaning. And yet figurative is not impenetrably separated from literal. On the contrary, the transition from one into another is gradual, thus creating a continuous scale from more vague to less vague. Reasoning along these lines would lead to the conclusion that the literal is just an instance of a dead metaphor (Hinman, 1982, p. 189).

The conventionalization of a metaphor has far-reaching consequences for its functioning in speech. The living metaphor functions in the domain of predicate — because its function is to characterize, to supply some new information on the subject of the utterance. The characterization via metaphor constructed, roughly speaking, is employing something more concrete, directly perceivable, better known, to point out to something abstract, not perceivable directly, less known. Paradoxically, we use old information in the syntactic function of the predicate. In a parallel to the contrast of old and new information, the metaphorical construction consists of a topic and a vehicle, although one of them, i.e., topic, may be implicit. Neither is the shared background of the two terms explicitly stated but rather presupposed. This background may range from a superficial similarity (cf. Malay *ekor mata* the corner of the eye ; *ekor* tail, *mata* eye) to a deep functional analogy (cf. Malay *ibu kota* capital ; *ibu* mother, *kota* town, city). What has been said, however, holds only for the living metaphor. On the other hand, a conventionalized metaphor may be characterized as a resource of nomination (cf. Arutyunova, 1979, p. 159) and as such moves from the position of the predicate of a sentence to that of its subject.

Sometimes it is thought that metaphor as a linguistic pattern is characteristic of certain languages and that the frequency of its occurrence in these „primitive" languages needs further explanation (cf. Fearing, 1954, p. 71). This seems to be confirmed by R. M. W. Dixon who pays attention to metaphorical extensions in Australian aboriginal languages (Dixon, 1980, pp. 109—111). According to him, it is the body-part lexemes that are often used metaphorically to describe parts of trees, artefacts and geographical phenomena. The same procedure is used in many compounds as well. On the other hand, however, it is a well-known fact that metaphorical creations abound in some domains of English vocabulary, e.g., in the terminology of nuclear physics and astronomy and neither are they absent from sports, etc. No one would be ready to admit that English is a primitive language

because of this. The explanation for a high occurrence of metaphors obviously should be sought for elsewhere.

We employ language in basically two different situations or rather types of situations. They may be termed conventional and problematic situations here. In the conventional, customary situations we can easily manage with those linguistic devices we have acquired, so to say, in a second-hand manner, i.e., through learning from our parents, teachers, siblings, friends, etc. When using language in this manner, we do not have to ponder about its properties and we do not have to extend its application to new phenomena.

However, employing language in what we term problematic situations is an entirely different matter. In the problematic situation we utilize the open-endedness of our language, its inherent vagueness which enables us to extend its limits. In such a situation the language we have learnt from our elders must be modified in order to cope with new, hitherto nameless objects, actions and qualities, in order to be able to reveal profound emotions in original ways or, finally, in order to serve as an adequate and ready vehicle of communication between the members of two (or more) different ethnics. Thus the problematic situations give an impetus to the development of language.

In all of these situations we have too few words at our disposal and we cannot avoid the task of extending the inventory of our lexical units. One of the most important means of modifying and extending the vocabulary in such situations is metaphor.

The first type of problematic situations may be illustrated with nuclear physics which abounds in figurative terms created by English-speaking scientists and borrowed from English by many other languages of the world. The advantage of metaphorical terms is that they create, through their vagueness, a semblance of continuity (in an analogy to reality) and, besides, give us an opportunity to characterize new concepts in terms of those that are already familiar to us (cf. Pylyshyn, 1979, p. 421). Thus metaphor is a means of preserving the gradual character of semantic change, its diachronical continuity. These are scientific metaphors that may be labelled as epiphors. Their aim is not to shock recipients. On the contrary, they are meant to be exploited energetically (Hesse, 1965, p. 255). And, as K. K. Zhol stresses, if a scientist introduces a metaphor into his discipline, he is obliged to render it into a term with a well delineated conceptual meaning and reference (Zhol, 1984, p. 269).

Another type of problematic situations is to be looked for in the emotional sphere. When angry, we tend to use figurative, picturesque and hyperbolic language. It is not rare to hear in everyday speech such words as pig, dog, bitch, etc. applied to beings that cannot be so characterized from the zoological point of view. Other feelings are likewise compatible with a proliferation of metaphors, be it love (cf. words honey, sunshine, treasure) or sorrow (cf. pass away, at a rest). Euphemisms are also frequently based upon a metaphor, when we take care of avoiding the primary term

11

for fear or for the sake of decency. Poetical metaphors no doubt belong to the emotional sphere. For a variety of reasons, poets are unable to express their feelings in conventional terms. In order to express themselves adequately, they search other conceptual domains for words that epitomize the desired quality (cf. Weiner, 1984, p. 6). In other words, poets do not use metaphors to give names to new things but rather to expressively characterize things, persons and events that surround them, in which they are involved. As C. A. Kates puts it, metaphorical language is appropriate whenever one believes that the conventional term will not select exactly that aspect of an experience which one wants to frame (Kates, 1979, p. 151). As stated before, poetic metaphors are diaphors and as such are used in predicative position. Their diaphoric character is linked to their creativity and originality — from the standpoint of the recipient. A poetic metaphor shocks its recipient through the distance between the tenor and the vehicle domains. However, from the standpoint of its creator, a metaphor cannot be shocking to such an extent and as such remains epiphoric. Thus the difference between diaphors and epiphors is due to individual differences in the aprioristic function of the distribution of the semantic variants among the members of the same community (cf. Nalimov, 1979 on this issue). While any metaphor is based upon the personal experience of its author and in this sense is predictable, the experience of the recipient is different and this lack of a complete coincidence forces the recipient to do some guesswork based upon his own aprioristic function as well as upon available context.

Lexical metaphors are closely related to the scientific (knowledge) metaphors. Metaphorization in vocabulary leads to the rise of new signs. This gradual process is paralleled by a suppression of motivation in the new, metaphorical sign. Theoretically speaking, there are always many motivation paths available but we have to select just one. This plurality of motivation choice is due not only to the cognitive depth of any object but also to the multiplicity of subjective attitudes to it.

In o.her words, if a new metaphor is pronounced out of any context, the recipients may disagree as to which motivation has been chosen, at least until that metaphor becomes conventionalized. The aprioristic funcion of the semantic distribution can explain the meaning of the innovation only to some extent ; its ambiguity cannot be satisfactorily solved without context. This context is to a considerable extent non-linguistic and is represented by the shared universum of associations characteristic of a particular language community, available to all its members, even if only statistically.

However, while it is the more distant associations that are selected for metaphorization in poetry, in the lexical field only a few very transparent motivational models are utilized. This is expecially true of those languages that are or in some period of their history were used as media of communication between members of two (or more) different ethnic and linguistic communities, usually in a rather restricted range of functions. Such is the case of New-Guinean Pidgin English. Its vocabulary

12

abounds in figurative and descriptive lexemes such as *taim bilong biksan* drought (i. e. time of big sun), *skru bilong pinga* joint (i.e. screw of a finger), *pikinini bilong diwai* fruits (i.e. children of a tree). Metaphorization in Malay vocabulary may also to some extent be due to this reason since Malay served as a lingua franca to seamen and traders throughout Southeast Asia.

In the interethnic contact characterized as a type of problematic situation, the inventory of basic lexical units is drastically decreased so as not to tax memory and to make the language easy to learn; the rest of required lexemes are produced combinatorially, with the aid of figurative devices such as metaphor, metonymy, synecdoche, etc. And since the role of metaphor in such a situation consists in enhancing communication, in making it easier, only very few basic metaphorical models are utilized.

One could ask why metaphor and not merely compounding is employed in such situations. The reply obviously lies in the fact that metaphorization pushes communication down to the iconic level that is more lively, more plastic, easier to remember and, finally, easier to decode than the conventional level.

In addition to what has been said, metaphor functions emphatically. First, it selects some features of the object in question and in selecting these features turns our attention to them. Second, metaphor transfers, and in the process of transfer creates something unusual and new. Finally, creating something unusual and new, metaphor once again turns our attention to it. At the same time, metaphor is a means of condensation of meaning and this makes it useful in communication which takes place upon the level of hints. Metaphor is an instrument of reproductive assimilation that enables language to communicate about new facts with the aid of old means. This raises the question of identity and truth of metaphor. While it is generally agreed upon that metaphor treats two different phenomena as if they were identical there are widely divergent views concerning its truth value. Obviously, this question can only be solved in logic that operates with more than two truth values because metaphor is based upon partial identity. Strictly speaking, there is no such thing as a total identity, and it is also in this sense that some scholars regard metaphor, not literal meaning, as basic, and the two differ only as to their degree of acceptance or conventionalization.

In the early phase of its life, metaphors, both poetic and non-poetic, are creative. However, their functions and subsequent development diverge. While poetic metaphors fade away and have to be replaced with new ones, in order to preserve the desirable emotional effect, cognitive metaphors in the domain of science are not discarded because of their loss of freshness; they are conventionalized since it is their function to contribute to human knowledge and, in the case of lexical metaphors, to linguistic communication. Lexical metaphors seem to be even more durable than cognitive (scientific) metaphors. We cognize reality because we are unable to reflect it in a truly reliable and exhaustive way. In other words, we cognize in order to

survive and that is why our cognition includes a subjective factor. The latter is present in scientific metaphor with the aid of which we select only a fraction out of the infinite set of the properties of any observed object. As a consequence of this, a full understanding of an object in its entirety may only be achieved via an open set of cognitive approaches. Therefore the rise of scientific metaphors, their replacement and disappearance are due to the advance of science.

Lexical metaphors behave in a different way. They come about in the process of communication and tend to be fairly stable because language can satisfactorily function only upon a fairly high level of stability. The lexical metaphors contribute to the stability of languague so that they employ old means in new functions and, on the other hand, the stability of lexical metaphors is enhanced in practice by the utilization of very few metaphorical patterns. This has been confirmed by our study of Malay lexical metaphors. Our results agree with the idea of the process of metaphorization as described by E. J. Weiner in her recent paper (Weiner, 1984). She has based her approach on a knowledge representation system and listed as important the factors of salience, incongruity, hyperbolicity, inexpressibility, prototypicality, and probable value range. It is true that the process of metaphorization is creative and as such cannot be described by an algorithm but if we have two concepts A and B, each with a set of predicates of their own, then the concept B can be chosen as a metaphorical vehicle for the concept A if those predicates that have high salience in B can be used to raise the salience of the same predicates in A, i.e., in the topic. As for the concept B, it must be prototypical with respect to the predicates selected for the ground of the metaphor in question. It is easy to notice that a set of concepts may be established with respect to the given predicates, but the very process of selection of a concept from this set cannot be described deterministically and this is the basis of the creativity of metaphor.

In accordance with other scholars, E. J. Weiner maintains that another important feature of metaphor is that the concepts A and B must come from different semantic domains. This does not seem to be always the case, as illustrated by some Malay examples.

Our data on Malay lexical metaphors have been collected from R. J. Wilkinson's abridged dictionary containing some 10,000 entries (Wilkinson, 1961). Some 200 metaphors have been examined and classified. Our description is based upon the following conceptual classification consisting of 12 classes of concepts:
    (1) social organization,
    (2) human (or animal) body,
    (3) plant (or tree) body,
    (4) fauna,
    (5) flora,
    (6) natural phenomena,

(7) human artefacts,

(8) actions (of living beings),

(9) states, feelings (of living beings)

(10) properties,

(11) space and time,

(12) abstractions.

This is a classification that reflects the pragmatic attitudes typical of folk taxonomy and can only be regarded as open and tentative. New conceptual classes can be added to it when required by data.

Each metaphor has been examined as to the conceptual characteristics of its topic and vehicle, and this has given us a chance to characterize lexical metaphorization in Malay in terms of links between various conceptual domains.

The greatest number of lexemes of metaphorical origin has been attested for the conceptual domain of human (animal) body, e.g. *batang leher* neck (*leher* neck, *batang* tree trunk), *anak mata* the pupil of the eye (*mata* eye, *anak* child), *ibu jari* thumb (*jari* finger, *ibu* mother), *bunga kuku* the base of the finger-nail (*kuku* nail, *bunga* flower), *buah pinggang* kidneys (*pinggang* waist, *buah* fruit, spherical object), *ibu telur* turtle (*telur* egg, *ibu* mother), *batu kepala* cranium (*kepala* head, *batu* stone), *anak telinga* tympanum (*telinga* ear, *anak* child).

Almost as many terms of metaphorical origin occur within the domain of natural phenomena such as *mata air* water spring (*air* water, *mata* eye), *tahi air* scum on water (*air* water, *tahi* filth, excrement), *tahi angin* light fleecy clouds, words of little account (*angin* wind, *tahi* filth, excrement), *anak sungai* rivulet (*sungai* river, *anak* child), *raja bintang* the principal heavenly bodies (*bintang* star, *raja* king).

The third domain in which metaphorical lexical units occur fairly frequently is that of artefacts, objects produced by human beings, e.g. *anak genta* the clapper of a bell (*genta* bell, *anak* child), *meta pedoman* the needle of a compass (*pedoman* compass, *mata* eye), *muka surat* page (*surat* letter, *muka* face), *anak panah* arrow (*panah* bow, *anak* child), *daun dayong* the blade of an oar (dayong oar, *daun* leaf).

When we look at the lexical metaphors the other way round, it turns out that most images, i.e. vehicles, are taken from the conceptual domain of human (animal) body, cf. *mata air* water spring (*mata* eye, *air* water), *tahi besi* rust (*tahi* filth, excrement, *besi* iron), *tahi gergaji* sawdust (*tahi* filth, excrement, *gergaji* saw), *gigi laut* high-water mark (*gigi* teeth, *laut* sea), *mata hari* sun (*mata* eye, *hari* day), *ekor pulau* the downstream point of a riverine island (*ekor* tail, *pulau* island).

The next most important source of metaphorical images in Malay vocabulary is the domain of plant (or tree) body, e.g. *daun telinga* the outer frame of the ear (*daun* leaf, *telinga* ear), *bunga api* spark (*bunga* flower, *api* fire), *bunga uang* interest on money (*bunga* flower, *uang* money), *pokok angin* a storm cloud (*pokok* root, tree, *angin* wind), *batang air* a water-course (*batang* tree trunk, *air* water).

15

Quite a few vehicles are borrowed from the domain of social organization such as *anak air* rivulet (*anak* child, *air* water), *anak panah* arrow (*anak* child, *panah* bow), *raja bintang* the main celestial bodies (*raja* king, *bintang* star), *raja udang* a kingfisher (*raja* king, *udang* crayfish), *perang saudara* civil war (*saudara* brother, *perang* war), *ibu kota* capital (*ibu* mother, *kota* town, city), *ibu pasir* gravel (*ibu* mother, *pasir* sand).

Other metaphorical sources are illustrated with such examples as *ular danu* rainbow (*ular* snake, *danu* mere, pool), *makan hati* to brood (*makan* to eat, *hati* heart, liver), *ajak ayam* insincere invitation (*ajak* to invite, *ayam* cock, hen), *surat terbang* anonymus letter (*surat* letter, *terbang* to fly).

As far as individual words are concerned, among those that frequently occur as vehicles of a metaphor are the following ones : *mata* eye, *gigi* tooth, *kaki* foot, leg, *ibu* mother, *anak* child, *tahi* filth, excrement, *batang* tree trunk, *bunga* flower. They are employed as vehicles in quite diverse conceptual domains, e.g., *mata hari* sun (*hari* day), *mata hati* mental perception (*hati* heart, liver), *mata jalan* scout (*jalan* road), *mata jerat* the loop of a noose (*jerat* noose), *mata air* spring (*air* water), *mata pelajaran* educational subject (*pelajaran* education) ; *anak air* rivulet (*air* water), *anak genta* the clapper of a bell (*genta* bell), *anak lidah* uvula (*lidah* tongue), *anak negeri* a native of the country (*negeri* country), *anak panah* arrow (*panah* bow), *anak perahu* boat-man (perahu boat), *anak rambut* the fringe of hair over the forehead (*rambut* hair), *anak roda* the spoke of a wheel (*roda* wheel) ; *ibu akar* the main root (*akar* root), *ibu jari* thumb (*jari* finger, toe), *ibu kota* capital (*kota* town, city), *ibu panah* bow (*panah* bow), *ibu pasir* gravel (*pasir* sand), *ibu sungai* the main river-bed (*sungai* river), *ibu tangga* rail (*tangga* staircase) ; *bunga api* sparks, firework *(api* fire), *bunga tanah* humus, black soil (*tanah* earth), *bunga uang* interest on money (*uang* money), *bunga angin* light breeze (*angin* wind), *bunga bibir* flattery, sweet words (*bibir* lips), *bunga badan* a skin disease (*badan* body), *bunga tahi* dirty words (*tahi* filth, excrement, *bunga hati* favourite (*hati* heart, liver) ; *tahi air* scum on water (*air* water), *tahi angin* light, fleecy clouds, words of little account (*angin* wind), *tahi besi* rust (*besi* iron), *tahi gergaji* sawdust (*gergaji* saw), *tahi lalat* a freckle, a mole (*lalat* a fly) ; *kaki angkasa* horizon (*angkasa* air), *kaki dian* candlestick (*dian* candle), *kaki tangan* accomplice, henchman (*tangan* hand), *kaki tembok* the foundations of a wall (*tembok* a wall), *kaki minum* drunkard (*minum* drink), *kaki-rokok* cigarette fiend (*rokok* cigarette).

Many authors are of the opinion that a topic requires a vehicle from a different conceptual domain. This may hold in general but much depends upon the way we define our domains. In the metaphor *ekor mata* the corner of an eye, however, both terms belong to the domain of human (animal) body where *ekor* refers to tail and *mata* to eye ; the same is true of the expression *mata susu* the nipple of the breast (*mata* eye, *susu* breast, milk), or of the expression *mata luka* the orifice of the wound (*luka* wound). Perhaps, instead of speaking of incompatible conceptual domains, the

16

latter should be characterized as usually incompatible.

If, however, both terms come from the same domain, the topic is often more abstract than the vehicle, or at least less well known. The tendency to characterize the abstract with the aid of the concrete even within the same domain is illustrated by such expressions as *mata hati* inward perception (*mata* eye, *hati* heart, liver, seat of feelings) or *hati berbulu* to be angry (*bulu* body hair, wool, feather).

Terms that frequently occur in metaphorical constructions are elements of lexical paradigms and it is usually whole paradigms that are employed in figurative speech. Since the anthropomorphic model prevails in human cognition, it is by no means surprising that the most typical model is that consisting of the names of human (animal) body parts as schematized below:

<div align="center">

kepala head : :

rambut hair, *mata* eye, *telinga* ear

mulut mouth :

gigi tooth, *lidah* tongue

tubuh body :
</div>

tangan hand	*tulang* bone	*kulit* skin
jari finger		*bulu* body hair, wool
	urat sinew, vein, *darah* blood	
	perut belly	
kaki leg, foot		*tahi* filth, excrement
		ekor tail
		telor egg

A somewhat less exhaustive is the model based upon plant (and tree) parts:

	pohon / *pokok* tree, trunk :	
daun leaf		*ranting* branch
bunga flower		*buah* fruit
	batang trunk	
	akar root	

As far as the domain of social organization is concerned, it is the terms *anak* child and *ibu* mother that are frequetly employed, followed by *bapa* father, *raja* king, and *saudara* brother.

In the domain of fauna nouns referring to both domestic and wild animals are productive in imagery, e.g. *gajah* elephant, *babi* pig, *anjing* dog, *kera* monkey, *tikus* mouse, *ayam* hen, *tebuan* hornet, *katak* frog, *ular* snake, *ikan* fish, *udang* crayfish. The opposition of *jantan* male versus *betina* female is also utilized.

The word *karang* coral is classified with plants of which *pinang* the areca-nut, *pisang* banana, and *anggor* grapes, vine are often used. Within the domain of natural

phenomena we sometimes find the lexemes *air* water, *api* fire, *awan* cloud, and *angin* wind in metaphorical expressions.

The frequent utilization of terms from the human (animal) body domain and the fairly insignificant presence of lexemes from the domains of inanimate objects is in full accord with the conceptual scale of decreasing saliency (often binarized into an opposition of animate versus inanimate) at the top of which are human beings followed by animals, plants, artefacts, and finally by natural phenomena, a scale that pervades all languages and the whole of language structure (including syntax and phonetics, cf. onomatopoeia in the latter and genus verbi as well as transitivity — intransitivity in the former), confirming thus that man is, in his own terms, a measure of all things and that he tries to cognize himself in cognizing the surrounding world under the pressure of the need and desire to see complete identity where there is only partial one.

REFERENCES

Arutyunova, N. D.: *Yazykovaya metafora (Sintaksis i leksika).* In: *Lingvistika i poetika.* Moscow, Nauka 1979, pp. 147—173.

Dixon, R. M. W.: *The languages of Australia.* Cambridge, Cambridge University Press 1980.

Fearing, F.: *An examination of the conceptions of B. L. Whorf in the light of the theories of perception and cognition.* In: *Language in Culture.* H. Hoijer (Ed.). The American Antropologist, *56*, 1954, 6, 2, Mem. 79, pp. 47—81.

Hesse, M.: *The explanatory function of metaphor.* In: *Logic, Methodology and Philosophy of Science.* Y. Bar-Hillel (Ed.) Proceedings of the 1964 International Congress. Amsterdam, North-Holland Publishing Co. 1965, pp. 249—259.

Hinman, L. W.: *Nietsche, metaphor and truth.* Philosophy and Phenomenological Research, *43*, 1982, No. 2, pp. 179—199.

Kates, C. A.: *A pragmatic theory of metaphor.* Forum Linguisticum, *4*, 1979, No. 2, pp. 138—158.

Nalimov, V. V.: *Veroyatnostnaya model yazyka.* Moscow, Nauka 1979.

Pylyshyn, Z. W.: *Metaphorical imprecision and the "top-down" research strategy.* In: *Metaphor and Thought.* A. Ortony (Ed.). Cambridge, Cambridge University Press 1979, pp. 420—436.

Searle, J. R.: *Metaphor.* In: *Metaphor and Thought.* A. Ortony (Ed.). Cambridge, Cambridge University Press 1979, pp. 92—123.

Shibles, W. A.: *Metaphor: An Annotated Bibliography and History.* Whitewater, Wisconsin, The Language Press 1971.

Weiner, E. J.: *A knowledge representation approach to understanding metaphor.* Computational Linguistics *10*, 1984, No. 1, pp. 1—14.

Wheelwright, P.: *Metaphor and Reality.* Bloomington, Indiana University Press 1964.

Wilkinson, R. J.: *An Abridged Malay-English Dictionary.* London, MacMillan and Co. Ltd. 1961.

Zhol, K. K.: *Mysl, slovo, metafora.* Kiev, Naukova dumka 1984.

18

DESCRIPTIVE TERMS IN MODERN WRITTEN ARABIC. A STUDY IN LEXICAL CLASSIFICATION

LADISLAV DROZDÍK, Bratislava

The aim of the present study is to contribute to the classification of descriptive terms in the 20th century Arabic. An attempt has been made at devising classificatory criteria that might help to get a better insight into this highly variable and largely uncodified domain of the MWA lexicon.

1. The present study is intended to analyse lexical relationships between various types of descriptive terms in the 20th century Arabic. In contrast to one-word units, the class of what we call descriptive terms will be identified with units consisting of several word constituents, irrespective of their number and the type of syntactic relationship linking them together. The attribute 'descriptive' is used here somewhat arbitrarily and has to point to an extemporaneous nature of these lexical (mostly terminological) units by which they differ from the rest of more firmly established multicomponent terms of the lexicon of Modern Written Arabic (MWA, in what follows). The latter feature is betrayed by the presence of a lexical variation that involves one or several descriptive (D) and/or one-word (OW) units. This type of a largely unwanted variation is made possible by the low degree of lexical and terminological codification and inter-Arab co-ordination in the present-day Arab world.

Whenever a D-term is related to an OW-alternant, throughout the present paper, the relationship analysed will futher be extended to the whole set of possible OW-alternants. On the other hand, those OW-units that cannot be related to D-terms will be disregarded.

1.1 The definition of a D-term, as understood in the present paper, is not always easy. The decision of what to include in the lexical domain examined is frequently obscured by several disturbing factors.

(1) One of them resides in the difficulty to define the limits of a D-unit. In most cases, this difficulty results from the occurrence of additional explicative elements of various length, structure and lexical relevance, freely appended to both D- and OW-units, as in:

lawḥ xašabī ṣaġīr (tuksā bihi s-suqūf) "shingle" (Khat., 543; lit. 'small wooden board (used as a covering for roofs)', as against a homogeneous, undifferentiated description, as in:

19

qitaᶜ xašabiyya murabbaᶜa 'aw mustatīla li-tagtiyat as-suqūf wa-l-judrān "idem"
(Don., 1138: shingle (wooden tile); lit. 'square-shaped or oblong wooden pieces for
covering the roofs and walls'), etc.

In cases like the present one, the explicative additions will be taken into account,
since they display a high rate of lexical relevance that supplies for the relatively low
degree of lexical codification. Furthermore, the bulk of D-terms with incorporated
explicative elements added to the basic description (the latter feature is mostly
marked by bracketting) are, from the point of view of lexical explicitness, fully
commensurable with typical D-terms occurring without them. Nevertheless, a cer-
tain degree of impressionism is necessarily involved in the procedure, since there are
no reliable formal and semantic criteria to define the limits of a D-term by way of
distinguishing between 'basic' and 'added' descriptive elements.

(2) The incompatibility of lexical descriptions, derived from various stages of
scientific and cultural development of the Arab world through the last two centuries
of the linguistic evolution of Modern Written Arabic, presents another serious
problem. It consists in the difficulty of deciding whether a given lexical description
belongs to the same set of D-term alternants. From this point of view one can easily
disagree on the question of whether some early 19th century descriptions may be
evaluated together with their recent counterparts despite an immense cultural,
scientific and technological difference in approaching them. Or, in other words,
whether a general linguistic identity of MWA, as a linguistic variant of Arabic
evolving through the last two centuries, necessarily implies a lexically recognizable
identity of terms covering the same phenomenon in spite of the fact that the latter is
viewed from quite different levels of knowledge, as in:

Early Nineteenth Century Arabic:

jādibiyya tazhar fi-l-'ajsām ᶜinda daᶜkihā "electricity" (Boc., 1.298: électricité,
propriété d'attraction des corps frottés; lit. '/faculty of/ attraction appearing in
substances when subject to friction'); or its reduced variant *jādibiyya* operating as
a component of some D-terms, as in:

'ahdata fi-š-šay' al-jādibiyya "to electrize, to generate /static/ electricity in
a substance" (ibid.: électriser, développer, communiquer la faculté électrique),[1] or:

'ālat al-'išāra; burj al-'išāra; bayt al-'axbār "telegraph" (Boc., 2.264: télégraphe,
machine pour transmettre les nouvelles par des signes; construction en forme de tour
sur laquelle est placée cette machine; lit. 'machine for signalling; tower for
signalling; information center /house/'),[2] or:

---

[1] The latter term, related to the early 19th century concept of static electricity, is in the recent MWA
lexicon used to denote the physical phenomenon of gravitation.

[2] Literal translations refer to the Arabic terms and not to the second-language definitions that may
markedly differ from the latter, as in the present case: 'telegraph, a machine for transmitting messages by
means of signs; a tower-shaped construction upon which this machine is placed'.

20

ᶜilm 'iṣṭilāḥāt al-mamālik bayna baᶜḍihā "diplomacy" (Boc., 1.270: diplomatie, science des rapports, des intérets de puissance à puissance; lit. 'diplomacy, science of relations between states'), etc.

In order to raise the level of lexical compatibility of the D-terms evaluated, a rough chronological restriction has been introduced: only such descriptions that originated in the 20th century or, at least, that may be attested in the 20th century sources, will be taken into consideration. Earlier items, even when occasionally quoted for illustrative purposes, will be disregarded while computing recurrence indexes, defined in what follows.

It must be recognized, however, that the latter restriction, although it proved to be highly useful, does not solve the problem in its entirety. Notably, it does not show how to treat the relatively great class of 20th century neologisms that have fallen into disuse, like:

ar-ru'ya ᶜan buᶜd "television" (an unsuccessful calque tentatively proposed by the Egyptian journal *al-Muqtaṭaf;* lit. 'the vision from afar' (Krahl, diss. 21, n. 45); or:

'iḏāᶜa mar'iyya "idem"; lit. 'video broadcast' (regionally used: Libya (Wehr, 365: *al-'iḏāᶜa al-mar'iyya),* or:

'iḏāᶜa muṣawwara "idem"; lit. 'picture broadcast' (disused);

'iḏāᶜa taṣwīriyya "idem"; lit. 'picture broadcast' (disused), etc. The last three terms are Maḥmūd Taymūr's creations.[3]

Similar terms, unless being regionally used, at the very least, will be disregarded.

On the other hand, however, some archaic terms, as far as attested in the 20th century sources, will be taken into account irrespective of their suitability to the lexical covering of what is denoted, as in:

fānūs siḥrī "episcope" (Khat., 202; lit. 'magic lantern, laterna magica'), as against:

fānūs 'isqāṭ "epidiascope" (ibid.; lit. 'projection lantern';); *fānūs siḥrī* "idem" (ibid.; see above), where the difference between the system of projecting images of opaque objects (viz. 'episcope') and that of projecting images of both opaque and transparent objects (viz. 'epidiascope') is not adequately marked.

(3) Regional divergences, as already stated above, will be registered notwithstanding the fact that they may considerably violate the principle of a full lexical identity of a given set of D-term alternants by way of introducing too specialized regional features, as in:

ṭarīq wāsiᶜ muzdawij muxaṣṣaṣ li-s-sayyārāt as-sarīᶜa yarbuṭ al-mudun al-'almāniyya "autobahn" (Don., 78; lit. 'broad two-track road specially designed for rapid cars connecting German cities), as against less narrowly specialized:

---

[3] See Anawati, G. C.: *Le vocabulaire de la culture de Mahmoud Teymour.* In: *MIDEO,* 7, 1962—1963, pp. 267—330; requoted after Krahl, diss. p. 20, n. 41 and p. 21, n. 45.

ṭarīq li-s-sayyārāt ḏū 'ittijāhayn "highway, autobahn" (SDA, 125: Autobahn; lit. 'road for cars having two tracks /two directions/'), etc.

(4) Metalinguistic elements, frequently integrated in the MWA D-terms, may have a largely unwanted disturbing effect, too. Some examples:

nisba 'ilā 'intāj al-'aṣwāt al-musajjala bi-l-muḥāfaẓa ʿalā-l-madā at-tāmm li-ḍ-ḍabḍabāt "high-fidelity, adj." (Don., 552; lit. 'adjective referring to the reproduction of recorded sounds by maintaining the whole range of frequencies', in contrast to the true linguistic descriptions, like: *ʿālī l-'amāna, daqīq al-'adā'* "idem" (Khat., 278; lit.'of high-fidelity', 'of precise rendition', respecively); or:

nisba 'ilā-l-brūlītāryā "proletarian" (Don., 988; lit. 'adjective referring to the proletariate'), etc., etc.

Similar meta-descriptions may involve various types of introducers, like: *min, tābīʿ li* "pertaining to, related to"; *yaxuṣṣ* "concerning", etc., as in:

min ṭabaqat al-ʿummāl "proletarian" (Don., 988; lit. 'pertaining to the working class'); or, from an early 19th century lexicon:

tābīʿ li-ḥukm al-jumhūr "democrat" (Boc., 1.248: démocrate; lit. 'pertaining to the people's government'), or:

yaxuṣṣ ḥukm al-jumhūr "democratic" (ibid.: démocratique; lit. 'concerning the people's government'), etc.

In view of the incompatibility of the linguistic and meta-linguistic levels, the latter type of descriptions will not be taken into account, not even in cases where no other suitable units are available.

2. The proper aim of the study is to contribute to the classification of D-terms at the present level of lexical condification of MWA. Since it is not always possible, on the ground of the textual and lexicographical evidence, to draw a clear-cut dividing line between definitively accepted and perspective units, on the one hand, and between hot, extemporaneous coinages, on the other, an attempt has been made to devise some classificatory criteria that might somewhat lower the negative impact of this defficiency. The procedure devised consists in stating the amount of identical constituents in each set of D-terms referring to the same extra-linguistic phenomenon. In order to simplify the procedure, the computation will be restricted to the constituents that exhibit a high rate of lexical relevance, notably to nouns (substantives and, in general, all types of entity terms that may equal them), adjectives and verbs. Items, constituting the latter class of words, will summarily be referred to as keywords (KW, in what follows). The relation between the inventory of key-words (I) within a given set of D-term alternants and the total number of their occurrences (O) therein, inclusively of their repetitions, will serve as a basis for the calculation of the recurrence index (R) for each set of D-term alternants: $R = I/O$. The greater is the recurrence index of a given set of D-term alternants, the higher is the level of lexical identity of their constituents and, accordingly, the higher is the level of lexical

compatibility of the respective sets of descriptions, irrespective of the number of the D-term alternants observed.[4]

The average length (A) of a given set of D-term alternants, expressed in terms of the number of their KW-constituents, will be obtained by means of the formula: $A = O/D$ where D stands for the total number of the D-term alternants (for A and O see above).

The D-terms will be arranged in descending order in accordance with the number of the D-term alternants observed. In order to facilitate the exploitation of data, the lexical material quoted will also be summarily presented in a rearranged form, along with the respective R-indexes.

Other symbols used:

KW — x: the recurrence rate of a KW, expressed in terms of the number of its repetitions within a given set of D-term alternants;

D — x: the serial number of a D-term within a given set of D-term alternants;

OW — x: the serial number of an OW-term within a given set of D-term alternants;

D (x): the total number of D-term alternants within a given set;

OW (x): the total number of OW-terms within a given set of D-term alternants.

2.1 Some D-terms in a D(x) arrangement:

D(11) — OW(1): "avalanche":

D-1: *jurf taljī yanhār min saṭḥ al-jabal* (Don., 79: avalanche; lit. 'sloping (masses of) snow that fall down from the top of a mountain');

D-2: *kutlat jalīd munhāra* (SDA, 746: Lawine; lit. 'mass of snow that has fallen down');

D-3: *jurāf taljī* (Khat., 37: avalanche; Reig, No. 5792: avalanche; lit. 'a torrential flood of snow');

D-4: *jurāf talj* (Reig, No. 964: avalanche; lit. 'a torrential flood of snow');

D-5: *jurāf jalīdī* (Reig, No. 964; avalanche; lit. 'a torrential flood of snow');

D-6: *jurd jalīdī* (Wehr, 143: avalanche; lit. 'sloping (masses of) snow');

D-7: *hayār jalīdī* (Khat., 37: avalanche; SDA, 746: Lawine; lit. 'snow fall, crash');

D-8: *hayār taljī* (SDA, 746: Lawine; lit. 'snow fall, crash');

D-9: *'inhiyār taljī* (Krahl, 246: Lawine; Reig, No. 5792: avalanche; Bar., 862: lavina; lit. 'snow fall, crash');

D-10: *'inhiyār jalīdī* (Bar., 862: lavina; lit. 'snow fall, crash');

---

[4] This approach substantially differ from that adopted in an earlier study (*Descriptive Terms in the Lexicographical Treatment of MWA*. In: *Graecolatina et orientalia*, Vols. 15—16, in print) where the range of lexical variation, manifesting itself in the number of competitive D-term alternants, has been regarded as one of the most important characteristics indicating the relative stability of a given lexical unit.

23

D-11: 'inhiyār ṭulūj (Wehr, 1216: avalanche; lit, 'fall of snow masses').[5]
Recurrence of key-words:
KW-4: jalīdī "snow, adj."; ṭaljī "snow, adj.";
KW-3: 'inhiyār "crash, fall, collapse"; jurāf "violent stream, torrential flood";
KW-2: jurf "steep slope, undercut bank"; hayār "crash, fall, collapse"; ṭalj; ṭulūj "snow; great masses of snow";
KW-1: kutla(t) "mass"; munhāra "fallen, crashed down"; yanhār "that fall(s) down"; saṭḥ "surface; roof (here: top)"; jabal "mountain".
Co-occurring OW-terms:
OW-1: hayār (Bar., 866: lavina) coincides with the KW-2 constituent of D-7 and D-8.
Relevant data: I = 12; O = 25; R = 0.48; A = 2.27.

D(7) — OW(2): "slide, transparency":

D-1: ṣūra fūtūġrāfiyya maṭbūᶜa ᶜalā mādda šaffāfa wa yumkin ᶜarḍuhāᶜalā aš-šāša (Don., 1287: transparency; lit. 'photographic picture printed on a transparent substance that may be projected upon a screen');

D-2: ṣūra mulawwana ᶜalā zujāj šaffāf li-l-fānūs as-siḥrī (Don., 1161: slide; lit. 'color picture upon a transparent glass (designed) for a slide projector ('magic lantern')');

D-3: šarā'iḥ fānūs al-ᶜarḍ aš-šaffāfa (Khat., 334: lantern slides; lit. 'transparent plates for the projection lantern');

D-4: šarīḥa zujājiyya muṣawwara (SDA, 285: Diapositive; lit. 'glass plate bearing a picture', possibly 'glass plate obtained by photographic way');

D-5: šarīḥa muṣawwara šaffāfa (Khat., 633: transparency; lit. 'transparent plate bearing a picture' or, alternatively, 'transparent plate obtained by a photographic way');

D-6: šarā'iḥ al-fānūs as-siḥrī (Khat., 334: lantern slides; lit. 'plates for magic lantern');

D-7: šarīḥa (zujājiyya) munzaliqa (Khat., 554: slide; lit. 'a glass sliding plate').
Recurrence of key-words:
KW-5: šarīḥa, šarā'iḥ "plate(s), slice(s)";
KW-4: šaffāf, šaffāfa "transparent (masc., fem.)";
KW-3: fānūs "lantern";
KW-2: siḥrī "magic"; ṣūra "picture"; muṣawwara "bearing a picture; photographic (fem.)"; zujājiyya "glass (adj., fem.)"; ᶜarḍ "projection";
KW-1: zujāj "glass"; mādda "substance"; šāša "screen"; munzaliqa "sliding

---

[5] Apart from a nonincluded early 19th century term: haḍf ṭalj min jabal (Boc., 1.72: avalanche, avalange, masse de neige qui roule des montagnes).

24

(fem.)"; *mulawwana* "color (adj., fem.)"; *fūtūġrāfiyya* "photographic"; *maṭbūʿa* "printed (fem.)"; *yumkin* "it is possible".

Co-occuring OW-terms:

OW-1: *šarīḥa* (Wehr, 541: microscopic slide; (photographic) slide) coincides with the KW-5 of D-3, 4, 5, 6, and 7;

OW-2: *silāyid* (from the English 'slide') is not represented at the D-level.[6]

Relevant data: I = 16; O = 30; R = 0.50; S = 4.28.

D(6) — OW(−): "driving license":

D-1: *'ijāzat sawq (as-sayyārāt)* (Khat., 177: driver's licence; lit. 'licence to drive (cars)');

D-2: *ruxṣat qiyādat sayyārāt* (Don., 358: as a part of *'imtiḥān li-l-ḥuṣūl ʿalā 'ijāzat siyāqa 'aw ruxṣat qiyādat sayyārāt*: driving test; lit. 'examination for obtaining driving license or permission to drive cars'; Wehr, 384: *ruxṣat qiyādat as-sayyārāt*: driving permit, operator's license);

D-3: *'ijāzat as-sawq* (Wehr, 516: driving license; lit. 'idem'; Reig, No. 2739: *'ijāzat sawq*: permis de conduire);

D-4: *ruxṣat al-qiyāda* (SDA, 431: Führerschein);

D-5: *ruxṣat siyāqa* (Wehr, 384: driving permit, operator's license /Saudi Ar./);

D-6: *'ijāzat siyāqa* (Don., 358: as a part of 'driving test' quoted under D-2; Reig, No. 2739: permis de conduire).

Recurrence of key-words:

KW-3: *'ijāza(t)* "license; permit; authorization";

KW-3: *ruxṣa(t)* "idem";

KW-2: *sawq* "driving";

KW-2: *qiyāda(t)* "driving; steering";

KW-2: *siyāqa* "driving";

KW-2; *sayyārāt* "cars".

Relevant data: I = 6; O = 14; R = 0.42; A = 2.33.

D(6) — OW(−): "mass media":

D-1: *wasā'il al-'ittiṣāl bi-l-jumhūr* (Khat., 369: mass media; lit. 'media for communicating with the public');

D-2: *wasā'il al-'ittiṣāl bi-l-jamāhīr* (Don., 752: mass media; lit. 'media for communicating with the masses'; SDA, 808 (quoted in singular): *wasīlat al-'ittiṣāl bi-l-jamāhīr*: Massenmedium);

D-3: *'ajhizat al-'iʿlām* (Don., 752: mass media; lit. 'information devices'; SAD,

---

[6] Nevertheless, the term is conceptually related to the KW-1 *munzaliqa*.

307: die Massenmedien; Reig, No. 3627: moyens/techniques/organes d'information; mass media; médias);

D-4: *wasīlat al-'i'lān* (SDA, 808: Massenmedium; lit. 'medium for public announcement');

D-5: *wasīlat ad-di'āya* (ibid.; lit. 'medium of propaganda');

D-6: *wasā'il al-'i'lām* (Reig, No. 3627: see under D-3 above; lit. 'information media').

Recurrence of key-words:

KW-5: *wasīla(t), wasā'il* "medium (media), means; device(s)";

KW-2: *'ittiṣāl* "communication";

KW-2: *'i'lām* "information; notification";

KW-1: *jumhūr* "public, general public";

KW-1: *(al-)jamāhīr* "the masses, the people";

KW-1: *'ajhiza(t)* "devices; appliances";

KW-1: *'i'lān* "announcement; notification";

KW-1: *di'āya* "propaganda".

Relevant data: $I = 8$; $O = 14$; $R = 0.57$; $A = 2.33$.

D(5) — OW(−): "astronautics":

D-1: *'ilm al-milāḥa bayna l-kawākib* (Don., 71: astronautics; lit. 'science of navigation between planets /stars, celestial bodies/');

D-2: *'ilm ġazw al-faḍā'* (SDA, 62: Astronautik; lit. 'science of conquerring the space');

D-3: *al-milāḥa al-falakiyya* (Khat., 32: astronautics; lit. 'space navigation');

D-4: *al-milāḥa al-faḍā'iyya* (ibid.; lit. 'space navigation');

D-5: *milāḥat al-faḍā* (Reig, No. 4016: astronautique; lit. 'space navigation').

Recurrence of key-words:

KW-4: *milāḥa(t)* "navigation";

KW-2: *'ilm* "science"; *faḍā* "space";

KW-1: *faḍā'iyya* "space (adj., fem.)"; *falakiyya* "space (adj., fem.); celestial, orbital"; *ġazw* "conquest"; *kawākib* "planets; stars; celestial bodies".

Relevant data: $I = 7$; $O = 12$; $R = 0.58$; $A = 2.4$.

D(4) — OW(1): "the Galaxy, the Milky Way; galaxy":[7]

---

[7] Early 19th century terms, related to the concept of the Galaxy (the galaxy, as distinct from the Galaxy or the Milky Way, is a 20th century concept) stand closely to their modern counterparts:

D(4)—OW(1): The Galaxy, the Milky Way:

D-1: *ṭarīq at-tibn* (Boc., 2.428: voie lactée, amas d'étoiles qui font une trace blanche dans le ciel; lit. 'the way of straw');

D-2: *durayb at-tabbāna* (ibid., lit. 'the (narrow) path cf straw vendors');

D-3: *'umm as-samā* (a colloquialized variant of *'umm as-samā'*; ibid,; lit. 'the mother of the sky');

D-1: *darb at-tabbāna* (Don., 772: the Milky Way; SDA, 825: Milchstrasse; Khat., 244: Galaxy; ibid., 378: Milky Way; etc.; lit. 'the path of straw vendors');

D-2: *ṭarīq al-majarra* (Don., 772; lit. 'the way of the Galaxy');

D-3: *aṭ-ṭarīq al-labanī* (FK, 6—7; lit. 'the milky way');

D-4: *nahr al-majarra* (Rabat, Vol. 8, 17: Milky Way, Voie lactée; lit. 'the river of the Galaxy');

Recurrence of key-words:

KW-2: *majarra* "the Galaxy; galaxy; 'the place where /stars/ are drawn, dragged along together'";

KW-2: *ṭarīq* "way, road";

KW-1: *darb* "path, trail; road"; *tabbāna* "straw vendors"; *nahr* "river"; *labanī* "milky".

Co-occurring OW-terms:

OW-1: *(al-) majarra* "the Galaxy, the Milky Way (see also KW-2 above), generally used, coincides with the KW-2 of D-2 and D-4. In the 20th century astronomy the term is also used to denote the 'galaxy' in general, as distinct from the Galaxy.

Relevant data: $I = 6$; $O = 8$; $R = 0.75$: $A = 2$.

D(4) — OW(−): "master-key (passkey)":

D-1: *miftāḥ yaftaḥ kull al-'abwāb ʿalā-xtilāf 'aqfālihā* (Don., 753: master-key; lit. 'a key that opens all the doors irrespective of their locks');

D-2: *miftāḥ ʿumūmī* (Khat., 370: master key; lit. 'universal key');

D-3: *miftāḥ ʿāmm* (Khat., 552: skeleton key; lit. 'universal key');

D-4: *miftāḥ haykalī* (ibid.; lit. 'skeleton key'),[8]

Recurrence of key-words:

KW-4: *miftāḥ* "key";

KW-1: *yaftaḥ* "(that) opens"; *kull* "all"; *'abwāb* "doors"; *'aqfāl* "locks"; *ʿumūmī* "universal"; *ʿāmm* "universal"; *haykalī* "skeleton (adj.)".

Relevant data: $I = 8$; $O = 11$; $R = 0.72$; $A = 2.75$.

D-4: *ṭarīq al-labbāna* (ibid.; lit. 'the way of milk vendors');

Recurrence of key-word:

KW-2: *ṭarīq* "way, road";

KW-1: *durayb* "the (narrow, small) path" (diminutive of *darb* "path, trail"); *tabbāna* "straw vendors"; *labbāna* "milk vendors"; *tibn* "straw"; *'umm* "mother"; *samā (samā')* "sky".

Co-occurring OW-terms: OW-1: *(al-)majarra*; unrepresented at the D-level.

Relevant data: $I = 7$; $O=8$; $R = 0.87$; $A = 2$.

[8] Apart from other 'passkey'-devices that need not necessarily occur in form of a key, such sa *ṭaffāša*; *fātiḥat (fassāxat) al-'aqfāl* (SDA, 291: Dietrich).

D(3) — OW(−): "shingle":

D-1: *qiṭaᶜ xašabiyya murabbaᶜa 'aw mustaṭīla li-taġtiyat as-suqūf wa-l-judrān* (Don., 1138: shingle /wooden tile/; lit. 'square-shaped or oblong wooden pieces used to cover the roofs or walls');

D-2: *lawḥ xašabī ṣaġīr (tuksā bihi s-suqūf)* (Khat., 543: shingle; lit. 'small wooden board (designed to cover the roofs)');

D-3: *lawḥ xašab ṣaġīr* (SDA, 1004: Schindel; lit. 'small wooden board').

Recurrence of key-words:

KW-2: *lawḥ* "board; plate"; *xašabī, xašabiyya* "wooden (masc., fem.)"; *ṣaġīr* "small"; *suqūf* "roofs";

KW-I: *tuksā bihi* "/they/ are covered with it"; *judrān* "walls"; *xašab* "wood"; *qiṭaᶜ* "pieces"; *murabbaᶜa* "square-shaped (fem.)"; *mustaṭīla* "oblong (adj., fem.)"; *taġṭiya(t)* "covering (verb. abstract)".

Relevant data: I = 11; O = 15; R = 0.73; A = 5.

D(3) — OW(1): "provitamin":

D-1: *al-mādda allatī tataqaddam al-fītāmīn* (ᶜAHṬ, 148: as a part of: *al-mādda allatī tataqaddam fītāmīn 'alif*: provitamin A; lit. 'substance that precedes vitamin A');

D-2: *muqaddam al-fītāmīn* (ᶜAHṬ, 148, 149: as a part of: *muqaddam fītāmīn 'alif*: provitamin A; lit. 'precursor of vitamin A');

D-3: *ṭalīᶜat al-fītāmīn* (RAMS, 422: provitamin; lit. 'precursor of vitamin').

Recurrence of key-words:

KW-3: *fītāmīn* "vitamin";

KW-1: *mādda* "substance"; *tataqaddam* "/that/ precedes"; *muqaddam* "precursor"; *ṭalīᶜa(t)* "precursor".

Co-occuring OW-terms:

OW-1: *al-burūfītāmīn* (so vocalized) "provitamin" is not represented at the D-level.

Relevant data: I = 5; O = 7; R = 0.71; A = 2.33.

Ḍ(3) — OW(1): "planetarium":

D-1: *(miflāk:) jihāz 'isqāṭ yuẓhir ḥarakat aš-šams wa-l-kawākib wa-n-nujūm fī qubba bi-'aᶜlāhu* (Khat., 449; planetarium (projector); as an additional explicative element, it co-occurs with the neologism *miflāk* (see below); lit. '*miflāk*: a projecting device demonstrating the motion of the sun, planets and stars upon a /hemispherical/ dome above it'; from the derivational point of view, the OW-term *miflāk* consists of the instrumental pattern *miCCāC* and the root **f-l-k*, as occurring in e.g. *falak* "celestial body; orbit");

D-2: *qubbat al-falak aṣ-ṣināᶜiyya (li-'īḍāḥ ḥarakāt an-nujūm)* (SDA, 906: Planetarium; lit. 'an artificial cupola (visualizing the motion of celestial bodies)');

D-3: *jihāz yumaṯṯil ḥarakāt al-kawākib* (Don., 927: planetarium; lit. 'apparatus demonstrating the motion of the planets').

Co-occurring OW-term:

OW-1: *miflāk* (see under D-1 above).

Recurrence of key-words:

KW-3: *ḥaraka(t), ḥarakāt* "motion(s)";

KW-2: *qubba(t)* "dome, cupola"; *kawākib* "planets; stars; celestial bodies"; *nujūm* "stars; celestial bodies"; *jihāz* "apparatus";

KW-1: *'isqāṭ* "projection"; *falak* "celestial sphere; orbit"; *ṣināʿiyya* "artificial (fem.)"; *'īḍāḥ* "visualization; explication, illustration"; *yumaṯṯil* "(that) demonstrates"; *yuẓhir* "id."; *šams* "sun".

Relevant data: I = 12; O = 18; R = 0.66; A = 6.

D(2) — OW(1): "matriarchy"

D-1: *niẓām 'ijtimāʿī yaʿūd an-nasab wa-l-'irṯ fīhi 'ilā sulālat al-'umm* (Don., 755: matriarchy; lit. 'social system in which descent and inheritance are traced through the mother's side of the family');

D-2: *niẓām al-'umūma* (SAD, 56 and SDA, 810: Matriarchat; Bar., 42: matriarkhat; etc. lit. 'system of motherhood').

Recurrence of key-words:

KW-2: *niẓām* "system";

KW-1: *'ijtimāʿī* "social"; *yaʿūd* "(that) is traceable; falls to someone's lot"; *nasab* "lineage, descent"; *'irṯ* "heritage, inheritance"; *sulāla(t)* "progeny; family"; *'umm* "mother"; *'umūma* "mortherhood; maternity".

Co-occurring OW-terms:

OW-1: *'umūmiyya* (Reig, No. 194: matriarcat); unrepresented at the D-level.
Relevant data: I = 8; O = 9; R = 0.88; A = 4.5.

D(2) — OW(3): "boulevard":

D-1: *šāriʿ ʿarīḍ mušajjar* (Don., 143: boulevard; lit. 'a wide tree-lined street');
D-2: *šāriʿ kabīr* (SDA, 233: Boulevard; lit. 'large street').[9]

Recurrence of key-words:

KW-2: *šāriʿ* "street";

KW-1: *ʿarīḍ* "wide"; *mušajjar* "tree-lined": *kabīr* "large".

Co-occurring OW-terms:

OW-1: *šāriʿ* (Reig, No. 2862: artère; avenue; boulevard; rue); coinciding with KW-2 in both D-1 and D-2;

---

[9] The early 19th century terms point to the circular shape of the boulevard network as well as to the presence of trees: *dāyir al-madīna* (instead of the standard *dā'ir al-madīna*; Boc., 1.106: boulevard, allées d'arbres autour d'une ville); *'ašjār maṣfūfa ṣaffayn ḥawla l-madīna* (Boc., 1.106; lit. 'trees arranged in two lines around a city').

OW-2: *jādda* (Reig, No. 915: avenue; boulevard; grande route; voie); unrepresented at the D-level;

OW-3: *būlfār* (Wehr, 101: boulevard; Wehr-reading: *bulvăr*); unrepresented at the D-level.

Relevant data: I = 4; O = 5; R = 0.80; A = 2.5.

D(2) — OW(1): "ham":

D-1: *laḥm faxḏ al-xinzīr baʿda 'an yumallaḥ wa yuqaddad wa yudaxxan* (Don., 529: ham; lit. 'meat from a hog's hind leg after having been salted, dried and smoked');

D-2: *laḥm mumallaḥ min faxḏ al-xinzīr* (SDA, 1004: Schinken; lit. 'salted meat from a hog's hind leg').

Recurrence of key-words:

KW-2: *laḥm* "meat"; *faxḏ, faxiḏ* "thigh; hind leg"; *xinzīr* "hog, pig".

KW-1: *yumallaḥ* "/it/ is salted"; *yuqaddad* "/it/ is dried; *yudaxxan* "/it/ is smoked"; *mumallaḥ* "salted".

Co-occurring OW-terms:

OW-1: *jāmbūn* (from the French *jambon*; Wehr, 132), unrepresented at the D-level.

Relevent data: I = 7; O = 10; R = 0.70; A = 5.

2.2 The material quoted rearranged in accordance with the recurrence index (in an ascending order):

R:			I:	O;	A:
0.42:	D(6)—OW(−)	"driving license"	6	14	2.33
0.48	D(11)—OW(1):	"avalanche"	12	25	2.27
0.50:	D(7)—OW(2):	"slide, transparency"	16	30	4.28
0.57:	D(6)—OW(−):	"mass media"	8	14	2.33
0.58:	D(5)—OW(−):	"astronautics"	7	12	2.4
0.66:	D(3)—OW(1):	"planetarium"	12	18	6
0.70:	D(2)—OW(1):	"ham"	7	10	5
0.71:	D(3)—OW(1):	"provitamin"	5	7	2.33
0.72:	D(4)—OW(−):	"master-key"	8	11	2.75
0.73:	D(3)—OW(−):	"shingle"	11	15	5
0.75:	D(4)—OW(1):	"The Galaxy; galaxy"	6	8	2
0.80:	D(2)—OW(3):	"boulevard"	4	5	2.5
0.88:	D(2)—OW(1):	"matriarchy"	8	9	4.5

2.3 Finally, it should be noted that the number of D-terms in any given set of conceptually identical units is constantly varying. Accordingly, the lexical material

quoted is subject to at least two types of restrictions. It reflects the present stage of the lexical development of MWA, on the one hand, as well as the extent and assortment of lexicographical and textual sources available to the author.

REFERENCES

^cAHṬ — Sulaymān ^cAẓmī: ^cAlā hāmiš aṭ-ṭibb. I. Cairo, Dār al-Qalam 1961.

Bar. — Baranov, Kh. K.: Arabsko-russkii slovar (Arabic-Russian Dictionary). Fifth (enlarged) ed. Moscow, Izdatelstvo Russkii yazyk 1975.

Boc. — Bocthor, E.: Dictionnaire français-arabe. Revue et augmenté par C. de Perceval. 2 Vols. Paris, Firmin Didot Père et Fils, Libraires 1828—1829.

Don. — Doniach, N. S. (Editor): The Oxford English-Arabic Dictionary of Current Usage. Oxford, Clarendon Press 1972.

FK — Jamāl ad-Dīn al-Fandī: al-Faḍā' al-kawnī. Cairo, Dār al-Qalam 1961.

Khat. — Al-Khatib, Ahmed: A New Dictionary of Scientific and Technical Terms. English-Arabic. Beirut, Librairie du Liban 1971.

Krahl — Krahl, G.: Deutsch-Arabisches Wörterbuch. Leipzig, VEB Verlag Enzyklopädie 1964.

Krahl, diss. — Krahl, G.: Die technischen und wissenschaftlichen Termini im modernen Arabisch (Inauguraldissertation 1967; mimeographed).

Rabat — Muṣṭalaḥāt al-falak fi-t-ta^clīm al-^cālī (Terminology of Astronomy in Higher Education). League of Arab States. Education, Culture, and Sciences Organization (Co-ordination Bureau of Arabization, Rabat). Casablanca, Dar El Kitab 1977.

RAMS — Arslanyan, G. — Shubov, Ya.: Russko-arabskii meditsinskii slovar. Moscow, Izdatelstvo Russkii yazyk, 1977.

Reig — Reig, D.: Dictionnaire arabe-français, français-arabe. Paris, Larousse (Collection Saturne) 1983.

SAD — Schregle, Götz: Arabisch-deutsches Wörterbuch (fasc. 1—6). Wiesbaden, Franz Steiner Verlag 1981—1983.

SDA — Schregle, Götz: Deutsch-arabisches Wörterbuch. Wiesbaden, Otto Harrassowitz 1974.

Wehr — Wehr, H.: A Dictionary of Modern Written Arabic. Edited by J. Milton Cowan. Fourth (enlarged) ed. Wiesbaden, Otto Harrassowitz 1979. The English equivalents quoted are given in full or in reduced quotations. The transcription is slightly modified in accordance with the system of writing adopted in the present study.

31

THE STABILIZERS AND PERSONAL PRONOUNS IN DENDI-SONGHAY

PETR ZIMA, PRAGUE

The paper is based on field work with the Songhay language informants from the Dendi communities of Salaga (Republic of Ghana), Djougou (Benin People's Republic) and certain adjacent areas of the Republic of Niger. It analyses the system of stabilizers gònnó × sì, no with a tonal polarity × ná d̂ and their constructions with personal pronouns. It compares them with analogical and related morphemes and constructions in other described dialects of Songhay and comes to the conclusion that major parts of the Songhay verbal paradigms might have developed from such verbonominal constructions. A similar or comparable development of the verbal systems in other languages of this area (Niger-Kordofan and/or Chadic in their genetic affinities) is not altogether to be excluded.

0.   It is not the purpose of this paper to analyse either the purely nominal aspects of the structure of the southern Dendi dialects of Songhay of their verbal system (for the latter see Zima, 1986). Rather, its aim is to focus attention on certain transitional features between these nominal and verbal sections, namely: the stabilizers and the personal pronouns. Both of these types of morphemes play a major role in Songhay grammar, and a description of their functions and forms in the southern Dendi dialects (for this cluster of dialects[1] we shall use further the abbreviation SDD) may throw more light especially on the origin and development of the verbal system of this language.

1.0   While the personal pronouns represent an old and well established class of morphemes, which have been accounted for since the ancient philological classifications of the parts of speech, the stabilizer as a grammatical category has been introduced into African linguistic methodology probably by H. Carter (1956) who used it with success in analysing Bantu languages. Later on, the usefullness of this

---

[1] The present paper is based on my own field research in West Africa (in Ghana, the then Dahomey, now the Benin People's Republic and the Republic of Niger between 1965—1970). Most of my Dendi informants spoke idiolects subsumed for the purposes of the present analysis as the Southern Dendi Dialects (hence the abbreviation SDD). They originated from the Djougou area (northern parts of the Benin People's Republic), from the Dendi community of the ancient trading city of Salaga (Ghana) and from certain other adjacent areas. On possible historical links between the Djougou and Salaga Dendi communities see Levtzion (1966), on their dialectal links see Zima (1975). On the place of the whole cluster of Dendi dialects within the context of the possible historical links between the westernmost and the southernmost Songhay dialects see the interesting hypothesis formulated by J. Rouch (1954, p. 12 ff.).

concept and term was confirmed by several other authors, notably in the Chadic field (Parsons, 1960; Carnochan, 1951; Zima, 1972, etc.) and later on in Mande (Brauner, 1974). Whether we understand it as a defective verb or as a nominal particle, depends on the particular language structures in which it occurs,[2] as well as on our methodological viewpoints (see Böhm, 1984).[3] In any case, in all the known cases it should be analysed as a transitional, verbonominal class of morphemes. It is usually translated into the IE languages by various types of the verb "to be", partly in its existential (situational) and partly in its copulative (linking) functions.[4] Thus, French linguists analysing Songhay label it either as an "actualisateur" (Tresis, 1981, p. 95) or "situatif/equatif, locatif" (Creissels, 1981, p. 311 ff.).

1.1   In SDD we distinguish basically between two different types of stabilizers. The "absolute" (or existential) stabilizer expresses the mere existence or non-existence of the noun or of a nominal clause that enters into construction with it. This absolute stabilizer — if it is used not only with a subject constituent, but also with a predicate consituent (whether verbal or adverbio-nominal in its character) also has a locative meaning.

The other type of stabilizing morphemes is the linking one (equatif). This morpheme links a nominal subject with an adverbio-nominal predicate which may be either explicitly expressed or merely understood, and hence expressed by means outside the given sentence and clause or within its situation and context (extralinguistically).

1.2   The positive existence of nominal substance is expressed by the absolute stabilizer (situatif) which usually displays the form *gònnó*, the non-existence of it is expressed by its negative counterpart *šíì*. Most bilingual informants translate these

---

[2] Brauner established for Bambara a special sub-class of "Prädikatsbilder" within his form-class II. These "Prädikatsbilder" (Stabilizers) share with the "full" verbs the capacity to function an syntactic predicates, but they do not share all their morphological features (1974, p. 52 ff.). It is interesting to note that the Bambara stabilizers may display even the contrast present × past, while not displaying any of the strictly nominal categories. In this way, we may postulate that typologically the Hausa stabilizer *nee/cee/nee* which shares with its nominal subject the categories of gender and number, is most "nominal" in its character. On the other hand, the Bambara stabilizer — if contrasted to those of Hausa and Songhay — is most "verbal"; the Songhay stabilizers, analysed in the present paper, appear typologically somewhere half-way between the Bambara and the Hausa structure (they are clearly verbonominal in their character).

[3] This author (Böhm, 1984, p. 31 ff.) prefers the criteria of meaning and function to that of formal structure, what is in agreement with his psychological approach to language data. While this type of approach brings him to some promising results (see further in footnote 5), strictly linguistically speaking we must agree with Brauner. The stabilizers cannot be fully identified with verbs, in any structure described sofar they represent a subclass between nouns and verbs.

[4] On have and be in English syntax see e.g. Bach (1967).

morphemes by means of the Hausa equivalents *àkway* (there is . . .) and *baabù* (there is not, no . . .).

Examples: *nwáárì gònnó* (food exists, there is food),

nwáárì šìì (food does not exist, there is no food).

As we have stated, a whole nominal constructions may replace the simple noun entering into construction with the same type of stabilizers.

Examples: *írì kpéì gònnó* (our lord exists),

írì kpéì šìì (our lord does not exist).

These constructions are not defective, they must be considered as complete, and they may be used in any linguistic and extralinguistic contexts. In some idiolects, these types of stabilizers also display the forms *gòó* or *bara*. The usage of these latter forms — though given as typical for other Songhay dialects — appears as marginal in SDD and it is not out of the question that the occurrence of these latter forms in SDD is due to interdialectal contacts and interference.

1.3.1   Two nouns or nominal constructions may be linked together in clauses of the type "A is B" (equatif) by the linking stabilizer *no*. This morpheme usually displays a tone opposite to that of the last preceding syllable; in Chadic we often speak about such a feature in terms of a 'tonal polarity'. The non-existence of such a link ("A is not B") is expressed by the construction with the morphemes *ná čì*.

Most bilingual SDD informants translate these constructions by means of the Hausa constructions using the stabilizer *nee/cee/nee* which is, incidentally, similar not only in its form, but which also displays a tonal polarity

Examples: *bòró wò kpéì nó* (this man is a chief),

bòró wò ná čì kpéì (this man is not a chief).

1.3.2   Apart from such linking constructions, these same *no* morphemes may also be used in constructions having only one nominal constituent immediately preceding them. However, these should not be considered absolute stabilizers (situatif). If the second constituent is not expressed in the given clause, it may appear in its immediate environment (these are often answers to questions containing the second constituent); or the second constituent is also often implied in the extralinguistic context of the given clause, a gesture showing a particular object or substance, etc.

Examples: *nàí nò?* (who is it?) — *gàmbárí ñzê nó* (it is a Hausaman),

ìsá nò? (what is it?) — *nwáárì nó* (it is food).

Thus, while surface structure of the two constructions *nwáárì gònnó* and *nwáárì nó* appears identical, their deep structure and meanings are different. Consequently, constructions of the type *nwáárì nó* are to be considered defective variants of the linking constructions (equatif).

1.4   Major differences between the two types of stabilizers in SDD appear, if their constructions with different forms of personal pronouns and with different adverbio-nominal or verbal morphemes are taken into consideration. Before

undertaking an analysis of these constructions, the SDD system of different forms of personal pronouns should briefly be outlined.

2. The system of personal pronouns in SDD may be analysed in terms of two sets, the independent and the dependent forms.

2.1 The independent forms of personal pronouns are relatively free in terms of their character, they may substitute the noun in isolation, in answering a question or whenever a noun which functions as a clause-subject is substituted. That is why these forms are labelled as "formes emphatiques" by Prost (1956, p. 68) or as "modalités personelles absolues" by Tersis (1972, p. 75). If compared with their analogical forms in other Songhay dialects described thus far (i.e. Gao-Songhay, as described by Prost, op. cit. and Dosso-Zarma, as described by Tersis, op. cit.), the SDD set of independent personal pronouns offers the following picture:

SDD	Dosso-Zarma	Gao-Songhay
Singular		
1. *háỳ*	*ááy*	*agey*
2. *níí*	*nîn*	*nii*
3. *ŋà*	*ŋ́gà*	*nga*
Plural		
1. *írì yó*	*írì*	*iri, ir*
2. *ŋ́óò*	*árà*	*war*
3. *ŋàyò*	*ŋ́gày*	*ngi*

2.2 The dependent forms of personal pronouns display more or less the character of bound morphemes: they function as subject pronoun prefixes expressing the categories of person and number of the finite verbal forms. However, these same forms function as so-called possessive pronominal prefixes. As the nomen rectum appears in front of the nomen regens in all Songhay possessive construction, linked to it by a zero marker, one may assume that these possessive prefixes should be considered as merely pronominal possessive attributes. Thus one may compare as structurally identical the similar constructions: *bààbé fúú* (lit. of the father house, father's house)
á bààbé (lit. of me father, my father).

These same pronominal forms also appear, however, also in functions of direct and indirect objects, the former often enclitically merging with the final vowel of the preceding verbal marker, the latter being followed by the indirect object markers. If compared with these same dependent forms of the personal pronouns in the Gao-Songhay and Dosso-Zarma dialects (taken over from the same sources as indicated in par. 2.1), the SDD paradigm offers the following picture:

SDD	Dosso-Zarma	Gao-Songhay
Singular		
1. *á*	*àáy*	*ay/ey*

2. ń (or ŋ́, ḿ, respectively)	ní	ni, n
3. à	à	a
Plural		
1. írí	írì	íri, ir
2. ńóò	árà	war
3. ǹ	ì	i

2.3 A comparison of the entire system of personal pronouns in SDD with those of other Songhay dialects suggests the following preliminary conclusions:

2.31 A certain parallelism of the singular and plural forms of personal pronouns appears especially in the independent set of forms. It is possible that, historically speaking, only one single set of personal pronouns exists, the category of number having been contrasted with the plural marker -yo. Incidentally, this plural marker appears to be identical with the nominal plural marker in SDD, which also displays the form -yo. Cf. bòró man, bòró-yò — men. If this parallelism is proved to be an archaic feature of SDD (and not an analogical innovations), this fact might support the hypothesis of the Nilosaharan affinities of Songhay (see Cyffer, 1981).

2.3.2 A tendency toward monosyllabic shorter forms appears to have developed in the SDD personal pronoun system. Under such conditions, the function of tonal contrasts is much more important, as in several cases they serve as the main distinctive feature: compare the 1st and 3rd person singular dependent form, the 2nd singular and 3rd plural of the same forms, etc.

3. Turning now to the constructions personal pronoun + stabilizer, one can distinguish interesting contrasts and parallels.

3.1 The subject of the constructions with the linking stabilizer no — if substituted by the personal pronoun — is always displayed directly by the independent form of the personal pronouns. This is valid in cases in which the subject immediately precedes the stabilizer, as well as in cases in which a nominal predicate is inserted between them.

E.g.: háỳ Dèndí bòró nò (I Dendi man am),

háỳ nó Dèndí bòró (I am Dendi man).

Similarly, the stabilizer may be used for the topicalisation of any part of the clause (whether it be a noun, a nominal construction, or even a finite verbal form). The topicalised part of the clause or sentence is placed in front of it together with no, thus recalling the emphatic constructions of various IE languages: English — It is X that . . ., French — C'est lui, qui . . .). In all types of constructions with no stabilizer, the linking, equating character is well preserved, whether the no equates parts of a clause or semi-independent clauses. In any case, it seems that the major role of this morpheme is to express the nominative, subjective or topical function of the word or clause standing in the initial position of the whole stabilizing construction.

3.2   The position of the constructions with the stabilizer *gònnó* is much more complicated, but these constructions have unquestionably played a major role in the development of the verbal system of SDD and the Songhay language as a whole.

3.2.1   If this stabilizer is immediately preceded by a personal pronoun, it always displays the dependent form, i.e. the form which functions as a bound, purely grammatical prefix in SDD and in other Songhay dialects as well. Its form and its functions in constructions with the *gònnó* stabilizer appears absolutely identical with those of a subject-pronoun prefix preceding either the verbal stem or its aspect-tense marker. In neutral clauses, such constructions as subject pronoun prefix + stabilizer/ or verb may be preceded by full nominal subject. Thus, we may compare :

Màdínà à gònnó túrúkù (lit. Medina, it is close by),

à gònnó túrúkù (it is close by),

àkpààsí à nà hànší wí (my friend, he killed a dog),

à nà hànší wí (he killed a dog).

As in the case of the finite verbal forms, in constructions with the stabilizers, too, there must be a grammatical agreement of number and person between the nominal subject and its subject-pronoun prefix. Moreover, it should be stressed that :

a) the nominal subject may be substituted by an independent form of the personal pronouns. Thus independent forms of pronouns may occur even in front of this type of stabilizers, providing that these two constituents are separated by the dependent form of the personal pronounn inserted between them.

Example : *níí ŋ gònnó kódírà* (lit. you, you are travelling).

b) in constructions using the 3rd person singular and plural forms, the dependent form of the personal pronoun is facultative, providing the subject is expressed explicitly by a full noun. This sometimes also occurs with the finite verbal forms in the same categories.

Examples :   *ákpéỳ à gònnó húgù* (my chief, he is in the house),
            ákpéỳ gònnó húgù (my chief is in the house),
            ákpààsí à nà hànší wí (my friend, he killed a dog),
            ákpààsí nà hànší wí (my friend killed a dog).

3.2.2   While the inventory of the subject constituents, i.e. those occurring in front of the *gònnó* stabilizers in neutral clauses seems to be limited to nouns and their subsitutes, the inventory of its predicative constituents, which occur in neutral clauses in the positions following the stabilizers, appears different. These may be :

3.2.2.1   verbal stems preceded in SDD usually by the *kó-* prefix.

Examples :   *à gònnó kó ŋwáà* (he is eating),
            írì gònnó kó dírà (we are travelling).

It is interesting to note that Tersis (1981, p. 96) points out that — *kô* is used in Zarma as an affix deriving the nominal from the verbal stem ("nom d'agents — *à nà càbé* — il a montré — *càbékô* — celui qui montre") ;

3.2.2.2   adverbial expressions of a locative (or temporal) character, whether, in their forms, they are closer to the class of nouns or to that of verbs.

Examples: *á káì, à gònnó Zúgù* (my grandfather, he is at Zugu), (lit. he is Zugu),
à kpêì, à gònnó húgù (my chief, he is /in/ the house).

Such adverbial locatives may appear — if stressed — in front of the whole clause, in a topicalised position, either introduced by another stabilizer of the *no* class or without it.[5]

Example: *túúrì dì bánná (nò) hìnnè gònnó* (behind this tree /it is/, the road is),
fúútéé kì nná bóósó gònnó (this box inside /it is/ ashes are).

3.3 The adverbial locative predicate may also be expressed by a demonstrative.

Examples: *kpéì à gònnó ñónwò* (the chief is over there),
kpéì dì gònnó mô ďínné (this chief is in front).

If pressed by the demonstrative *ne* (here), it may even phonetically merge with the final syllable of the stabilizer.

Thus one may hear either *kpéì dì à gònnó né,*
or *kpéì dì à gònnè*
(this chief is here).

3.4 The stabilizer *gònnó* is probably also at the origin of paradigm *gònnǎ*, which is used in SDD in the meaning to have, to be with something.

Example: *á gònnǎ hárí* (I have water).

3.5 All these constructions with the stabilizer preceded by a facultative dependent form of the personal pronoun and/or the nominative subject and followed by different adverbial or verbal predicates are translated into Hausa by means of the Hausa construction *sunàa* ... or *sunàa dà*, respectively (this latter is valid for constructions outlined in par. 3.4). The parallels with these Hausa constructions are manifold: the locative-temporal character of their adverbial constituents, the verbonominal character of their predicative parts (see e.g. the *kó* deverbal nouns in SDD and the verbal nouns following the so-called Hausa *sunàa* subject pronouns) and, last but not least, the possible formal links between the two types of stabilizers.

4. Before taking up possible broader similarities or links of the SDD stabilizers and their constructions with the personal pronouns, we assess their position within the present Songhay language structure, especially in the light of the data known from other Songhay dialects.

4.1 The constructions of the linking stabilizers appear to be relatively similar in most of the Songhay dialects described thus far. Although certain differences exist

---

[5] On the adverbial locative-temporal character of the predicative constituents standing in constructions with such types of stabilizers see the interesting psychological analysis operated by Böhm (1984, p. 54—55 ff.) for Mande and perhaps other languages of West Africa. Though formal markers supporting such psychological postulates may sometimes be absent in the surface language structure, the distinction between grammatical objects and adverbial predicates of time or place can often be proved by transformations. For these or comparable problems of Hausa structure see Zima (1970, p. 219 ff. and 1972, p. 33).

apparently as far a possible distinction between *no* and *ne* (see Prost 1956, p. 74, and Tersis, 1972, p. 96), the form and the basic functions of this linking stabilizer are close, if not identical in most dialects of Songhay. The negative construction *ná čì,* existing in SDD, may be explained in terms of the Gao Songhay *ti* (Prost, 1956, p. 83: "Ti est le verbe copulatif qui marque l'identité de deux termes"). In the Gao dialect the negative forms of this verb are *ši ti* (for the "progressif"), *man ti* (for the perfect) and *ma ši ti* for what Prost calls the "subjonctif". As we have shown elsewhere, the SDD equivalent of man is *ná* (Zima, 1986); this *ná* appears in identical functions in other dialects as well (see Westermann, 1920—1921, p. 192, 200). The positive usage of the verb *ti* (*či*) in SDD is relatively rare.

4.2   The negative absolute stabilizer *šì* in SDD is very likely the dialectal equivalent of the Gao *šì* and even some phonetic *s—š* alternation established earlier (Zima, 1975, p. 318) speaks in favour of this situation, in relation to other dialects.

4.3   On the other hand, the position of the positive stabilizer *gònnó* in relation to its equivalents in other Songhay dialects seems much more complicated.

4.3.1   Both Prost (1956, p. 80 ff.) and Tersis (1972, p. 99) indicate the form *go/gòó* respectively as the absolute stabilizer. Prost calls it a Gao equivalent for the existential verb "to be", together with *bara*, whereas in Tersis's opinion the *gòó* in Zarma may well be considered "le seul réprésentant de sa catégorie comme un existentiel" (similarly in Tersis, 1981, p. 95). The morpheme *gònnó* exists — according to Tersis (1981, p. 93) — also in Zarma, but it functions according to this source, as a formal marker of verbal forms (modalité verbale). In construction with the preceding subject pronoun prefix and the following verbal stem it is used to express "duratif" — *á gònnó kà* — il est venant". (l.c.).

4.3.2   Hence it follows that the *gònnó* morpheme fulfils in Zarma mainly the function of the formal marker fully integrated into the paradigms of verbal forms, while that of the stabilizer is displayed by the *gòó* morpheme. In SDD, on the other hand, the *gònnó* morpheme functions both as the stabilizer (both absolute and locative) and to some extent also as a formal marker. In this latter function, however, it is not yet fully integrated into the paradigm of verbal forms, it functions not in construction with the verbal stem (like other purely verbal markers) but mostly in constructions with deverbal nouns marked by the prefix *kó-*. In a way, the SDD construction subject pronoun prefix + *gònnó* + deverbal noun reflects the well known origin of most "progressive" or "durative" forms, not uncomparable to the well-known English type.

4.3.3   That is why one is tempted to consider the SDD structure as more archaic even in this case, inspite of the fact that the SDD tendency towards a certain monosyllabism favours the hypothesis of the earlier stages of development being expressed in Zarma (which, after all, cannot be altogether disregarded).

4.3.4   In a preliminary way, we presume therefore that the SDD state — the usage of *gònnó* in all functions — represents an earlier state of development of the

Songhay language. The absolute and locative stabilizer (which in its turn may well be historically linked to the *no* stabilizer) has penetrated into the paradigm of the verbal forms via the verbonominal constructions wih the *kó-* prefix. Later, *gònnó* was replaced in its stabilizing functions by *gònnó* as replaced in its stabilizing functions by *gòó* (the tone-pattern of the long vowel may also support such a hypothesis), while if used as a formal marker of verbs it conserved its more archaic full pattern. The morpheme *gònnó* was integrated into the whole set of formal markers used for the finite verbal forms of Songhay and the integration of such constructions into the verbal paradigms was expressed even by the loss of the *kó-*prefix, with the original verbal noun acquiring the regular pattern of the verbal stem of other finite forms. One cannot exclude the possibility that this was not the first case of nominal or verbonominal construction penetrating into the regular verbal paradigms in this language.

4.3.5 Alternatively, the *gònnó* stabilizer is to be analysed — even in the present-day Dendi — as a construction *gòó* + *nò*, i.e. a certain cumulation of the two original stabilizers, a sort of emphatic od 'hypercorrect' stabilizing construction, assuming, however, new and specific functions.

5. The analysis of the stabilizers and their constructions with different forms of personal pronouns in SDD seems to confirm either the relatively archaic character of these dialects within the Songhay language cluster, or a new wave of 'hypercorrect' ways of development of the verbal system in this language. At least to some extent this verbal system has developed from the verbonominal constructions of this language. The analogical development and similarities of Songhay with certain languages of the Niger-Kordofan and Chadic family (see Creissels 1981, Zima 1972) hint that this might not have been an altogether isolated development.

REFERENCES

Bach, E.: *Have and be in English syntax.* Language, *43*, 1967, pp. 462—485.
Böhm, G.: *Elemente des Satzbaus in den Mande-Sprachen und ihre Verbreitung im Sudan.* Wien, Veröffentlichungen des Instituts f. Afrikanistik u, Ägyptologie der Univ. Wien, Nr. 31, 1984.
Brauner, S.: *Lehrbuch des Bambara.* Leipzig, VEB Verlag Enzyklopädie 1974.
Carnochan, J.: *A study of quantity in Hausa.* Bull. School of the Or. and Afr. Studies, Univ. of London, *13*, 1951, pp. 1032—1044.
Carter, H.: *Stabilization in the Manyika dialect of the Shona Group.* Africa (London), *26*, 1956, pp. 398—404.
Creissels, D.: *De la possibilité de rapprochements entre le songhay et les langues Niger-Congo (en particulier Mandé).* In: *Nilo-Saharan.* Eds. Th. C. Schadeberg, M. L. Bender. Dordrecht 1981, pp. 307—327.
Cyffer, N.: *The Person Elements in Saharan Languages: A Step towards the Creation of Proto-Saharan.* In: *Nilo-Saharan.* Eds. Th. C. Schadeberg, M. Lionel Bender. Dordrecht 1981, pp. 185—199.

Levtzion, N.: *Salaga — A Nineteenth Century Trading Town*. In: *Asian and African Studies*, Vol. 2, 1966, pp. 207—244.

Parsons, F. W.: *An Introduction to Gender in Hausa*. African Language Studies *1*, 1960, pp. 117—136.

Prost, A.: *La langue Soñay et ses dialectes*. Dakar, M.I.F.A.N. 1956.

Rouch, J.: *Les Songhay*. Paris, C.N.R.S. 1954.

Tersis, Nicole: *Le Zarma. Etude du parler Djerma de Dosso*. Paris, S.E.L.A.F. 1972.

Tersis, Nicole: *L'aire Songhay-zarma. Le zarma*. In: *Les langues dans le monde ancien et moderne: Afrique subsaharienne*. Eds. J. Perrot et G. Manessy. Paris, C.N.R.S. 1981, pp. 83—89.

Westermann, D.: *Ein Beitrag zur Kenntnis des Zarma-Songhai am Niger*. Zeitschrift für Eingeborenen Sprachen, *11*, 1920—1921, pp. 188—200.

Zima, P.: *Some Problems of Word Order and Grammar in Hausa*. Afrikanische Sprachen u. Kulturen — Ein Querschnitt (Festschrift Johannes Lukas), Hamburg 1971, pp. 217—223.

Zima, P.: *Problems of Categories and Word Classes in Hausa*. Prague, Academia — Dissertationes Orientales 1972, No. 33.

Zima, P.: *Research in the Territorial and Social Stratification of African Languages (Hausa and Songhay)*. Zeitschrift für Phonetik, Sprachwissenschaft u. Kommunikationsforschung, *28*, 1975, pp. 311—323.

Zima, P.: *The Verbal Forms in Southern Dendi Dialects of Songhay*. To appear in Acta Universitatis Carolinae — Philologica, 1986.

STUDIES IN MODERN CHINESE INTELLECTUAL HISTORY.
IV. YOUNG GUO MORUO (1914—1924)

MARIÁN GÁLIK, Bratislava

This is a study of the ideological and intellectual development of Guo Moruo (1892—1978), modern Chinese writer and scholar, during the period of 1914—1924, pointing out his transition from the traditional platform through pantheism to Marxist conviction.

In contemporary Chinese People's Republic, Guo Moruo [1] (1892—1978) is considered as the second most prominent representative of modern Chinese culture, ranking next to Lu Xun [2] (1881—1936). Their young years and fates were in certain respects fairly similar, although as intelectual and artistic types, they differed considerably.

Practically one decade of Guo's intelectual and ideological development with which we intend to acquaint the reader in some detail, took place especially in Japan and only partly in China. An important date in his life was January 14, 1914. That day, at the end of a long "road" which had begun in the southwestern corner of the Szechwan province in the middle China, near the beautiful Mount Omei, one of the most famous in China, through Jiading [3] where he studied at the primary and the middle school, then Chengtu, Tientsin, Peking, Manchurian cities and Korea, he finally reached Japan.[1] He found himself in a totally different world from the one he had been used to in the 21 years of his life. The notion (that might have once prevailed) of the great country in the Far East proudly calling itself the "Middle Kingdom" (*Zhonghua*) [4] being the central point, the carrier of a "sinocentric" world order, had by then lost its lustre in both Japan and China itself.[2] This change in mental outlook in Japan had a longer history. Already back in the Tokugawa era (1603—1867) and quite definitely in the mid-17th century, this notion began to fade and in the course of time came to be totally reversed. Even at that time already the view appeared that as far as observance and presentation of such basic civic virtues as wisdom, humanity and valour are concerned, "Japan greatly excels China in each of

---

[1] Roy, D. T.: *Kuo Mo-jo. The Early Years.* Cambridge (Mass.), Harvard University Press 1971, pp. 7—56.

[2] Fairbank, J. K.: *A Preliminary Framework.* In: Fairbank, J. K. (Ed.): *The Chinese World Order.* Cambridge (Mass.), Harvard University Press 1968, pp. 1—14.

them and undoubtedly merits the name middle kingdom (*chūchō*) far more than China".[3] Later, in the first decades of the 19th century, Hirata Atsutane (1776—1843) claimed that not China, but Japan was the real source of civilization.[4] Leaving aside all superfluous and at the time not solidly substantiated boasting, we see that the opposition "Middle Kingdom vs. barbarians" acquired in this connection a totally different meaning. At least for a time, the Japanese turned the "sinocentric world order" into the opposite "japanocentric world order". It was no more a question of the Japanese being barbarians in the eyes of the Chinese, but the other way round. However, in this mental tergiversation, the Japanese either forgot or deliberately altered a few things. For instance, that initially it was often the Chinese who had contributed in an abundant measure to Japanese westernization, particularly in the area of foreign trade, manufacture and elsewhere. But in time, the Japanese began to catch up with their teachers in every sphere of life, particularly in technology, industrial production, commerce, warfare, and even in culture and soon even outdid them in most of these pursuits.

During the Sino-Japanese War (1894—1895), Japanese "dwarf pirates" defeated the descendants of the ancient legendary Chinese emperors Yao and Shun. The Chinese had been looking for rather too long a time through the distorting prism of their sinocentric view of the world, and even after they had become conscious that the European "ocean devils" were strong and invincible. The events of two years of the Sino-Japanese war opened the eyes of many Chinese intellectuals. Megalomanic delusions in many of them gave way to feelings of shame of their own weakness. The necessary reforms were attempted — which, however, were never reinforced — with the 1898 movement known as the Hundred Days Reform which entered history as a presage of the great changes that took place in China in the early years of the 20th century. Many intellectuals expressed wonder at Japanese successes. That was a time when the Island Empire began to show signs of sympathy towards Chinese reformers or revolutionaries, fighters against the despotism of the foreign Manchus, a readiness to help in educating Chinese professionals for the most diverse branches in politics, economics, military art, science and culture, but simultaneously also expressions of ruthless aggression, of a barbaric exploitation, political violence, brutality and the like.

Between 1900 and 1937, far more Chinese students pursued their education in Japan than in other advanced countries of Europe or America. On the basis of fairly exact data and probable estimates, Y. C. Wang gives the number at over 34

---

[3] Harootunian, H. D.: *The Functions of China in Tokugawa Thought.* In: Iriye, Akira (Ed.): *The Chinese and the Japanese. Essays in Political and Cultural Interactions.* Princeton, New Jersey, Princeton University Press 1980, p. 14.

[4] Ibid., p. 26.

thousand.[5] Chinese students chose Japan for several reasons. A very important factor in the selection was the geographical proximity, the lower charges for studies than in other foreign countries, the hieroglyphic (although not linguistic) relatedness of Chinese with Japanese and the opportunity of a political refuge. Guo Moruo who had for whole years longed to go out into the wide world from the narrow and conservative circle of his native town Shawan and his province, took without hesitation, the first opportunity. This came his way more or less fortuitously when a certain Zhang Ciyu [5], a former classmate and colleague of his eldest brother Guo Kaiwen [6], took him along to Japan. Kaiwen was able to help him out financially for half a year only, and Moruo had to prepare himself during that short time for the prescribed language examination which normally required two years.[6]

1

The extraordinarily gifted Guo Moruo successfully passed the entrance examination to one of the middle schools in Tokyo in June 1914.[7] If it is true that none of the Chinese students had done it before him, he could be proud of his feat, although he had gone through a certain linguistic preparation back in China; we know that he learned Japanese in 1908 at the middle school at Jiading.[8] The school at which Guo Moruo sat for his language examination was the First Higher School and there he spent one year in a special course, apt to prepare him to be capable of following up the middle school curriculum along with Japanese students.[9]

Precisely during this scholastic year 1914—1915, at a time when World War I raged in distant Europe and the Japanese Government presented the Chinese Government of President Yuan Shikai [7] (1859—1916) with the humiliating Twenty-One Demands which, when accepted, would mean the Japanese colonization of Manchuria, Inner Mongolia, Shantung, China's southeast coast, the Yangtze Valley, and an economic and administrative control of a whole Chinese territory, Guo Moruo attended lectures by the Buddhist scholar Gui Xinggu [8] on *Dacheng qixin lun* [9] *Aśvaghosha's Discourse on the Awakening of Faith in the Mahāyāna*, one of the fundamental texts of the Weishi [10] Consciousness-Only, otherwise Faxiang [11] Characteristics of the Dharmas, Yogācāra or Dharmalakṣaṇa.[10] In one

[5] Wang, Y. C.: *Chinese Intellectuals and the West, 1872—1949.* Chapel Hill, The University of North Carolina Press 1966, p. 119.

[6] Ibid., p. 116.

[7] Roy, D.T.: op. cit., p. 56.

[8] Loc. cit.

[9] Ibid., p. 57.

[10] Ibid., p. 58.

of the preceding studies of this cycle, we dealt with the question of the impact of Consciousness-Only in connection with the intellectual development of Qu Qiubai [12] (1899—1935) where we also attempted to present a concise characteristic of this teaching.[11] Here it will perhaps suffice for our purpose to remark that this very sophisticated and highly speculative philosophical teaching derives from the thesis that "the external world is but a fabrication of our consciousness, that the external world does not exist, that the internal ideation (i.e. consciousness, M.G.) presents an appearance as if it were an outer world. The entire external world is therefore an illusion".[12]

This teaching which Guo evidently admired, but did not quite believe, was no obstacle to his anarchistic protest. He made at least one that fateful year, and this on May 7th, 1915 when he wrote a poem in which he expressed his readiness to fight (or to die) for his country.[13] Together with several of his friends he returned to Shanghai, but there was no fighting, for in the meantime Yuan Shikai had accepted in part the Japanese demands and after three days, Guo returned to Tokyo.[14]

Jiang Baili [16] (1882—1938), one of the founders of the Wenxue yanjiuhui [17] Literary Association in 1920 and a close collaborator of Liang Qichao [18] (1873—1929), in his book *Ouzhou wenyi fuxing shidai shi* [19] History of the Renaissance in Europe, wrote the following sentences, which seemed absolutely true in the second half of the 20s of our century: "The dawn of modern European history came from two great waves of (light): one, the revival of Greek thought, which was the 'Renaissance', and the other, the resurgence of primitive Christianity, which was the 'Reformation'. Our country's new turning point hereafter should also develop from two directions: one, the emotional, which (involves) a new literature and new art, and the other, the rational, which (involves) a new Buddhism."[15] The subsequent evolution ran in a different direction and the two sources represented Marxism and Confucianism, despite numerous endeavours to show something different insofar as the latter was concerned.

Guo Moruo's interest in Buddhism at that time might have been incidental in some measure, but certainly corresponded to his inner needs. As a young boy at Jiading (he was then 14), Guo smashed statues of "deities who govern conception and

---

[11] Gálik, M.: *Studies in Modern Chinese Intellectual History. II. Young Ch'ü Ch'iu-pai (1915—1922).* In: *Asian and African Studies,* Vol. XII, 1976, pp. 92—95, 102—103.

[12] Ch'en K.: *Buddhism in China. A Historical Survey.* Princeton, New Jersey, Princeton University Press 1964, p. 321.

[13] The poem is reprinted in Gu Fulin [13]: *Guo Moruo shijieguan zhongde fanshenlun wenti* [14] The Problems of Pantheism in Guo Moruo's *Weltanschauung,* Wenxue pinglun congkan [15] Series of the Literary Review, *8,* 1981, p. 9.

[14] Roy, D. T.: op. cit., p. 59.

[15] Liang Ch'i-ch'ao: *Intellectual Trends in the Ch'ing Period.* Second Printing. Cambridge (Mass.), Harvard University Press 1970, p. 117.

fertility"[16] and expressed his contempt by urinating on the shards. Naturally there is an enormous difference between superstitious forms of Buddhism and the teaching of Consciousness-Only. As one of the phenomena of subjective idealism, it belongs among the most elaborated systems (in the sense of speculative reflection) in world philosophy.

Interest in a study of the Consciousness-Only had of course originated long before the year 1915. Many of the New Text scholars from the end of the Qing dynasty, e.g. Kang Youwei [20] (1858—1927) and Liang Qichao and their followers, had studied Buddhism and before them such great scholars as Gong Zizhen [21] (1792—1841) or Wei Yuan [22] (1794—1856).[17]

Quo was interested in Buddhism not solely because it was in the vogue, or because it was originally an Indian philosophy whose teachings had become close to the Chinese. The Consciousness-Only embodies one trait that closely links this essentially foreign, Indian teaching with the home Taoist doctrine as we know it from the book ascribed, at least in part, to the philosopher Zhuangzi [23] (3rd cent. B.C.). This relates to dream as a philosophical category and dreamness (or dream-likeness) as a form of human, natural and cosmic existence. The core of the Consciousness-Only philosophy is embodied in a brief formula by the Indian Vasubandhu (4th or 5th cent. A.D.) whis is rendered in Chinese as: *"Yiqie weishi"* [24],[18] which translated, means: "All is only consciousness". Consciousness (but likewise "ideation" as this term is occasionally translated) is not the most correct word. It also comprises a certain form of "unconsciousness", although different from that which S. Freud discovered for metapsychology. In the original, it is termed *ālaya-vijñāna* (storehouse consciousness) and from it "there evolve what to us seem to be external phenomena".[19] In this consciousness are the "seeds" *(bijās) (zhongzi)* [25] of all phenomena which are continously producing external phenomena.

We have referred to the principal similarity between Zhuangzi and Consciousness-Only Schools elsewhere.[20] But there exist several more of them and, so far as we are aware, nobody has as yet undertaken a comparative study that would help to elucidate them in more detail. We shall draw attention to at least one of them here. Zhuangzi, in the second chapter of the book, relates a short anecdote with a deep philosophical message: "Once Chuang Chou (Zhuangzi's name, M.G.) dreamt he

---

[16] Roy. D. T.: op. cit., p. 24.

[17] Liang Ch'i-ch'ao: op. cit., pp. 115—118.

[18] *Ch'eng Wei-shin-lun. Doctrine of Mere-Consciousness.* Hong Kong, The Ch'eng Wei-shih-lun Publication Committee 1973, p. cxxx.

[19] D. Bodde's explanation in Fung Yu-lan: *A History of Chinese Philosophy.* Vol. 2. Princeton, Princeton University Press 1953, p. 304.

[20] Gálik, M.: *Studies in Modern Chinese Intellectual History. II. Young Ch'ü Ch'iu-pai, 1915—1922,* p. 102.

was a butterfly flitting and fluttering around, happy with himself and doing as he pleased. He didn't know he was Chuang Chou. Suddenly he woke up and there he was, solid and unmistakable Chuang Chou. But he did not know if he was the Chuang Chou who had dreamt he was a butterfly, or a butterfly dreaming he was Chuang Chou. Between Chuang Chou and butterfly there must be some distinction. This is called the Transformation of Things".[21]

Philosophers of the Consciousness-Only School presented no poetic events but endeavoured to prove their assertions. One of the commentaries on the principal work of this school Cheng weishi lun [27] Doctrine of Consciousness-Only contained, among others, also the following passage: ". . . when, for example, it is dreamed that here is sexual intercourse between two persons, although the objects (of this dream) are unreal, they yet function so that (the dreamer), if a man, loses semen, and if a woman, loses blood".[22]

"Dreamness" in the first case helps the Chinese Taoist philosopher to explain the thesis, that "although in ordinary appearance there are differences between things, in delusions or in dreams one thing can also be another. 'The transformation of things' proves that the differences among things are not absolute".[23] In the second case, "dreamness" has quite a different purpose. Instead of a relativity of things, values and views, it is here stated fairly rigorously and dogmatically that "although there are no real objects apart from consiousness, yet the principle that unrealities can function (e.g. loss of semen, M.G.) is established."[24]

We have no means of knowing if, and to what extent the teaching of Consciousness-Only made an impression on Guo Moruo. If it did, then it was thanks primarily to his reading of the book Zhuangzi which he came to like in 1912. It is not without interest to note that the only quotation from it which he used in the description of an event from that period (his marriage to his first wife) comes from the beginning ot the chapter carrying the anecdote about the butterfly. In the words of Nanguo Ziqi [28], with whom Guo had identified himself to a certain extent, we find the following statements, perhaps the most remarkable ever to have been formulated by native Chinese philosophy and literature: "What is acceptable we call acceptable; what is unacceptable we call unacceptable. A road is made by people walking on it; things are so because they are called so. What makes them so? Making them so makes them so. What makes them not so? Making them not so makes them not so. Things all must have that which is so; things all must have that which is acceptable. There is

---

[21] The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu. Translated by B. Watson. New York—London, Columbia University Press 1968, p. 49 and Zhuangzi yinde [26] A Concordance to Chuang Tzu, Peking 1947, p. 7.

[22] Quoted according to Fung Yu-lan: A History of Chinese Philosophy. Vol. 2, p. 323.

[23] Fung Yu-lan: Chuang Tzu. A New Selected Translation with an Exposition of the Philosophy of Kuo Hsiang, Shanghai 1933, p. 64.

[24] Fung Yu-lan: A History of Chinese Philosophy. Vol. 2, p. 323.

nothing that is not so, nothing that is not acceptable. For this reason, whether you point to a little stalk or a great pillar, a leper or the beautiful Hsi-shih, things ribald and shady or things grotesque and strange, the Way makes them all into one."[25] Hsi-shih (Xishi) [29] was a famous beauty of old times and Guo's fiancée and young wife was ugly, uneducated, backward, he called her "Black Cat" and probably never "knew" her.[26] We might be surprised that he did not protest against his parents' will (for, of course, they had arranged this marriage), but his acquiescence certainly stemmed from his reading of Zhuangzi.

A closer examination of the most fundamental poetic-philosophical "stanza" of the Consciousness-Only will reveal the thesis, that "all is only consciousness" is preceded by three lines that run as follows:

The various consciousnesses manifest themselves in two divisions:
Perception and the object of perception.
Because of this, Ātman and dharmas do not exist
Therefore *all is only consciousness.*[27]

Ātman here stands for *wo* [30] ego and *dharmas (fa)* [31] for external things outside ego. Guo Moruo, as one of the most prominent representatives of modern Chinese individualism, could in no way recognize either the one or the other as long as their objective existence was denied, i.e. *wo fa fei bie shi you* [32], ego and external things are not real entities.[28] If shortly after that, sometime towards the end of summer 1915, he wished to become a Buddhist monk this had other reasons. It was a severe neurasthenia which he had brought on himself through his very arduous studies for one and a half years. His psychic tension was accompanied with sleeplessness, nightmares, headaches and giddiness.[29] He had no recourse to Consciousness-Only, nor to any other Buddhist teaching for his mental remedy, but reached out for his own memories. One of his first teachers at Jiading in 1906 had been Yi Shuhui [33], nicknamed Tiger, who was a believer in the teaching of Wang Yangming [34] (1472—1529).[30] In mid-September 1915, on passing into the Sixth Higher School at Okayama, Guo bought *Wang Wencheng gong quanshu* [35] The Complete Works of Wang Yangming. This work, compiled by Xie Tingjie in 1572, is the basic source for the study of Wang Yangming's life and work comprising his philosophical and prose writings, letters, poetry and miscellanea. He read ten pages daily, practised the technique of contemplative sitting *(jingzuo)* [36] twice a day for half an hour,

---

[25] *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu*, pp. 40—41 and Concordance to Chuang Tzu, p. 4.

[26] Roy, D. T.: op. cit., pp. 44—45.

[27] Cf. *Ch'eng Wei-shih-lun*, pp. cxxx—cxxxiii.

[28] Ibid., pp. 502—503.

[29] Roy, D. T.: op. cit., pp. 59—60.

[30] Ibid., p. 23.

pondering over the contents of the book and trying to calm down his own disturbed mind.[31]

If Vasubandhu with his teaching of panconscientialism failed to satisfy Guo Moruo, Wang Yangming with his pansubstantialism proved to be a congenial philosopher who became to him a bridge spanning the values of the old Chinese and Indian philosophy, but leading him also to a knowledge of European teachings, especially of modern age: he again read, and now with a deeper understanding Zhuangzi, Laozi [39] (4th cent. B.C.), Confucius (551—479 B.C.), and became acquainted with Upaniṣads, B. Spinoza and J. W. Goethe.[32]

In June 1924, in the article Wang Yangming — Revivalist of the Confucian Spirit, Guo Moruo recollected the period of his admiration for the ideas and deeds of this remarkable philosopher and political personality. Starting from his own principal socio-moral postulate, i.e. a free development of personality, he saw his own predecessor in Wang Yangming. According to his explication, the meaning of life for Wang did not reside in a conception of impermanence *(anitya)*, i. e. that life's phenomena, their existence, process of their becoming and their ceasing to be, are never resting for a moment, nor in suffering *(duḥkha)*, but in life he saw a "struggle" with diseases and with death.[33] His fighting spirit was not to be satisfied with escapist Taoist teachings, nor pessimistic Buddhist doctrines, but with humanistic Confucian thoughts, particularly his fundamental premise of a "single substance of Heaven, Earth and all things",[34] which allegedly was preached by the founder of Confucianism, and the faith stemming from it, in a self-aggrandizement *(ziwo zhi kuangchong)* [42].[35] But Confucius taught neither the one nor the other. As to Wang Yangming, he taught the former, but not the latter. True, Confucius in conversation with his pupil Zengzi [43] said that there is "one" which runs through his teachings; however, scientifically we might argue *ad infinitum* about what that "one" is.[36] In Wang Yangming, the idea of "all in one", or for the "unity of all things" *(wanwu yiti)* [44],[37] is truly the base of his world outlook and his other idea "mind and essence of things are the same" *(xin ji li)* [45][38] is only a more graphic example of this

---

[31] Cf. Guo Moruo: *Rujiao jingshen zhi fuhuozhe Wang Yangming* [37] Wang Yangming — Revivalist of the Confucian Spirit. In: Guo Moruo: *Wenyi lunji* [38] Studies in Literature and Art. 4th Printing, Shanghai 1929, pp. 79—80. Henceforth only Wang Yangming.

[32] Ibid., pp. 80—81 and Guo Moruo: *Chuangzao shi nian* [40] Ten Years of Creation. In: Moruo wenji [41] The Collected Works of Guo Moruo. Vol. 7. Peking 1958, pp. 58.

[33] Guo Moruo: Wang Yang-ming, p. 85.

[34] Ibid., p. 86.

[35] Ibid., pp. 86—87.

[36] *Lunyu*, IV, 15. Cf. Legge, J.: *The Chinese Classics.* Vols. 1 and 2, Taipei 1969, p. 169.

[37] Cf. Guo Moruo: Wang Yangming, pp. 89—92 and Ching, J.: *To Acquire Wisdom. The Way of Wang Yang-ming.* New York—London, Columbia University Press 1976, pp. 126—128.

[38] Cf. Guo Moruo: Wang Yangming, loc. cit. and Ching, J.: op. cit., pp. 57—61.

relationship, especially that between man and the cosmos. However, Wang Yang-ming was not the individualist that Guo Moruo thought him to be. For one thing, this was a concept unknown in old China, although some of his followers tended towards it;[39] it was practically impossible in old China and extremely heretical towards the prevailing Confucian ideology. Every major measure of individualism was liable to disrupt the premise concerning the unity of the mind and essence of all things and would be in the way of reinforcement of the so-called heavenly virtue *(tianli)* [46] of the mind and of removing its (i.e. mind's) selfish desires *(renyu)* [47].[40] In addition, it might have far-reaching effects for social order, even endangering its existence. In the premise "mind and essence of things are the same", Guo Moruo underlined especially that "sameness" and considered it as the prime cause of the cosmos identifying it with Heaven *(Tian)* [48], Way *(Dao)* [49] and Substance *(benti)* [50], as the existence of something that is in motion; all things are its expression, its processual objectivization *(dongtai)* [51].[41]

Guo Moruo was under the impression that through Wang Yangming he had arrived at a comprehension of old Chinese philosophy of Zhuangzi and Laozi. How he grasped the philosophy of the former, he does not state in the article under study. As to the latter, he remarked that it leads to "selfishness" *(lijizhuyi)* [52].[42] His admiration for Wang Yangming's social activism prompted in him a critical attitude towards Laozi's social quietism. He did not submit Laozi's teaching to a scientifically objective investigation, but made his inferences partially only from his statements and subjectively supplemented them. Laozi certainly did not belong among those who would have defended selfishness as a way of self-realization in life. He rather propagated selflessness when at one place of his famous work he wrote regarding the relation that men ought mutually to entertain, how they ought to envisage knowledge, yearnings and what qualities they should have: "Let them have selflessness *(shaosi)* [53] and fewness of desires *(gua yu)* [54]".[43]

Judging from his somewhat earlier study of May 1923 entitled *Zhongguo wenhua zhi chuantong jingshen* [55] Traditional Spirit of Chinese Culture, Guo had held a more correct view of Laozi, and his antireligious teaching — in relation to other and earlier ones from the times of the first three Chinese dynasties (Xia, Shang and Zhou) — was more sympathetic to him: "After the rooster's mighty crow", he wrote

---

[39] de Bary, Wm. Th.: *Individualism and Humanitarianism in Late Ming Thought.* In: de Bary, Wm. Th. (Ed.): *Self and Society in Ming Thought.* New York—London, Columbia University Press 1970, pp. 145—247.

[40] Übelhör, M.: *Das kosmische Ordnungsprinzip* (t'ien-li) *und die persönliche Wünsche* (jen yü). Oriens Extremus, 27, 1980, 1, pp. 25—32.

[41] Guo Moruo: Wang Yangming, pp. 89—90.

[42] Ibid., p. 85.

[43] Cf. Waley, A.: *The Way and Its Power.* London, George Allen and Unwin Ltd. 1934, p. 46.

much in a poetic vein, "the revolutionary thinker Laozi rose like the sun. He completely destroyed the prejudices of three dynasties, cursed the moral philosophies of other teachings, plucked out of them the conceptions of the human and the divine and replaced them with the category of *'Dao'*. He said: *'Dao'* was of itself in the chaos before Heaven and Earth, the eye cannot see it, nor the ear hear it, it is transcending, unnamable, as if 'nonexisting' and yet without it, there is nothing that is. This *'Dao'* is the essence of the universe".[44] In Laozi's teaching and epoch, Guo literally saw a "Renaissance of Chinese history of philosophy", an attack on the heteronomic ethics and religious prejudices of past times as a consequence of the demand for "liberation of personality" *(jiefang gexing)* [56] and a return to the so-called national spirit and free thinking from the times before the Three Dynasties.[45] Of course, he did not say what he had in mind thereby. The fact is that we do not know nor can we judge even on the basis of the most recent knowledge, what was the character of thinking of that period. Guo's high opinion of Laozi, although often wrongly formulated, led him to turn to this philosopher also in solving some fundamental problems in his own view of the world. Laozi's attitudes hardened him both in atheism, in a realistic view of live (existence is an expression of the real) and in his conviction that the outcome of all human acting and evidently also its goal (or at least one of them) is "self-perfection" *(ziwo wancheng)* [57].[46]

2

According to Guo Moruo, these last two traits of Laozi's *Weltanschauung* were also proper to Confucius, only instead of atheism, he found pantheism in Confucius's teaching. Neither before the May Fourth Movement in 1919, nor in the years immediately after it, did he join scholars who considered *Lunyu* [58] *Analects* as the only reliable source of Confucius's teaching. He was probably ignorant of the old writings by Ouyang Xiu [59] (1017—1072), or Cui Shu [60] (1740—1816), as also of those by the majority of serious scholars of the present times;[47] it is likewise possible that he was impressed by the numerous works of the New Text School which, for some reasons, refused to see in Confucius only a historical personage of the 6th and 5th century B.C., but looked at him as a great philosopher belonging to all the epochs of Chinese history, and even a universal figure of a great sage and teacher.[48] Guo

[44] Guo Moruo: *Zhongguo wenhua zhi chuantong jingshen* [55] The Traditional Spirit of Chinese Culture. In: *Studies in Literature and Art*, p. 4.
[45] Ibid., p. 5.
[46] Ibid., p. 13.
[47] Cf. Fung Yu-lan: *A History of Chinese Philosophy*. Vol. 1. Princeton, Princeton University Press 1952, p. 381.
[48] Kam Louie: *Critiques of Confucius in Contemporary China*. Hong Kong, The Chinese Univer-

Moruo explained the main principles of Confucius's teaching in relation to Laozi and the book *Yijing* [61] *The Book of Changes,* its appendices known as *Ten Wings (Shi yi)* [62], traditionally attributed to Confucius, but probably written by his followers during the first part of the Former Han dynasty.[49] This interest in arguments *per se* is not surprising. The authors (or author?) of the appendices were well acquainted with the philosophy of Laozi. In the article under study on the traditional spirit of Chinese culture, Moruo quotes a passage from *Yijing,* in which a similarity between "Confucius"[50] and Laozi is particularly evident. Here, we shall reproduce also sentences that do not appear in his text but that we deem necessary to the reader for a better understanding:

"One *yin* and one *yang* constitute what is called *Tao.* That which is perpetuated by it is good *(shan)* [63]. That which is completed by it is the individual nature *(hsing)* [64]. The benevolent see it and call it benevolence *(jen)* [65]. The wise see it and call it wisdom. The common people use it daily, yet without realizing it. Thus the Superior Man's *Tao* (is seen by) few. It is manifested in acts of benevolence, and lies stored up in things of utility. It drums all things onward, without having the same anxieties thereon that possess the Sage. Complete is the abundance of its Power *(Te)* [66] and the greatness of its achievement! Richly possessing it is what is meant by 'the greatness of its achievement'. The daily renewing it is what is meant by 'the abundance of its Power'."[51]

In connection with the principles of *yin* [67] passive or female and *yang* [68] active or male, *Dao* is reminiscent of Laozi's formal assertions in Chapter 42 of this book: "*Tao* produced Oneness, Oneness produced duality. Duality evolved into trinity, and trinity evolved into ten thousand things. The ten thousand things support the *yin* and embrace the *yang*".[52]

Guo Moruo, having before his eyes these two quotations, probably hit on the idea of a unity of substance which in both passages is termed *Dao* and is connected with the principle *ying* and *yang,* on the one hand, and on the other, is called *yi* (change), in "Confucius" and is characterized as consecutive (temporally) or adjacent (spatially) changes in a relatively unlimited cycle of existence: "Change is that which

sity Press 1980, pp. 3—4. The life and work of Confucius, also on the basis of Chinese studies from the 1920s and 1930s is delineated and analysed in H. G. Creel's book *Confucius, the Man and the Myth,* New York, John Day 1949. Cf. also Staiger, B.: *Das Konfuzius-Bild im kommunistischen Chinas.* Wiesbaden, Otto Harrassowitz 1969, pp. 23—25.

[49] Fung Yu-lan: *A History of Chinese Philosophy.* Vol. 1, pp. 379—381.

[50] Guo Moruo: The Traditional Spirit of Chinese Culture, p. 7. "Confucius" is meant here as the image broadly conceived on the basis of the works he has never written or edited.

[51] Fung Yu-lan: *A History of Chinese Philosophy.* Vol. 1, p. 384.

[52] Ibid., pp. 383—384. The original text see in *Laozi Daodejing xiapian* [69]. SPPY ed. Taipei 1966, p. 5A.

is reproducing itself in the life phenomenon. . . That which cannot be fathomed in the terms of *yin* and *yang* is called spirit *(shen)* [70]".[53]

Along with change, as may have just been observed, also "spirit" is here characterized as part of being, existence, but unapprehensible by rational or emotional cognition. According to Guo, this "spirit" — in Christian or Moslem pantheism the pendant of God, is a lawgiver, is an expression of the unique substance of the universe, although rationally and emotionally inexplicable. "Confucius" allegedly knew and understood substance as identical with "spirit". Substance develops in the sense of "good", although it is not any conscious development of the "spirit"; it is due to inevitability as an attribute of the substance.[54]

"Spirit" or "god" is here understood in a different sense from that usually meant in Chinese philosophy or religion, where this meaning included souls of the dead or supernatural beings.[55] "Spirit" in this context expressed the "unfathomable force beyond all transformations",[56] perhaps that "Oneness" which *Dao* implies within itself, i.e. Way. According to Guo Moruo, *Dao* and Change are equivalent concepts, two synonyms for the same substance.[57] The same relates also to the concept of "spirit" in the sense it has just been explained from *The Book of Changes.* Guo Moruo does nothing but "infers" his "Confucius" when he atrributes him the view that "substance is spirit"[58] and explains him within the sphere of his apprehension not only of the *Weltanschauung,* but also of the history of philosophy when he writes that "in Confucius we may see a Pantheist".[59]

Although Guo Moruo evidently considered Zhuangzi to have been the greatest, or at least the most remarkable among Chinese pantheists, he wrote very little about it. This philosopher is mentioned more frequently only in his study *Hui Shide xingge ji qi sixiang* [71] The Temperament and Philosophy of Hui Shi and this in connection with the tenth paradox of Hui Shi: "Love ten thousand things; Heaven and Earth are of the same substance *(yi ti)* [72]".[60] Although probably none among known translators of Zhuangzi has rendered this paradox in this mode, according to Guo Moruo it expresses the preeminent pantheistic idea and central also in Zhuangzi's philosophical system. He devotes at least as much space to this paradox as to the

---

[53] Quoted according to Guo Moruo: The Traditional Spirit of Chinese Culture, p. 7.

[54] Loc. cit.

[55] *A Source Book in Chinese Philosophy.* Transl. and comp. by Wing-tsit Chan. Princeton, New Jersey, Princeton University Press 1963, pp. 789—790.

[56] Chan Wing-tsit: op. cit., p. 266.

[57] Guo Moruo: The Traditional Spirit of Chinese Culture, p. 6.

[58] Loc. cit.

[59] Ibid., pp. 7—8.

[60] Guo Moruo: Studies in Literature and Art, pp 71—74. Later in 1938 he wrote about Zhuangzi a few sentences more in Chuangzao shi nian xupian [73] Ten Years of Creation Continued. In: The Collected Works of Guo Moruo. Vol. 7, p. 186.

remaining nine. It seems to him to be the basis of Zhuangzi's Taoist *Weltanschauung*, although it belonged to a philosopher of a different school. In Chapter Two of Zhuangzi's book from which we have already quoted above, we read: "There is nothing in the world bigger than the tip of an autumn hair, and Mount T'ai is tiny. No one has lived longer than a dead child, and P'eng-tsu died young. Heaven and Earth were born at the same time I was, and the ten thousand things are one with me".[61] Guo would undoubtedly translate the end of the last sentence otherwise than B. Watson, for immediately after the quotation he adds: "That is, of course, equivalent to saying that Heaven and Earth and ten thousand things are made of one substance".[62] This substance is nothing else but *Dao*, this time supplemented with this passage from Chapter Six of the book *Zhuangzi*: "The Way has its reality and its signs but is without action or form; you can hand it down but you cannot receive it; you can get it but you cannot see it. It is its own source, its own root! Before Heaven and Earth existed it was there, firm from ancient times. It gave spirituality to the spirits and to God; it gave birth to Heaven and to Earth. It exists beyond Great Ultimate *(Tai ji)* [74] and yet you cannot call it lofty; it exists beneath the six limits of space *(liu ji)* [75] and yet you cannot call it deep. It was born before Heaven and Earth, and yet you cannot say it has been there for long; it is earlier than the earliest time, and yet you cannot call it old."[63]

In view of all these statements, Guo understands *Dao* as a substance of all that exists, its temporal and spatial expression, yet transcending both these aspects and, as far as form is concerned, tends towards Zhuangzian, however, as regards content, then towards a pantheistic confession which forms an extended basis of this *Weltanschauung* of that time: "Ten thousand things are the representation *(biaoxiang)* [76] of the Way. Substance and phenomena are one, I am nothing else but the Way — substance. Substance does not become extinct, neither will I; substance is inexhaustible, hence, I too am inexhaustible. Therefore, from the visual angle of time, I can say: I was born simultaneously with Heaven and Earth. From the aspect of space, I can state: ten thousand things and I, we form one substance."[64]

3

The above sentences, together with the statement from *Shaonian Weite zhi fannao xuyin* [77] A Preface to the Sorrows of Young Werther: "I am God (shen), the whole

---

[61] *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu*, p. 43 and A Concordance to Chuang Tzu, p. 5.

[62] Guo Moruo: The Temperament and Philosophy of Hui Shi. In: *Studies in Literature and Art*, p. 72.

[63] Cf. loc. cit., *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu*, p. 81 and A Concordance to Chuang Tzu, p. 16.

[64] Guo Moruo: The Temperament and Philosophy of Hui Shi, p. 73.

nature is my expression *(biaoxian)* [78]",[65] are all striking confessions of a pantheist outlook on the world.

In Guo's overall philosophical conviction, however, they had a history of some years and do not relate solely directly to Zhuangzi or to B. Spinoza. Guo looked for their roots also in ancient Greek and Indian philosophies and of course also in modern European philosophy. He saw them already in Thales and his water, in Heraclitus and his fire, in Democritus and his atoms; also in the water of the *Ṛg-Veda*, in brahman of the Upaniṣads and in the atomic theory *(paramānuh)* in the philosophy of the Vaiśeṣika school.[66]

As to philosophical teachings of foreign origin, he was first interested (about the years 1915—1916) in Indian pantheism of Kabir (ca 1440—1518)[67] and then in Upaniṣads (between 1000—300 B.C.).[68] He had probably read *One Hundred Poems of Kabir* in Rabindranath Tagore's translation, together with long *Introduction*.[69] He liked Kabir as a poet (we may surmise this from the fact that he ranked him among three world pantheists whom he esteemed),[70] but not as a philosopher, for he did not agree with his excessive religious mysticism, nor with his apprehension of the relation brahman-ātman which presumed a difference and not a substantially conditioned identity between them as the God or the Absolute and the self or the ego.[71] When subsequently Guo reached out for the source or mediated study of the Upaniṣads, he was enormously impressed by the conception of the self, the emphasis on the significance of self in the whole thinking of the Upaniṣads, as a philosophical and cosmic category, as a universal subject and simultaneously also object: "I indeed am this whole universe *(Aham eva idam survo'smi)*,[72] but also the conviction that Ātman "is the presupposition of both self and not-self."[73] Brahman as a cosmic and objective principle was probably only a secondary object of his interest; however, he was attracted to it by the thesis on the identity of brahman and ātman.

This knowledge and recognition of identity of our innermost individual being and the universal nature and its phenomena (and of course Chinese Taoist philosophers) were the fountainhead of Guo's respect and admiration for nature, the universe, the

---

[65] Guo Moruo: A Preface to The Sorrows of Young Werther. In: *Studies in Literature and Art*, p. 341.

[66] Guo Moruo: Studies in Literature and Art, pp. 2 and 71—72.

[67] Roy, D. T.: op. cit., pp. 66—67.

[68] Loc. cit.

[69] Loc. cit. *Introduction* to the translation was written by E. Underhill. See *One Hundred Poems of Kabir*. London, Macmillan and Co. Reprinted 1954, pp. v—xliv.

[70] Guo Moruo: *San fanshenlunzhe* [79] Three Pantheists. In: *Nushen* [80] *The Goddesses*. 8th Printing. Shanghai 1928, pp. 103—104. This collection was originally published in 1921.

[71] Cf. Underhill, E.: *Introduction*, pp. xiv—xv, xx—xxi and especially xxviii—xxix.

[72] Radhakrishnan, S.: *Indian Philosophy*. Vol. 1. New York, The Macmillan Co. 1951, p. 158.

[73] Ibid., p. 159.

sun, the starry firmament, for individual phenomena of life and for man's great works.[74] Upaniṣadian "that are thou" *(tat twam asi)*[75] pervaded the universe and ten thousand things around him as salt the water in seas and oceans, and during a certain time, particularly that of the May Fourth Movement, delight, bliss or active enjoyment *(ānanda),* the state of human and cosmic reality which in the philosophy of the Upaniṣads is linked with a knowledge of the relation between brahman and ātman, could clearly be observed in many of his optimistically tuned and stylistically exalted works.[76] Elsewhere we have shown how he modelled his own new world, his new solar universe, sang the praises of energy, light, heat and life of the new cosmos.[77] Of course, in its modelling, he did not adhere uniquely to the teaching of Upaniṣads; the springs of his inspiration were many and reached from Chinese, Asian Minor, Egyptian, Jewish and Greek notions, myths, literature, up to W. Whitman and his knowledge of astronomy and physics, up to about 1920. He unified their pantheistic *Weltanschauung,* atheistic-pantheistic mode of looking at the world proper and typical of him, which differed from all other "pantheisms" with which he took contact.

A very favourable influence on Guo Moruo's *Weltanschauung* of that time and on his creative or translation efforts, was exercised by the poetic, prosaic, dramatic, theoretical or memoir works of J. W. Goethe. He had met with his *Dichtung und Wahrheit* already in the year 1917—1918 in the last year at the Sixth Higher School at Okayama where this text was prescribed for study as compulsory reading.[78] Of Goethe's creative works, the most significant were his *Faust* and *The Sorrows of Young Werther.*

Perhaps a few words on the background of these works will not be out of place here. Before writing *The Sorrows of Young Werther* (1774) and *Faust,* Goethe had gone over a relatively long developmental road in the domain of philosophy. Among his precursors, M. Loesche counts (we shall not mention them all) Heraclitus, Anaxagoras, Empedocles, Plotinus, Roger and Francis Bacon, European mediaeval mystics, Hobbes, Descartes and particularly Spinoza.[79] Goethe focused his attention on Spinoza's philosophy at the time when secretly preparing to write *The Sorrows of Young Werther,* but he knew it indirectly only, for the most part on the basis of

---

[74] Cf. Guo Moruo's two volumes of poems: *The Goddesses* and *Xing-kong* [81] Starry Sky. The second one was originally published in 1923.

[75] Radhakrishnan, S.: op. cit., p. 170.

[76] Cf. Guo Moruo's *The Goddesses,* for example, some poems in the English translation by J. Lester and A. C. Barnes under the title *Selected Poems from The Goddesses,* Peking 1958.

[77] See Chapter Three of my book *Milestones in Sino-Western Literary Confrontation (1898—1979).* Bratislava—Wiesbaden, Veda Publishing House of the Slovak Academy of Sciences — Otto Harrassowitz 1986.

[78] Roy, D. T.: op. cit., pp. 68—69.

[79] Loesche, M.: *Goethes geistige Welt.* Stuttgart, S. Hirsel Verlag 1948, pp. 19—57.

one-sided and incorrect judgements collected on it by Johann Colerus.[80] Spinoza, an impostor according to Colerus,[81] became a great philosopher to Goethe (but also to Hegel and Engels)[82] when he began to read him in the original in the spring of 1773. Thus he wrote about Werther directly in Spinoza's shadow. He recalled Spinoza and his first intoxication with his thinking also in his *Dichtung und Wahrheit*; he appraised him as a refuge in which he found "tranquility" for his passions.[83] This last statement is only partially true. That emotionally unusual strength evident in Goethe's *Sturm und Drang*, required a certain bridle, but Spinoza's "tranquil world" in which human and personal ego becomes immersed in "the personal infinite",[84] perturbed, discomposed Goethe and this is clearly felt in Werther's letters. He was troubled that in Spinoza's system, "man's individuality before God and in Good"[85] became lost. But already then and also later when he read Spinoza in the pleasant company of Charlotte von Stein, Goethe agreed with the principal premises of Spinoza's teaching, that God is substance and there is only one substance, God or nature *(Deus sive natura)*, individual things (human creatures inclusive) are merely aspects of divine being, etc.

Guo Moruo learnt about Spinoza already when reading *Dichtung und Wahrheit* and was evidently interested in Goethe's evaluation, as testified by his later recollection. [86] He read his works directly and indirectly. In all probability he did not devote to them the same sustained and concentrated attention as to Goethe's, for Spinoza must have been somewhat more remote to him. He explicitly recalls his interest in Spinoza's *Ethica, Tractatus Theologico-Politicus* and *Tractatus de Intelectu Emendatione*.[87] As to Goethe, he not only read, but also translated his *Faust* and *The Sorrows of Young Werther;* both represented stimuli for his own work of that time. In a Preface to The Sorrows of Young Werther he wrote his most comprehensive and the most weighty commentary on pantheism:

"Pantheism is atheism... When man reaches the state of non-ego *(wuwo)* [83] *(anātman)* he unites with God, transcends time and recognize equality of death and life. If he reaches the state of ego-belief *(wojian)* [84] *(atmadṛsti)* he sees external appearances of the universe, of ten thousand things and of the self, the sorrow of

---

[80] Türck, H.: *Goethe und sein Faust.* Leipzig, Wilhelm Borngräber Verlag 1921, pp. 102—103. The book by Colerus on Spinoza found young Goethe in father's library.

[81] Ibid., p. 103.

[82] Marx, K.—Engels, Fr.: *Werke,* Band 20. Berlin, Dietz Verlag 1962, p. 315.

[83] Goethe, J. W.: *Dichtung und Wahrheit.* In: *Goethes sämtliche Werke.* Band 21. Stuttgart, Cottasche Buchhandlung, n.y., p. 164.

[84] Loesche, M.: op. cit., p. 51.

[85] Ibid., p. 52.

[86] Guo Moruo et al.: *Sanyeji*[82] *Kleeblatt.* 6th Printing. Shanghai 1929, p. 17. This is a letter written on January 18, 1920.

[87] Guo Moruo: Ten Years of Creation, p. 58.

what is changing, destroying, impermanent, being born, dying, existing and ceasing to exist. Ten thousand things must be born and die, life cannot restrain itself, death cannot obstruct itself and hence, it is possible to see only 'heavens and the earth and the powerful web they weave between them. . . I can see nothing but an eternally devouring, eternally regurgitating monster'. This energy is the cause of birth of ten thousand things, is the will of the universe, it is *Ding an sich*. He who unites himself with this energy, chooses life, not death, the permanent not changing. Where there is substance *(ti)* [85], there is paradise, there is always the kingdom of God there, eternal joy filling the souls. 'Before the infinite I am with thee in an eternal embrace'. Man's ultimate aim is to seek this eternal joy. Those who wish to seek it, must forget themselves *(wangwo)* [86]. Goethe found a recipe for this self-oblivion not in rest, but in motion. It is with the energy of the lion striking a hare, with one's whole body and soul that one should utilize the most beautiful moment *(kṣaṇa)* for self-aggrandizement *(ziwo kuangzhang)* [87] and fall on it with one's entire spirit and subjugate it. Later, when Werther became acquainted with Lotte, he said: 'Since then sun, moon, and stars can do what they will — I haven't the faintest notion whether it is day or night. The world around me has vanished.' To love man with one's whole soul, to intoxicate oneself in this way, to experience melancholy, sorrow with one's whole soul, to do everything thoroughly and on principle. That is why Werther expressed sympathy towards the confused madman and did not think suicide to be wrong, he even spoke of it with admiration. That is rather high morale: its principles cannot be grasped by the little revivers of the 'Golden Mean'."[88]

This long extract requires a more detailed analysis. The very first statement in which pantheism is defined as atheism comes from Guo Moruo's identification of the spirit or God (Chinese currently uses the same term for both the concepts *shen*) [88] and various words expressing substance. This statement embodies the basic nucleus of Guo's utterance. The remaining ones constitute but a more detailed explication of substance from which comes everything that exists, it is eternal, indestructible, inexhaustible, it has always been and always will be, all that is, was and will be are but its temporal and spatial metamorphosis. Guo Moruo's identification of the ego with God, comprising in it also his personality, is not an expression of his own deification or of that of other people, it is a manifestation of unity with the universe, with nature and with ten thousand things, with the substance which is their *raison d'être*.

In the further part of the statement, Guo Moruo seems to go back to the times

---

[88] Guo Moruo: A Preface to the Sorrows of Young Werther, pp. 341—342. All English quotations from *The Sorrows of Young Werther* are taken over from the translation entitled *The Sorrows of Young Werther and Selected Writings* by C. Hutter, New York, The New American Library 1982. Cf. this translation, pp. 63 and 41 and the original German text from *Die Leiden des jungen Werthers, Goethes sämtliche Werke.* Band 15. Stuttgart, Cottasche Buchhandlung n. y., pp. 55 and 32.

when had was getting acquainted with the pantheistic idea between 1915 and 1922 and briefly recalled the various stages (or they at least flashed through his mind) whether of his searching or his getting even with this notion. The first one is a very orthodox Buddhist stage with a requirement of the existence of anātman which characterized one aspect of Buddha's original teaching — as the philosopher Nāgārjuna (about 2nd cent. A.D.) wrote: "The Tathāgata (one of the ten titles of Buddha, M.G.) sometimes taught that the Ātman exists, and at other times he taught that the Ātman does not exist... Now, which of these two views represents the truth? It is doubtless the doctrine of the denial of Ātman. This doctrine which is so difficult to understand, was not intended by Buddha for the ears of those whose intellect is dull and in whom the roots of goodness have not thriven."[89] In all probability, Guo Moruo never assented to the anātman concept, although he did reflect on it and tried to get even with it.

Further sentences in the quoted texts are a denial of one aspect of the teaching of the Consciousness-Only theory. *Atmadṛṣti* (ego-belief) was one aspect of the four fundamental sources of affliction *(kleśa) (fannao)* [89] relating to seven or eight kinds of human consciousness known as the *manas (mona)* [90], or consciousness of the intellection. The next there were: ego-ignorance *(ātmamoha) (wochi)* [91], self-conceit *(atmamāna) (woman)* [92] and self-love *(ātmasneha) (woai)* [93].[90] Guo unified the ego-belief with a nonconvential unobstructed knowledge of the world without prejudices or biases and in concordance with natural laws. He did as young Goethe had done and took over his grasp of natural phenomena as an expression of the divine in nature (there being no difference between the divine and the natural), even though that natural-divine acts like a "monster" that destroys, but also creates. That, however, agreed also with Spinoza's view, according to which various phenomena could be created or destroyed, but not so substance.[91] Spinoza would certainly have named Guo's energy *(li)* [94] God who "is not only the effective cause of the existence of things, but also their essence".[92] Goethe, too, would admit the same by way of natural laws. Guo's reference to the realization of *Dao* of the "spirit" of a certain part of ancient Chinese, brahman and *ānanda* of Indian philosophy, brings out those enthusiastic words on substance and its union with paradise and a kingdom of God. Moruo felt an "eternal joy" when he read that Werther will remain with Lotte "in the sight of Infinite God in one eternal embrace."[93]

---

[89] Radhakrishnan, S.: op. cit., p. 389.

[90] Cf. Fung Yu-lan: *A History of Chinese Philosophy.* Vol. 2, pp. 312—313.

[91] Spinoza, B.: *Ethic.* London, Oxford University Press 1927, p. 18.

[92] Ibid., p. 27.

[93] Cf. Guo Moruo's translation in *Shaonian Weite zhi fannao.* 10th Printing. Shanghai 1932, p. 179, Hutter's translation p. 121 and Goethe's original p. 113.

Self-aggrandizement is to Guo Moruo a means to achieving pantheistic self-realization. It is a form of self-expression — the principal slogan of members of the literary association Chuangzaoshe [95] Creation Society which carries a significant Faustian trait. Self-aggrandizement is an abstraction of the process which this great classic and humanist had in mind when he said through Faust's mouth: "Und so mein eigen Selbst zu Ihren Selbst erweitern / Und, wie sie selbst, am End auch ich zerscheitern".[94] Guo Moruo admits to a Faustian and Wertherian spirit when he elevates the social and human *'carpe diem'* with every activity and rest, joy and sorrow, intoxication and sobriety, to a moral pedestal worthy of following. Self-aggrandizement in his conception is congruent with, or very similar to self-perfection of which we have written earlier. He saw outstanding examples of self-perfectioning in Confucius and Laozi, in Kant and Goethe.[95]

In certain things, Guo went further than Goethe and much more so than Spinoza. He took identification of man and God (or self and God) quite seriously and Werther's doubting question: "What is man, this exalted demigod?"[96] or Faust's: "Am I a God?",[97] was to him irrelevant, for some time at least, and in the theoretical domain. Young Guo Moruo came closer to Herder than to Goethe who, as an 18-year old young man wrote: "What, am I a spirit? I am a spirit, I am God!. . .God, what have You given to me! All your world I shall create anew in me."[98] Guo Moruo most probably did not know Herder, they were linked only incidentally by similar views on a creative God and on man.

The premise of feeling or emotion is a further link by which Goethe and Guo Moruo come closer together. This concept in its diverse variations has a long history in Chinese literary criticism and may be clearly noticed in Chinese creative practice. In Europe, the question of feelings in philosophy, literature and art came to be intensively followed towards the end of the Enlightenment period and during romanticism. As we have shown elsewhere, a certain infatuation with feelings in China lasted for about three centuries (16th—18th), in England and Germany, eventually in other European countries, for about one century (in the 18th and 19th cent.). However, while in China interest in feelings *(qing)* [96] had always been balanced by emphasis on their counterpole, human nature *(xing)* [97] or scenes, external things *(jing)* [98], in Europe feelings played an immense role in the history of literature and art; they were one of the causes of the latter's assertion over the

---

[94] Goethe, J. W.: *Faust I.* Leipzig, Verlag Philipp Reclam jun. 1974, p. 57.

[95] Guo Moruo: The Traditional Spirit of Chinese Culture, pp. 5—14.

[96] Guo Moruo translated this sentence in his own way: "This is what kind of man, of whom it is said that he is a Superman?"

[97] *Faust I*, p. 19.

[98] Quoted according to von den Steinen, W.: *Das Zeitalter Goethes.* Bern, A. Francke AG Verlag 1949, p. 138.

two-thousand year old sway of the classical ideal and an important element of romanticism as a literary and artistic movement.[99]

In A Preface to The Sorrows of Young Werther we read: "He said: 'People are always people; even though having a little reason, when they meet with an ardent feeling and this exceeds the limits of human nature *(renxing)* [99],they do not know whether that has any value or not'. This is a reality of which we all may have convinced ourselves; we may say that this is an axiom — a truth needing no proof. The prince had a high regard for Werther's intellect and talent, but since he takes no note of his heart, he (Werther, M.G.) asserts 'this heart of mine, of which I am so proud, for it is the source of all things — all strength, all bliss, all misery'. He also says that all what he knows, everyone may know, but his heart belongs solely to himself. He is not intent on analysing and dissecting the universe and the ten thousand things with the aid of reason, but to unify and create with the aid of his own heart. His heart wishes to create a paradise of everything that surrounds him, when he lies in the grass amidst imperceptible, unheeded insects and constantly feels the 'presence of the Almighty' and the 'going to and fro of the All-loving and generous'. In a world where there is no love *(aiqing)* [100],there is no shining magic lantern *(shendeng)* [101] which is capable suddenly to conjure up many pictures on a white wall and cause dead nothingness to give birth to a living universe."[100]

When dealing with Goethe's emotionalism *(zhuqingzhuyi)* [102], Guo Moruo starts solely from European romanticism, although he translates (or rather interprets) the first sentence quoted and the last citation (given in simple quotation marks) differently from what they mean in the original.[101] He probably did this to make them more comprehensible to his contemporary readers. Here, man is the measure of all things, reason and its abilities are considered as universalia, while the heart belongs solely to the individual possessing it. However, the human individual has not the heart only for himself, but with its help he unites or creates the world. What Guo in this preface calls love, European romanticists and historians of romanticism termed sympathy.[102] It is one and the same thing, both involved interhuman harmony, understanding and unity, and even unity between man and the surrounding, external nature. Goethe related the magic lantern *(Zauberlantern)*

---

[99] Gálik, M.: *The Concept of Feeling in Chinese, English and German Literaty Criticsm,* Neohelicon *10*, 1983, 1, pp. 123—130.

[100] Guo Moruo: A Preface to The Sorrows of Young Werther, pp. 339—340.

[101] Cf. the original text by Goethe: "Man möchte rasend werden, Wilhelm, daß es Menschen geben soll ohne Sinn und Gefühl an den Wenigen, was auf Erden noch einen Wert hat" (15. September), und "das Wehen des All-liebenden, der uns in ewiger Wonne schwebend trägt und erhält" (10. Mai). It is interesting that the translation of the last example is different than in the Chinese text of the novel, see p. 6. The same is also valid for the first sentence, see p. 117. The translations in the novel are more appropriate.

[102] Bate, W. J.: *From Classic to Romantic.* New York, Harper and Row 1961, pp. 129—159.

with mimetic processes in art and with interhuman sympathy. At one place Werther writes: ". . . what is life worth without love? A magic lantern without light. All you have to do is put in the light, and it produces the loveliest colored pictures on a white wall. And if there is nothing more to it than these, oh, so transient phantoms, always it denotes happiness when we stand in front of it like naive boys and are enchanted by the magical visions".[103]

In the concept of the magic lantern as a recorder of the mimetic process, but simultaneously as a projector of the same phenomenon, Goethe's and Guo Moruo's views on the essence of art, come much closer together. However, while Goethe adheres for the most part to the principle of mimesis, Guo Moruo, as evident from his stress on the principle of creation, rather underlines the role of the heart as a demiurge of the living universe being born in dead nothingness. Guo Moruo was not consistent in this emphasis on the heart, or he was, but in that case "heart" conveyed a broader meaning to him: it must have been equivalent to "substance", to God and a human "Great Ego" *(dawo)* [103]. This comes out very strikingly in the poem *Chuangzaozhe* [104] Creators which he published in the first issue of the magazine Chuangzao jikan [105] Creation Quarterly in the spring of 1922, in the first common work of the Creation Society, of which he was a leading member. In this poem, one of his most expressive ones, Guo presented to the young readers of his time his own version of a mythopoieic cosmogony. In it he took little contact with Chinese tradition, and when he did, it was rather with one less Chinese, that had originally belonged to ancestors of the south-Chinese nationalities — Miao [106] and Yao [107].[104] It is a demiurgic variant of the creation of the world in which Pan Gu [108] creates the world of his own body. Guo called him "man-God" *(renshen)* [109] and in accordance with mythological notions handed down in Chinese literature (although not consistently for modern mythologists among writers usually alter the original material according to their needs), described him as a "creative spirit" who "created this shining world" of himself, making the sun and moon of his eyes, hills and mountains of his head, trees and grass of his hair and rivers and seas of his fat.

The notion of Pan Gu as a mythical egg out of which he was born, and his ninety-thousand-mile-long body which has thus grown during the course of a eighteen-thousand-year long intra-oval development, meant to Guo Moruo a chaos out of which a new heaven, a new earth and also new people can be born. While preparing with his friends the first issue of the Creation Quarterly, and also while

[103] Cf. Hutter's translation, pp. 51—52 and Goethe's original, pp. 42—43.

[104] Cf. Münke, W.: *Die klassische chinesische Mythologie.* Stuttgart, Ernst Klett Verlag 1976, pp. 254—255 and Yanshina, E. M.: *Formirovanie i razvitie drevnekitaiskoi mifologii* (The Formation and Development of Ancient Chinese Mythology). Moscow, Nauka 1984, pp. 127—130.

translating *The Sorrows of Young Werther,* he pursued the same idea: out of the chaos of the contemporary world to create a new world characterized by active enjoyment referred to earlier, unselfish individualism, self-expression and self-aggrandizement. The magic lantern could provide only an inadequate reflection of what he wished to attain. The "Great Ego" is, in his view, the "ego" of a man liberated by the knowledge that he is an embodiment of "substance", a concretization of objective reality in the aspect of an inner unity of all its forms, that he is a guarantee of self-development, but also of development of at least those phenomena that affect him in the domain of nature, society, various forms of knowledge including literature and art. Guo Moruo was himself as a "demiurge" of his universe:

I conjure to life creators from *The Book of Poetry.*
I conjure to life creators of elegies of the Chu Kingdom.
I conjure to life the great poets of the Tang Dynasty.
I conjure to life playwrights of the Yuan period.
You ancient Indian poets of the Vedas!
Dante, you wrote the *Divine Comedy,*
Milton, author of *Paradise Lost,*
Goethe, creator of *Faust,*
you have known feelings of loneliness,
you have known suffering,
you have known joy,
you have known glory.[105]

Guo Moruo designated the third trait of Goethe's pantheism as reflected in *The Sorrows of Young Werther,* as admiration for nature. In his preface he follows up Werther's confessions relating to this topic and quotes what fits in with his own idea about man's relationship with nature. He practically skips over one of the confessions, for Werther's perception is remote to him. The entire passage runs as follows: "This strengthened my decision to stick to nature in the future, for only nature is infinitely rich and capable of developing a great artist. There is much to be said for the advantage of rules and regulations, much the same things can be said in praise of middle-class society — he who sticks to them will never produce anything that is bad or in poor taste, just as he who lets himself be molded by law, order, and prosperity will never become an intolerable neighbour or a striking scoundrel. On the other hand — and people can say what they like — rules and regulations ruin our true appreciation of nature and our powers to express it."[106] It should be observed that Guo left out the second and the first part of the third sentence from the passage he

---

[105] Guo Moruo: Creators. Reprinted in The Collected Works of Guo Moruo. Vol. 1, pp. 286—287.
[106] Cf. Hutter's translation, p. 30 and Goethe's original, pp. 20—21.

quoted.[107] He distorted somewhat Goethe's message also in his translation of these sentence in the novel itself. Goethe's impersonally expressed view which clearly states that "much is to be said for the advantage of rules and regulations", is rendered by him as follows: "Some people insist on maintaining the rules" which differs considerably from Goethe's statement. He translated quite differently the words by Goethe: "much the same things can be said in praise of middle-class society", namely as: "or they assent to the highly learned but low appreciation". It was evidently because Guo Moruo disliked rules and regulations, as we have pointed out elsewhere, and despised "middle-class society" of his time. Where Goethe sides with his society while it is well ordered and adheres to the recognized social, ethical and moral code, Guo Moruo prefers not to express, not to translate Goethe's ideas and satisfies himself with a certain statement, a commentary which he gives as his own opinion.

Finally, Guo Moruo made a point of two further traits in Wertherian pantheism: admiration for a primitive way of life, usually in simple nature unaffected by civilization, and respect for children. Reflections on the latter trait induced him to make a rather extensive commentary and to point to parallels in ancient oriental philosophy or religion. A certain inducement to this were his children with his Japanese common-law wife Sato Tomiko. He devoted considerable attention to at least the first of them, as evident from his poems.[108] Even if not all the classical references relate to children as young Goethe fancied them when literarily moulding his Werther, it is nevertheless worth noting Guo's arguments. Guo gave the quotation from Laozi, according to which people, when concentrating on breathing, should strive to do its as soft as a child.[109] He put rather too great a reliance on his memory and quoted erroneously. As regards the philosopher Mencius (374—289 B.C.), the quotation, with the exception of one grammatical particule,which does not alter the sense, is exact. According to him: "A great man is one who retains the heart of a new-born babe".[110] He also calls to his aid the prophet Isaiah from the *Old Testament* and his visions of the future society: "The wolf also shall dwell with the lamb, and the leopard shall lie down with the kid, and the calf and the young lion and the fatling together; and a little child shall lead them".[111] The Hebrew writer had in mind a Utopian society and stylized it in a poetic form, while Goethe saw in children

---

[107] Cf. Guo Moruo: A Preface to The Sorrows of Young Werther, pp. 342—343 and Guo's translation in the novel, p. 45.

[108] E.g. Guo Muruo et al. *Kleeblatt*, pp. 40—42, 47—48 and *The Goddesses*, pp. 129—135 and 208—209.

[109] Cf. Waley, A.: op. cit., p. 153, A Preface to The Sorrows of Young Werther and *Laozi Daodejing shangpian* [110], SPPY ed. Taipei 1966, p. 5B.

[110] Cf. *Mencius*. Translated with an Introduction by D.C. Lau. Harmondsworth, Middlesex, Penguin Books 1970, p. 130 and *Mengzi Zhao zhu* [111]. SPPY ed. *juan* [112] 8. Taipei 1970, p. 4A.

[111] Isaiah, 11, 6.

"models" for adult people. However, Guo Moruo embodied more into this notion, for in the child "there is not a moment of the day when he does not devote his entire self to the tasks of creation, expression and enjoyment. The life of a child is the life of a genius in miniature, it is the epitome of a life of self-realization".[112]

4

Early in June of 1921, Guo Moruo met his former schoolmate from Okayama, Li Shanting [113] (died 1927). It was at the Economics Department of the Kyoto Imperial University. Li Shanting had studied there under the famous Japanese propagator of Marxism, Professor Kawakami Hajime [114] (1879—1946). Li Shanting advised Guo to read Kawakami's journal Shakai mondai kenkyu [115] Studies of Social Problems, but Guo did not read Kawakami's works for some time and Li's explanations regarding the "dictatorship of the proletariat" and the "inevitability of the crash of capitalism" did not convince him in the least.[113]

Guo Moruo's article, written on the occasion of Rabindranath Tagore's visit to China in October 1923, presents more or less a compendium of his preceding development.[114] He came to be seriously interested in socialist ideas and Marxist philosophy in connection with the new situation which prevailed at the time when young communists like Deng Zhongxia [117] (1897—1933), Yun Daiying [118] (1895—1931) and others made themselves heard and began to propagate the need of a concerned literature,[115] and evidently also under the impact of events in Japan where revolutionary and proletarian literature had come into being through the launching of the magazine Tane-maku hito [119] The Sower.[116] At that time, he was passing through an active expressionist period of his literary-critical development and the experiences, events and knowledge acquired between 1921—1924, gradually brought him to Marxism-Leninism. In his "condemnation" of Tagore, we read: "I believe that the materialist interpretation of history offers the only clue to the solution of the world situation. Until the economic system of the world have been transformed, such things as the reality of brahman, the dignity of the individual and the gospel of love can only be the morphium or cocaine of the propertied and leisured class, while the members of the proletariat are left to soak themselves in sweat and blood".[117]

---

[112] Guo Moruo: A Preface to the Sorrows of Young Werther, p. 345. The translation is taken over from Roy, D. T.: op. cit., p. 136.

[113] Guo Moruo: Ten Years of Creation, pp. 95—96.

[114] Guo MoruO: Taigeer lai Huade wojian [116] My Views on Tagore's Visit to China. In: Studies in Literature and Art, pp. 289—301.

[115] Gálik, M.: The Genesis of Modern Chinese Literary Criticism, 1917—1930. Bratislava—London, Veda Publishing House of the Slovak Academy of Sciences—Curzon Press 1980, pp. 129—141.

[116] Shea, G.,T.: Leftwing Literature in Japan. Tokyo, The Hosei University Press 1964, pp. 69—126.

[117] Roy, D. T.: op. cit., p. 155. Original text see in: My Views on Tagore's Visit to China, p. 299.

This process of the philosophical rebirth was a progressive one, for precisely during the years 1923—1924, he wrote most about pantheism insofar as the theoretical aspect of the question was concerned. In May 1923, hence less than six months before his article about Tagore, he asserted in a letter to his friend Zing Baihua [120] (1897—), that the capitalist system alone had been responsible for World War I, that it had been foretold by far-sighted philosophers and the great men of action rose up in order to up an end to it as to the root of the evil from which it had sprung. He explicitly mentioned in it K. Marx and V. I. Lenin as heroes admired by young people of that period.[118]

A peculiar situation came to be formed in Guo Moruo's intellectual development, particularly in the second half of 1923 and the early months of 1924, when, still pushed by his own impetus he went on expressing his pantheistic views while at the same time he began to manifest interest in Marxism-Leninism and his world outlook became enriched with social, class, economic and other notions that subsequently led to a complete change in his philosophical orientation and towards dialectical-historical materialism.

That was a very complex process, often filled with contradictory turns, reactions, spasmodic searchings of a man who was incapable of coping with himself and with his surrounding world — whether present, or of the remote past. One week following the appearance of his article about Tagore in which, as we have just seen, he sided with a materialistic (and hence also Marxist) apprehension of history, he published an article, at least partially anarchistic in character, written on the occasion of the assassination of the Japanese anarchist Osugi Sakae [122] (1885—1923), an advocate of individualism and of "man's blind action — the explosion of human spirit".[119] In his article *Guojiade yu chaoguojiade* [123] State and Super-State, we find a protest against the State as a "cage" in which people are kept like birds, and also an appeal for nations to unite in "super-state" associations according to the motto "all men are brothers" (sihai tongpao) [124], allegedly preached by old Chinese philosophers.[120] This type of cosmopolitanism *(shijiezhuyi)* [125] assumed the existence of States in super-State frameworks, a Utopian wish in Guo Moruo's times.[121]

Similar contradictory tendencies may also be noted in Guo's literary development during the early 1920 s. Moments of an activist optimism alternated with a pessimistic quietism, even defeatism. One case in point to be referred to here, will serve for many others that might easily be cited. On July 12th 1922, he finished a work on

---

[118] Guo Moruo: *Lun Zhongde wenhua shu* [121] A Letter on Chinese and German Culture. In: *Studies in Literature and Art*, p. 22.

[119] Arima, Tatsuo: *The Failure of Freedom. A Portrait of Modern Japanese Individuals.* Cambridge (Mass.), Harvard University Press 1969, p. 62.

[120] Guo Moruo: *Studies in Literature and Art*, p. 414.

[121] Ibid., pp. 414—415.

a dramatic dialogue between the rivers Yangtze and Huangho, in the conclusion of which he appealed to the Chinese people to stand up in the name of liberty, as the Americans had done against British domination in the years 1775—1783, or the French in the Great French revolution, or the Russians at the time of the Great October Socialist Revolution.[122] A quite different spirit prevaded his other short play Guzhu jun zhi erzi [126] The Two Princes of Guzhu, written likewise in Japan towards the end of November of the same year.[123] In it he describes two brothers Bo Yi [127] and Shu Qi [128], the sons of the Prince of Guzhu, during a meeting with fishermen and villagers who had experience of Zhou Xin [129] (reigned allegedly in 1154—1122 B.C.), the last bad king of the Shang (Yin) dynasty. The two brothers did not decide to fight against him, nor do they condemn him in any way, for that would be contrary to the principle of loyalty towards the ruling dynasty, but betake themselves to the mountains Shouyangshan [130] where they live on the wild leguminous plants in the "bosom of nature".[124]

V. I. Lenin's death in January 1924 and "feelings of inferiority, inadequacy, guilt, depression, resentment and paranoia"[125] which he experienced when he learnt that his wife and three children in Japan greatly suffered (and even that his wife intended to commit infanticide and suicide),[126] influenced his more or less final decision in the domain of his philosophical, world-outlook or ideological orientation. In January 1924, the 39th number of the magazine Chuangzao zhoubao [131] Creation Weekly carried the last instalment of Guo's translation of Nietzsche's Also sprach Zarathustra (Thus Spoke Zarathustra). That was the fourth chapter of the second part of the book entitled Of the Priests, and carries words which Guo Moruo, a perceptive and attentive mind, could have noted: "And you, my brothers, must be redeemed by greater men than any Redeemer has been, if you would find the way to freedom!".[127] One thing is certain: he translated two more sentences from Nietzsche, which followed the above quotation and then nothing more.

*

After this unfinished translation of Nietzsche, Guo Moruo began, in April 1924, the translation of the book Shakai soshiki to shakai kakumei [132] Social Organization and Social Revolution by Kawakami Hajime. This book had originally appeared

---

[122] The Collected Works of Guo Moruo. Vol. 1, pp. 300.

[123] Ibid., pp. 195—213.

[124] Ibid., p. 213.

[125] Roy, D. T.: op. cit., p. 156.

[126] Loc. cit.

[127] Nietzsche, Fr.: Thus Spoke Zarathustra. Translated with an Introduction by R. J. Hollingdale. Harmondsworth, Middlesex, Penguin Books 1967, p. 117.

in the magazine which Li Shanting had recommended to Guo Moruo for reading in 1921,[128] as he admitted to his collaborator and friend Cheng Fangwu [133] (1897—1984) in a letter on the eve of the 100th anniversary of Byron's death, on April 18th 1924. Instead of an article on Byron which he had promised for the Creation Quarterly, he devoted himself to the translation of Kawakami's work.[129] In a subsequent letter of August 9th, 1924, addressed to the same friend, Guo Moruo expressed his conviction that it was possible to build up scientific socialism in which people could live in accordance with the principle "each one according to his possibilities, to each one according to his needs" and that it would be "a social organization in which an individual's free development would be conditioned by a free development of the society". He considered the way leading to this society to be "the only road" obligatory for all the people living in subjection. His pronouncement that he had become "a consistent adherent of Marxism" should be taken with a certain reserve, for at that time elements of a "vulgar sociologism", in particular, irreconcilable with Marxism, had rather firm roots in his world-outlook conviction.[130] That was due, among other causes, also to his misery. Lack of financial means forced him to pawn even a copy of the Social Organization and Social Revolution after its translation into Chinese.[131]

The translation of Kawakami's book marks the most important turning-point in Guo's further development. This book woke him up from his "drowsiness", "showed him the way out from his uncertain gropings" and saved him allegedly also from "the dark shadows of death".[132]

His atheistic pantheism came to be relegated to history.

---

[128] Guo Moruo: Ten Years of Creation Continued, p. 182.

[129] Zhang Jun [134] (Ed.): *Xiandai mingren shuxin* [135] The Letters of Famous Men. Shangahi 1937, pp. 168—172.

[130] Guo Moruo: *Gu hong* [136] The Lonely Swan. In: The Collected Works of Guo Moruo. Vol. 10, Peking 1959, pp. 286—301.

[131] Ibid., p. 292.

[132] Ibid., p. 289.

1.郭沫若 2.魯迅 3.嘉定 4.中華 5.張次王叡 6.郭開文 7.袁世凱 8.桂馨谷 9.大乘起信論 10.唯識 11.法相 12.瞿秋白 13.谷輔林 14.郭沫若世界觀中的泛神論問題 15.文學評論叢刊 16.蔣百里 17.文學研究會 18.梁啟超 19.歐洲文藝復興時代史 20.康有為 21.龔自珍 22.魏源 23.莊子 24.一切唯言識 25.種子 26.莊子引得 27.成唯識論 28.南郭子綦 29.西施 30.我 31.法 32.我法非別實有 33.昌曙輝 34.王陽明 35.王文成公全書 36.靜坐 37.儒家精神之復活者王陽明 38.文藝論集 39.老子 40.創造十年 41.沫若文集 42.自我擴克 43.會子 44.萬物一體 45.心即理 46.天理 47.人欲 48.天 49.道 50.本體 51.動態 52.利己主義 53.少私 54.寡欲 55.中國文化之之傳統精神 56.解放箇性 57.自我完成

KONG SHANGREN'S (1648—1718) INNOVATIONS OF SOME CHUANQI CONVENTIONS[1]

DANA KALVODOVÁ, Prague

This study shows the most important innovations in the drama *Taohua shan (The Peach Blossom Fan)* by Kong Shangren, namely: originality of theme, inspiration by social reality, action limited to the most important lines and ending without a happy-end scheme.

Kong Shangren based his drama Taohua shan, *The Peach Blossom Fan* (1699) on the historical events which took place only half a century before. He worked on the theme with great personal involvement. These facts led to some important innovations of the *chuanqi* drama conventions.

The most part of the *chuanqi* [1] themes were not original. Scarcely ever was the subject inspired by reality. Playwrights gathered their topics from biographies, memoirs, legends and historical annals. They also treated the subjects already known from drama of the Mongol era, *Yuan zaju* [2] and took over the themes from Tang literary tales called likewise *chuanqi.*

For the time being, any detailed analysis was not made of tens of Ming—Manchu *chuanqi* dramas and it is, therefore, rather difficult, to attempt any summary conclusions regarding both the subjects' sources and the frequencies of concrete themes.

The moral issue of Chinese drama was always strong. It should improve the common morale by objective examples. It is in this sense that the theatre is characterized also by Li Liweng [3] (1611—1679): "(The ancients) composed plays of the kind, because among simple men and women there were only few people who could read and write and their *dao* [4], way, did no rest on the firm foundations. (The plays) should lead to the good and warn against the evil. Use was made of the actors to talk to the broad public. Good people took proper place on the stage, while those mischievous lived to see their corresponding end, in order that the spectators learn what to strive for and what to beware of. This is the way of curing people and ensuring a high age to the world, this is how to avoid sufferings and disasters."[2]

---

[1] This study is taken over from my so far unpublished manuscript: Kong Shangren's Peach Blossom Fan, Contribution to the Studies of Ming Drama (Chuanqi). Prague 1969, 267 p.

[2] Li Liweng: *Xienqing ouji* (Random Expressions of Idle Feelings). In: *Zhongguo gudian xiqu lunzhu jicheng..* Vol. 7. Peking 1959, p. 11.

In standard subjects and with inclination to moralizing, there was a risk of schematism in the *chuanqi* dramas. Of this was aware likewise Li Liweng in his time and assumed that a concrete, unworn story of new characters can provide new contents to the traditional store of themes: "...there are not many wonderful stories in the world, while there is plenty of common ones. It is easy to penetrate into the laws of nature, but difficult into human feelings. Relations between rulers and subjects, fathers and sons, bring about, in every single day (concrete expressions of) loyalty, piety, purity and justice. That which derives from human nature is ever more admirable. That which did not happen in the past is waiting for future generations."[3]

In general, Li Liweng's concern was concentrated on substantiating a standard matter by means of story and genuine action of trustworthy characters.

The immortality of Gao Ming's [5] *Pi-pa ji* [6] The Lute, consists evidently in a masterly analysis of individual fate illustrating a common conflict phenomenon of Confucian society: contradiction existing between personal feelings and wishes on one part, and obligations and allegiance toward the upper strata of the society and rulers, on the other. A similar conflict between the feelings and the reason, romantic love and strict principles of public morale, form the backbone of Tang Xianzu's [7] *Mudan ting* [8] Peony Pavilion. Hong Shen's [9] *Chansheng dian* [10] Palace of Eternal Life, is found among those *chuanqi* pertaining to a very extensive subject group of dramas dealing with *lihezhi qing* [11], "farewells and meetings".[4] The in the end tragic love story of emperor Minghuang of the Tang and his favorite Lady Yang Guifei is a symbolic parallel of the rise and fall of the Tang dynasty. At the same time, it is also a covert allegory of the fall of the Ming dynasty. The author completed the drama in 1688, at the commencement of the Manchu (Qing) dynasty, when works with anti-Manchu tendencies were proscribed and persecuted.

Topical subjects in *chuanqi* were very sporadic. Probably the first drama on a topical theme *Mingfeng ji* [12] The Phoenix is Singing, appeared about 1570.[5] Cyril Birch characterizes it as follows: "Mingfeng ji is conceived on a majestic scale. Its protagonists are political giants of the Jia Qing period... (The dramatist) is underscoring the nationwide nature of the catastrophe on an evil dictatorship, he is mirroring very sharply a growing sense of nationhood."[6] This drama deals with the events of the tyranny of Yen Sung and his son Shifan. The play is unusual by its exact portraying of political action, but it proved to be a rather literary drama and its stage values are controversial.

A hundred years later, in the second half of the 17th century, there appeared a few

---

[3] Ibid., p. 19.

[4] Ibid., p. 76.

[5] This drama is attributed to Wang Shihzhen, but also to Liang Chenyu.

[6] Birch, C.: Some Concerns and Methods of the Ming Chuanqi Drama (the paper delivered at the Conference on Chinese Literature, Bermuda, 1967).

chuanqi plays in Suchou, Wuxi, Kunshan and other centres of Kunqu [13] theatre, written by intellectuals who renounced voluntarily their official career in the service on the foreign dynasty. They chose the subjects from the recent past. The most renowned of these plays are Li Yu's [14] *Qingzhong pu* [15] Writing of Honour, on the mass insurrection against eunuch tyrant Wei Zhongxian in Suchou in the twenties of the 17th century, and his *Yipeng xue* [16] A Handful of Snow, written on the same theme as The Phoenix is Singing.

Dramas on new unworn and topical subjects form a special group within the *chuanqi* series. Among them The Peach Blossom Fan takes a quite particular place. In the Prologue the author characterizes its subject by the following words: Master of Ceremonies — The rise and fall of an empire are evoked in the story of meeting and separation (of lovers). Thus, he does not abandon one of the traditional topics on "separation and meetings", neither is he the first author to connect the lovers' fate with that of an era. However, he is one among not many dramatists who chose a quite new subject, namely, authentic events from a recent past, in the distance of less than fifty years. Kong Shangren's contemporary, Li Liweng, in the chapter Beware of the arbitrariness of his theoretical writing already mentioned, said the following: "Any playwright of *chuanqi* should proceed, as far as possible, from that which he can see and hear and should avoid labouring for anything beyond his immediate experience."[7]

For his drama Kong Shangren prepared the material in a way quite unusual in the sphere of the Chinese theatre. He proceeded from information received from eye witnesses, from the study of authentic topical manuscripts and from investigation of places where events had taken place.[8]

The careful, even scientific approach to the matter of the drama led to an action developing in logical sequence with the events tied up one with another and corresponding to historical reality. The love theme follows the historic theme in causal conjunction. Moreover, this approach led to the circumstance that the two lines of the plot, historic nad love line, proceed only on realistic level. In many *chuanqi* plays it is, however, quite current that the story along the real lines permeates the supernatural scenes, without any difference being made between the dream, vision and reality.

Beside the ritual scenes (3,32 and 40) of The Peach Blossom Fan, there are only two vision scenes and they take their logical place in the action, being justified in one case as a dream, in the other as a monk's vision in meditation. In the Supplementary scene in the middle of the drama, Zhang Wei, ex-dignitary at the imperial court in Peking, sees in his dream the late emperor Chong Zhen going in the company of his

---

[7] Li Liweng, op. cit., p. 19.

[8] More about the approach of Kong Shangren to the material for the drama, see in my study: *The Life of K'ung Shang-jen*, Archív orientální, Prague, *43*, 1975, No. 1, pp. 53—63.

faithful dignitaries and preparing for ascension to heaven. In the scene 40, entitled Entering the Way, the now Taoist monk Zhang Wei, immersed in his meditation, sees an apparition of some dignitaries, headed by Shi Kefa, who remained up to the very end faithful to the Mings. They announce the posthumous honours they obtained in the celestial palace. Subsequently, there appear the traitors Ma Shiying and Yuan Dacheng pursued by the God of Mountains and God of Thunder, and killed in the end. These both visions offered a great show, in which many extras were engaged. Symptomatically enough, they are bound only with one person, namely Chang Wei, who incorporates a loyal allegiance toward the Ming dynasty. Conspicuous appear also the collocation of the visions in the overall composition of the drama where they are placed at the ends of the First and Second part respectively, as if their function should strengthen the previous actions and emphasize the supernatural powers which determine the afterlife of men according to their deeds on earth. The moral mission of the drama — the evil retaliated by the evil, the virtue rewarded — is evidently shifted purposely into an extra-real dimension. It is also stressed optically by pantomimical and dance appearences as well as by splendid costumes.

One of the negative characteristics of chuanqi — mainly that of the later era — was an excessive ramification of the lines of action and insufficient survey of the subject. Therefore, Li Liweng, requiring yi ren yi shih [17], one character — one action, says: "Too many action lines mean a malady to chuanqi . . ."[9] After giving an example of some early chuanqi dramas with a single theme, he continues: "The later authors do not depict the basic event only, but they do invent secondary actions, claiming that any additional character enlarges the story of the main one. However, a ramified action crumbles the contents, and the spectator feels as if walking 'on dark road in the mountains where he always meets new people'."[10]

However, the reciprocal permeation of two parallel plots is very frequent in chuanqi. Kong Shangren also applied this composition method, because he resolved to choose the parallel: love story — history of the the end of the Ming dynasty. Though the love of the protagonists Hou Fangyu and Li Fragrant Lady should have presented a parable of the era in which it took place, in reality the relation between the two dramatical themes is more complex.

The drama provides an analytical view of the decline of a great dynasty. The author explains the means by which the corrupt and discredited dignitaries acquired the power after the fall of Peking and following emperor's Chong Zhen's death. Unveiling the methods of their repressions used against the intellectuals who criticized those in power from the position of ethical principles, he apprehends the anarchy in the decaying system of civil administration even in military camps and sees the problems of the short term South Ming dynasty in its whole complexity. The

[9] Li Liweng, op. cit., p. 14.
[10] Li Liweng, op. cit., p. 18.

definite end of the dynasty then followed with the advancement of Manchu troops to which the disintegrated Ming army could no more put up any resistance.

Thus, owing to its authenticity and urgency, the historical story line outbalanced the romantic line of love which, otherwise, was stressed in *chuanqi* and was prevailing on the mere ground of being interpreted by a couple of main protagonists.

The problems of The Peach Blossom Fan exceed in many respects its temporal and local limits. They have much broader validity and constant topicality. The fate of love relation between the young scholar, Hou Fangyu and a teenage courtesan, Li Fragrant Lady, depends directly on the socio-political action of which it is an inseparable and organical part. Such a consequent treatment of individual fates of lovers in direct dependence on the complicated events of their times, occurs rarely in Chinese classical dramaturgy.

"The century between Jia Qing of Ming and Kangxi of Qing (1522—1723) represents, after the Mongol era, a farther significant epoch in the history of theatre. In the traditional drama there appears a realistic spirit characterized by individual fates connected, in historical dramas, with great political events in the nation."[11]

The Peach Blossom Fan undoubtedly appears as a very expressive work of this new trend. Kong Shangren consciously strove for his drama, dealing with the recent national tragedy, to be a memento to his contemporaries or even further generations. In the introduction to his play he wrote: "The play The Peach Blossom Fan is evoking the recent events of the Southern Ming dynasty still in memory of the old. Anything sung and spoken on the stage reveals circumstances related to these events. Who annihilated the three hundred years dynasty? Who crushed it? When is it fallen? The purpose is not to make the spectator moved or weeping, but the aim is to reform human hearts and save the present day."[12]

The author's concern for the theme of the drama was so strong that he asserted in it, to a certain extent, his own subject. As I proved in the chapter in the prologue, the conclusive implication of the subjectivism is the character of the Master of Ceremonies, represented by *fumo* [18], who does not appear only in prologue as in other *chuanqi* dramas, but also in other crucial scenes.[13]

The original approach to the topic of the play is also evident in the conclusion. As it was conventional in *chuanqi*, the couple of protagonists and nearly all important characters met in the final scene of the play. The tenor of the meeting, *tuanyuan* [19], was harmonious. Authors kept to this rule even at the cost of the happy-end which if not possible on earth, was transferred to the afterlife.

---

[11] Wang Jisi: *Taohua shan jiaozhu qianyan* (Commentator's Introduction). In: Kong Shangren: *Taohua shan*. Peking 1958, p. 12.

[12] Kong Shangren: *Taihua shan xiaoyin* (Small Introduction to The Peach Blossom Fan). In: Kong Shangren: *Taohua shan*, op. cit. p. 1.

[13] Kalvodová, D.: The Prologue of the Drama The Peach Blossom Fan. In: *Maske und Kothurn, 18*, 1972, No. 3, pp. 234—245.

In the great final scene of The Peach Blossom Fan the lovers meet, it is true, after a long separation, but the author subjected the conclusion to the logic of the development of the historical events and, possibly, also to his own personal feeling. A drama on a great tragedy of the nation could not end with a happy end of the protagonists. After the Manchus conquered Nanking, the Ming dynasty collapses definitely. Many honourable people retired in seclusion. The drama ends by Taoist resignation of the world, with the lovers leaving for a monastery in the hills.

Inconventional conclusion of a *chuanqi* play was evidently, in its times, perturbing to such an extent, that Gu Cai [20], Kong Shangren's excollaborator on the drama *Xiao hulei* [21] The Little Lute, wrote, later on, a new version of the drama, entitled *Nan taohua shan* [22] The Southern Peach Blossom Fan. He changed the conclusion: the drama has a happy end in which Hou Fangyu takes Li Fragrant Lady to his wife.[14]

Kong Shangren's choice of the original theme and his personal relation thereto appear absolutely new in *chuanqi*. The Peach Blosson Fan is ranged with those literary works of the Manchu era, in which author's subject begins to show through. This new phenomenon in literature was the consequence of the decaying feudal structure of society. "Subjectivism and individualism imply the beginning relaxation of the bonds by which the feudal order was tying the individual and also the beginning liberation of him, at least in a mental sense from all limitations of the past."[15]

New features of the drama can be seen particularly in the following points:
1. A changed relation between the amorous and historical theme.
2. A truthworthy motivation and logical tying up of the action, without reflexes of legendary or mythical elements.
3. The Master of Ceremonies pervading the whole play as a bearer of the author's subjective views.
4. The drama does not end by a happy-end scheme, because the protagonists are closely bound with the time in which they live and their individual fates fused organically with it.

The dramatists's original and biassed approach to the subject is reflected in the modifications and innovations of traditional conventions relating to the structure of *chuanqui* plays.

---

[14] Although listed in the catalogues, the text of this play is not preserved. Kong Shangren writes about it in his essay Taohua shan benmo (First and Last about The Peach Blossom Fan) in: Kong Shangren, Taohua shan, ed. 1958, p. 3, as follows: "Gu Cai read through The Peach Blossom Fan and immersed into the play so deeply as to rewrite it into The Southern Peach Blossom Fan. Protagonists of the *sheng* and *dan* type reached the happy-end in order to please the spectators. The style of his verses is brilliant, flowery and flowing, in Tang Xianzu's foot-steps. Although he filled out my defects, he put me in condemnable light. Should I not abandon everything and retire in seclusion?"

[15] Compare Průšek, J.: *Subjectivism and Individualism in Modern Chinese Literature.* Archív orientální, Prague, *25,* 1957, pp. 261—286.

孔尚任：桃花扇

[1] 传奇 [2] 元杂剧 [3] 李笠翁 [4] 道 [5] 高明
[6] 琵琶记 [7] 汤显祖 [8] 牡丹亭 [9] 洪昇
[10] 长生殿 [11] 离合之情 [12] 鸣凤记 [13] 昆曲
[14] 李玉 [15] 清忠谱 [16] 一捧雪 [17] 一人一事
[18] 副末 [19] 团圆 [20] 顾彩 [21] 小忽雷 [22] 南
桃花扇。

THE FIRST WORKS OF JAPANESE POSTWAR LITERATURE PRESENTING THE ATOMIC TRAGEDY OF HIROSHIMA AND THEIR SIGNIFICANCE

KAROL KUTKA, Bratislava

The study concentrates on the first writings in Japanese postwar literature that dealt with the topic of the atomic bomb dropped on Hiroshima. Its primary intent is to point to the background of their origin, to their content and ideational meaning within the context of postwar literature, as well as to their artistic legacy which even today loses nothing of its urgency. Attention is also devoted to those facts that impelled writers to make an artistic statement on this topic.

I. Introductory Remarks on Japanese Literature of the First Postwar Years and on Literature about the Atom Bomb

Towards the end of World War II, when the din and the clatter of weapons were dying down also in the Far East, atom bombs were dropped on the Japanese towns of Hiroshima and Nagasaki — on August 6 and 8, 1945, respectively. The destructive explosions took the lives of tens of thousands of people within the fraction of a second and condemned further tens of thousands to a gradual death, the intervening respite being filled with unimaginable sufferings and fear of the morrow. The atomic tragedy of Hiroshima and Nagasaki, the first of its kind in the history of mankind, came to be necessarily reflected — just as the war itself, conducted by Japanese imperialism — in Japanese postwar literature.

It was no mere chance that following the defeat of militaristic Japan, which meant a significant divide in the development of modern Japanese literature, writers taking contact with the prewar movement of proletarian literature were the very first to initiate a revival of literary activity. After a prolonged period of darkness when proletarian and progressively thinking writers in general, had been subjected to increasing reprisals and were forbidden to carry out all publishing activity, they quickly set about renewing their literary activity and initiated a struggle for a new democratic literature. Those influenced by ideas of the progressive and democratic movement were the so-called *après-guerre* writers (or the postwar group) *daiichi sengoha* [1], who represented the most outstanding literary movement of the first postwar period.

It was quite natural that the principal thematic domain for these writers who had been directly through front battles, should have been the war itself. Just as stated in the publication *Introduction to Contemporary Japanese Literature*, "they wanted to grasp the essence of man and society anew, and express it comprehensively in their

works. At the bottom of these efforts were their war experiences or their experiences of ideological conversion".[1] They not only made a critical appraisal of their own war experiences, but also subjected to an analysis the more complex philosophical and socio-moral issues, as for instance responsibility for the war. Their works give testimony not only to the imperialist character of the war as pursued by Japan, but simultaneously also to the horrors and sufferings that war brings in its wake. A characteristic trait of these works is humanism, progressive ideas, an unequivocal condemnation of war and a yearning for life in peace.

The context of literature about the war which, during the first postwar years represented the principal literary movement — essentially quite a natural phenomenon — also includes literature dealing with the topic of the atom bombs dropped on Hiroshima and Nagasaki. Although works of the "atomic" literature — *genbaku bungaku* [2] won recognition on the part of both literary circles and readers at large rather belatedly after their publication, the artistic processing of the Hiroshima and Nagasaki topics undeniably constitutes an inseparable part and parcel of the progressively and democratically oriented movement of Japanese literature during the first postwar years.

Literature processing the topic of atom bombs in Japan has passed till now through several developmental stages and its significance has grown with the growing arsenal of more and more effective nuclear weaponry and the threat of an imminent nuclear conflict. Nagaoka Hiroyoshi [3] in his History of Atomic Literature, *Genbaku bungaku shi* [4], recognizes four periods in the development of this type of literature up to the year 1967, the first period lasting until the year 1950—1951.[2] The present study will focus on the first works of this first period, works that represent the beginning and became the vanguard in the development of atomic literature. This process, of course, did not stop with the year 1967 but goes on even at the present time, as evident not only in the appearance of new works, but also in the widespread progressive movement of Japanese writers for the prevention of the nuclear threat, headed by Ōe Kenzaburō [6], Nakano Kōji [7], Ōda Minoru [8], Inoue Hisashi [9], Kinoshita Junji [10] and many others.[3]

The literary scholar Odagiri Hideo [15] was one of the first to appreciate the

---

[1] *Introduction to Contemporary Japanese Literature. Synopses of Major Works 1956—1970.* University of Tokyo Press 1972, p. XV.

[2] Nagaoka Hiroyoshi: *Genbaku bungaku shi.* History of Atomic Literature. Fūbai shuppan [5], Nagoya 1973, pp. 5—6.

[3] For more details re. beginning of the antinuclear movement of Japanese writers, see: *Kakusensō no kiki o uttaeru bungakusha no seimei* [11] *Writers'Appeal on the Danger of Nuclear War.* In: Iwanami bukkuretto [12]. No. 2, Tokyo, April 1982. Also Nakano Kōji: *Hankaku ni gōryū shita bungakusha no nikusei* [13]. Natural Appeal of Writers Who Had Joined the Antinuclear Movement. In: Asahi Jānaru [14]. February 25, 1982, pp. 8—11. This article appeared in English, slightly abridged, under the heading: *Japanese Pens Defy the Nuclear Sword.* In: Japan Echo, *IX*, No. 3, 1982, pp. 20—24.

weightiness of the content and significance of the first works of the atomic literature; in his study *Genshiryoko mondai to bungaku* [16] Problems of Atomic Energy and Literature, in which he points out the fundamental difference in the utilization of atomic energy for a policy of "atomic imperialism of the United States" and the policy of a peaceful utilization of atomic energy by the Soviet Union, he writes as follows in connection with questions of freedom under conditions of the persistance of a nuclear threat: "Literature, always closely connected with the life of the people and their requirement of liberty, by creating its own, original beauty, has come to be one of the inner supports of the development of life, liberty and mankind, no matter what formation is involved, exists up to the present time, incessantly deeply linked with the blood, tears and sweat shed for the sake of liberty and progress. The relation between literature and freedom . . . is a fundamental relation. Consequently, faced with the threat of a loss of everything — of human life and freedom as such, literature could not avoid a confrontation with this crisis. In view of the new conditions, literature, too, will have to be re-assessed . . . and in relation to the greatest task facing mankind in the second half of the 20th century, writers must do their utmost in order to prevent a destructive use of atomic energy."[4] At the present time, when the Soviet Union incessantly strives for nuclear disarmament and has bound itself not to use as the first nuclear weapons, while the United States on the contrary are developing new arms within the framework of the so-called peaceful policy, more effective means of mass destruction and strive to pollute also the cosmic space with nuclear weapons, these words carry a twofold value.

Just as *sengo-ha* writers drew in their literary works on their own war experiences, or rather they may be said to have been provoked by war with its sequelae to their artistic statement, so also authors of the first works about the atom bomb, about Hiroshima and Nagasaki were writers who had been eyewitnesses of the atomic hell. Not only did this event influence in an essential manner their way of thinking, stimulate their work and determine its content orientation, but it simultaneously decided their private life.

What was the reason why literature about the atom bomb of the first postwar years failed to occupy such a significant position in the literary process as literature produced by the *après-guerre* writers — a position that would have rightly belonged to it from the aspect of criteria laid on literary work, i.e. from the aspect of its functionalism and ideation, as also the weightiness of its content? Such a situation was brought about primarily by the action of two basic factors: an external one — the policy of the principal occupying power, the United States of America, and an internal one — the attitude on the part of the literary circles towards the issue of the atom bomb.

---

[4] Odagiri Hideo: *Genshiryoku mondai to bungaku.* In: Odagiri Hideo (Ed.): *Genshiryoku to bungaku* [17] Atomic Energy and Literature. Dai Nihon yūbenkai Kōdansha [18], Tokyo 1955, pp. 179—180.

While doing away with the old administrative order in Japan, the US occupation command set up new control offices over culture with the task to exercise a strict censorship over everything that was printed and this, of course, in the interest of the U.S.A. These ends were served particularly by the Press Code of September 19, 1945, which proscribed all writings liable to cast an unfavourable light on the United States or criticise their policy.[5] That meant that the budding literature came right from its beginning under the control and censorship of the occupying power of the United States which, understandably enough, strove that as little as possible should be written on this topic. Yoshida Kin'ichi [22] writes about this as follows: "...Before those who had been forced to keep silent during the war, a new enemy appeared at the moment when they tried, within the framework of their literary activity, to present testimony to the horrors of the atom bomb.

At the time when the poets' task was to write precisely about what the enemy endeavoured to keep secret, America showed to us her real face under the heading of the Press Code. People say that Japan has recovered after her lost war thanks to American aid. But precisely this America required of the Japanese nation, under strong pressure, to keep silence about all that was connected with the atom bomb."[6]

By enforcing censorship over the problem of atomic war, the United States evidently endeavoured to keep the problem of Hiroshima and Nagasaki to be a local one, to refer solely to these two towns and the people who survived the attack — and in this manner to prevent the atom bomb from becoming not merely a Japanese issue, but a problem of the whole mankind. And although Hiroshima and Nagasaki did get into partial isolation, especially during the first postwar years, the United States failed to fully succeed in their design. Hiroshima and Nagasaki presented too bitter an experience for censorship to succeed in hushing it up, too hot a hell for censorship to force writers to be silent.

As already stated, such a situation was also determined by the action of an inner factor — an inner opposition of writers and literary circles to this topic. This was evident also, for example, from the fact that while works by après-guerre writers described the sufferings and horrors of the war whose originator and organizer was Japanese imperialism, the explosion of the atom bombs was an act aimed against militaristic Japan which bore the guilt for this war. In addition, the immediate postwar period was as yet far too short a time for the population and the writers themselves — particularly those who had not been witnesses of the atomic catastrophe — adequately and fully to grasp the true meaning of that deed as also of

---

[5] *Sengo shiryō* [19] Postwar Materials. Masukomi [20] Mass Media. Nihon hyōronsha [22], Tokyo 1970, p. 1.

[6] Yoshida Kin'ichi: *Kurihara Sadako no shi kōdo ni tsuite* [23] *On Kurihara Sadako's Poetic Activity*. In: *Kurihara Sadako shishū* [24]. Poetical Works of Kurihara Sadako. *Nihon gendai shi bunko* [25] Library of Contemporary Japanese Poetry, Vol. 17, Doyō bijutsusha [26], Tokyo 1984, p. 148.

the atom bomb itself, to become conscious of what came out only later, namely that the United States in this case did not primarily follow purely military goals ensuing from the ongoing war, but had in view tactical, experimental, political aims above all. It was as yet too short a time lapse for the writers to understand and realize that the atom bomb did not mean the end of wars, but the beginning of a new danger that looms far greater than the last war.

Yet a further important fact played its role here. The war which the *après-guerre* writers described in their works had lasted for many long, unbearable years. During that time, hatred of and aversion to war had cumulated in these writers, a war in which they were, willy-nilly, involved. Hence, it is understandable that their long-term, stored experiences became reflected in literature shortly after the war like a mighty geyser. On the other hand, the explosion of the atom bomb was a single occurrence, an event that related solely to Hiroshima and Nagasaki and, in addition, lasted but a relatively brief lapse of time — two days at the end of the war, appearing to many at first as a consequence of the war. Hence, a longer lapse of time was necessary for writers, particularly those who had not been witnesses of this apocalypse, adequately to become conscious of the horror of the atom bomb in all its depth, as also of the havoc it had wrought, in order rightly to grasp the weightiness and significance of the first works of the atomic literature.

II. The First Issue of the Literary Magazine *Chūgoku bunka* Culture of the Chūgoku Region

Although Hiroshima following the atomic explosion was a shambles with a deci- mated population, yet literary life in this region was renewed relatively promptly. Here, too, the very first to join the new, democratic and progressively oriented literary movement were writers who had been associated or had sympathized with the prewar proletarian literature, writers who had been forcibly reduced to silence during the war. The end of the war did not mean a defeat to them, but a longed-for peace, freedom, and therefore, filled with ideas of humanism and democracy, they looked forward with hope to the future. The principal trends, typical of the renewal of the literary life following the capitulation, as also the direction of development in Japanese literature during the first postwar years were manifest in a like intensity also in Hiroshima.[7] In this, Hiroshima did not differ from the other literary centres of the country. Nevertheless, there was here one specificity which needs must be reflected in the works of progressively oriented writers. That was the atom bomb which became to many the starting-point of their work, to others it meant a sudden

---

[7] For more details on the postwar literary life in Hiroshima, see: I w a s a k i S e i i c h i r ō [27]: *Hiroshima no bungei* [28] The Art of Hiroshima. *Shōsetsu — hyōron* [29] Literature — Criticism. *Hiroshima bunka sōsho* [30] Series Culture of Hiroshima. Vol. 5, Hiroshima bunka shuppan [31], 1973, pp. 66—87.

turning-point in their way of thinking. Writing in Hiroshima began amidst wreckage and ruins.

Considerable credit for the renewal of literary life in Hiroshima goes to Hosoda Tamiki [32] (1892—1972) — a writer strongly influenced by Tolstoy's ideas of humanism — whose works from the early 20's criticizing the Japanese army elicited general attention. He actively joined the movement of proletarian literature and did not renounce his conviction and his progressive ideas even at the time when fascist terror reached its climax.

According to *Kurihara Sadako nenpu* [33] — Kurihara Sadako's Chronological Record, on the third day following the dropping of the atom bomb, i.e. August 9, — Hosoda Tamiki paid a visit to Kurihara Tadaichi [34] and his poet wife and spoke with them about the imminent end of the war and a renewal of the cultural and literary movement after the war. The same source also mentions that on August 9, the poetess Kurihara Sadako (1913) wrote the first verses on the topic of the atom bomb: one was a Japanese verse — *tanka Genbaku tōka no hi* [35], The Day When the Atomic Bomb Was Dropped, and *Akumu* [36], Nightmare.[8] On the initiative of these three, *Chūgoku bunka renmei* [37] — The Cultural Union of the Chūgoku Region was founded, based on and taking contact with the progressive traditions of the prewar movement of proletarian literature. The Union set as its aim to cooperate in creating the culture of the new Japan on democratic principles. These democratic trends were implemented in the very first issue of the Union's magazine, *Chūgoku bunka* [38] — Culture of the Chūgoku Region, which appeared in March 1946. The significance of the magazine resided in the fact that it was devoted to the atom bomb and was published as *Genshi bakudan tokushū gō* [39] — Special Issue on the Atom Bomb, inserted as sub-title on the front page.[9] It was in fact the first time that the public had an opportunity to witness an attempt at a literary processing of the topic of the atom bomb, the topic of *Hiroshima* in literature. In view of the Press Code referred to above, this was a bold feat at this time, which deserves not only our attention but also recognition and even admiration.

The Special Issue on the Atom Bomb — the first number of the magazine *Chūgoku bunka* was not a simple matter and did not escape interventions on the part of censorship. As Kurihara Sadako states: ". . . this magazine was subject to the censorship of the Allied Supreme Command in Fukuoka, and it was printed

---

[8] *Kurihara Sadako nenpu, Kurihara Sadako's Chronological Record.* In: *Kurihara Sadako shishū,* p. 156.

[9] *Chūgoku bunka. Sōkan gō* [40] The First Issue. *Genshi bakudan tokushū gō.* Chūgoku bunka hakkōsho [41], Hiroshima, March 1946. Reprint of the whole first number, supplemented with a selection of articles published in Nos 2 to 18, and materials relating to the Union and the magazine, appeared in 1981. See: '*Chūgoku bunka' Genshi bakudan tokushū gō — fukkoku* [42] Culture of the Chūgoku Region. Special Issue about the Atom Bomb — Reprint. *Chūgoku bunka fukkoku kankō no kai* [43], Association for the Edition of the reprint Culture of the Chūgoku Region. Hiroshima, May 1981.

according to the instructions of the Americans. It was also subject to further checks, and the publisher (Kurihara Tadaichi — author's remark) was, on top of this, subject to a severe interrogation by the Civil Information Department of the American Secret Police CIC, today's CIA, in Kureshiki".[10] At the Civil Information Department, Kurihara Tadaichi was subjected to a cross-examination on the grounds that he put obstacles to the implementation of the occupation policy of the United States Army. The CIC officer gave as reason Tadaichi's undue stress on the antihuman character of the atom bomb. As Iwasaki Seiichirō remarks: ". . . freedom of expression was indeed granted to the postwar society, but during the period of occupation it was implemented within the framework of a secretly organized system of censorship whose aim was to control criticism of the occupation policy".[11]

Of the papers included in the first issue of the magazine *Chūgoku bunka*, the following deserve attention: the introductory editorial article by Kurihara Tadaichi *'Chūgoku bunka' hakkan narabi ni genshi bakudan tokushū gō ni tsuite* [44] On the Launching of Culture of the Chūgoku Region and the Special Issue on the Atom Bomb,[12] an essay entitled *'Minshu sensen' no bungaku e* [45] — For a Literature of the Democratic Front, from the pen of a leading personality of the magazine, Hosoda Tamiki,[13] and an essay by Jata Kōichi [46], *Ippai no bancha* [47], Over a Cup of Tea,[14] in which ideas of humanism and democracy came out to the forefront — principles that guided the Cultural Union of the Chūgoku region and its press organ.

These original literary works were the first attempts at an artistic processing of the atom bomb topic. Three short prose works comprised in the magazine, viz. *Mikkakan* [48] Three Days by Okubo Sawako [49], [15] *Maboroshi* [50] Phantom by Yamamoto Yasuo [51][16] and *Kyōten* [52] Unlucky Point by Iguchi Genzaburō [53],[17] capture the fateful day of the atom bomb catastrophe of Hiroshima. The author of the last work tries to depict, outwardly in a cynical style, people's way of acting following the crash of the bomb. However, that is merely feigned cynicism, some sort of a smile through tears, whereby the author strove to uncover the horror of which he had been a witness, to set it off even more and thus to express his protest

---

[10] Kurihara Sadako: *A Lecture Text, The sufferings of writers who experienced Hiroshima, and contemporary literature on the subject of the atomic bomb. 18 bis 25 Juni in Köln, West Germany.* In: Kurihara Sadako: *The Songs of Hiroshima, When Hiroshima is Spoken of.* Anthology Publishing Association, Hiroshima, October 1983, p. 17.

[11] Iwasaki Seiichirō, op. cit., p. 68.

[12] *Chūgoku bunka. Sōkan gō. Genshibakudan tokushū gō,* p. 1.

[13] Ibid., pp. 2—6.

[14] Ibid., pp. 7—9.

[15] Ibid., pp. 12—15.

[16] Ibid., pp. 15—19.

[17] Ibid., pp. 19—20.

against the atom bomb, against the inhumanity of this deed. According to Nagaoku Hiroyoshi: ". . . outwardly, the work impresses as cynical, but against a background of designedly simple phenomena, we can understand part of the human psyche".[18]

The Special Issue on the Atom Bomb comprised also poetry in the traditional form *tanka*,[19] and *haiku*[20] and also a number of poems,[21] many of which were of a high artistic level and for many years counted as the vanguard of the developing poetry about the atom bomb.[22] A well-deserved place among them belongs to the 18-verse poem by Kurihara Sadako *Umashimenkana* [54] We Shall Bring Forth New Life.[23] In it the poetess captured a real event that took place shortly after the bomb had dropped. In the middle of the night, a new life is born in a dark cellar overcrowded with bleeding victims of the atomic explosion. A gravely wounded midwife forgets her own pain and helps to bring a new human life into the world, after which, blood-covered, she dies. Especially impressive is the conclusion of the poem:

Umashimenkana	I shall give forth new life
Umashinenkana	I shall give forth new life
Onore ga inochi sutettomo [55]	Even to my death[24]

The cogency of this true versified episode resides in the ideative content, in its symbolism, in the hope and faith in the rebirth of a new life in Hiroshima which lay in ruins. Kurihara Sadako comments this poem and the motif that had prompted it, as follows:

"I wrote this poem at the end of the horrific month of August, at a time when corpses lay everywhere in Hiroshima. And the people who were suffering from the direct effects of the bombardment, were slowly dying from the effects of radiation. At a time like this, new life had been born; I was fascinated, and had to write it down. What does this birth, this new life, in the dark cellar mean? It was the birth of a new Hiroshima that would not cease to long for peace in the world. It happened at the end of a 15-year expansionist war waged by Japanese Imperialism in Asia. What does this blood-covered midwife mean who died before she could see the dawn? She is a symbol of those 200,000 people killed by the bomb, who died without experiencing the first day of peace, August 15."[25]

The significance of the Special Issue on the Atom Bomb resides not merely in the fact that, regardless of the difficulties with the censorship of the American occupation power, it undertook as the first to try and process artistically the topic of

---

[18] Hagaoka Hiroyoshi, op. cit., p. 8.

[19] *Chūgoku bunka. Sōkan gō. Genshi bakudan tokushū gō*, pp. 26—33.

[20] Ibid., pp. 34—35.

[21] Ibid., pp. 21—25.

[22] Nagaoka Hiroyoshi, op. cit., 8.

[23] *Chūgoku bunka. Sōkan gō. Genshi bakudan tokushū gō*, pp. 21—22.

[24] Translated by Wayne Lammers.

[25] Kurihara Sadako: *A Lecture Text*, pp. 22—23.

the atomic bomb, but also in that the magazine brings the first, genuine, unallayed statements by writers — people who were eyewitnesses of the atomic horror and would not keep silent. They wrote their works at a time when they were as yet ignorant of the whole truth regarding the atom bomb and its appalling, horrendous sequelae, at a time when as yet they could not even surmise that for those who survived, suffering was only beginning. In these first works of the atomic literature we find tears and a cynical smile, suffering, sorrow and hope — everything that is characteristic of works processing the topic of atomic bombs. Many of the works can be reproached a lack of artistic matureness, but certainly not ideation, and precisely the latter conceals the real strength and significance of these works. The deep ideas of humanism comprised in these first writings of the atomic literature lose nothing of their weightiness even today.

III. The First Works Depicting the Tragedy of Hiroshima and the Effect of the Atom Bomb on the Formation of Writers' Moral and Ethical Attitudes

The explosion of the atom bomb became reflected in writers who survived it — victims of the bomb — on two planes: it affected their private life, and also their literary creation; their life attitudes as men and as writers. The atom bomb intervened into their private life, influenced and determined their way of thinking which many critics could not understand for a long time and many still do not grasp, or refuse to, even today. It intervened into their conscience and affected their moral and ethical attitudes, their sense of responsibility towards society, towards mankind.

The poetess Kurihara Sadako is today one of the few living writers that witnessed the atomic catastrophe of Hiroshima. Shortly after the publication of the Special Issue on the Atom Bomb in the first number of the magazine *Chūgoku bunka* in which she took an active part, she published her first collection of poetry *Kuroi tamago* [56] Black Egg,[26] through the good offices of the Cultural Union of the Chūgoku Region. This rounded poetic work, conceptually well grounded, with an introduction by a leading personality of the Union, comprises 252 *tanka* and 26 poems, including also the one referred to above, We Shall Bring Forth New Life.

Nor did this strikingly democratic and progressively tuned work with a strong antiwar accent, escape interventions by the censorship which impoverished it by 11 *tanka* and 3 poems. The collection includes poetry which she had written secretly during the course of the long war years and captures the poetess' ideological development, her attitude to the war which Japan waged, her unequivocal condemnation of war, her defamation of the *tennoism* system that reigned in Japan, but

---

[26] K u r i h a r a S a d a k o: *Kuroi tamago. Chūgoku bunka hakkōsho,* Hiroshima, August 1946. The original is difficult to come by, but part of the poems in this collection are published in *Kurihara Sadako shishū,* pp. 10—19.

89

also the first verses about the Hiroshima tragedy, about the atom bomb. It goes without saying that such poems, as e.g. *Futatabi taiyō o* [57] May the Sun Shine Again, from the year 1941, [27] *Kuroi tamago* from 1942,[28] *Senso to wa nani ka* [58] What is War? from 1942,[29] or *Subete no sensen kara* [59] From all the fronts, from the year 1943[30] in which she condemned the "holy" war and called for peace at a time when *"senso banzai!"* (Hurray for the War!) resounded on all sides, could be published only after the war.

Two moments decided Kurihara Sadako's life as a human being and as a poetess: Japan's imperialist war in Asia and the explosion of the atom bomb in Hiroshima. These two moments became the point of departure for her work and influenced its ideational content. She never succeeded in giving up the topic of Hiroshima and condemnation of war, although she hurted against obstacles laid down by the American occupying forces and frequent lack of understanding on the part of home literary circles. Kurihara Sadako's poetry is convincing because her insight is never one-sided. She does not strive merely to condemn the atom bomb, does not point solely to the antihuman deed of the United States, but directs her sharp criticism also against Japanese imperialism — the originator of the war and in that sense also against the person of the emperor himself, which is very unpopular, but on the other hand, this factor imparts objectiveness and convincingness to her poetry.

*

Among those who refused to keep silent despite the strict censorship on the part of the occupation offices, was also the poetess Shōda Shinoe [60] (1911—1965), who survived the atomic explosion in Hiroshima, but subsequently succumbed to its sequelae. Shōda Shinoe published secretly, without approbation by the occupying offices, her private collection of poems under the heading *Sange* [61][31] Scattering Flowers. It comprises a total of 100 *tanka*, in which she describes the horrors of the atomic explosion and the sufferings of innocent people. What prompted her to undergo the risk and secretely to publish her literary testimony regarding the tragedy of Hiroshima? As she herself mentioned later, it was: ". . . an urge to express

---

[27] *Kurihara Sadako shishū*, pp. 14—15.

[28] Ibid., p. 10.

[29] Ibid., pp. 12—13.

[30] Ibid., pp. 13—14.

[31] Shōda Shinoe: *Sange. Shikahan* [62], Private edition, Hiroshima, December 1947. In reality, the work had appeared already in March 1946. The falsified date as stated was meant to mislead the occupation officers should they discover this secret edition. Cf.: Mizuta Kuwajirō: [63]: *Genbaku o yomu* [64] Readings on the Atomic Bomb. *Hiroshima—Nagasaki o kataritsugu zen bukku risuto* [65] Complete List of Books Giving Testimony on Hiroshima and Nagasaki. Kōdansha [66], Tokyo 1982, p. 21.

sympathy for those who stayed dead on the spot, those who died later, it was a feeling constantly alive, the sorrow and grief of suffering people. . ."[32] The writer's sense of responsibility towards the society, whose basis was humanism, proved much stronger than any pressure exerted by the occupation power. Shōda Shinoe could not keep silent about what she had witnessed, about that which she hold to be inhuman, although it might cost her her life. "I was told — she recalls — that if they discover it, the death punishment will not miss me. But I carried out this secret edition with an invincible feeling . . . with a determination even at the cost of my life, should it come to that."[33]

<center>*</center>

Progressively thinking writers — witnesses and simultaneously also victims of the atomic catastrophe, felt a deep inner need to write about the horrors caused by the atom bomb. This need sprang forth from their inner conviction, from their deep consciousness of responsibility as men, but also as writers towards the society, towards mankind and humanity, or humanism. They understood their artistic processing of the topic of the atom bomb as their moral and ethical duty.

Ōta Yōko [70] (1903—1963) writes about a writer's attitude — a witness of the atomic catastrophe — in her novel *Shikabane no machi* [71] Town of Corpses, as follows:

"— How can you look at it? I can't stop to look at corpses — my younger sister chided me.

I replied to her:

— I am a writer. And I look at it in two ways, as a human being and as a writer.

— And can you write anything at all about it?

— Sometime I must write about it. It is the duty of a writer who has seen it."[34]

Ōta Yōko began to write the novel Town of Corpses immediately following the atomic explosion in Hiroshima, i.e. in August 1945 and finished it in November that year. As she says herself: ". . . I hurried with the writing of the Town of Corpses. If, like the others I, too, should die, I had to make haste with my writing."[35] And Ōta Yōko wrote, without taking note of her own difficulties and the ban of the occupying army, on bits of paper and the yellowed paper-screen from the *shōji* (sliding-door) and this in moments when she lay on the borders between life and death, not knowing whether she would live to see the next day.[36] Shōda Shinoe had decided to present

---

[32] Shoda Shinoe: *Miminari* [67] *Ringing in the Ears. Genbaku kajin shuki* [68] Jottings by a Poetess Writing about the Atomic Bomb. Heibonsha [69], 1962.

[33] Ibid.

[34] Ōta Yōko: *Shikabane no machi*. Chūō kōronsha [72] 1948.

[35] Ōta Yōko: *Jobun* [73], *Introduction. Shikabane no machi*. Toga shobō [74] 1950.

[36] Ibid.

her testimony about Hiroshima even if it would cost her her life. Ōta Yōko yearned to die once her writer duty would be finished.[37]The feeling of responsibility towards the society and towards mankind was equally intensive in both these writers and their attitude towards life and death was fully influenced by the explosion of the atom bomb.

In the novel Town of Corpses, Ōta Yōko describes in the form of a literary reportage, the first three days which she survived in Hiroshima following the dropping of the atom bomb. She describes the events in their successive course as they followed one another, striving to keep the fictive aspect down to a minimum, so as to adhere as close as possible to reality which she had experienced. Kuroko Kazuo [75] has this to say about it: "Although the writer confines the radius of her description to what she herself had seen and heard and to the emotions thus aroused, yet the reader's imagery exceeds this description and thus the reader can grasp most faithfully Hiroshima's situation immediately after the bombardment. This is evidently due to the fact that ultimately the reader is totally swallowed up by the writer's wrath and he looks at Hiroshima through the same eyes as Ōta Yōko."[38] And Ōta Yōko compels every reader to reflect and ponder over the important, fundamental question — was the tragedy of Hiroshima and the sufferings of its inhabitants truly inevitable? Is it at all possible to exculpate this deed of the American army?

The uccupying power gave permission for the work to be published in 1948 only and this following extensive censorship interventions affecting some of the parts which the authoress considered as of great importance.[39] The complete edition of Town of Corpses came out in 1950 only, i.e. at a time when the strict censorship system had somewhat relaxed, which of course, was not conditioned by any magnanimity on the part of the Americans, but rather by an overall change in the occupation policy under the influence of the national liberation movement in Asia and the new role that Japan began to play in the United States Far Eastern policy. But another important factor here was the fact that despite all efforts to the contrary, exerted by the occupation power, Hiroshima and Nagasaki penetrated deeper and deeper into the consciousness not only of the Japanese themselves, but of all the progressive people over the world. This trend became strikingly evident in literature of the atom bomb by an intense growth in the number of works of the most diverse genres.[40]

---

[37] Ibid.

[38] Kuroko Kazuo: Genbaku to kotoba [76] The Atomic Bomb and Expression. Hara Tamiki kara Hayashi Kyōko made [77] From Hara Tamiki up to Hayashi Kyōko. San'ichi shobō [78], Tokyo 1983, p. 39.

[39] Ōta Yōko: Jobun. Shikabane no machi.

[40] Thus for example Genbaku kankei bunken ichiran [79] Bibliographic Review dealing with the atomic bomb lists 18 of the most important works for the period 1945—1948, but 39 for 1949—1950. See Genbaku kankei bunken ichiran. In: Mizuta Kuwajirō, op. cit., pp. 368—370.

Ōta Yōko drew on the Hiroshima topic also in her further works. In fact, she never succeeded in depersonifying herself from this theme throughout her life and stated her reasons for this as follows:

"On finishing the Town of Corpses, I intended to write a work of a different type, one that would not be related to the atom bomb. However, the phantom of Hiroshima — this seal on my conscience — did not permit me to mould any new idea. . . It compelled me to return to that reality — destruction of the whole town, hundreds of thousands of people — to a tragedy that has entered my life. All wish to write a book about something else just died away. And in order to write about Hiroshima of August 1945, I had again to revive the events of those days in my memory, to bring them back into my consciousness, but this made me giddy and I felt overcome with nausea. . ."[41]

To revive and recall the frightful moments of this tragedy that permanently entered her life, was neither easy nor simple. It required courage to face misunderstanding, a humanist conviction and strong moral and aesthetic principles that remained adamant even during the war. Nevertheless, not even these factors, although important, were sufficient. For the topic of Hiroshima and Nagasaki, a topic of atom bombs to achieve the literary form of a full-blooded work of art, to enter literature and become its part, an author had to realize and grasp the essence of the atom bomb. Writers who understood the explosion of the atom bomb as part of the ongoing war could not become conscious of the essence of this deed and in their works could not draw on this topic. Such an attitude could not become an impulse to the creation of a convincing literary work of great value about Hiroshima and Nagasaki and consequently in their work they rather inclined to the prewar modernist movements. As K. Recho states: "Hiroshima raises weighty problems of modern art before writers. Hiroshima's tragedy has become a complex school of humanism for Japanese literature, one of the mighty factors stimulating a humanists comprehension of the present times. A consciousness of Hiroshima's tragedy has again brought out the irreconcilableness between realistic art and modernism."[42]

The picture of Hiroshima, burnt, scorched and levelled with the ground after the atomic explosion, a picture of corpses with inhumanly marred, disfigured bodies and faces, a picture of living corpses that waited for death as for redemption, a picture of victims suffering unspeakable tortures, calling for help, or piteously entreating for a drop of water — that was a picture of hell that became deeply and permanently engraved in the mind and the sensitive heart of the writer and poet Hara Tamiki (1905—1951). He was a writer of a broad erudition. In his youth he liked to read Gogol, Chekhov, Dostoyevsky and Tolstoy. He studied Greek philosophy. Before

---

[41] Ōta Yōko: *Jobun, Shikabane no machi.*

[42] Recho, K.: *Sovremennyi yaponskii roman* (Contemporary Japanese Novel). Moscow, Nauka, 1977, p. 258.

the war he was for a brief period of time attracted by Dadaism, but when the movement of proletarian literature was steadily gaining influence in Japan, he intensively studied Marxist philosophy and was in close contact with the leftist movement until its disruption by the coming militarism.[43]

The topical orientation of his postwar prosaic and poetic works, but also his personal life became influenced by the picture of Hiroshima after the atomic explosion. He began to take notes on the atomic horror of which he was a witness, immediately after the explosion of the bomb[44] and already in autumn, regardless of "his extreme exhaustion and distress from hunger",[45] he wrote the story *Genshi bakudan* [90] which he subsequently renamed *Natsu no hana (Summer Flower)*. He intended to publish it in the first issue of the magazine *Kindai bungaku* [91] Modern Literature which was then in preparation and came out in January 1946, nevertheless, although the story met with recognition and was highly appreciated, it was not included on account of the American strict censorship. It took practically two years for the story, much revised, to appear in June 1947 in the magazine *Mita bungaku* [92] Mita Literature,[46] of whose editorial staff also Hara Tamiki was a member. The circulation of the magazine was small and the censor evidently overlooked the story *Natsu no hana.* [47]

Where was the fountainhead of that indomitable inner strength that drove Hara Tamiki to give a literary testimony to Hiroshima without caring for subjective and objective external and internal obstacles? As in the case of Ōta Yōko and others, this strength gushed forth from a deep conviction about the role and obligation of the writer — witness of the apocalypse, towards the society, towards mankind; it sprang from a deep humanism, faith and hope which he confided in man. Hara expressed this conviction clearly, simply and simultaneously with artistic conviction, in the story *Summer Flower:*

". . . When I sat at the side of a narrow road near a river, I had the feeling that I was saved. That which had for long been scaring me, that which was to come, had already come. With a sense of relief I reflected that I was alive. Some time before I had thought that perhaps half of them would perish, but now I was excited by the thought that I live.

I'll have to note it all down — I said to myself mentally. But then I was far from knowing the whole truth about this air-raid."[48]

---

[43] Masuoka Toshikazu [80]: *Hiroshima no shijin tachi* [81] Hiroshima's Poets. Publishing House *Shin nihon shinsho* [82]. Vol. 134, *Shin Nihon shuppansha* [83], Tokyo 1980, p. 8.

[44] These notes were published under the heading *Genbaku hisaiji no nōto* [84] Notes from the Time of Suffering from the Atomic Explosion. In: *Hara Tamiki zenshū* [85] Complete Edition of Hara Tamiki's Works Seidosha [86] Tokyo 1978, Vol. 3.

[45] Hara Tamiki: *Goki* [87] In: *Natsu no hana* [88] Summer Flower. Nōgaku shorin [89] 1949.

[46] The magazine's title is derived from a place name in Tokyo.

[47] Mizuta Kuwajirō: op. cit., p. 40.

Hara Tamiki could never forget the people, "such as no words could describe. . . But who were in fact these people? Such as could not be told whether they were men or women, with deformed, swollen faces, with eyes narrowed to threads, with horribly scarred lips", people who "exposing their pain-stricken bodies, lay closer to death than to life".[49] Nor the victim's pitiful cries for a drop of water. He could never forget that which — sa Ōta Yōko wrote — could not be termed otherwise than hell, even though she considered the use of such a word as the ultimate[50] — a hell that was incomparably more terrible and "more infernal" than the picture of hell in Akutagawa Ryūnosuke's story [93] *Jigoku hen* [94] *The Hell Screen*,[51] for it takes support in painful reality, in a true hell which he had seen. This is the way he describes it:

". . . I could scan practically the whole place of conflagration. On this extensive space of silvery nothingness spreading out under the glittering sun, there were roads, there were rivers, there were bridges. And here and there corpses were laid out, flayed from their skin, red and bloated. A new hell, created in an absolutely precise way — all that had been human, was blotted out, even the corpses' expression had changed into something modelled, mechanical. The dead bodies which had evidently stiffened desperately fighting in the last second of anxiety, concealed within them a specific, bewitched rhythm. Broken electric wires strewn about, enormous heaps of débris and splinters gave the impression of a convulsive sketch of nothingness."[52]

This description of the town's tragedy and of people outwardly rings as gruff, abrupt, documentary, however, the captivating and artistic expression in *Summer Flower* resides in the terseness of the realistic description, in the careful choice of the means of expression in which one feels the author's poetic background, but also in the humanist way of acting of the principal personage of the work, which is the author himself. Hara presents a sincere testimony in which he reveals not only what he saw, only the exterior, but also the interior. He interprets his own attitude, his own views and deep thoughts.[53] In this manner he achieved a realistic, plastic description which absorbs the reader, compelling him not only to feel, but also to ponder. He is not concerned with eliciting a feeling of sympathy, participation on the part of the

---

[48] Hara Tamiki: *Natsu no hana.* This story is considered to be one of his best works about the atom bomb and has appeared in numerous editions. It is likewise one of the most translated works from the atomic literature. It has appeared in English, Russian, German, Hungarian, Polish and Slovak.

[49] Ibid.

[50] Ōta Yōko: *Shikabane no machi.*

[51] Akutagawa Ryūnosuke: *Jigoku hen.* The Hell Screen. In: *Akutagawa Ryūnosuke zenshū* [95] Complete Works of Akutagawa Ryūnosuke. Chikuma shobō [96], Tokyo 1979, Vol. I, pp. 265—289.

[52] Hara Tamiki: *Natsu no hana.*

[53] Udō Toshirō [97] also writes about the identification of the principal personage in the story and its author: *Sangeki no chokushi to nageki* [98] A Direct Look at Tragedy and Grief. *Hara Tamiki Natsu no hana ni tsuite* [99] About Hara Tamiki's Summer Flower. In: *Minshu bungaku* [100] Democratic Literature, August 1971, No. 69, p. 89.

reader, or of sadness and compassion, but to bring him to reflect, and to condemn the atom bomb, to feel an aversion towards it. And precisely in this is concealed the principal significance not only of *Summer Flower,* but of all the works dealing with atomic literature which many failed to apprehend until the moment when the notion and threat of mankind's new suffering has become real and unbearable. Odagiri Hideo writes as follows about these issues:

"Summer Flower and Town of Corpses have become the first testimony of Japanese writers aimed against the evil of the atom bomb... However, the great majority of people — including myself — have failed correctly to grasp the meaning of Summer Flower and of the Town of Corpses until they have perceived the crisis of a third world war and the open appearance of American imperialism, and only the imminence of a war crisis cleared the eyes of many and attention began to be directed on the weighty content . . . hidden in the artistry of these two works. Both the writers had decided firmly to implant into their writer lives antihumanism and the fearful reality of the destructiveness of the atom bomb. . ."[54]

The picture of suffering people, their pitiful appeal for help, for water, the picture of a new hell — these are motifs that recur most frequently in *Summer Flower.* But not uniquely there. These pictures of the apocalypse, woven with a fiery faith in a new man, are firmly anchored in the whole of Hara Tamiki's postwar work and are an inseparable part of it.

Hara was convinced that the new hell would never be ever repeated anywhere, not only in Japan, but in any part of the Earth. He believed in a new man, in humanism, in a return to this fundamental social norm. However, as stressed also by Kuroko Kazuo, the hope which he placed in a new man was soon deceived. "The conflict in Korea and the remilitarization of this country (Japan) proved sufficient reasons to hurl Hara, who had hoped in a new world, into the abyss."[55] In March of 1951, at the time of the Korean war when the United States of America threatened with a repeated use of the atom bomb, when there was danger that the new hell would be repeated, Hara committed suicide.

Hara's suicide is often put into relation with the death of his wife. It is true that he bore with difficulty separation from his wife (she died in 1944) and never succeeded in becoming reconciled to the end of his life, a fact that became reflected in his work. Nevertheless, the tragedy of his native city, the immense sufferings of the people which he saw and never ceased to see, were far stronger than his own individual suffering. That forced him to live on and meet his writer obligation which he felt inwardly towards mankind and this until the moment when the phantom of a new catastrophe became intolerable to him.

---

[54] Odagiri Hideo: op. cit., p. 187.
[55] Kuroko Kazuo : op. cit., p. 137.

1. 第一戦後派　2. 原爆文学　3. 長岡弘芳　4. 原爆

文学史　5. 風媒社　6. 大江健三郎　7. 中野孝次

8. 小田実　9. 井上ひさし　10. 木下順二　11. 核戦争の

危機を訴える文学者の声明　12. 岩波ブックレット　13. 反核に

合流した文学者の肉声　14. 朝日ジャーナル　15. 小田切秀雄

16. 原子力問題と文学　17. 原子力と文学　18. 大日本雄

弁会講談社　19. 戦後資料　20. マスコミ　21. 日本評論

社　22. 吉田欣一　23. 栗原貞子の詩行動について　24. 栗原

貞子詩集　25. 日本現代詩文庫　26. 土曜美術社　27.

岩崎清一郎　28. 広島の文芸　29. 小説・評論　30.

広島文化叢書　31. 広島文化出版　32. 細田民樹

33. 栗原貞子年譜　34. 栗原唯一　35. 原爆投下の日

36. 悪夢　37. 中国文化連盟　38. 中国文化　39.

原子爆弾特集号　40. 創刊号　41. 中国文化発行所

42. 中国文化原子爆弾特集号・復刻　43. 中国文化

復刻刊行の会　44. 中国文化発刊並びに原子爆弾

特集号について　45. 民主戦線の文学へ　46. 畑

耕一 47. 一杯の番茶　48. 三日間　49. 大久保

澤子　50. 幻　51. 山本康夫　52. 凶点　53.

井口元三郎　54. 生ましめん哉　55. 生ましめん哉

生ましめん哉。己が命捨つとも　56. 黒い卵　57.

再び太陽を　58. 戦争とは何か　59. すべての

戦線から　60. 正田篠枝　61. さんげ　62. 私家

版　63. 木田九八二郎　64. 原爆を読む　65. 広島・

長崎を語りつぐ 全ブックリスト　66. 講談社　67. 耳鳴り

68. 原爆歌人の手記　69. 平凡社　70. 大田洋子

71. 屍の街　72. 中央公論社　73. 序文　74.

冬芽書房　75. 黒古一夫　76. 原爆とことば　77.

原民喜から林京子まで　78. 三一書房　79. 原爆

関係文献一覧　80. 増岡敏和　81. 広島の詩人

たち　82. 新日本新書　83. 新日本出版社　84.

原爆被災時のノート　85. 原民喜全集　86. 青土

社　87. 後記　88. 夏の花　89. 能業書林 90.

98

原子爆弾　91. 近代文学　92. 三田文学　93.
芥川龍之介　94. 地獄変　95. 芥川龍之介全集
96. 筑摩書房　97. 右遠俊郎　98. 惨劇の直視と
嘆き　99. 原民喜夏の花について　100. 民主文学
与超国家的 124. 四海同胞 125. 世界主义
126. 弧以君之二子 127. 伯喜 128. 和齐 129. 射
幸 130. 首陽山 131. 創造週報 132. 社会組
織と社会革命 133. 成仿吾 134. 張軍
135. 現代名人書信 136. 弧以鴻

ZWISCHEN EINSAMKEIT UND KOMMUNIKATION. ÜBER ZWEI TÜRKISCHE GEGENWARTSROMANE

XÉNIA CELNAROVÁ, Bratislava

Die Romane der türkischen Schriftsteller Yakup Kadri Karaosmanoğlu (1889—1974) *Yaban* (Der Fremdling, 1932) und Ferit Edgü (geb. 1936) *O* (Er, 1977) werden durch den gemeinsamen Grundkonflikt verbunden — die Absonderung der Intellektuellen von der Landbewohnerschaft. Im Gegensatz zur pessimistischen, resignierten Einstellung des Autors von *Yaban* zu diesem Problem, bringt Edgü einen neuen, perspektiven Zutritt zu dessen Lösung, und legt so ein Zeugnis vom Übergang des Schriftstellers auf die Positionen des aktiven Humanismus ab.

„Der türkische Intellektuelle, das ist ein seltsames, einsames Wesen in dieser weiten und öden Welt, die man das türkische Land nennt."[1] Mit diesen Worten äußerte der Schriftsteller Yakup Kadri Karaosmanoğlu mittels des Protagonisten seines Romans *Yaban* seine eigene pessimistische Ansicht über die türkischen Intellektuellen, die ihre Isoliertheit zu überwinden, eine gemeinsame Sprache mit dem Volk zu finden nicht fähig sind.

Bei der Gelegenheit der fünfzigsten Wiederkehr der ersten Ausgabe des Romans *Yaban* entbrannte in der Türkei eine Diskussion über die wechselseitige Beziehung zwischen den Intellektuellen und dem Volk,[2] da dieses bekannteste Werk Karaosmanoğlus im Laufe des verflossenen halben Jahrhunderts zum Begriff geworden ist, der mit der Abgesondertheit der Intelektuellen vom Volk fest verbunden ist.[3] Die Mehrzahl der Diskussionsteilnehmer war sich darüber einig, daß das Drama des der gesellschaftlichen Basis entrissenen türkischen Intellektuellen bis zur Gegenwart fortdauert.[4]

Noch bevor *Yaban* sein bedeutendes Jubiläum erreichte, bekam er sein Pendant im Roman des Prosaikers Ferit Edgü mit dem kurzen Titel *O*. Das Thema des von der westlichen Zivilisation und Kultur erzogenen Intellektuellen, der sich plötzlich in einer Welt befindet, die sich diametral von jener unterscheidet, in der er bislang gelebt hat, erhaltet bei Edgü völlig neue Dimensionen.

Beide Romane entstanden auf Grund eines sehr intensiven Erlebnisses, einer

---

[1] Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: *Yaban*. Istanbul 1981, S. 55.

[2] Sözer, Ö.: *50 yılında „Yaban"*. Somut, Istanbul, 1983, Nr. 40—41, S. 9.

[3] Özkırımlı, A.: *„Yaban" üzerine*. In: Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: *Yaban*, S. 14.

[4] Sözer, Ö.: *50 yılında „Yaban"*, S. 9; Kahraman, K. B.: *Kör dövüşü*. Yazko Edebiyat, Istanbul, 1980, Nr. 2, S. 67; Erhat, A.: *Romancıya karşı yargılayıcı ve suçlayıcı tutum*. Yazko Edebiyat, Istanbul, 1982, Nr. 21, S. 114—115.

unvergeßlichen persönlichen Erfahrung ihrer Autoren. Im Vorwort zur zweiten Auflage des Romans sagt Karaosmanoğlu darüber aus: „Yaban ist ein herzzerreißender Schrei seelischen Fiebers, ausgestoßen vom Gewissen, das sich plötzlich der schmerzhaften und fürchterlichen Wirklichkeit gegenübergestellt sieht. . . Der Alptraum der in der Gegend des Porsuk Baches verbrachten drei bis vier Monate, überlebte andauernd für ein Jahrzehnt lang in meinem Unterbewußtsein."[5]

Im Jahre 1921 unternahm Karaosmanoğlu als Mitglied einer von der Regierung in Ankara gebildeten Kommission zur Untersuchung der vom Agressor verursachten Schäden eine Inspektionsreise durch Anatolien. Außer des offiziellen Berichts veröffentlichte er seine Eindrücke von dieser Reise in etwa zwanzig Erzählungen, sowie in einer Serie von Zeitungsartikeln. In einer dieser Erzählungen mit dem Titel *Barbarların yaktığı köyler ahalisine* (An die Bevölkerung der von den Barbaren niedergebrannten Dörfer), zeichnet sich bereits die Problematik ab, die der Schriftsteller zehn Jahre später im *Yaban* bearbeitete.[6]

In der erwähnten Erzählung, ebenso wie im Roman *Yaban* geht es vor allem um die Sicht „von oben herab". Der Erzähler — ein Intellektueller blickt vom Piedestal, auf das ihn das Wissen von eigener geistiger Überlegenheit, Zivilisiertheit und materiellen Wohlstand emporgehoben hat, auf das verarmte, rückständige Volk, einmal mit Mitleid, einmal mit Despekt, einmal sogar mit Furcht herab. „So wie der Mörder die Leiche des von ihm Ermordeten fürchtet, so fürchte ich euch",[7] gesteht der Schriftsteller in seiner Erzählung. Es sind dies allzu starke Worte um sie mit der Behauptung widerlegen zu können, die größte Freude, die größte Ehre für ihn wäre es, sich mit dieser armseligen Menschenmasse zu identifizieren. Und wenn dieser Erzähler, der sich über die armselige Masse nicht nur bildlich, sondern auch wörtlich stellt, da er sie aus der weichen Polsterung einer Limousine betrachtet, diese Opfer des Kriegsdramas anschließend davon zu überzeugen beginnt, daß sein Leiden unvergleichbar größer sei als ihres, klingen seine Worte als Heuchelei.

Ahmet Celâl, der Protagonist des Romans *Yaban*, ist in dieser Hinsicht wenigstens aufrichtiger, da er nicht einmal sich selbst einreden will, er könne sich mit der Landbevölkerung vorbehaltlos identifizieren: „So sein wie sie sind, sich kleiden wie sie es tun, essen und trinken wie sie, sich setzen und aufstehen wie sie, ihre Sprache sprechen... Gut, all das will ich tun. Aber wie kann ich denken wie sie? Wie kann ich fühlen wie sie?"[8] Der Dorfmensch ist für ihn jemand, der zu einem bestimmten

---

[5] Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: *Yaban'ın ikinci basılışı vesilesiyle.* In: Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: *Yaban,* S. 23, 26.

[6] Kudret, C.: *Türk edebiyatında hikâye ve roman. 1859—1959. II. Meşrutiyet'ten Cumhuriyet'e kadar. 1911—1922.* Ankara 1970, S. 152; Akı, N.: *Y. K. Karaosmanoğlu.* In: Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: *Yaban,* S. 282—283.

[7] Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: *Barbarların yaktığı köyler ahalisine.* In: Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: *Yaban,* S. 23—24.

[8] Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: *Yaban,* S. 96.

historischen Zeitpunkt versteinerte und den daher von ihm, durch die westliche Kultur erzogenen Ahmet Celâl, Jahrhunderte trennen, und seiner Ansicht nach ist diese Kluft nich zu überbrücken.

Zu einer unvergeßlichen persönlichen Erfahrung, die dann später in seinem literarischen Schaffen ihre Widerspiegelung erfuhr, wurde für Ferit Edgü der einige Monate dauernde unfreiwillige Aufenthalt in Pirkanis, einem noch in den Bergen der südöstlichen Türkei gelegenem Dorf, wohin er Mitte der sechziger Jahre als Lehrer verlegt wurde.[9] Die Begegnung mit der unvorstellbaren Armut, der Rückständigkeit, mit dem Tod, der hier in diesem gottverlassenen Landstück täglich gegenwärtig ist, hinterließ im Künstler, der sein ganzes bisheriges Leben in Großstädten verbrachte,[10] eine tiefe und anhaltende Spur, wie er dies im Vorwort zu seinem Roman O (Ön ve sonsöz — Vor- und Nachwort) expressiv zum Ausdruck brachte.

Gleich hier, in diesem einleitenden Teil, der als ein Gedicht in Prosa komponiert ist, wird Edgüs Zutritt zur Lösung des Grundkonflikts, der den beiden Romanen O und Yaban gemeinsam ist, angedeutet, ein Zutritt, der sich diametral von jenem unterscheidet, den anfangs der dreißiger Jahre Karaosmanoğlu wählte. Während Ahmet Celâl es nicht einmal versucht die Sprache der Dorfbewohner zu verstehen, d.h. in deren Probleme einzudringen, ja im Gegenteil den Dorfbewohnern hartnäckig seine eigene Denkart und Ausdrucksweise aufdrängt und sich ihnen so immer mehr entfremdet, wählt der Erzähler und zugleich Protagonist von Edgüs Roman eine völlig unterschiedliche Vorgangsweise: „Als ich bemerkte, daß die Menschen, unter denen ich mich eines Tages befand, die Sprache, die ich sprach, fast überhaupt nicht verstanden haben, anstatt ihnen meine Sprache beizubringen. . . versuchte ich es ihre Sprache zu erlernen, ihre Sprache zu sprechen."[11]

Ohne sein eigenes Zutun befindet sich Edgüs Protagonist plötzlich inmitten himmelhoher, verschneiter Berge. Er war hier unter fremden Menschen, die eine für ihn unverständliche Sprache sprachen. Dies war die einzige Realität. Er war ein Fremder unter Fremden. Er war gleichzeitig jedoch auch ein Mensch unter Menschen, und das war jener feste Punkt, auf den er sich stützen konnte, von dem er

---

[9] Seit dem Jahre 1960 begann die türkische Regierung dem Mangel an Lehrkräften für provinzielle Schulen durch Reserveoffiziere abzuhelfen, die vor allem in abgelegene und für Berufslehrer wenig attraktive Gegenden gesandt wurden. Wie A. Özkırımlı berichtet, kam es so für die städtische Intelligenz in einem größeren Maßstab zur Begegnung mit der Realität der Provinz, mit den Menschen vom Lande. Eine solche Begegnung rief bei den meisten „Betroffenen" Gefühle der Einsamkeit, der Entfremdung hervor. Özkırımlı, A.: 1976'da öykü ve roman. In: Nesin Vakfı Edebiyat Yıllığı 1977. Istanbul 1977, S. 63.

[10] Ferit Edgü, geboren in Istanbul, verbrachte nach dem Abschluß seines Studiums an der Akademie der bildenden Künste in seiner Geburtsstadt sieben Jahre (1958—1964, 1967—1968) in Paris, wo er sein Studium an der Académie du Feu und an der Sorbonne fortsetzte. Kurdakul, Ş.: Şairler ve yazarlar sözlüğü. Istanbul 1981, S. 188—189.

[11] Edgü, F.: O. Istanbul 1980, S. 14—15.

bei seinem Versuch ausgehen konnte sich in eine neue Persönlichkeit zu verwandeln, die fähig wäre, dem Druck der rauhen Realität standzuhalten, ein vollwertiges Leben zu führen. Zur zweiten Stütze wurde für ihn die Arbeit. Die Aktivität ist das zweite unterscheidende Element im Vergleich zu Karaosmanoğlus Konzeption des Intellektuellen.

Ahmet Celâl kommt in ein auf der Hochebene Zentralanatoliens gelegenes Dorf mit dem Kopf voller Ideale, mit einer Kiste voller Bücher von Klassikern, mit der Büste Sokrates'. Er stellt sich seine Ankunft aufs Land im Sinne der von Ziya Gökalp, dem geistigen Führer der türkischen Nationalisten, propagierten Mission vor, im Rahmen welcher die Intellektuellen das Volk aufwecken und ihm das nationale Bewußtsein einprägen sollten.[12] Ziya Gökalps gedankliches Einwirken widerspiegelte sich auch in Ahmet Celâls Überlegungen über die Blutbruderschaft, die ihn, durch die gemeinsame Sprache, Geschichte und Kultur, den demeinsamen Glauben potenziert, mit jenen verbindet, die ihn den „Fremdling" nennen. Daß die Praxis viel komplizierter ist als die Theorie, mußte Karaosmanoğlu schon damals erkennen, als er seine Erzählung *Barbarların yaktığı köyler ahalisine* verfaßte, wo er, ein begeisterter Anhänger der kemalistischen Revolution, eine skeptische Haltung zur von Gökalp übernommenen Losung der Kemalisten „*Halka doğru!* (Zum Volke!)" einnimmt.[13]

Adäquat dazu entwickelte sich auch die Gestalt Ahmet Celâls, der sehr bald auf irgendwelche aufklärerische Tätigkeit verzichtet und sich mit Beschuldigungen türkischer Intellektueller für die Rückständigkeit des türkischen Dorfes begnügt. Schließlich, jede Bemühung wäre hier umsonst, denn: „Bildung, Erziehung, das gute Beispiel, das alles sind vergängliche Dinge, und ohne die Umgebung zu verändern, ist die Veränderung des Menschen unmöglich."[14] Diese Überschätzung des Einflusses der Umgebung auf den Menschen, zu der bei Karaosmanoğlu zweifelsohne seine Annahme des Schaffens französischer Naturalisten beigetragen hat,[15] dokumentierte in *Yaban* dessen Autor namentlich in der Gestalt Mehmet Alis. Mehmet Alis Rückkehr in sein Heimatsdorf nach einigen Jahren Militärdienst, bedeutet auch seine Rückkehr zur herkömmlichen Denk- und Handlungsweise, sie ist also ein Schritt rückwärts in dessen Entwicklung.

Indem der Schriftsteller diese Idee dem Protagonisten seines Romans eingeprägt hat, schloß er bei ihm gleichzeitig den Willen zur aktiven Handlung aus. Ahmet Celâl, als typischer Darsteller der Istanbuler Aristokratie vom Beginn des Jahrhun-

---

[12] Afkajewa, L. O.: *Otscherki po isstoriji turetskoj literatury 1908—1939 gg.* Moskau 1959, S. 194.

[13] Ziya Gökalp: *Türkçülüğün esasları.* Istanbul 1976, S. 41.

[14] Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: *Yaban*, S. 42.

[15] Die Kontakte Y. K. Karaosmanoğlus mit der französischen Literatur behandeln folgende Arbeiten — Bingöl, N.: *Yakup Kadri'nin beş romanında realist ve natüralistlerin tesisleri.* Dil ve Tarih-Coğrafya Fakültesi Dergisi. Band III, 1944, Nr. 1, S. 1—32; Akı, N.: *Yakup Kadri Karaosmanoğlu. İnsan, eser, fikir ve üslüp.* Istanbul 1960.

derts, die von einem äußersten Individualismus, Introvertiertheit, Sensitivität gekennzeichnet ist, verheimlicht schließlich keineswegs seine Lustlosigkeit zu irgendwelcher praktischen Tätigkeit. Mehmet Alis Vorschlag, Berater von Salih Ağa zu werden, erwidert er mit dem Worten: „. . . ich bevorzuge das Nichtstun und das Verschwenden vor Bargeld".[16] Dessen einziger Traum, sich in ein vom Garten umgebenes Häuschen zurückzuziehen und dort in Untätigkeit bis ans Lebensende zu verharren, korrespondiert mit den Überlegungen des Autors von Yaban aus der Zeit seiner frühen Schaffensperiode, als er unter der Einwirkung von Rousseaus Lehre über die Rückkehr zur Natur stand.[17] Die Flucht aus der Hölle der Städte in die Einsamkeit der Natur, über die Karaosmanoğlu in seinem mystisch gestimmten Gedicht in Prosa mit dem kennzeichnenden Titel Erenlerin bağından (Aus dem Garten der Eingeweihten, 1922)[18] schreibt, war im Grunde genommen die Flucht eines Osmanen vor der Realität des Verfalls des Reiches und dessen Untergangs.[19] Das erdrückende Wissen von dem Zerfall der traditionellen Werte führte Karaosmanoğlus Generationsgenossen zur Suche nach einem Ersatz für diese Werte. Einige unter ihnen, darunter auch Karaosmanoğlu, finden sie in der Kultur der Antike und schlagen vor, die Renaissance des türkischen Denkens auf der Antike zu begründen.[20]

Zur Zeit des Entstehens von Yaban stand Karaosmanoğlu bereits auf den Positionen des äußersten Rationalismus,[21] er war einer der Haupttheoretiker der sogenannten Revolution von oben, einer Revolution, die von der intellektuellen Elite geleitet werden sollte.[22] Und so konnte er den Hang des Protagonisten seines Romans zur Antike schon von oben her betrachten. Die Vorstellung eines bukolischen Dorfes zerschmilzt mit den ersten Schritten Ahmet Celâls im neuen Milieu, nachträglich wirkt sie dann als ein Paradox, indem er die einzelnen Einwohner des Dorfes mit antiken Gestalten vergleicht.

Karaosmanoğlu verlieh seinem Roman die Form eines Tagebuchs, der fiktive Schreiber dessen ist der Kriegsinvalide Ahmet Celâl. In seiner Aussage über die

---

[16] Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: Yaban, S. 46.

[17] Yavuz, K.: Der Islam in Werken moderner türkischer Schriftsteller. Freiburg im Breisgau 1974, S. 92—93.

[18] Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: Erenlerin bağından. Istanbul 1970, S. 25. Dieses Werk Karaosmanoğlus ging aus seinem Mitwirken in der literarischen Gruppe, die sich Ende des ersten Jahrzehnts um die Zeitschift Dergâh versammelt hat, und der auch die Dichter Ahmet Haşim und Yahya Kemal Beyaltı angehörten, hervor. Das Ziel der Gruppe war es eine Synthese von Bergsons intuitivistischer Philosophie mit dem islamischen Mystizismus zu schaffen und diese beim türkischen Publikum zu propagieren. Enginün, İ.: Halide Edib Adıvar'ın eserlerinde Doğu ve Batı meselesi. Istanbul 1978, S. 14.

[19] Kurdakul, Ş.: Çağdaş Türk edebiyatı. Meşrutiyet dönemi. Istanbul 1976, S. 351—352.

[20] Kudret, C.: Türk edebiyatında hikâye ve roman, S. 134—135.

[21] Yavuz, K.: Der Islam in Werken moderner türkischer Schriftsteller, S. 95.

[22] Siedel, E.: Sabahattin Ali, Mystiker und Sozialist. Beiträge zur Interpretation eines modernen türkischen Autors. Berlin 1983, S. 95; Özkırımlı, A.: „Ankara" üzerine. In: Karaosmanoğlu. Y. K.: Ankara. Istanbul 1981, S. 14—15.

Motivation seiner Eintragungen behauptet er, seine Zeilen hätten keinen Adressaten, es sei lediglich ein Gespräch mit sich selbst. Andererseits wendet er sich stellenweise direkt an den Leser, appelliert an dessen Gefühl und Gewissen. Auch mit seinen frequentierten Anspielungen aus dem Bereich der Literatur und Kunst, sowie mit der Hervorhebung seiner vornehmen Herkunft scheint der fiktive Schreiber des Tagebuchs seine Kultiviertheit, seine Bildung auf einem hohen, vielseitigen Niveau vor den angenommenen Lesern demonstrieren zu wollen. Dabei entgeht es ihm, daß sein Sich-Vergleichen mit literarischen Helden in einem Widerspruch zu gerade jenen Ideen steht, mit denen die Autoren diese ihre Helden ausgestattet hatten.

Ahmet Celâl findet eine Ähnlichkeit zwischen Don Quijote und den orientalischen Mystikern, und vergleicht sich selbst mit diesem unsterblichen Held von Cervantes. Don Quijote ist jedoch kein passiver Träumer, er will sein Ideal des Guten, der Wahrheit, des Edelmuts und der Schönheit durch ritterliche Handlungen, die gegen eine Gesellschaft gerichtet sind, welche dieses Ideal tötet, in die Tat umsetzen. Mit den Worten von Nazım Hikmet ausgedrückt, ist „Don Quijote ein starker Mensch, ein Mensch der Tat".[23] Ahmet Celâl bringt es nichteinmal zustande seine Dulcinea zu erkämpfen und als ihm im Abschluß des Romans Emine selbst ihre Sympathien zum Ausdruck bringt und sich entschließt ihm zu folgen, überläßt er sie, verletzt und von Feinden umgeben, ihrem Schicksal, und sucht Rettung nur für sich selbst.

Die tragische Pose eines Menschen in Erwartung des unabwendbaren Todes in Verlassenheit und Vergessenheit einnehmend, vergleicht sich Ahmet Celâl mit Hamlet. Der Literaturkritiker Burhan Ümit Toprak, der sich schon bei der Erstausgabe von Yaban über den Roman ablehnend geäußert hat, bezeichnete dessen Protagonisten als einen „hamletartig deformierten Nachkömmling der Paschas" (Hamlet bozması paşazade).[24] Die Lage, in der sich Ahmet Celâl befindet, erinnert nur oberflächlich an die Tragödie von Shakespeares Helden. Hamlets scheinbarer Wahnsinn ergibt sich daraus, daß er als Mensch, der seiner Zeit weit voraus war, von der alten Welt abgelehnt wurde.[25] Die Einwohner des im Mittelalter erstarrten anatolischen Dorfes nahmen Ahmet Celâl bei sich nicht auf, sie nannten ihn den „Fremdling". Kann man jedoch Ahmet Celâl als neuen Menschen, als die Vorhut der neuen Epoche betrachten? Nein, weil er, trotz der äußeren Schichte der westlichen Zivilisation und Bildung, ein Nachkomme der Paschas bleibt, dessen Pessimismus dem Wissen vom unabwendbaren Untergang seiner Welt, der Welt siegreicher Kriege und prunkvoller Paläste entspringt. Auch seine Ankunft aufs

---

[23] Nazım Hikmet: *Oğluma mektuplar*. Yeni Dergi, Istanbul, 1967, Nr. 36, S. 123.

[24] *Türk edebiyatında Yaban*. In: Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: Yaban, S. 274.

[25] Schklowskij, W.: *Próza* (Úvahy a rozbory). Prosa (Überlegungen und Analysen). Prag 1978, S. 108.

Land, auf den ersten Blick als freiwillig erscheinend, wurde von diesem Wissen der Katastrophe erzwungen, er sucht hier nach einem ruhigen Ort, wo er über das verlorene Paradies meditieren könnte. Natürlich fühlt er sich in diesem, von seiner gewohnten Umgebung so abweichenden Milieu, als in einem „fremden Land" *(gurbet ili)*. Nicht nur die Dorfbewohner verhalten sich ihm gegenüber als zu einem Fremden, mißtrauisch, gleichgültig, ja sogar feindselig, aber vor allem er selbst distanziert sich von ihnen, der Gedanke, er könne mit ihnen etwas gemeinsam haben, erscheint ihm absurd, Tiere stehen ihm näher als sie.

„Inmitten dieser weiten, öden anatolischen Steppe wurde ich zu einem zweiten Robinson Crusoe. Zwischen dem Haus, das ich bewohnte, und der verlassenen Insel war keinerlei Unterschied."[26] Im Gegensatz zu dieser Äußerung Ahmet Celâls stehen die Worte des Protagonisten des Romans *O:* „Aber ich lebe nicht auf einer verlassenen Insel. Aber ich bin nicht allein auf einer verlassenen Insel... Ich habe Schüler... Ich bin Lehrer und Schüler. Das heißt, es gibt Dinge, die ich erlernen muß. Sowie alle Leute. Ist dies nicht auch ein Glück (seien die Verhältnisse, wie sie wollen), ist dies nicht auch ein Glück?"[27] Obwohl sich Edgüs Held nicht mit Robinson Crusoe vergleicht, erinnern diese Worte nicht doch an jenen Abschnitt von Defoes Roman, in dem sich der schiffbrüchige Matrose zu seinem Glücksgefühlen bekennt, von denen er durch seine Gespräche mit Freitag während ihres dreijährigen Zusammenlebens erfüllt wurde? Gespräche, in denen „ich Freitag durch Erklären viele Dinge erläuterte und selbst so manches über viele, mir unbekannte oder wenig bekannte Probleme erfuhr".[28]

Zwischen Edgüs und Defoes Protagonisten besteht jedoch ein wesentlicher Unterschied. Während Robinson Freitag an seine Vorstellungen anpaßt, ihm seine Sprache beibringt, seine Zivilisation, seine Weltanschauung, seine Überlegenheit aufdrängt, und von ihm dafür als Gegenleistung bedingungslosen Gehorsam und Dankbarkeit erwartet, bittet Edgüs Lehrer zum Abschluß seines Aufenthaltes in den Bergen, der, obwohl unfreiwillig in so mancher Hinsicht für ihn von Nutzen wurde, die Kinder der Bergbewohner, auch das Wenige, was er ihnen beigebracht hatte, zu vergessen, denn: „Was für mich richtig ist, ist nicht richtig für euch. Was für mich notwendig ist, ist nicht notwendig für euch."[29]

In Robinsons Augen bleibt Freitag für immer ein „armer Wilder", der für ihn ein hervorragender Diener, aber nie ein Freund sein kann.[30] Ebenso sind auch für Ahmet Celâl die Provinzler eine Herde, die noch nicht auf den Stand gesellschaftlicher Wesen herangereift ist, er ist nicht imstande mit ihnen freundschaftliche

[26] Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K.: *Yaban*, S. 147.

[27] Edgü, F.: *O*, S. 97.

[28] Defoe, D.: *Robinson Crusoe*. Bratislava 1978, S. 189.

[29] Edgü, F.: *O*, S. 199—200.

[30] Novak, M. E.: *Defoe and the Nature of Man*. Oxford, Oxford University Press 1969, S. 50.

Kontakte anzuknüpfen, ihr Unglück berührt ihn keineswegs. Andererseits sieht Edgüs Held in der Aufnahme des Denkens, Fühlens, der Ethik der Bergbewohner eine der Grundvoraussetzungen der Selbsterhaltung in dieser nicht gastfreundlichen Gegend.

Die Ausgangssituation beider Helden, Karaosmanoğlus sowie Edgüs, ist analog. Und obwohl sich um Ahmet Celâl eine ganze Reihe dramatischer Ereignisse abspielen, in die er im Abschluß des Romans auch selbst miteinbezogen wird, dauert seine Isoliertheit, seine Einsamkeit an, er bleibt von der Exposition bis zum Finale des Romans für seine Umgebung der „Fremdling". Seine Lage kann sich gesetzmäßig nicht ändern, da er vom Anfang bis zum Ende immer derselbe Aristokrat bleibt, mit seiner überheblichen, verächtlichen Einstellung seiner Umgebung gegenüber, ein Aristokrat, der sich nicht die geringste Mühe gibt die Menschen um sich zu verstehen, ihnen näherzukommen. Er verändert sich nicht, er entwickelt sich nicht. Im Gegensatz zu ihm, wird der Lehrer aus dem Roman O in seiner an äußeren Handlungen armen Umgebung menschlicher, er reift heran, findet sich selbst, was in einem gewissen Sinn an den Vorgang des Heranreifens des Protagonisten in Thomas Manns Roman *Der Zauberberg* erinnert. Diesen Prozeß des Heranreifens von Manns Helden charakterisiert J. M. Meletinskij folgend: „. . . Im Rahmen seines eigenwilligen, hermetischen Experiments, versunken in Meditation unter der Bedingung einer äußerlich extrem begrenzten, aber intensiven intellektuellen und emotionellen inneren Erfahrung, sucht und findet Hans Castorp sich selbst, und auch den Wert und Sinn des Lebens."[31]

Genauso wie im Werk Thomas Manns geht es auch um Roman O um die räumliche Absonderung zweier, mit unterschiedlichen Sprachen redenden Welten, der Welt dort „unten", an die die Helden beider Romane gewöhnt waren, und der Welt dort „oben", in extremen Höhen, in der sich beide plötzlich befanden, isoliert von all dem, was „unten" geschieht. Diese zwei Welten verstehen einander nicht, sie sind von unterschiedlicher Moral, Philosophie, Logik und Zeit, und gestalten auch den Charakter des Helden völlig unterschiedlich.[32]

Auf die Analogie im Prozeß des Heranreifens der Protagonisten der Romane *Der Zauberberg* und O machte in seiner eingehenden Analyse von Edgüs Werk Gürsel Aytaç aufmerksam. Gleichzeitig wies er auf eine gewisse Unterschiedlichkeit hin, die darin besteht, daß während Hans Castorp nur empfängt, ist Edgüs Held Empfänger und Spender, also wie bereits gesagt, er ist Lehrer und Schüler zur gleichen Zeit.[33] Mit Aytaçs Ansicht über die identische Auffassung der symbolischen

---

[31] Meletinskij, J. M.: *Poetika mifa*. Moskau 1976, S. 302.

[32] Dazu Bagin, A.: *Traja majstri (Gustave Flaubert, Anton Pavlovič Čechov, Thomas Mann).* (Drei Meister (Gustave Flaubert, Anton Pawlowitsch Tschechow, Thomas Mann)). Bratislava 1982, S. 151—154.

[33] Aytaç, G.: *Ferit Edgü'nün romanı „O".* Yazko Edebiyat, Istanbul, 1982, Nr. 21, S. 82—83.

Funktion der Zeit in beiden Romanen kann man jedoch nicht übereinstimmen. Dies deshalb, weil bei Mann die Wahrnehmung der Zeit „auf dem Weg vom scharfen Sich-Bewußtseins der Zeitlichkeit über die Annahme der zyklischen, wiederholten, d.h. stereotypen Zeit . . . bis zur Zeitlosigkeit dahinschreitet".[34] Dieses Phänomen wirkt beim Absinken der menschlichen Aktivität bis in das Nirwana mit. Im Roman *O* hingegen schreitet der Held von der Zeitlosigkeit zum Sich-Bewußtwerden der Zeit und deren Verlaufs und der damit verbundenen Tätigkeit hin. Das unterscheidet ihn auch von Ahmet Celâl, der sich anfangs wundert, daß die Dorfbewohner keinen Begriff von der Zeit haben, allmählich verliert jedoch dieser Begriff auch für ihn die Bedeutung.

Die Zeit, als eine Größe, die in extremen Bedingungen einer Deformation unterliegt, fand ihren Einzug auch in den Roman von Carlo Levi *Cristo si è fermato a Eboli* (Christus kam nur bis Eboli, 1943). Für seinen autobiographischen Helden scheinen Tage länger als Monate zu sein, alle fließen sie eintönig dahin, bis er die Orientation darin verliert: „Das Morgen, sowie auch alle übrigen Tage bis ans Ende der Welt, wurden auch für mich zu diesem ungewissen ländlichen *Crai*, gewebt aus einer nebeligen, außer Zeit und Geschichte stehenden Geduld."[35]

Im zitierten Roman gestaltete Levi realistisch seine Erlebnisse, Erfahrungen und Eindrücke aus seiner jahrelangen Internierung in einer unwirtlichen Landschaft im Süden Italiens, zu der ihn Mussolinis faschistisches Regime verurteilt hat. Also auch hier, sowie in den Romanen *Yaban* und *O* befindet sich der Protagonist, der gleichzeitig als Erzähler des Geschehens auftritt, in der Isolation in einer trostlosen und unfreundlichen Gegend, wo der Mensch auf dem ausgedörrten, vom Tode gekennzeichneten Boden, unter Menschen, die eine andere Sprache sprechen, sein armseliges Dasein fristet. Während er anfangs durch seine Haltung eines „Fremd- lings", eines passiven Zeugen und Beobachters des Lebens um sich dem Aristokra- ten Karaosmanoğlus nähersteht, kommt er durch seinen Übergang auf die Positio- nen des Menschen, der an diesem Leben teilnimmt und seine Verantwortlichkeit und Aufgabe darin begreift, Edgüs Lehrer immer näher.

Gleich zu Beginn ihres Aufenthaltes auf dieser Landzunge der Zivilisation werden Edgüs genauso wie Levis Protagonisten Zeugen des Sterbens, das zu verhindern nicht in ihrer Macht steht. Unter dem Eindruck ihrer Machtlosigkeit und unter dem Druck ihrer eigenen drückenden Lage steht jeder von ihnen der Resignation nahe. Die erste Voraussetzung seinen Pessimismus zu überwinden ist, sich mit den Problemen jener Menschen zu identifizieren, mit denen ihn das Leben zeitweilig verbunden hat, in ihre abgeschlossene, isolierte Welt einzudringen, sie verstehen zu lernen. Die weitere Voraussetzung ist es dann sich mit seinem ganzen Wesen für ihre Interessen einzusetzen, sie von der Existenz eines anderen Lebens zu überzeugen

---

[34] B a g i n, A.: *Traja majstri*, S. 152—153.

[35] L e v i, C.: *Kristus se zastavil v Eboli*. Prag 1969, S. 218.

und es mit ihnen gemeinsam zu suchen. Freilich, dieser perspektive Ausweg ist hier lediglich angedeutet.

Der Protagonist von Edgüs Roman faßt seinen unfreiwilligen Aufenthalt inmitten der Berge und derer Bewohner als Gelegenheit auf, sein bisheriges Leben umzuwerten, ihm einen neuen Sinn zu verleihen, es von der Einsamkeit zu den Menschen, vom Traum zur Realität hin auszurichten.

Die Einsamkeit des Seemannes, für den sich der Erzähler ausgibt, ist ein symbolischer Ausdruck der Einsamkeit des entfremdeten Einzelwesens, das sich in der unpersönlichen Welt der Großstadt als das einzige Wesen auf einem weiten Meer fühlt. ,,Als wäre mein früheres Leben in Vereinsamung / im Wald / in der Wüste / oder auf Meeren in einem Einpersonenboot / verflossen."[36] Er erinnert sich an die großen, übervölkerten, lärmenden Städte zurück, nicht aber an die Menschen, an kein einziges menschliches Gesicht. Hier jedoch, in diesem weltentrissenem Dorf, wird er sich plötzlich dessen bewußt, daß er noch nie so mit Menschen verbunden war wie jetzt, daß er nicht mehr nur an sich denkt, sondern an alle Leidenden. Der Morgen, der nach jener Nacht graut, in der er die Grundsätze gesteckt hatte, die seinem neuen Leben Richtung und Sinn geben sollen, erscheint ihm als das Erwachen aus einem tiefen, jahrelangen Traum. Und er ist glücklich, endlich erwacht zu sein.

Die Träume zu verlassen und sich der Realität zuzuwenden, das nimmt sich der Protagonist des Romans O in einem seiner Grundsätze vor, deren es, so wie der biblischen Gebote, zehn gibt. Die übrigen ermuntern ihn zur Selbsterkenntnis, zum Kennenlernen der Umgebung und der Leute, zum Glauben an die Menschen und zum Willen auszuharren. Und in einer schlaflosen Nacht taucht aus dem Unterbewußtsein des Helden dazu noch ein weiteres, kategorisches Gebot, das eine entscheidende Bedeutung bei der Suche nach sich selbst haben soll: ,,Du sollst ihnen aufmerksam zuhören, du sollst sie wahrnehmen!"[37] Den anderen findend, findet auch sich selbst, durch das Erkennen anderer Leute, verwirklicht sich bei ihm die Selbsterkenntnis.

In einer Hinsicht ist der Protagonist des Romans O Ahmet Celâl gegenüber im Vorteil. Wie Z. İpşiroğlu in seiner Rezension darauf hinweist,[38] meiden die Dorfbewohner den Lehrer nicht, in ihren Augen ist er kein Fremder mehr, sondern ein Mensch, den sie brauchen, den sie selbst aufsuchen um ihn um Hilfe, um Rat zu ersuchen, oder aber nur um ein Paar Worte mit ihm zu wechseln und eine Tasse Tee zu trinken.

Bildnisse der Besucher, oft nur in einigen Linien angedeutete Umrisse, bilden den

---

[36] Edgü, F.: O, S. 49.

[37] Ibid., S. 92.

[38] İpşiroğlu, Z.: *Uluslararası iletişimde yazın.* In: *Nesin Vakfı Edebiyat Yıllığı 1981.* Istanbul 1981, S. 515—516.

zweiten Teil des Romans *O*. Lediglich das Porträt von Halit nimmt panoramatische Ausmaße und eine plastische Tiefe an, es projizieren sich die sozialen Verhältnisse der Gegend, die ungeschriebenen Gesetze der Berge hinein. Das Bildnis wird von Halits Schilderung, von der subjektiven Anschauung des Lehrers auf seinen Besucher und dessen Erlebnis geschaffen, sowie vom objektiven Zutritt, wenn die Stelle des Ich-Erzählers zeitweilig der Er-Erzähler einnimmt, um das Gespräch des Lehrers mit Halit aus der Sicht eines unparteiischen Beobachters festzuhalten. Das Ergebnis dieser Sicht aus mehreren Perspektiven ist das eindrucksvolle Bild eines eigenständigen Bergbewohners, den die traditionelle Abhängigkeit vom Aga zum Mörder werden ließ.

Das Traummotiv, das Edgü bereits im Motto zum Roman *O* hervorruft, und das ein Zitat aus dem Buch *Journey to Ixtlan* von Carlos Castenedo darstellt, wird im Zusammenhang mit der Gestalt von Halit zum Leitmotiv. „Wir alle träumen. Und wenn wir morgens aufwachen, unterscheiden wir nicht, was Traum war und was nicht,"[39] sagt Halit zum Lehrer, dem dieser seit ihrer ersten Begegnung als ein Produkt des Träumens mit offenen Augen erscheint. Wenn Halit lange nicht kommt, ruft sich ihn der Lehrer in seine Träume herbei. Er führt dessen Erlebnis in seinen eigenen Gedanken zu Ende, bis er letztlich selbst nicht unterscheiden kann, was Wirklichkeit ist und was seine eigene Phantasie hinzugedichtet hat. Und im Abschluß des Romans, wenn ihn Halit bis an die Schwelle der weiteren Etappe seines Lebens begleitet, erscheint ihm wieder alles als ein Traum.

Über die Bedeutung, die er dem Traum in seinem Schaffen beimißt, sagt Ferit Edgü im Interview aus, das er anläßlich der Verleihung des Sait-Faik-Preises für seine Erzählungssammlung *Bir gemide* (Auf dem Schiff, 1979) der Zeitschrift Milliyet Sanat gewährte: „Durch die Wirkungskraft des Traumes kann der Künstler die Welt in der er lebt, sowie die Realität dieser Welt wirkungsvoller zum Ausdruck bringen. Ich schreibe inmitten der Realität vom Traum, inmitten des Traumes von der Realität."[40]

An der Scheidelinie des Traumes und der Wirklichkeit bewegt sich auch die Gestalt des Buchändlers Süryani — des Syrers, die im Sujet des Romans *O* eine wichtige Rolle einnimmt. Die Bücher, die der Buchhändler dem Lehrer während dessen ersten Aufenthalts in der Stadt gegeben hat, werden zur Quelle der Impulse

[39] Edgü, F.: *O*, S. 100.

[40] *Nesin Vakfı Edebiyat Yıllığı 1980*. Istanbul 1980, S. 304. Die zitierten Worte Edgüs können mit der Ansicht des Schriftstellers František Švantner, eines bedeutenden Darstellers der slowakischen lyrisierten Prosa, konfrontiert werden: „Ich bin der Meinung, die Realität ist nicht das, was das Inventar unserer Umgebung bildet, sondern das, was wir gerade erleben, was den Inhalt unseres gegenwärtigen Lebens bildet, weil ohne uns würde dieses zahlreiche Inventar der Umgebung nicht existieren, ja es wäre im vollsten Sinne des Wortes die Irrealität. Freilich, wenn wir von diesem Standpunkt ausgehen, müssen wir zugeben, daß auch der Traum ein Teil der Wirklichkeit ist." *František Švantner zblízka* (František Švantner aus der Nähe). In: *Slobodný rozhlas*. Bratislava 1948, S. 522.

des Denkens und des Tuns des Lehrers. Eines davon enthält den Schlüssel zur Entschlüsselung des Titels des Romans. Als es der Lehrer öffnet, stellt er erstaunt fest, daß es ein einziges „O" enthält, von dem es nicht klar ist, ob es ein Buchstabe, eine Nummer, ein Zeichen oder ein Fürwort ist. Ist es vielleicht Süryanis Absicht gewesen, den Lehrer dazu zu bewegen auf die leere Seiten das Ergebnis seines Versuchs zu verzeichnen, den Sinn des Lebens zu finden? Süryanis Bitte an den Lehrer, ihm das Ergebnis mitzuteilen sowie einen Brief, in dem ihn ein unbekannter Schreiber ermutigt darüber zu schreiben, wie er seine Verbannung überlebt hat, gestatten die Möglichkeit einer solchen Auslegung.

Das letzte Kapitel des ersten Teils des Romans *O* wird mit dem Zitat aus einem Buch eingeleitet, das der Lehrer vom Buchhändler erhalten hat: „Wüßte der Mensch, daß er sich selbst genügen wird, wäre dies die Lösung eines wichtigen Problems."[41] Der Lehrer, der in seinem früheren Leben die Last der Einsamkeit eines entfremdeten Einzelwesens erlebte, weiß, daß eine solche Einsamkeit zum Wahnsinn führt. Und deshalb nimmt er mit Dankbarkeit die Anwesenheit der Menschen in seiner Verbannung, wie auch all das, was die Realität des Lebens unter ihnen mit sich bringt, an.

Schon im Roman *Kimse* (Jemand, 1976), der Edgüs ersten Versuch darstellt sich mit einem intensiven, provozierenden Erlebnis auseinanderzusetzen, das für ihn seine Wirkung im Dorf Pirkanis bedeutete, ist die Idee der Selbsterkenntnis durch das Kennenlernen anderer Menschen angedeutet. Während das Motto des ersten Teils des Romans signalisiert, daß es hier um ein Suchen sich selber gehen wird, steckt sich das Motto des zweiten Teiles das Ziel mit Menschen zusammenzukommen und diese kennenzulernen. Das Erzählen wird im Roman *Kimse* durch einen Dialog zweier Stimmen realisiert. Es ist eigentlich ein Gespräch, das der Protagonist des Romans in schlaflosen Winternächten mit sich selbst führt. Aus diesem fiktiven Dialog geht hervor, daß der Protagonist an jene Menschen denken muß, mit denen er das gleiche Schicksal teilt, daß er sich von ihnen nicht distanziert, daß er nicht mehr in Kategorien „ich — sie", sondern nur „wir" denkt. Und er wird sich dessen bewußt, daß ein oberflächlicher Blick nicht ausreicht um diese Leute zu begreifen, er muß es lernen, sie von innen her kennenzulernen.

A. Özkırımlı charakterisiert den Roman *Kimse* als eine Analyse des eigenen „Ich", die jedoch aus der subjektiven individuellen Realität nicht ausbricht, und als Werk daher zur Hoffnungslosigkeit inkliniert.[42] Das Wissen des Protagonisten des Romans um seine Zugehörigkeit zu den Dorfbewohnern, seine Befriedigung durch die Arbeit des Lehrers, bringt jedoch schon auch in diesem Roman einen Schuß Optimismus hinein.

---

[41] Edgü, F.: *O*, S. 129.

[42] Özkırımlı, A.: *1977'de öykü ve roman. Nesin Vakfı Edebiyat Yıllığı 1978.* Istanbul 1978, S. 62—63.

Durch die Idee der Unumgänglichkeit sein eigenes Leben mit jenem anderer Leute zu verbinden, sich durch Arbeit zugunsten dieser Leute zu realisieren, knüpft Ferit Edgü an die humanistischen Grundsätze des Schaffens von Sait Faik Abasıyanık (1906—1954) an, zu dessen Vermächtnis er sich offen bekennt: „Ich nehme an, daß meine Anschauung von der Welt, der Gesellschaft, der Leute, der Kunst und vor allem von der Literatur, von der Sait Faiks nicht allzusehr entfernt ist."[43] Genau so wie für Sait Faik existiert auch für Ferit Edgü ein einziger Wert, ein einziges Heiligtum, und das ist der Mensch.[44]

Die Zusicherung einer neuen, besseren Zukunft des Menschen sieht Edgü in den Kindern. Deshalb wird den Kindern im Roman *O* eine wichtige Rolle eingeräumt. Der alltägliche Kontakt mit ihnen stellt für den Protagonisten eine feste Stütze dar, durch sie dringt er in die Denkweise der Bergbewohner ein, bemächtigt sich ihrer Sprache, ihrer Logik. Sie sind für ihm Schüler und Lehrer zur selben Zeit, so wie er ihr Lehrer und Schüler ist.

In der ersten Unterrichtsstunde nagt in ihm noch der Zweifel, ob er diese anspruchsvolle Aufgabe meistern wird. Er hat das Gefühl, daß er lediglich Lehrer spielt, da er nichts weiß, was er anderen beibringen könnte. Zuerst muß er also die anderen und sich selbst kennenlernen. Einstweilen ist er nur ein armseliger Wanderer, der von seinem Weg abgekommen ist. Eines von Süryanis Büchern bietet ihm die Anweisung, wie er sich in einer solchen Situation zu verhalten hat. Der Lehrer unterstreicht für sich darin einen solchen Satz: „Wanderer, solltest du eines Tages von deinem Weg abkommen, versuche es nicht mehr den alten Weg zu finden, suche dir einen neuen Weg."[45] Und es sind gerade die Kinder, an die der Lehrer seine Hoffnung zur Entdeckung neuer Wege knüpft: „Der Schnee bedeckte die Wege. / Macht nichts wir entdecken / nicht die alten Wege, wir entdecken neue Wege / gemeinsam mit unseren Kindern. . ."[46]

Damit die neue Generation andere Wege beschreiten kann, als die welche ihre Eltern beschritten hatten, prägt ihnen der Lehrer in der letzten Unterrichtsstunde eine Kenntnis ein, die jene Lebensphilosophie verneint, nach der sich ihre Vorfahren jahrhundertelang gerichtet hatten, und zwar, daß nichts vom Schicksal bestimmt ist.

Wie der hervorragende türkische Literaturkritiker Fethi Naci konstatierte, ist sich Ferit Edgü dessen bewußt, daß die „Rettung" des Volkes, so wie es die historische

---

[43] *Sait Faik Ödülünü Ferit Edgü kazandı.* In: *Nesin Vakfı Edebiyat Yıllığı 1980,* S. 300. Über Sait Faiks Einwirken auf Edgü und die Schriftsteller seiner Generation siehe: *Ferit Edgü'nün ödül türeninde konuşması.* In: *Nesin Vakfı Edebiyat Yıllığı 1980,* S. 297. Ein gewichtiges Zeugnis von dieser Einwirkung ist Edgüs Erzähluhg *Dönüş* (Die Rückkehr) aus der Sammlung *Bir gemide.*

[44] Edgü, F.: *Ders notları.* Ankara 1980, S. 109.

[45] Edgü, F.: *O,* S. 84.

[46] Ibid., S. 175.

Entwicklung zeigte, keine Sendung ist, die die Intellektuellen in die Tat umsetzen könnten, sondern daß das Volk lediglich sein eigenes Bewußtsein retten kann.[47]

Ferit Edgüs Werk stellt in der Entwicklung des türkischen realistischen Romans einen bedeutsamen Schritt vorwärts dar. Es ist dessen Modifikation, bei der die soziale Ebene in die symbolische übergeht, wobei die gesellschaftliche Aktualität des Werkes durch diesen Vorgang keineswegs geschwächt wurde, ja im Gegenteil, durch den Lakonismus der Symbolsprache, sowie durch die poetische Kürze wurde diese Aktualität noch schärfer und dringender.

---

[47] Fethi Naci: *Türkiye'de roman ve toplumsal değişme.* Istanbul 1981, S. 143—144.

THE PROMETHEUS-MYTH
AND CAUCASIAN EPIC TRADITIONS

JÁN KOMOROVSKÝ, Bratislava

The motif of a hero chained to the peak of a high mountain was spread since time out of mind in the folkloric tradition of Caucasian peoples as documented not only by reports of ancient authors, but also by research over the past hundred years or so. One facet of this topic left out of research thus far relates to the complex way in which this mythical personage reached Greece.

Even in Homer's time (9th—8th cent. B.C.), the Greeks had only very vague ideas about the shores of the Black Sea which they called Pontos Euxeinos, or the Hospitable Sea. The horizon of their geographical knowledge expanded proportionally to the spread of their political, trade and cultural contacts. In comparison with Homer's, Hesiod's geographical horizon was already wider, although only a relatively short period of time separated the two. This progress was undoubtedly due to the Greek's colonial movement then being started in the western direction, but also eastwards in the direction of the Black Sea. However, they made no mention of the Caucasus in their works.

The name Caucasus is first met with in Hecataios of Miletus (about 546—480 B.C.), considered by experts as one of the earliest Greek geographers and historians. In his work *Períodos tés gés* (Description of the Earth), he sketched a characteristic of countries known to contemporary Greeks. Unfortunately, only fragments have been preserved. From him is also a map of the Earth, engraved on a copper plate which, in the words of a contemporary author, evoked general wonder and admiration. Hecataios' views seem to have been also shared by the poet Pindar and the dramatist Aeschylus.

According to Hecataios' notions, the dry land was encompassed on all sides by an outward sea to which led three inlets: the Pillars of Hercules, i.e. the Strait of Gibraltar, the Phasis river in the Caucasus or the present Rioni, and the Nile. Hecataios was much better familiar with the Caucasian shore and the Kimmer Bosporus (the Kerch straits) than with the western and northwestern shores of the Black Sea. He mentions the names of numerous peoples that were settled there.

In Hecataios, the Caucasian range of mountains runs to the northeast from the Caspian sea, around the Sea of Azov and directly connects with what the Greek called Rhipaion oros — Rhipaean mountain range situated in the north of Europe. In the ancient period this range was identified with various mountain ranges. Some went so

far as to see the Alps in it. Herodotus and Strabo did not consider reports on such a range as trustworthy. In reality, it was a purely imaginary range, illusory, mythical. Ancient Greeks presumed it to be a place where great „Scythian", i.e. east-European rivers were born, flowing into the Black Sea. They were convinced that beyond this mountain range there lived a legendary tribe of "noble barbarians", Hyperboreans, i.e. a nation living beyond the northern wind (Boreas). Earlier, the Greeks believed that this wind blew from Thrace and the Rhipaean mountains, and the Hyperboreans lived closer to them. However, with the accumulating geographical knowledge they gradually shifted the legendary Hyperboreans and with them also the Rhipaean mountain range, further away to the distant north.[1]

The great Athenian tragic writer Aeschylus in his Prometheus Bound put into the mouth of his hero a description of future wanderings of the hapless Io whom jealous Hera transformed into a cow persecuted by a gad-fly. Prometheus' prediction presents a mythical geographical image of part of the then known world, on the other hand, it expresses the views and notions of Hecataios, Aeschylus' elder contemporary.

In the prologue to the tragedy, demonic personages come on the stage — personifying Strength and Power which bind Prometheus, behind them comes Hephaestus carrying a hammer and fetters in his powerful hands. On reaching the top of the mighty rock, Power comments that they have finally reached a far-off country on the territory of the Scythians in a man-forsaken wilderness. Hence, there is question here of a country spreading to the north of the Black Sea. At another place of the play, Prometheus astonished at the arrival of the Ocean asks him how he had dared to leave sea waters "and come to the land that begets iron?". Our attention, however, is attracted specially by the first part of Io's explanation beginning with the words: "From here, set out first of all in the direction of the East. . ." The question that naturally arises here is: Wherefrom? Her prescribed itinerary mentions the Caucasus, but before she gets to it she would have to pass first through the country of the Scythian nomads, around the Chalybs who were indeed settled on the southeastern shore of the Black Sea and therefore away from the route of Io's peregrinations till then. Prometheus goes on to predict that Io would reach the Hybriste river, i.e. the "Wild", by which Aeschylus probably understood a river with its headwater in the Caucasus — perhaps the Kuban (Hypanis) flowing into the Sea of Azov. Only then was she to cross the Caucasian peaks and head southwards. Prometheus' forecast of Io's subsequent wanderings end up in Egypt where the unfortunate creature gets rid of the gad-fly and regains her human appearance. She bore a son to

---

[1] Thomson, J. O.: *History of Ancient Geography.* Cambridge 1948; Russian ed.: *Istoriya drevnei geografii.* Moscow 1953, pp. 80—84; Yelnitsky, L. A.: *Znaniya drevnikh o severnykh stranakh.* Moscow 1961, pp. 53—78; Ditmar, A. B.: *Rubezhi oikumeny,* Moscow 1973, pp. 18—20.

Zeus — Epaph — and the episode turns into a myth involving the fifty Danaides. This, however, is beyond the framework of our topic.[2]

Projecting Aeschylus' geographical notions into modern geographical knowledge with, of course, certain adjustments and corrections, we may arrive at the conclusion that the place of Prometheus' torments might have been the Urals to which the words "earth that begets iron" may justifiably be applied. Support for such a hypothesis comes indirectly from Herodotus' *History*. In Chapt. 21—23 of Book IV while speaking of the territory to the east of the Tanais river, i.e. the Don, he says that in comparison with the chernozem, west of the Don, that one is rocky and raw. "After traversing this rough extremity, one finds people settled at the foothills of high mountains, who, it is said, are bald-headed from birth— both men and women alike; they have snub noses and (men have) big beards. They speak their own language, but wear Scythian dress. They live on the fruit of trees. The tree whose fruit they eat is called *pontikon* and is about the size of the fig tree; the fruit resembles berries but with kernels. When the fruit is ripe, they press it through kerchiefs, a thick black juice, called *aschy*, comes out. They lick it and drink it mixed with milk, and make marmalade of the thick part of the must..."

The people mentioned by Herodotus is known in historical literature under the name af Agripeys. They were remote ancestors of the Kalmucks (Kalmycks) who had their pasture lands in southern Ural during the 16th—17th century and by way of assimilation of earlier inhabitants, took over their customs. The beverage *aschy* that used to be prepared from the fruit of the *pontikon* tree (Prunus Padus), that is to say of cherries, is still known to the Kazakhs to this day, as also to the Bashkir and the Kazan Tatars.[3]

During the antiquity, a trade route ran precisely through this territory from Olbia (at the site of present Odessa), a Greek colony at the mouth of the Bug river on the northern shore of the Black Sea, which was founded in the first half of the 6th century B.C. by the Greeks of Miletus and which became a flourishing centre. This trade route led far beyond the Urals and was used particularly by the Scythians, who, as A. P. Smirnov writes in his book about this people, "played an enormous role as trade intermediaries. Without any doubt, thanks to them, items from cultural centres of the then civilization penetrated far into the north. Thus, for instance a bronze figurine of the Egyptian god Ammon was found in northern Urals and vases from the Achaemenid aera of Persia were unearthed in the Transural region. Greek painted vessels from the 6th—5th cent. B.C. have been found beyond the frontiers of the Scythian territory."[4] These facts speak for the assumption that Aeschylus may have heard about the distant mountains through Greek colonists from the Pontus.

[2] Yelnitsky, L. A.: op. cit., p. 42.

[3] Thomson, J. O.: *Istoriya...*, op. cit., pp. 99—100; Yelnitsky, L. A.: op. cit., p. 60.

[4] Smirnov, A. P.: *Skytové*. Prague 1980, p. 127.

Another possibility is that Aeschylus had in mind the illusory, mythical Rhipaean mountain range, although he does not name it explicitly. As has already been stated, according to Hecataios, the Caucasus Mountains running from northwest to southeast, about directly on the Rhipaean mountains situated in the north and running in a west-to-east direction. It may be that Aeschylus' conception of the Caucasus Mountains or the Urals fused with these mythical Rhipaeans, except that the latter were not considered to be the "earth begetting iron".

Later, when the tradition localizing the execution of punishment on Prometheus on the Causacus had become tangled, Scholia remarks on Aeschylus: "We must realize that Aeschylus portrays Prometheus chained not in the Caucasus as held by the generally disseminated tradition, but in the European extremities of the Ocean."

On the other hand, there is the stratling fact that in the fragment from Aeschylus' lost tragedy *Prometheus Unbound*, which Marcus Tullius Cicero freely translated into Latin in his second book of *Tusculan Talks*, the Caucasus is taken as the place where Prometheus was expiating his punishment. That is one of those puzzles difficult to explain, discrepancies that have accumulated in relation to the question of Aeschylus' authorship of *Prometheus Bound*. It looks as if the author of *Prometheus Unbound* was somebody else and as if he lived at a later period, since in the former case the place of the punishment is very vague and in the latter it is explicitly localized in the Caucasus. But of course, it is likewise admissible that Cicero, freely paraphrasing Aeschylus' text, adjusted it to correspond to the existing tradition.

In the tradition that developed after Aeschylus, the localization of Prometheus' punishment in the Caucasus had become far more explicit. Of interest in this connection is the epos of the writer from the Alexandrine school Apollonius Rhodius from the 3rd cent. B.C., author of the *Argonautica*.

The core of the very old Greek myth about the Argonauts, i.e. "sailor on the ship Argo" is the story about Jason, the son of Aeson of Iolcus in Thessaly, how he was sent by his uncle Pelias to Colchis in the Caucasus to fetch the Golden Fleece. The original stimulus for the Argonauts' expedition to Colchis in the Caucasus had probably been an exploration for finding gold. The Greek world had for long felt a lack of this precious metal. Only minor, long exhausted deposits existed on the islands Siphnos and Tasos, those at Macedonia were poor, and probably only the mines at Thrace were somewhat richer in gold-bearing veins.[5] Nor may be exaggerated the influence of the Hittites on the origin of the myth about the Golden Fleece. This people is known to have had protective gods of various towns worshipped in the form of a fleece, i.e. of a sheep or a goat skin with hair. To all appearances, the myth about the Argonauts evolved gradually and the central topic of the episode, viz. the theft of the Golden Fleece came to be embodied in the epos only later.

---

[5] Hennig, R.: *Terrae incognitae*. I. Leiden 1944; Russian ed.: *Nevedomye zemli*. I. Moscow 1961, p. 36 ff.

The names and terms of the myth about the Argonauts are partially mentioned already in Homeric epic. For instance, Jason (Il. VII, 469; Od. XII, 72), king Aeëtes (Od. X, 137; XII, 70), the ship Argo (Od. XII, 70), Pelias (Od. XI, 256), etc. But the name Medea does not occur in it, neither that of "Colchis", nor "Golden Fleece". The last two terms were unknown also to Hesiod. The name "Colchis" was first introduced by Aeschylus.[6]

When describing the Argonauts' voyage to Colchis in the Caucasus, Apollonius Rhodius mentions, that after the country of the Macrons and the Sapirs, the sailors spied the Straits of Pontus, with the steep peaks of the Caucasus Mountains soaring up before them and on which Prometheus bound to the wild rock with strong copper fetters, had his liver devoured by an ever-returning eagle; in the evening they saw the bird, with a shrill whizzing of its wings, soar above their ship high beneath the clouds; the strokes of its wings caused all the sails to fill. It did not look like an ordinary bird flying through the air, but it waved its rapid wings as if they were well carved oars. Immediatelly, they would hear Prometheus' painful shriek as the eagle tore out his liver; the air was filled with groans until they again saw the blood-thirsty eagle returning the same way it had come. During the night, relying on the experienced Argo, they reached the broad Phasis (today Rioni) on the extreme boundary of Pontus.[7]

In another place of the Argonauts, Apollonius Rhodius mentions another interesting motif of the Promethean myth. Medea, daughter of the king of Colchis, prepared a remedy for Jason, called "Prometheus' balsam". This medicine was allegedly prepared of the juice of a plant that grew from soil bedewed the blood of tortured Prometheus. Anyone who smears himself with that balsam, "will be immune to wounds from strokes of the sword, nor will blazing fire harm him". This motif already implies the existence of a home Caucasian folkloristic tradition.[8]

The motif of Prometheus bound to the Caucasian peak is also to be found in the Bibliotheca — a mythological manual dating back to about the 1st cent. B.C., and wrongly attributed to Apollodorus of Athens who lived in the 2nd cent. B.C. This episode, however, is not enriched with new elements, probably because the Bibliotheca represents only some sort of an ancient Greek mythology. Far more information is provided by geographers and travellers. From them we learn gradually more and more not only about the Caucasian localization of the execution of the punishment of Prometheus, but likewise on the Caucasian tradition regarding the hero, as a rule, a giant, chained to the peak of a high mountain.[9]

---

[6] Ibid., p. 37.

[7] Latyshev, V. V.: *Izvestiya drevnikh pisatelei o Skifii i Kavkaze.* Vestnik drevnei istorii, 1947, No. 3, p. 282.

[8] Ibid., p. 284.

[9] Ibid., p. 306.

Strabo of Amaseia on the Pontus (63 B.C. — 19 A.D.) was primarily a historian, but his *Historical Notes,* with the exception of a few fragments, have been lost. However, his *Geographica,* divided into 17 books, has been preserved with the exception of Book 7. On the basis of his own experiences, literature and diverse reports, he described the then world in this work. While describing India, he also touched on an ancient legend about Hercules' voyage to the east and remarked that "this story is corroborated by episodes about the Caucasus and Prometheus. The tradition came here through an insignificant motive: As a matter of fact, when the people saw the sacred cave at Paropami, they declared it to be the site of Prometheus' torments. Allegedly, Hercules had come there to deliver Prometheus and here is that Caucasus which the Hellenes designated as the place of Prometheus' affliction."[10]

Strabo's report is of interest in that it relates to the incursions of the Macedonian king Alexander the Great (336—323 B.C.) into Asia and deals with that stage of the Anabasis at which the great military commander bypassed Kandahar on the territory of present-day Afghanistan and, crossing the snow-covered uplands, wintered in the smallish Caucasian Alexandria at the site of present Kabul, in the foothills of Paropamis, as the Hindu Kush range was then called. Another name of this mountain range was "Indian Caucasus".

Soldiers of Alexander's army probably saw in the Hindu Kush an analogue of the Caucasus, but there might have been also such who, in view of the then geographical knowledge, saw in it a continuation of the Caucasus. This notion may have been so strongly rooted in them that, on seeing the sacred cave in the Paropamis, they were immediately reminded of the spot where Prometheus, or his Caucasian double, was chained in the Caucasus. For the Caucasian folklore has preserved down to the present times numerous versions of the bound hero. Among them many are connected with a cave, others speak of the peak of a high mountain.

The Caucasian tradition about a chained hero receives support also from the Greek historian of Alexander the Great's expeditions, Flavius Arrianus, a native of Nicodemia in Bitynia in Asia Minor (born about 95 A.D.). He became a consul under emperor Hadrian around 130 and shortly after governor of the province of Cappadocia in Asia Minor (now in Turkey). In this function, he undertook in 131, an inspection trip along the shore of the Black Sea and on his return sent a report to emperor Hadrian in which, among other things, he says: "On our way to Dioscuriade (present Sukhumi in the Abkhazian Rep.) we saw the Caucasus Mountains, which by their height come closest to the Celtic Alps. We have been shown one peak of the Caucasus — its name is Strobil — on which, as fables will have it, Hephaestus, on Dio's orders, had hung Prometheus."[11] This testimony of Arrianus' also goes to show

---

[10] Ibid., No. 4, p. 240.
[11] Ibid., 1948, No. 1, pp. 270, 271.

that in the 2nd cent. A.D. a living tradition was perpetuated among the Caucasian tribes regarding a hero chained to the peak of a mountain, who probably was not called here Prometheus, but this Caucasian myth must have somehow evoked associations in this educated Greek, with the mythology of his nation.

One of the four Philostrati related by kinship, probably Flavius (ca 217 A.D. called The Athenian), gave an even more detailed report on the hero chained in the Caucasus: "The same legends circulate among the barbarians regarding this mountain as among Hellenic poets, namely, that Prometheus had been chained to it for his love towards men, and Hercules . . . could not bear it and with an arrow form a bow shot the bird that devoured Prometheus' entrails; according to the words of some, he had been chained in a cave that is seen at the foot of the mountain; Damis even states that chains hang there on the rock, whose size can hardly be imagined. According to others, he was chained atop the mountain. This had a double peak and it is said that he was tied by the hands to these spurs which are at least one stadium apart, so enormous was he in size. And the inhabitants of the Caucasus consider the eagle as an enemy and burn the nests they make themselves on the rocks, with fiery arrows, and even lay traps on them and explain this to be in revenge for Prometheus. So convinced are they of the truthfulness of the legend."[12]

The earliest Greek reports prove beyond all possible doubt that local traditions regarding a hero chained to the summit of a high mountain, had been alive in the Caucasus since times immemorial. And this is supported even more strongly by folkloric material collected among Caucasian peoples during the past hundred years or so. Abundant Promethean motifs are represented in Nart epic which occupies an important place in the oral tradition of the Adyghes, Circassians, Kabardians, Abkhazians, Karachains and Balkars, Ossets, Ingushs and Chechens, marginally also in the folklore of the Dagestan Avars, Svans and other nationalities of the Caucasus. The first mention regarding the existence of a national epos among the Ossets is to be found in the work *Reise in den Kaukasus und nach Georgia* by the prominent linguist and orientalist J. Klaproth who travelled across Ossetia in the 19th century. In the forties and fifties of the last century, reports on Nart epic songs and prosaic episodes began to appear in ethnographic publications of the Russian Academy of Sciences. The Kabardian scholar and enlightener Shora Bekmurzovich Nogmov then published, in a Russian translation, his jottings on the Nart episodes. At the same time, the ethnographer and scholar Sultan Khan-Girey published Kabardian and Circassian myths and legends about the Narts in Russian journals.

The name Nart referred to a legendary family of heroes and episodes about them were moulded for some two and half thousand years into an extensive grandiose epopee. To this day, investigators have failed to unify as regards the meaning of Nart.

---

[12] Ibid., No. 2, pp. 293, 294.

Perhaps the most acceptable is the explanation proposed by V. F. Miller, who deduces it from the Old-Iranian *nara,* meaning "man", but also "brave", "daring", "courageous", "fighter", "hero". It seems that the term embodies the influence of Iranian steppe tribes, particularly the Alans living near the Caucasus in the 1st millennium B.C. The original denomination of individual heroes came in time to be extended to denote the entire mythical family or tribe.

The prominent Ossetian linguist and folklorist V. I. Abayev explains the spread of the Nart epos among the Caucasian peoples not only through mutual contacts, a multi-sided influencing of national cultures, but also by the very character of the Nart episodes, whose core reflects a very remote period when the consciousness of a family and tribal solidarity reigned in the then society and when myths and legends still carried the seal of a primitive universality and all-human comprehensiveness which, of course, facilitated an exchange of spiritual values among the associations of antiquity.[13]

When we consider that under the influence of ethnohistorical processes, epic topics pass through a differentiation and contamination of motifs and subjects, we must assume a common substrate from which the Nart epos has grown through a cyclic process. The same may also be said of various epic works by nation of the Pontic-Aegean world.

Thus, in the Nart epic of the Caucasus we may repeatedly meet with motifs and entire topics known also from ancient Greek epic. For example in the Ossetian Nart episode "Uryzmag and the One-Eyed Giant",[14] we find an analogy from the ninth song in Homer's Odyssey. Uryzmag becomes a prisoner of the one-eyed giant as the Cyclop Polyphemos in Homer. Similarly as Odysseus, also Uryzmag makes the giant blind and escapes from the cave in a manner similar to that of Odysseus. The latter, together with his associates, gets hold of the biggest ram of Polyphemus' flock with thick fleece, binds them in threes and under the middle one ties one of his mates; he himself picks the biggest ram of all, draws himself in under its wooly belly and holding on fast to its thick fleece, escapes past the blinded giant who can check his flock at the cave's exit solely by touch. In contrast to Homer's episode, Nart Uryzmag secretely cuts the throat of a he-goat, the guardian of the flock, carefully flays it without separating the head and horns from the skin. At the first streak of dawn he puts it on and together with the flock, gets out of the cave. A remarkable detail apparent in both Homer's and the Nart episode is that of ridicule of the self-liberated hero at the giant — of course, "from a respectful distance".

The Nart epos of the Adyges also includes a Promethean topic involving a hero chained to the peak of a high mountain. The Kabardian version[15] relates how the god

---

[13] A b a y e v, V. I.: *Problemy nartskogo eposa.* In: *Nartskii epos.* Ordzhonikidze 1957.

[14] *Nartskie skazaniya. Osetinskii narodnyi epos.* Moscow 1949, p. 39.

[15] *Narty. Kabardinskii epos.* Moscow 1951, p. 281.

of evil Pako had for ages harassed the Narts by sending storms on their land thus destroying their homes and crops. When the Narts turned to him with a reproach — why he tormented them so, the angry Pako laid waste their hearths and put out fire in their fireplaces. The Narts then went to their Thamada — the elderly of the village named Nasrenzhake, i.e. Nasren the Long-Bearded, for advice and help. Nasren promised them that he would bring them fire from Pako, but the latter on hearing his request, put him in irons and chained him to the Oshkhomakho mountain, as the Adyges call the Elbrus (5633 m). Then he set an eagle on Nasren which plucked his breast and devoured his liver. However, the hero Bataraz overpowered Nasren's guardians Death and a Dragon and drove away the evil Pako. Then fire glowed again in the villagers' hearths. In this episode, Nasren is an analogue of Prometheus, while Bataraz plays the role of Hercules who freed Titan.

According to another Kabardian variant, the role of the Caucasian Prometheus is played by a one-eyed hero who dared to penetrate into the secrets of the highest Adygean god Tkha and entered the gap between two peaks, at the site where a rock, visible from afar, soars. . . Immortal Tkha could not stand such an effrontery and nailed the audacious man to the rock. He then set on him a wild vulture which came to pluck his heart every day.[16]

However, the subject of the nailed hero is far more disseminated outside the Nart cycle in innumerable variants of myths and legends.

Such are in the first place legends about Amirani, known in the whole of Georgia in all the dialects of the language. Numerous variants, enframed in voluminous episodes, speak of how Amirani, because of arrogance and defiance of the gods, was nailed to the rock in a cave of the Caucasian crest, where an eagle continuously pecked at his liver. Amirani's faithful dog continuously licks the chain to wear it thin, but every year on Maundy Thursday, smiths whom the god had set next to him, strengthen the chain. The ancient myth says that once in seven years the cave opens and Amirani may be seen inside.[17]

The Ingush relates that atop Mount Kazbek (5043 m) there is a mysterious cave in which a young man lies chained to the wall for some crime. He groans in pain, for a wild bird continuously plucks out his heart.[18]

A myth prevails with the Abkhazes concerning an invincible hero Abrskil, protector of his people. As he wished to achieve what is solely in the power of the gods, he challenged the highest god to a contest. The latter had him caught and locked in a cave, where, together with his horse, he is nailed to an iron pillar. Abrskil tries to rock the pillar free, but when he is about to achieve this, a little bird comes to

[16] Dalgat, U. B.: *Kavkazskie bogatyrskie skazaniya drevnikh tsiklov i epos o nartakh*. In: *Skazaniya o nartakh — epos narodov Kavkaza*. Moscow 1969, p. 133.

[17] Chikovani, N. Y.: *Narodnyi gruzinskii epos o prikovannom Amirani*. Moscow 1966.

[18] Dalgat, U. B.: *Geroicheskii epos chechentsev i ingushei*. Moscow 1972, p. 51.

sit on top; Abrskil swings his heavy hammer at it, but the bird flies away and the hammer falls on the pillar and drives it again deep into the ground. Abrskil's cave is taken to be that of Ochamchira in the Abkhazian District.[19]

In Svan superstitious episodes of Georgia, an evil demoniac being appears, named Rokapi, whose fate resembles that of Abrskil and Amirani. One Imeretian legend has it that god had Rokapi nailed to an iron pole driven deep into the centre of the Earth. Rokapi unceasingly tries to pull the pole out and free himself from his fetters. He, therefore, keeps on shaking the pole, but as he is about to pull it out clean, a wagtail flies in and sits on top, wagging its tail. Rokapi swings his enormous hammer at it and the ensuing fate is similar as in the case of the previous episode.[20]

A significant similarity with the motifs about Rokapi, Amirani and Abrskil is seen in the myth about the Circassian giant-hero chained to the Elbrus peak for some great crime. When he wakes up, he asks his guardians whether reeds still grow on earth and whether lambs are still born. The guards answer that reeds grow and lambs are born, which drives the giant into a fury and he starts jerking his chains till they clang and rattle as if thunder rolled, and sparks fly from them.[21]

A motif of special interest in the above versions is that of the pillar or pole, to which the hero is chained, as also the episode with the bird. This motif has a well-known iconographic parallel in the painting of the inside of a Laconian cup from the 6th cent. B.C., with the episode of Prometheus' brother the Titan Atlas holding the heavenly firmament on his shoulders, facing him is Prometheus bound to a pillar with a bird sitting on top; a bird of prey pecks at Prometheus's heart. This is essentially a scene illustrating the 522nd verse in Hesiod's Theogony which states that Zeus had the shrewd Prometheus locked in strong fetters "and pierced him in the middle with a pillar", which, according to O. Gruppe, is a figurative expression of the fact that Prometheus was chained to the pillar. This poetic inversion should be taken as meaning that the fetters were "pierced" in the middle by the pillar not the body.[22]

This motif of the pillar and the bird on the painting is further evidence of the connection between the Promethean myth and the Caucasian traditions. In fact, Greek mythology does not explain the meaning of the bird on the pillar to which Prometheus is attached. An elucidation is found solely in the Caucasian legends.

A figure of the type of chained Prometheus also has parallels in Armenian mythology. Episodes of similar heroes are scattered in historical writings of such authors as were Movses Khorenatsi, Grigol of Parthion, Eznik of Kohb and Grigol of

---

[19] Bgazhba, Kh. S.: *Ob abkhazskom geroicheskom epose.* In: *Voprosy izucheniya eposa narodov SSSR.* Moscow 1958, p. 189.

[20] Chikovani, M. Y.: op. cit., p. 63 ff.

[21] Ibid., p. 67.

[22] Gruppe, O.: *Griechische Mythologie und Religionsgeschichte.* Bd. 2. München 1906, pp. 382, 383, 1027, 1107.

Khlat. In early sources, Artavazd, Shidar and Mkher, in particular, are mentioned in the role of Prometheus.

Artavazd, the son of king Artashes, is a mythical figure in the Armenian epic *Vipasank*. The central motif of his last branch is the mutual relation between father and son, and also the strength of the father's malediction of whose efficiency the Armenian people are convinced even today. The epos speaks of Artashes' construction works for which he is liked by the people, further, of his death and solemn burial. Artavazd is jealous of his father's fame and says to him: "You have departed and taken with you the whole of our earth. How can I rule over ruins?" The father cursed him for these words: "When you go hunting to Azat, to Masis, the kadjis will catch you and will take you away and you will never see light again". The paternal curse was fulfilled. Artavazd was caught during a hunt by the spirits of storm and wind, the demons kadjis, who put him in iron chains in a cave of Masis. In the conclusion, the *Vipasank* says: "Old women talk of him, saying he is fettered in iron chains and locked in some cave; that two dogs continuously lick his chains and he tries in every possible way to get free and make the end of the world. But at the sound of strokes of smiths' hammers, the fetters become strengthened again." And the historian Movses Khorenatsi (5th cent.) adds: "Therefore, in our times also many smiths, adhering to the legend, every Sunday strike the anvil with a hammer three or four times, allegedly in order that Artavazd's fetters would become strengthened".[23]

As regards the person Mkher the Younger from a more recent epic of the Armenians entitled *David Sasunsky*, it is said that he was swallowed up by a rock into its entrails. According to another version, the highest divinity chained Mkher to the rock and a raven unceasingly pecked at his kidneys. This latter version probably stemmed from the legend about Artavazd, just as the legend about Artavazd's son Shidar derived from the original, primary core by way of a cyclic course.[24]

The material given here is, of course, purely illustrative and is far from exhausting the entire wealth of versions and variants of Caucasian episodes relating to the hero chained to a peak or to a pillar. Through their study, several investigators have come to the conclusion that the roots of the Promethean myth are in the Caucasus. The Russian folklorist Vsevolod Miller in his work *Caucasian Episodes on Giants Chained to Mountains* (1883) starts from the following basic premise which he formulated in these words: "The conviction that Prometheus had been chained somewhere in the Caucasus, which the Greeks had so tenaciously maintained among them, must have some foundation. . . It is difficult to think that their old national god in whose honour a torchlight race was annually organized in Athens, and whose

---

[23] Manuk Abeghian: *Istoriya drevnearmyanskoi literatury*. I. Yerevan 1948, pp. 53—54; *Mify narodov mira*. I. Moscow 1980, p. 106.

[24] *Mify narodov mira*. II. Moscow 1982, p. 160.

myth, connected with the early successes of the Hellenese in culture was so popular that it served as a subject to Aeschylus' eminent trilogy, could have moved, through a caprice of the imagination, to Asia, to the Caucasus. The reason for Prometheus' localization in the Caucasus probably resided in the fact that in the view of the Greeks, these sites were somehow connected with the myth. After all, in some places of the Caucasus legends about a certain legendary hero or giant, whom some god chained to the peak of a mountain, circulate to this day."[25]

Numerous Georgian scholars, from G. Liakhveli towards the end of the last century up to Mikhail Yasonovich Chikovani of the present time, adhere to the view that the Greek Promethean myth has its roots in the Caucasian folklore. And this statement is supported by various, more or less convincing arguments. Some of them were expressed quite a long time ago by Akakii Tsereteli in notes to his dramatic poem *Medea* (1895) and M. Y. Chikovani in his work *Popular Georgian Epos on Amirani Bound* likewise inclines to this view.[26]

Akakii Tsereteli is of the opinion that the Greeks had taken over legends from other nations and when they had processed them, these returned in an altered form back to their place of origin. Support to the view that the Greeks processed various Georgian legends and created personages widely known in the whole world, comes also from the earliest myths about Prometheus and Jason with Medea. Both these personages were born on the territory of Georgia, here they grew and passed from the Colchis in the form of tales to Hellad. According to the words of the Greeks, Prometheus, who through his disobedience drew on himself the anger of the highest god, was chained to the Caucasian crest. His tormentor was a vulture or an eagle, which plucked out his liver, but the hero did not die. His wound healed in order that his tormentor might rive it anew. The torments of the unhappy prisoner had no end. This episode, in different variants is spread everywhere in Georgia and in the whole Caucasus. The only difference is that here Prometheus bears the name of Amirani. In Greek, the word Prometheus means "circumspect", "far-sighted". And far-sightedness is also ascribed to Amirani. . . The Greeks do not say by what means Prometheus' rent wound always healed; this question is quite clear in Georgia: one variant says that a little dog licked his wound and it healed; another holds that after the eagle, a wonder bird always came and caressing Amirani with its wings, healed him. The Greek hero would not have been chained had not the guileful, crippled smith Hephaistos, one of the gods, put him in fetters. Likewise, nobody would have chained the Georgian hero to the mountain peak, had not a lame smith — a sorcerer made his appearance. . . In support of his views, Tsereteli has recourse to testimonies of Greek writers: In the 3rd cent. B.C., Apollonius Rhodius asserted that the river

[25] Miller, V.: *Kavkazskie predaniya o velikanakh, prikovannykh k goram.* Zhurnal Ministerstva narodnogo prosveshcheniya. St. Petersburg, 1883, No. 1, p. 101.

[26] Chikovani, M. Y.: op. cit., pp. 19, 21.

Phasis flowed from the mountain Amaranta where Prometheus was chained. What is that mountain mentioned by ancient Greeks and of which we just know nothing today? According to Tsereteli, it is the mountain called in Georgian oral tradition Amiranmta where Amiranmi was chained.

This last of Akakii Tsereteli's arguments may be further elaborated and supplemented. In Apollonius Rhodius and in the scholia relating to the Argonauts, mention is made not only of Amaranta mountains or mountains of the Amaranti, but also of a region named Amarantida, as also of a town in Pontus under the designation Amarant. The Greek historian Ktesias (ca 400 B.C.), personal physician of the Persian king Artaxerxes, author of the work *Persika* (Persian history) preserved only in an extract and in fragments, says that the inhabitants of Colchis have the Amaranta mountains. The term Amarantos in Caucasian toponymy was mentioned in relation to Georgian Imeretia.[27] Hence, it appears very probable that the Amaranta mountains, the Amaranta Phasis and similar place names are truly derived from the name of the hero Amirani.

The present material, particularly reports of ancient authors about the Caucasus and the local traditions connected with the motif of a hero chained to the peak of a high mountain, as also a confrontation with the present-day state of folklore of the Caucasian peoples clearly point to the origin of this motif outside the framework of the Greek world and everything supports the view that Prometheus' primeval country was the Caucasus. By what complex ways did this mythical figure reach Greece is a question that may be expected to be resolved by further studies along this line.

---

[27] Latyshev, V. V.: op. cit., 1947, No. 1, pp. 280—283. Meletinskii, Y. M.: *Proiskhozhdenie geroicheskogo eposa.* Moscow 1963, p. 217.

TRAITS FONCIERS DE LA FAMILLE CLASSIQUE AU VIETNAM

JÁN MÚČKA, Bratislava

Dans la structure sociale en tant que conglomérat des rapports sociaux, les relations conjugales et familiales constituent une partie essentielle du milieu humain et sont des relations les plus durables. Au point de vue sociologique, la famille comme institution sociale, se situe parmi les groupes sociaux, car on y étudie les développements et phénomènes sociaux non comme des conséquences isolées des relations et activités d'individus, mais comme conséquences de certains groupements. Cette prémisse sert ici de base nous permettant de caractériser la famille classique au Vietnam en relevant les points de chevauchement de la morale et des droits dans la société classique de ce pays, qui étaient fondés en principe sur le pouvoir de souverain, du père et du mari.

Un examen de l'organisation de la société classique vietnamienne révèle qu'un rôle-clef y joue le caractère patriarcal de la famille. Les mœurs, en vertu desquelles celle-ci se conserve, nous rappellent plutôt les sociétés primitives d'Europe. Cependant, il nous manque jusqu'ici une étude générale qui s'efforcerait de retrouver des analogies entre cette famille vietnamienne et la famille européenne. Cela a été accompli dans une certaine mesure uniquement dans le domaine du droit de famille, où la différence la plus saillante émane du fait qu'alors que les législations européennes avaient été déduites juridiquement à partir de changements et adaptations de diverses conditions de la vie, le droit vietnamien était avant tout le résultat d'un développement lent dans un ensemble d'idées vers une certaine conception juridique.

Jusqu'au début du 20e siècle, la famille vietnamienne conservait dans sa forme extérieure et intérieure une structure archaïque. Cette forme est très proche de la forme très ancienne, dite familles terriennes,[1] où l'authorité paternelle est conditionnée par la possession du sol et sa culture. Au mari, comme l'individu le plus fort, revenait le devoir principal de soutenir et protéger la famille et la femme n'avait qu'un statut de loco filio. Il en était de même dans la famille classique juive et chinoise, par contraste avec les familles dites maritimes[2] qui sont caractérisées par une structure familiale matrilinéaire et possèdent des normes juridiques différentes. Il est à observer, que ces termes ne peuvent pas être usités qu'en un sens strictement local et ne peuvent pas être rapportés aux institutions familiales en général.

---

[1] Gentile-Duquesne, Pierre de: *La Situation Juridique de la Femme Annamite.* Paris, Université de Paris 1925, p. 14.

[2] Ibid., p. 16.

Le développement de la famille vietnamienne classique fait preuve d'influences des civilisations voisines dont certaines agissaient parfois comme un isolateur, maintes fois, au contraire, elles aidaient la pénétration de tendances progressives. Ceci est déterminé par la situation géographique elle même du Vietnam qui se trouve sur les frontières de la civilisation chinoise et en même temps est en contact avec les peuples de la civilisation indienne. En termes concrets, il s'agit de l'influence chinoise et celle des Chams. Mais il faut remarquer tout au début que l'influence de la civilisation indienne n'a jamais prédominé et la culture des Chams n'a pas intervenu d'une manière radicale dans la vie familiale du Vietnam. L'influence chinoise avait l'ascendant tout spécialement en matière de la structure et composition du droit familial. La famille des Chams était une institution matrilocale. La question se pose, comment cette institution pouvait exister côte à côte avec une forme familiale tout à fait opposée. Les Chams sont des austronésiens de l'ouest, donc une race différente de la race vietnamienne, une race mongoloïde, connue dans les siècles reculés comme *Giao Chi* (en chinois *Jiaozhi*), dont l'origine géographique remonte au sud de la Chine. Ces *Giao Chi* se regroupèrent graduellement vers le sud, alors que les Chams arrivèrent du sud, probablement de diverses îles de la Polynésie. Peut-être, on pourrait répondre à la question posée ci-dessus d'un manière conditionnée précisément par le facteur géographico-ethnique : dans les pays au climat plus rude, il était indispensable de se grouper en familles avec un système de pouvoir et d'authorité centralisé dans les mains d'un seul individu capable de parer à tout obstacle immédiat et à l'imprévu. Donc, l'authorité en un certain sens remplaçait ici les facteurs assurant l'existence de la société. Dans les régions jouissant de conditions naturelles plus propices, qui ne menaçaient pas en une telle mesure l'existence physique de l'individu, ce facteur servit à renforcer la position de la mère au sein de la famille. Le caractère matrilinéaire de la famille austronésienne n'est pas une conséquence d'un défaut de patriarcat ou de son sens, mais était plutôt déterminé par les conditions naturelles. Evidemment, cette justification ne se passe pas d'une certaine partialité et rien que des études plus étendues seraient à même de fournir une réponse satisfaisant à cette question. Mgr. Granjeon a écrit : «Une chose, très originale, de cette législature coutumière périmée (des Chams — J. M.), peut-être unique dans le monde et très surprenante dans le monde païen, qui se dirige généralement vers une humiliation de la femme, est que l'origine, l'hérédité, le droit de possession, culte des ancêtres, donc tous les droits civils et privés, sont remis aux femmes. La femme représente tout dans la famille, on ne compte pas avec le mari ni pour le travail ni pour fonctions publiques.»[3] Une autre conséquence non moins curieuse de l'institution matrilocale des Chams était le droit publique touchant le mariage. Ici aussi le sexe féminin l'emportait sur le masculin. Le choix du partenaire

---

[3] Cité selon P. de Gentile-Duquesne, op. cit., p. 20—21.

était fait par la fille. Dans ses 17—18 ans, elle envoyait par l'intermédiaire de ses parents, du bétel et deux sortes de gâteaux spéciaux au jeune homme de son choix. Si celui-ci acceptait l'offre de mariage, il n'avait qu'à goûter de ces cadeaux délicats et les fiançailles étaient conclues sans aucunes autres formalités. On prit les mesures pertinentes, surtout on fixa la date du mariage. Dans la majorité des cas, le mariage comme tel était de peu de signification. Pour légaliser les liens matrimoniaux devant la société, l'assentiment des parents de la fille suffisait (ces filles ne quittaient pas la maison maternelle, ce qui est un témoignage frappant de la nature matrilocale de la famille). Alors, le mari était subordonné à sa femme ; il apportait la dot et les cadeaux de noces, ce qui nous permet de conclure que la polygonie dans la famille des Chams, alors même que possible et permise pour tous, néanmoins représentait du luxe à sa manière et dépendait des conditions matérieles du mari. Cette pratique s'est incorporée, dans une forme un peu altérée, aussi dans la famille vietnamienne où, lors même que, selon le principe patriarcal, l'homme choisit son épouse, cela représentait pour lui toujours des dépenses sensibles. Il est vrai que les parents de la femme et ses proches offraient de même des présents aux jeunes mariés (argent, buffles, sol, riz, etc.), mais c'était à titre arbitraire.

La manière dont la jeune fille invitait aux noces, était extrêmement simple. A la suite des cérémonies des fiançailles mentionnées ci-dessus, les témoins-imans ou autres dignitaires religieux accompagnaient le jeune homme à la maison de sa fiancée, où les parents de celle-ci les attendaient. Un des témoins dit alors : «Femme, voilà ton mari, est-ce que tu l'acceptes ?» La jeune fille et quatre femme un peu âgées qui l'assistaient, répondirent tout simplement : «Nous l'acceptons». Alors il remit la main de la femme dans celle du mari et l'acte était accompli (sauf le festin qui suivait).

En 1471 les Chams essuyèrent une grande défaite et leur empire passa sous la dominations du Vietnam. Les Chams étaient enserrés et localisés dans la région entre Phan Ri et Nha Trang, où ils étaient restreints par l'administration des mandarins vietnamiens. Cependant, leur civilisation avait une base si solide que les Vietnamiens étaient obligés de venir en contact avec elle même après l'avoir vaincue et ne pouvaient aucunement se soustraire à son influence. Une autre question, restant inexpliquée, est : pourquoi l'empire des Chams avait été vaincu par les Vietnamiens ? N'était-ce pas dû à la forme matrilinéaire de leur famille ? On trouve l'influence de ces relations matrilinéaires des Chams en tant que voisins, sur le développement de la famille vietnamienne surtout dans une élévation légale de la femme dans l'organisation économique de la famille.

Avant d'entamer l'explication concernant l'influence chinoise, il convient de dire quelques mots sur le droit maternel dont l'existence peut être présumée dans la société vietnamienne même à une période reculée. Ses vestiges peuvent être tracées dans les enregistrements de la Chine classique. Lors même qu'au temps de l'origine des livre confuciens, la vie familiale apparaît déjà dans la forme patriarcale connue,

ils laissent entendre qu'une certaine forme de droit maternel pouvait exister aussi dans cette organisation familiale. Dans le *Livre des Annales (Shuying)* on trouve plusieurs légendes sur la naissance surnaturelle des souverains. Des légendes analogues se trouvent aussi dans les écrits vietnamiens. Par exemple la légende sur le souverain Dinh Tien Hoang (Dinh Bo Linh) de la dynastie Dinh (9ᵉ siècle) raconte qu'une grande loutre vivait dans la région Hoa Lu (aujourd'hui le district de An Khanh, dans la province Ha Nam Ninh). Un jour que la femme Dinh Cong Tru (mère de Dinh Tien Hoang) piochait au bord du ruisseau, la loutre l'a violée et elle rentra enceinte. On   arriva qu'un peu plus tard les gens du village attrapèrent la loutre et la mangèrent, puis dispersèrent les os sur la route. Cette femme sortit, ramassa les os et à la maison les cacha dans la cheminée de cuisine. Après la mort de son mari seulement elle donna naissance à un fils et lui donna le nom Dinh Tien Hoang.[4]

Ces légendes sur une conception extraordinaire de souverains (ou bien de héros) pouvaient avoir pour origine une ignorance quant à la paternité et ainsi relevaient plus encore l'importance du droit maternel dans la société d'alors. Mais il paraît plutôt qu'elles provenaient d'une expérience psychique des femmes désireuses d'avoir des fils et sont donc une réflexion de l'état psychologique sans aucune portée réelle. Certains auteurs vont jusqu'à déclarer à priori qu' «il est inutile d'analyser ce point de vue, la famille patriarcale et la vénération des ancêtres étaient des institutions solidement fondées déjà au début de l'histoire chinoise».[5]

La langue vietnamienne dispose de deux mots pour indiquer la famille : *nha* et *ho*. Le premier indique ce concept dans un sens plus restreint, mettant l'accent sur l'origine familiale. La syllabe «*nha*» est employée, en fait, pour indiquer la «maison», visant par là le bâtiment. On la trouve usitée dans des liaisons diverses, par exemple *dung nha* (construire une maison), *lop nha* (couvrir une maison), *nha chai* (une maison brûlée), etc. L'expression «*nha cua*» (litér. maison et porte) fait clairement ressortir ce que Halbwachs[6] appelle «centre spatial» de chaque groupe apparenté, c'est-à-dire, maison familiale habitée par les parents (éventuellement les grands-parents et bisaïeuls), les enfants et tous ceux qui vivent sous l'authorité du père de famille, par exemple les adoptés et les domestiques. Une expression digne d'attention est «*nha toi*» qui veut dire «ma maison» au sens littéral, mais dans la langue parlée les Vietnamiens en font usage pour indiquer leurs femmes (épouses). Selon la morale traditionnelle, le rôle de la femme consistait à ce qu'elle restait à la maison et en même temps en fut l'âme et la protectrice pleine de sollicitude. Donc, «*nha*» désigne tous ceux qui habitent une maison comme famille, c'est-à-dire un groupement qui correspond dans les traits fonciers au concept européen de «famille». Ce mot «*nha*» semble répondre à la syllabe chinoise «*jia*», dont

---

[4] Phan Ke Binh: *Nam Hai Di Nhan, Liet truyen* (Personnalités exceptionnelles, Evénements notés). Hanoi 1926, p. 8.

[5] Wilkinson, H. P.: *The Family in Classical China.* London 1926, p. 72.

[6] Halbwachs, M.: *Morphologie sociale.* Paris 1938, p. 9.

l'équivalent sino-vietnamien est «*gia*». Donc, «*nha*» signifie en général, «le toit de la maison», c'est-à-dire, la maison et tout ce qu'elle protège, y compris les animaux domestiques. Par contre, le mot chinois «*jia*» (sino-vietnam. «*gia*») désigne aussi une école philosophique d'ou Farjenel déduit que ce terme est une désignation pour «l'union des individus dans une même doctrine».[7] Cependant, on peut dire avec certitude que dans le vietnamien parlé, »*gia*» ou «*nha*» désigne la famille dans un sens restreint du mot, alors personnes vivant sous un même toit.

Cependant du côté significatif, ce vietnamien «*nha*» entend une institution plus large que celle comprise en Europe moderne que E. Durkheim appelle «famille conjugale».[8] Il y entend le mari, la femme, les enfants mineurs et les enfants non-mariés. C'est la règle au Vietnam qu'après le mariage, l'aîné, ou même plusieurs fils cadets demeurent avec leurs parents pour les aider et les soigner. Cela découle de l'obligation du respect filial. Décidément, la famille vietnamienne peut être caractérisée plus à propos par la définition «d'une association de parents naturels ou parents par le sang». On peut constater que «*nha*», ou bien la famille vietnamienne dans un sens plus restreint, comprend en outre du mari et de la femme, aussi les grands-parents, les enfants, soit légitimes ou bien adoptés, les brus et en certains cas, même les domestiques. Dans certaines circonstances, la famille classique était augmentée par «*vo hai*» (une seconde femme), un terme traduit dans la majorité des travaux antérieures d'auteurs européens, comme «concubine». En vue de ces faits préliminaires, il semble que la «zone centrale» (selon Durkheim celle-ci désigne les cercles parentés plus ou moins proches) dans la famille vietnamienne classique se rapporte à une réalité plus compréhensive que n'en est son équivalent dans les sociétés européennes.

Famille dans son sens élargi, connue dans la langue vietnamienne sous le terme «*ho*», originellement indique de telles associations de gens qui correspondent au terme européen de «tribu», «clan».[9] Les mots vietnamiens qui partiellement correspondent à ceux-là sont «*ho*» et «*toc*», que les auteurs européens couramment traduisent aussi comme«famille». En réalité, il semble qu'une traduction plus précise de ce terme serait «parenté» ou «clan de famille».

Le «*ho*» vietnamien réprésente un concept plus étendu que «la famille patriarcale romaine» qui se composait du père de famille (pater familias) et de tous descendants issus de lui. Après la mort du père, les fils se séparaient généralement, fondaient leur propre famille et eux-mêmes devenaient «patres familias». Un tel phénomène n'a

---

[7] Farjenel, F.: *Le peuple chinois.* Paris 1906, p. 26.

[8] Durkheim, E.: *La famille conjugale.* Revue Philosophique, janvier 1921, p. 2.

[9] Clan — clan celtique dans la langue gaélique denote une organisation primitive de la famille qui s'est conservée chez les Celtes des îles britanniques, chez les Irlandais et les Ecossais. Ses membres sont liés par une parenté à la suite d'un ancêtre commun et respectent son descendant le plus proche qui est à la tête du clan.

pas été noté au Vietnam. Il est évident que là aussi, les frères mariés, après la mort du père (ou plus précisément après la mort des parents), tiennent bien le pouvoir au sein de la famille (*nha*) fermement dans les mains, néanmoins, il s'en faut de beaucoup qu'ils deviennent, de par cette raison, des chefs ou «leaders» réels, jouissant d'une authorité absolue dans le cadre de toute la famille, ou clan. On leur dit «*gia truong*» et dans leur famille ils possèdent une authorité presque illimitée. Le *Code de Gia Long*[10] délimite les droits et devoirs de ces pères de familles. Cependant, *Gia truong* n'avait pas le droit de mettre à mort ou de vendre son domestique comme en était le cas dans la famille patriarcale romaine, gaélique ou wisigothique. Les droits fondamentaux vietnamiens du *gia truong* (père de famille), compris dans le *Code de Gia Long*, sont les suivants : 1. le droit de reconnaître un nouveau-né de l'exclure de la maison avec renvoi simultanné de la mère si, à l'avis du juge, la famille avait été souillée par infidélité ; 2. le droit de marier les fils et donner les filles en mariage ; 3. le droit d'émanciper les fils ou de les exclure de la famille en cas de mauvaise conduite ; 4. le droit d'introduire un étranger dans la famille par adoption s'il n'y a pas de descendants mâles, à condition toutefois, qu'il conservera le culte des aïeux ; 5. le droit aux avantages acquis par les fils ; 6. le droit de punir sa femme, ses autres femmes, les enfants et les domestiques. Par contre, le premier devoir du père de famille était de servir d'example aux autres membres. *Gia truong* portait la responsabilité pour son groupe. Ceci est inséré déjà dans l'article 35 du *Code des Le*,[11] d'où il était incorporé aussi dans le *Code de Gia Long* (art. 235) en ces termes : «Si les personnes de la même famille commettent une faute collectivement, la personne principale ou la plus âgée sera inculpée.» A présent, la responsabilité du père et de la mère est essentiellement réduite aux termes de la responsabilité civile. En outre, le père de famille (*gia truong*) était tenu à exercer les fonctions d'imam aux cérémonies domestiques de culte, fair l'offrande aux âmes des ancêtres, alors que la tête du clan (*truong toc*) avait l'obligation de se soucier du culte commun du clan entier. W. Johnson note que le *Code des Le* se ressemble au *Code des T'ang* en Chine ancienne.[11a]

---

[10] Il s'agit du *Code annamite (Hoang-Viet luat le)*, une œuvre codifié sous le règne de Gia Long (1802—1820). Il était élaboré par une commission d'érudits, présidée par *cong tuoc* (titre de lettré) Nguyen Van Tran. Il entra en vigueur par décret du souverain en 1812. Il existe en deux traductions française — celle par Aubaret de 1865, et celle par Philastre de 1876. Cette seconde version est plus complète et plus accessible.

[11] Il s'agit du *Code de Hong Duc (Hong-Duc hinh luat)* proclamé sous le règne de Hong Duc (1470—1497) de la dynastie Le (1428—1527). Il était traduit en fraçais par Raymond Deloustal et publié dans le Bulletin de l'Ecole française d'Extrême Orient en 1908—1922. A présent, les savants vietnamiens à la Faculté de droit (Harvard University) préparent une traduction différente en anglais.

[11a] «And even as late as the fifteenth century, a large part of the *Code* (Code des T'ang — J. M.) was taken over either without alteration or only slightly modified by the Vietnamese Le dynasty.» In: *The T'ang Code*, Volume I, General Principles. Princeton, N. J., Princeton University Press 1979, p. 9.

Il est évident que la législation vietnamienne classique s'efforçait, par la sauvegar-de de l'ordre, de promouvoir l'authorité à tous les grades de l'hierarchie sociale, alors que le développement de la législation européenne représente une tendance à établir l'égalité et une plus grande liberté des membres du groupe.

Quant au droit tutélaire sur les enfants, celui-ci se rapporte sur tous les enfants, légitimes ou nés hors du mariage et en principe, les enfants appartiennent toujours à la maison de leur père. Ils sont sous l'authorité de la tête de famille sans égard à leur âge ou au fait qu'ils habitent ou non sous un même toit. Possessions acquises par un fils du vivant de son père, sont enrégistrées sous le nom du père. Si un *gia truong* se plaint par voie officielle de quelque membre de sa famille, aucune poursuite judiciaire n'est engagée contre lui lors même que l'accusation fût fausse et injustifiée.

Le droit pénal est appliqué envers tous les membres de la famille, mais à gradations différentes. Par exemple, le père de famille lui-même, s'il commet l'infanticide volontaire, est condamné au bannissement, et en cas de meurtre sans aucune motivation extérieure, le droit demande la peine capitale. Le père de famille a le droit de chasser de son groupe celui qui enfreint les règles : c'est ainsi qu'il chasse un domestique, congédie la femme, désavoue le fils ou le petit-fils. Au cas où un enfant est né en adultère à l'une de ses femmes, *gia truong* a le droit de congédier cette femme et selon article 332, l'enfant appartient à la famille de la femme congédiée.

Par contre, le père de famille peut recevoir dans son groupe une personne étrangère par voie d'adoption qui est un acte cérémonial, sujet à des formalités très strictes et conditionné par l'assentiment des notables. Enfin, le *gia truong* dispose du pouvoir d'administration des propriétés successorales (articles 82 et 83 du *Code de Gia Long*). Il s'agit plutôt du droit d'usage (même d'abus) de la propriété familiale, comme aussi une libre disposition du testament. Les liens de la paternité sont inscrits dans l'arbre généalogique (*gia pha*).

Le père de famille vietnamienne (*gia truong*) est plus ou moins sujet au chef du clan (*toc truong*) sauf le cas, naturellement, où la même personne exécute les deux fonctions. Au sens de la terminologie de Durkheim, la famille vietnamienne classique comprend en général, deux zones centrales. La zone primaire est donnée par chaque couple avec les enfants (un ménage). Par contraste avec la zone primaire européenne, celle-ci ne se disloque pas à la mort des parents ; la mort des parents n'est pas un événement qui saurait rompre les liens entre les enfants et leur père ou mère. Les enfants, comme aussi tous ceux qui avait vécu sous l'authorité du père défunt, restent sous une dépendance spirituelle de «l'âme du clan», c'est-à-dire, du *truong toc,* et sont tenus à faire preuve de cette dépendance par des actions. Ainsi, «*ho*» ou famille dans un sens plus élargi du mot, constitue la zone secondaire de l'institution familiale vietnamienne et comprend de nombreux «*nha*» du même nom de famille. *Truong toc* est responsable de la préparation et organisation des rites d'offrande à l'ancêtre commun, qui ont lieu au moins une fois par an dans la maison commune des ancêtres du clan (*nha tho to ho*). Un point d'intérêt est que

l'administration d'alors évaluait l'importance d'une commune non d'après le nombre de ses habitants, mais d'après le nombre des «toits familiaux» (*noc gia*).

La famille vietnamienne aux temps primitifs de son développement ne différait guère de la famille chinoise. Cette similarité a donné lieu au concept usité assez fréquemment, de «famille sinovietnamienne». La question, d'ailleurs déjà abordée, quoique très brièvement, vise à l'origine même de la famille. La difficulté consiste en ce que tradition orale — qui s'est certainement altérée au cours des siècles et de ce fait s'est dévaluée — ne nous permet pas de tirer une conclusion définitive. Quant aux documents écrits provenant de cette époque lointaine, ils ne sont pas, à l'avis des sinologues, de grande valeur non plus, de sorte que nous pouvons obtenir un appui uniquement dans les œuvres de l'époque ultérieure — confucienne, qui seuls nous permettent de former un jugement aussi sur l'époque précédente.

Il semble que l'hypothèse concernant l'institution familiale matrilinéaire, énoncée à base des œuvres mythiques, gagne du soutien (quoiqu'elle n'en reste pas moins une hypothèse seulement) à partir d'études des noms familiaux: le terme «*ho*» ne désigne pas simplement la «famille au sens plus large du mot», mais par sa seconde signification correspond au «nom générique» (nom de famille) porté par tous les descendants d'un ancêtre commun. Dans la famille patriarcale vietnamienne, il se rapporte à l'ancêtre masculin, paternel. Cependant, l'étymologie linguistique souligne qu'originellement, «*ho*» se rattachait à l'ancêtre du côté maternel.

L'idéogramme chinois avec la prononciation *xing* (prononciation sinovietnamienne «*tinh*» ou «*tanh*»), se compose de deux signes, à savoir, du signe pour «femme» (*nu*) et du signe signifiant «naître» (*sheng*, sinovietn. *sinh*). Il en ressort par déduction que le mot «*xing*» (*tinh*), au sens de «famille», évoque l'idée maternelle et ne comprend aucun élément qui impliquerait en quelque manière que ce soit, le genre masculin. Selon les règles de la formation des mots chinois, cette orthographie indique que «*xing*» est signe dénominatif du nom de la mère (métronymicon) pour qualifier un groupe ou clan maternel.

Alors, si on résume ce qui précède — non-connaissance de l'origine paternelle, vénération des ancêtres féminins au temps de *Shang* et *Tcheou*, l'orthographie du mot «*xing*» (*tinh, ho*), la pratique du culte des femmes et le système héréditaire y adapté — tout cela nous permet, semble-t-il, de tirer la conclusion relative à l'existence de la famille matrilinéaire chez les Vietnamiens des époques primitives. Sous l'influence de changements sociaux et économiques abrupts au commencement de l'époque de *Tcheou*, cette forme de famille se développa rapidement au sens d'une structure contraire, qui dut définitivement consolidée par le confucianisme; celui-ci avait ainsi posé des fondements solides aussi pour la famille vietnamienne patriarcale.

Une autre question en suspens est, si la famille constitue le fondement primitif de la société de l'Asie orientale généralement et dans la société vietnamienne, partiellement. La famille et le clan sont deux termes fondamentaux et selon les

136

théories patriarcales bien connues, les familles primitives s'agrandissaient avec le temps et devenaient des tribus, puis des clans. Le problème de primauté de la tribu ou du clan à part (voir L. H. Morgan, *Ancient Society*, New York 1877, p. 227), j'incline vers l'opinion de Durkheim c'est-à-dire qu'au Vietnam, de même que dans beaucoup d'autres pays, c'est le clan et non la famille qui constitue l'élément ultime des sociétés politiques.[12] En toute probabilité, la famille vietnamienne elle aussi provient du clan original, mais possèdes ses traits différents. On sait que le clan se distingue par deux traits fonciers. Le premier est que les individus qui font parti du clan, se considèrent comme une unité liée par des liens parentaux mais d'une nature très spéciale. Cette parenté n'indique pas qui d'entre eux sont apparentés par le sang ; ils sont parents du seul fait qu'ils portent le même nom. Le second trait foncier du clan est la loi d'exogamie. «L'exogamie a rendu le clan solidaire. Cette solidarité a ainsi déterminé qu'elle est réciproque : on ne connaît pas de clan qui répondrait à la définition ci-dessus et ne serait pas exogène. C'est, comme dit aussi Frazer, une loi commune et universellement appliquée, que les membres d'un clan ne peuvent pas conclure un contrat de mariage entre eux, mais sont obligés de chercher leur partenaire en dehors du clan.»[13]

Quant à l'authenticité d'une origine commune de ceux qui portent le même nom générique, celle-ci est restée très vivante jusqu'à nos jours. Cependant le nombre de ces noms a été réduit et limité et on estime généralement qu'il ne dépas pas la centaine. Mais H. Mespero remarque que le nombre traditionnel de «cent familles» (*po sing*) est certainement sousestimé.[14] On dit aussi que les Vietnamiens, de même que les Chinois aiment à se désigner par le nom «gens des cents familles» (*ba tinh* ou *bach tanh*). Par conséquent, il existe au Vietnam de grands nombres de personnes portant le même nom générique (*ho*) et dans la plupart des cas (surtout au Vietnam) il n'y a plus entre eux aucun lien de parenté par le sang. Certes, quand deux inconnus se rencontrent ayant le même nom générique, ils ressentent automatiquement une sorte d'affinité familiale. M. Granet écrit sur une coutume semblable en Chine : «Quand deux Chinois se rencontrent, ils vérifient s'ils ont le même nom générique ou non, et puis se comportent envers soi à l'avenant.»[15]

La durée de parenté selon le nom et le nombre de générations a été toujours fixée dans les codes de lois vietnamiens. On trouve la première application pratique de cette règle dans le processus de l'adoption. Presque chaque Vietnamien sans déscendants mâles et désireux d'adopter quelqu'héritier qui puisse préserver le culte des ancêtres, choisit d'ordinaire un enfant portant le même «*ho*» (*tinh*) que lui.

[12] Durkheim, E.: *Cours inédit . . .*, Notes Halbwachs, p. 4, cité selon Tran Van Trai, *La famille patriarcale annamite.* Paris, Université de Paris 1942, p. 48.

[13] Durkheim, E.: *La prohibition de l'inceste et ses origines.* L'Année sociologique, 1897, p. 9.

[14] Maspero, H.: *La Chine antique.* Paris 1927, p. 121.

[15] Granet, M.: *Catégories matrimoniales et relations de proximité dans la Chine ancienne.* Paris, Université de Paris 1939, p. 84.

L'authenticité d'une origine commune ressortit encore plus évidemment à partir de l'interdiction formelle de conclure un mariage entre personnes portant le même nom générique. Il semble que les restants de la loi sur l'exogamie constituent le second aspect caractéristique du clan. Cette interdiction dans la société vietnamienne date de plus de quarante sept siècles. Aux temps modernes, en dépit de son abrogation dans les législatures récentes (une restriction était introduite déjà dans le *Code de Gia Long*), beaucoup de Vietnamiens (surtout à la campagne) y tiennent encore. De ce restant de la loi sur l'exogamie, officiellement en vigueur dans une période relativement peu reculée, on peut conclure que les deux traits fonciers de clan étaient propres aussi au clan vietnamien.

Cette identité réfute la thèse de certains auteurs qui considèrent le group domestique (la famille) comme le noyau de la société originelle vietnamienne. Affirmer que le «ho» primitif était une famille, risque de se heurter à des faits difficiles à expliquer, par exemple, la grande étendue de certaines d'entre elles, qui même au Vietnam peuvent compter plusieurs millions de personnes. Quelque soit la longévité des membres d'une telle famille, celle-ci ne saurait jamais atteindre de si hautes chiffres. Pour s'en borner à un example concret, qu'il suffise de remarquer qu'il existe plusieurs mille Vietnamiens portant le nom générique Nguyen. Ce nom générique est le plus nombreux au Vietnam. Philastre aussi relève ce fait dans le *Code annamite*: «Nous ne voulons pas exagérer en disant que 9/10 des familles en Cochinchine portent le nom paternel Nguyen, le reste est partagé parmi 25 ou 30 noms communs et quelques autres très rares.»[16] En fait, Philastre tout de même exagère quelque peu, car selon une enquête faite au Vietnam du nord (Bac-bo) par P. Gourou dans la province Bac Ninh, une douzaine de noms génériques échoient à 85 % des familles, le seul nom Nguyen figurant chez 54 % d'elles.[17] La thèse selon laquelle divers «ho» était originellement des familles étant repoussée, il reste la question de leur numéricité très inégale comme clans. On en pourrait soupçonner la cause dans les guerres tribales et conflits militaires de caractère divers, dans lesquels des groupes plus faibles étaient exterminés ou absorbés.[18] Les membres des groupements vaincus étaient souvent obligés d'assumer aussi le nom du clan vainqueur. «C'est un fait historique que les vaincus, adoptent, de gré ou de force, la nationalité de leurs vainqueurs, et même leurs langue, coutumes, leur système politique, financier et économique.»[19] Une telle absorption d'un clan par un autre, caractéristique pour l'ancien Vietnam, se réalisait en général aux moyens coercitifs ou sous la menace de représailles.

Alors, il s'en suit du précédent que l'identité du nom générique chez les

---

[16] *Code annamite*. Tome I, p. 515.

[17] Gourou, P.: *Les paysans du delta tonkinois*. Paris, Université de Paris 1936, p. 481.

[18] Voir Halbwachs, M.: *Morphologie sociale*. Paris, Collection Armand Colin 1938.

[19] Tran Van Trai: *La famille patriarcale annamite*. Paris, Université de Paris 1942, p. 51.

Vietnamiens ne prouve pas encore, à lui seul, leur parenté par sang, mais seulement fait ressortir une parenté d'une caractère tout à fait spécifique. Au cours de son développement, le clan originel primitif se restreignait graduellement, alors que simultanément les rapports entre les membres qui le formaient, s'affermissaient. La parenté, originellement très étendue, commença à se concentrer dans certaines habitations où elle acquit une plus grande importance. Le progrès économique nécessitait une réduction l'étendue nonproductive de la parenté, afin que le sol puisse être mieux utilisé, car sa superficie allait diminuant de plus en plus. Il y avait de moins de grands agrégats familiaux, leur existence devenait de plus en plus impossible. La force solidaire qui avait toujours présupposé unité de pensée, ne trouvait plus des bases assez solides pour rapprocher les éléments de la vie intérieure du clan. Tout au contraire, le développement dans le processus de penser mena constamment vers des antagonismes plus prononcés, la discipline familiale perdait de sa rigueur et en plus, les individus acquéraient une valeur subjective, ce qui affaiblissait l'entretien de relations parentales lointaines. Le clan primitif s'est ainsi disloqué en de nombreuses familles indépendantes. Ce n'est pas à dire que le sentiment d'appartenance familiale ait complètement disparu des relations dans la société vietnamienne; nous ne voulons par là que souligner le fait que la famille patriarcale vietnamienne tire son origine du clan, et non pas inversement.

TÜRKISCHE BRIEFE UND URKUNDEN ZUR GESCHICHTE DES EYĀLET NOVÉ ZÁMKY. I

JOZEF BLAŠKOVIČ—VOJTECH KOPČAN, Prague—Bratislava

Nach euner kurzen, der Geschichte des *Eyālet* Nové Zámky (1663—1685) gewidmeten Einleitung befassen sich die Autoren mit Urkunden, die von Statthaltern und anderen Würdenträgern aus Nové Zámky zu verschiedentlichen Problemen ausgestellt wurden. Sie bringen grundlegende Informationen über die islamische Institution des *amān* (Schutz, Schutzbrief) für die Bewohner des Landes des Krieges, also der Nichtmuslime auf dem Gebiet des Islam (*dār ül-islām*), und veröffentlichen drei von Würdenträgern aus Nové Zámky ausgestellte Urkunden „*amān kāġıdı*".

Die Festung Nové Zámky war zweiundzwanzig Jahre (1663—1685) lang ein Zentrum der am weitesten vorgeschobenen osmanischen Provinz in Mitteleuropa. Das ausgedehnte Gebiet, das nach den erfolgreichen Feldzügen im Herbst 1663 von der osmanischen Armee kontrolliert wurde, schrumpfte während der Offensive der kaiserlichen Heere im Frühjahr und Sommer 1664 ein.[1] Damals ist es den kaiserlichen Heeren gelungen Nitra, Levice und einige kleinere Festungen, die im September und Oktober 1663 in die Hände der Osmanen gefallen waren, zurückzuerobern. Auf Grund des Friedensvertrags von Vasvár, der nach der Niederlage der osmanischen Armee bei St. Gotthard am 10. August 1664 abgeschlossen wurde, blieb jedoch Nové Zámky unter osmanischer Herrschaft. Der Krieg um Kreta zwischen dem Osmanischen Reich und Venedig (1666—1669) bedeutete eine weitere Begrenzung der osmanischen Macht auf diesem Gebiet. Die Herabsetzung der Zahl der osmanischen Garnisonen im Grenzgebiet, sowie in der Festung Nové Zámky ermöglichte es damals der kaiserlichen Seite eine Verteidigungslinie entlang des Flusses Váh, einschließlich der neuen Festung Leopoldov (Leopoldstadt) zu erbauen, und so dem Vordringen osmanischer Abteile in die Westslowakei und der Besteuerung der Gebiete jenseits des Flusses einen Riegel vorzuschieben. Die

---

[1] Mit der Geschichte von Nové Zámky als des Zentrums einer osmanischen Provinz befaßt sich die ältere Arbeit von Matunák, M.: *Nové Zámky pod tureckým panstvom (1663—1685)* (Nové Zámky unter der türkischen Herrschaft (1663—1685)). Slovenské pohľady, *18*, 1898, S. 129—132, 231—236, 486—496, 554—561, 569—578, 668—676. Die Reedition im Buch Matunák, M.: *Život a boje na slovensko-tureckom pohraničí* (Das Leben und die Kämpfe im slowakisch-türkischen Grenzgebiet). Bratislava, Tatran 1983, S. 215—299. Kopčan, V.: *Die osmanische Provinz Nové Zámky (Eyālet-i Uyvār).* In: Asian and African Studies, *21*, 1985, S. 147—164.

osmanische Seite versuchte es diese Entwicklung rückgängig zu machen, was ständige Spannungen in diesem Gebiet zur Folge hatte.

Die mehr als zwei Jahrzehnte des Bestehens dieser Grenzprovinz sind durch ständige Plänkeleien aber auch größere Konflikte ihrer Abteile mit den kaiserlichen Garnisonen, oder mit Soldaten des ungarischen Adels gekennzeichnet. Trotz der Tatsache, daß der Friedensvertrag von Vasvár in seinem neunten Artikel diese Formen der Feindseligkeiten untersagte, hielten die militärischen Auseinandersetzungen mit stillschweigender Gutheißung der höchsten Stellen von beiden Seiten an.

Ein ernstes Problem für die osmanische Verwaltung in Nové Zámky war die Steuereinnahme, die die meisten bewaffneten Auseinandersetzungen nach sich zog.[2] In der zweiten Hälfte der sechziger Jahre des 17. Jahrhunderts lehnten es die meisten, vom Zentrum der osmanischen Verwaltung — Nové Zámky — entlegenen Dörfer, unter dem Schutz der kaiserlichen Garnisonen oder der eigenen Landsherren ab, jene Steuern zu entrichten, deren Zahlung sie zur Zeit der Tatarenplünderungen und der Unsicherheit der Jahre 1663—1664 zugesagt hatten. Vor allem jene, den großen Feudalbesitztümern (Hlohovec, Topoľčany, Bánovce) gehörende Dörfer deren Eigentümer über eine größere militärische Macht verfügten, konnten sich erwehren. Oft wandten sich die Statthalter von Nové Zámky, oder auch niedrigere Würdenträger und auch die *Sipahis* mit Aufrufen voller Drohungen an die Vorsteher der Städte und Dörfer, die einst zugesagten Steuern — meist handelte es sich um eine vereinbarte Geldsumme und Naturalien, bzw. handwerkliche Produkte — herbeizuschaffen. Bezahlten die Dörfer oder Städtchen trotz wiederholter Appelle ihre Steuern nicht, griff die osmanische Macht zur Gewalt. Ein starker osmanischer Abteil — oft mit dem Statthalter an der Spitze — brannte das Dorf oder das Städtchen nieder, verschleppte die Einwohner in die Gefangenschaft und führte Nahrungsmittel und das Vieh davon.[3] Manchmal nahmen sie einen Menschen gefangen, den dann das Dorf aus der Gefangenschaft loskaufen mußte,

---

[2] Ein eingehendes Verzeichnis des *Eyâlet (Defter-i mufassal-i eyalet-i Uyvar*, weiter DM. Istanbul, Başvekalet Arşivi, TD No. 698 aus dem Jahre 1664) umfaßt an die 750 Städte, Dörfer und Gehöfte in der West- und Mittelslowakei. Viele dieser Lokalitäten stellten jedoch nach 1664 und später ihre Steuerzahlungen ein, wie wir es den Briefen osmanischer Würdenträger an die Städte und Dörfer direkt entnehmen können. Teile dieses Verzeichnisses veröffentlichte Blašković, J.: *Ziemie lenne (ḫâṣṣ) namiestnika Nowych Zamków v latach 1664—1685*. Rocznik Orientalistyczny, *38*, 1976, S. 83—91: *Ein türkisches Steuerverzeichnis aus dem Bezirk Žabokreky aus dem Jahre 1664*. Archiv orientální, *46*, 1977, Nr. 3, S. 201—210; *Turecký súpis Nitrianskej župy z roku 1664* (Türkisches Verzeichnis des Komitats Nitra aus dem Jahre 1664). Agrikultúra, *10*, 1971, S. 29—37.

[3] Im Jahre 1669 z. B. plünderte eine starke türkische Einheit dicht besiedelte Dörfer in der Umgebung von Topoľčany (Chynorany, Žabokreky nad Nitrou, Veľké Bielice und andere) als Vergeltung dafür, daß sie ihre Steuern nicht entrichteten. Später wurde die Stadt Šaľa in Brand gesetzt, im Jahre 1671 plünderten sie in Dörfern zwischen Nitra und Hlohovec, 1675 in der Umgebung von Hlohovec, 1682 in der Umgebung von Topoľčany und Levice, 1683 die Gemeinde Oslany. Siehe Matunák, M.: *Nové Zámky pod tureckým panstvom*.

oder sie zwangen einen wohlhabenderen Mann die Schuldsumme für das Dorf zu bezahlen und diese mußte er dann selbst vom Dorf einholen. Abteilte der geschädigten ungarischen Feudalherren oder kaiserliche Garnisonen erwiderten diese Eingriffe mit Gegenaktionen bis in die Nähe von Nové Zámky. Schließlich wuchs zu Beginn der achtziger Jahre des 17. Jahrhunderts diese untragbare Situation an der Grenze zu einer der Ursachen der Verschlechterung der Beziehungen zwischen dem Osmanischen Reich und Kaiser Leopold I. heran, und führte im Jahre 1683 zum Feldzug Kara Mustafa Paschas gegen Wien.[4]

Briefe und Urkunden der dortigen Würdenträger stellen bedeutende Quellen zur Erforschung der Verhältnisse in der osmanischen Provinz Nové Zámky dar. Die von den osmanischen Ämtern in türkischer Sprache herausgegebenen Schriftstücke berühren vorwiegend Fragen der inneren Verwaltung, während der Briefwechsel mit den Befehlshabern der Grenzfestungen und mit den unterworfenen Dörfern fast ausschließlich auf ungarisch, teilweise auch lateinisch, deutsch und slowakisch geführt wurde.[5] Diese Praxis hat sich im Osmanischen Reich schon seit längerem eingebürgert, da die Kanzlei des Sultans schon im 15. Jahrhundert Urkunden und Briefe auf griechisch, lateinisch, italienisch, serbokroatisch und deutsch ausstellte.[6] Nach der Besetzung Ungarns weitete sich dieser Register der Sprachen um das Ungarische und Slowakische, bzw. das slowakisierte Tschechisch aus.

Von den bislang bekannten Dokumenten, die von Würdenträgern aus Nové Zámky ausgestellt wurden, betrifft ein großer Teil die Steuerfragen. Hierzu gehören auch Drohbriefe, die die Bezahlung von Steuern fordern.[7] Unter diesen finden wir auch Beschwerden über Friedensbruch[8] oder solche, die die Kriegsgefangenen betreffen.[9] Aus diesen erhaltenen Dokumenten möchten wir formal und thematisch sich nahestehende türkische Urkunden und Briefe veröffentlichen.

---

[4] Kreutel, R. F.—Teply, K.: *Kara Mustafa vor Wien 1683 aus der Sicht türkischer Quellen.* Graz—Wien—Köln, Verlag Styria 1982, S. 30, 61.

[5] Kopčan, V.: *Turecké listy a listiny k slovenským dejinám* (Türkische Briefe und Urkunden zur slowakischen Geschichte). Historické štúdie, *12*, 1967, S. 105—122.

[6] Kraelitz, F.: *Osmanische Urkunden in der türkischen Sprache aus der zweiten Hälfte des 15. Jahrhunderts (Ein Beitrag zur osmanischen Diplomatik).* Wien 1922, S. 10—11. Akademie der Wissenschaften in Wien — Sitzungsberichte 197. Band 3.

[7] M. Matunák veröffentlichte in seiner Arbeit viele Briefe. Weitere finden wir im Buch *Rabovali Turci. . ,* Hrsg. von P. Horváth. Bratislava, Tatran 1972, S. 200 ff. Türkische Urkunden — Schutzbriefe und Empfangsbescheinigungen über Entrichtung von Steuern — veröffentlichte Rypka, J.: *Čtyři turecké listiny z Dolného Kamence na Slovensku* (Vier türkische Urkunden aus Dolný Kamenec in der Slowakei). Prúdy, *11*, 1927, Nr. 6, S. 355—365, Nr. 8, S. 471—482. Weitere nicht veröffentlichte Urkunden dieser Art befinden sich in slowakischen und ungarischen Archiven. Siehe Bayerle, G.: *Ottoman Records in the Hungarian Archives.* Archivum Ottomanicum, 4, 1972, S. 5—22.

[8] Budapest, MOL, P 125, Fasc. 665, Nr. 4154—4156 Beschwerdebriefe des Statthalters von Nové Zámky Küçük Mehmed Pascha an den Palatin P. Eszterházy aus den Jahren 1671—1679.

[9] *Rabovali Turci. . .,* S. 194—199. Ethey, Gy.: *Vágvölgyi krónika.* Komárno—Komárom 1935, S. 181. Sasinek, Fr. V.: *Slovenský letopis,* 6, 1882, S. 263.

Als eine besondere Gruppe haben wir einige Schutzbriefe (*amān kâġıdı*) ausgegliedert, die von Würdenträgern aus Nové Zámky für jene Einwohner ausgestellt wurden, die auf das Gebiet der osmanischen Provinz aus den nichtbesetzten Teilen der heutigen Slowakei übersiedelt sind.

Amān (arab. Sicherheit, Schutz, Schutzbrief) ist eine Einrichtung vorislamischer arabischer Herkunft, die dem Fremden außerhalb seiner eigenen Gemeinschaft den Schutz des Lebens und des Eigentums durch einen Angehörigen der fremden Gruppe, und somit den Schutz durch diese ganze Gruppe zusicherte. Im islamischen Religionsrecht ist das *amān* ein salvus conductus oder eine Bürgschaft der Sicherheit oder des Schutzes. Diesem Recht zufolge wird den Nichtmuslimen, die im *dār al-ḥarb* (tür. *dar ül-harb*), im „Land des Krieges", oder in der nicht von den Muslimen beherrschten Welt leben, im Gebiet des Islam (*dār ül-islām*) ein gesetzlich gesicherter Schutz des Lebens und des Eigentums für eine gewisse Zeit gewährt.[10] Den islamischen Rechtsgelehrten zufolge konnte ein jeder erwachsene Muslim, ob Mann oder Frau, ein gültiges *amān* einer oder mehreren Personen gewähren. Das Oberhaupt einer muslimischen Gemeinde konnte größeren Einheiten ein kollektives *amān* gewähren, z. B. einer ganzen Stadt, einem Gebiet oder sämtlichen fremden Kaufleuten. Das *amān* konnte mündlich in jeder beliebigen Sprache oder durch ein verständliches Zeichen erteilt werden. Später wurde diese Praxis in Schrift umgesetzt. Jene Person, der ein *amān* für eine bestimmte Zeit im Land des Islam gewährt wurde, wurde als *musta'min* bezeichnet. Blieb er jedoch ständig auf dem Gebiet des muslimischen Staates und unterwarf er sich dem islamischen Recht, hatte er den Status *ahl al-dhimma* (Volk des Vertrages) oder einfach *dhimmīs* (tür. *zimmī*). Dieser Terminus wurde im allgemeinen zur Bezeichnung von Christen und Juden benützt, die auf dem Gebiet eines islamischen Staates im Sinne der „geschützten Untertanen", der Steuerpflichtigen lebten, oder zur Bezeichnung von Leuten, die auf dieses Gebiet zum ständigen Aufenthalt übersiedelten. Auch unsere Dokumente gehen aus dieser Tradition hervor und halten die Garantie der Repräsentanten des *Eyālet* Nové Zámky schriftlich fest für jene Untertanen, die auf das Gebiet der Osmanen kamen und sich ihnen unterwarfen, derzufolge ihnen von türkischer Seite kein Unrecht zugefügt wird.

Die herausgegebenen Urkunden stammen aus der Sammlung des Magyar Országos Levéltár (Ungarisches Landesarchiv) in Budapest.[11] Soweit wir informiert sind, wurden Urkunden dieser Art aus Ungarn weder veröffentlicht, noch diplomatisch analysiert. Aus den Arbeiten über die osmanisch-türkische Diplomatik nennt diese

---

[10] Siehe das Stichwort J. Schachts *Amān* in *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*. New Edition. Vol. 1. A—B. Leiden—London, E. J. Brill 1960, S. 429—430. Lewis, B.: *The Muslim Discovery of Europe*. New York—London, W. W. Norton 1982, S. 62—64.

[11] MOL, R 315, Nr. 107, 113, 118. Hiermit danke ich dem Mitarbeiter des MOL Dr. E. Vass für das Besorgen der Xerokopien der Urkunden.

Art osmanischer Dokumente nur L. Fekete,[12] während die späteren Autoren J. Reychmann — A. Zajączkowski,[13] M. Guboglu,[14] und B. Nedkov[15] sie nicht erwähnen. Fekete reihte diese Dokumente der Gruppe „Die Schriftstücke der niedrigen Provinzbehörden", also des *Sancakbeys* und den ihnen untergeordneten Beamten zu (*Kadı, Alaybey, Kaimmakan, Kethüda, Emin, Nazır, Ağa, Sipah*).[16] Bei der deutschen Bezeichnung des „*amān kağıdı*" als „Ansiedlungserlaubnis" ging L. Fekete aus dem sachlichen Inhalt jener Art von Urkunden hervor, denen er in seiner Tätigkeit als Archivar zweifelsohne begegnete. Es ist vorauszusetzen, daß er als Mitarbeiter des Ungarischen Landesarchivs auch die von uns herausgegebenen Urkunden kannte. Es besteht jedoch kein Zweifel darüber, daß die *amān kağıdı* oder *amānnāme* [17] mit der islamischen Institution des *amān* im Zusammenhang stehen, obwohl sie Fekete „Ansiedlungserlaubnis" nennt.

Da es sich um Dokumente handelte, die sowohl den Untertanen, denen man gestattete sich auf dem Gebiet des Osmanischen Reiches, oder genauer gesagt auf dem Gebiet des *Eyālet* Nové Zámky niederzulassen, als auch den osmanischen Einheiten bestimmt waren, damit sie jene nicht belästigten und ihnen keinerlei Unrecht antaten, wurden diese in ungarischer Sprache mit einem kurzen türkischen Inhalt ausgestellt. Diese Praxis war in den Kanzleien der osmanischen provinziellen Würdenträger weder neu, noch ungewöhnlich. Es war dies natürlich keine einheitliche Praxis, da wir auch solche *amān kağıdı* kennen, die nur im Ungarischen oder im Türkischen ausgestellt wurden.

Die Dokumente werden mit der Intitulatio des Ausstellers eingeleitet. Diese Intitulatio der osmanischen Statthalter in Ungarn wurde von einheimischen Vorbildern beeinflußt.[18] Die Intitulatio des Statthalters von Nové Zámky lautete am häufigsten so:

Mi az hatalmas és gyöszhetetlen Török Csaszarnak az Dunan inend levő hadainak

---

[12] *Einführung in die osmanisch-türkische Diplomatik der türkischen Botmäßigkeit in Ungarn.* Budapest 1926, S. LV—LVI als ‚*dīn-u-emān kjāğıdı*' Ansiedlungserlaubnis und ‚*vere kjāğıdı*' Geleitschein, Passierschein.

[13] *Zarys dyplomatyki osmańsko-tureckiej.* Warszawa 1955. Die englische Übersetzung mit Berichtigungen und Ergänzungen *Handbook of Ottoman-Turkish Diplomatics.* Ed. by T. Halasi-Kuhn. The Hague—Paris, Mouton 1968.

[14] *Paleografia şi diplomatica Turco-Osmană.* Bucharest 1958.

[15] *Osmanoturska diplomatika i paleografija.* I—II. Sofia 1966—1972.

[16] Fekete, L.: op. cit., S. LV.

[17] Pakalın, M. Z.: *Osmanlı Tarih Deyimleri ve Terimleri Sözlüğü.* I. İstanbul 1971, S. 55.

[18] Siehe die Veröffentlichungen von Briefen der Statthalter von Ofen *A budai basák magyar nyelvű levelezése.* I. Hrsg. von S. Takáts—F. Eckhart—Gy. Szekfü. Budapest 1915; Bayerle, G.: *Ottoman Diplomacy in Hungary. Letters from the Pashas of Buda 1590—1593.* Bloomington, Indiana University 1972, sowie weitere Ausgaben ungarischer Briefe türkischer Würdenträger.

szerdarja, Ersék Uyvar varassanak helitartója és parancsolója, vas vezér Szeidi Mehemet pasa.[19]

Eine Variante dieser Intitulatio ist:

> Mi Küczük Mehemet Passa, az Hatalmas és Gyöszhetetlen Thörök Czászarnak, innend levő hadainak göndviselője, Ersek Uy Var veg varanak helitartoya.[20]

Eine neue Variante der Intitulatio bringt die von uns veröffentlichte Urkunde Nr. III:

> En az Tekintetes és Nagyságos Hatalmás Mehmed Pasa az Hatalmas gyözhetetlen Uralkodó Török Csaszarunk Egyik hadi tanácsa Ersek Uj Varanak egyik Helytartoja és Göndviseló ura:

Elemente der zweiten und dritten Intitulatio kombiniert die folgende:

> Mi Czerem Mehemed pasa az hatalmas giözhetetlen fenlö Thörök Csaszarnak titkos tanácza, a Dunan inét levő hadainak fö parancsoloia, Ersek Uyvari Vegi hazainak hely tarto gond viselöie Isten e(ngedemibül).[21]

Der Intitulatio folgte in der Regel das *pençe* (Handfest). Im Unterschied zu jenen Dokumenten, die von den osmanischen Statthaltern in türkischer Sprache ausgestellt wurden, wo sich das *pençe* am Rande rechts liegend zum Text befunden hat, oder aber am linken unteren Teil der Urkunde unter dem Text (je nach dem Charakter des Dokumentes) stand, steht dieses im *amān kāğıdı* links oberhalb des Textes. Wie dies bereits F. Kraelitz[22] bewiesen hat, beinhalten die *pençe* das stereotype Element *ahkār el-ᶜibād*, d. h. „der geringste der Diener" und den Namen des Ausstellers mit dessen Amtsbezeichnung (Pascha, *Kaimmakam, Kethüda*). Im Fall von Mehmed Ağa, des Ausstellers des Dokumentes Nr. II, ist angeführt „der derzeitige *Kaimmakam* von Nové Zámky". Das vom Statthalter ausgestellte Dokument (Nr. III) hat ein *pençe* mit drei Lamelifs, während die übrigen zwei Dokumente lediglich je zwei haben. Dies muß jedoch keine Regel sein, wie es sich bei der Analyse einer größeren Anzahl von Dokumenten, welche von niedrigeren Würdenträgern ausgestellt wurden, herausgestellt hat.[23]

Über dem Schweif des *pençe (kuyruk)* befindet sich der Stempel des Statthalters

---

[19] Seydi Mehmed Paschas Brief an den Bürgermeister von Kamenec, und die Bürgermeister der Städtchen im Komitat Tekov vom 27. Mai 1671. Matunák, M.: *Z dejín slobodného a hlavného banského mesta Kremnice* (Aus der Geschichte der Frei- und Hauptbergstadt Kremnica). Kremnica 1928, S. 495. Siehe auch die Intitulatio in der Urkunde Nr. I.

[20] Budapest, MOL, P 125, Fasc. 665, Nr. 4145 Der Brief des Statthalters von Nové Zámky Küçük Mehmed Pascha an den Palatin Paul Eszterházy vom 5. Februar 1671.

[21] Budapest, MOL R 315, Nr. 104 Der Brief des Statthalters von Nové Zámky Mehmed Pascha an die Bürgermeister von Žabokreky und der umliegenden Gemeinden, die kaiserliche Steuer zu entrichten, 28. November 1673.

[22] Kraelitz, F. von: *Studien zur osmanischen Urkundenlehre. I. Die Handfeste (Pençe) der osmanischen Wesire.* In: Mitteilungen zur osmanischen Geschichte, II, 1925, Nr. 3—4, S. 257—268.

[23] Blaškovič, J.: *Rimavská Sobota v čase osmansko-tureckého panstva* (Rimavská Sobota zur Zeit der osmanisch-türkischen Herrschaft). Bratislava, Obzor 1974, S. 87.

oder dessen Vertreters, und *Sahh* (eine Abkürzung des Wortes *sahih* mit Bedeutung „richtig"). Das *pençe* zusammen mit dem Stempel und — wie dies aus der unterschiedlichen Datierung des ungarischen und des türkischen Wortlautes in den Urkunden Nr. II und III hervorgeht — auch der osmanische Text wurden hinzugefügt und abgestempelt erst nach der Fertigstellung der ungarischen Reinschrift.[24]

Die Stempel zusammen mit dem *pençe* haben eine Funktion eines Ausweises und bestätigten die Identität des Ausstellers der Urkunde. Wie dies in der Urkunde Nr. II steht: „Zwecks größerer Sicherheit und Glaubwürdigkeit habe ich ihnen diesen Schutzbrief ausgestellt, der durch mein herrschaftliches Wappen (*pençe*) und meinen Stempel bestätigt wurde." Die Stempel auf unseren Dokumenten sind rund und verhältnismäßig groß: im Durchschnitt 32—33 mm (Nr. I und III) und 44 mm (Nr. II). Der Wortlaut der Inschrift auf dem Stempel ist stilisiert, die Wörter und Buchstaben sind so geordnet, um einen künstlerischen Eindruck zu wecken. Die Inschriften auf unseren Stempeln bringen den Namen ihres Besitzers, dessen Funktion (Nr. I) und irgendeinen Wunsch oder ein Gebet (Nr. II, III) in arabischer oder persischer Sprache.[25]

Der türkische Text enthält lediglich die Narratio und das Datum. Er gibt kurz Auskunft darüber, woher vom königlichen Gebiet die *zimmīs* auf das osmanische Gebiet kamen und in welchem Dorf oder Städtchen sie sich niedergelassen hatten. Dann folgt die Beschreibung der Personen (die Statur, charakteristische Gesichtszüge, Alter) mit einer Erklärung, daß ihnen (auf Grund ihres eigenen Ansuchens) das *amān kāğıdı* ausgestellt wurde. Abschließend äußert der Aussteller den Wunsch, es möge sie niemand belästigen oder ihnen Unrecht zufügen. Das Datum führt den Tag, den Monat und das Jahr der Hedschra an.

Der ungarische Text, bei weitem umfangreicher als der osmanische, informiert eingehend über die Gründe der Ausstellung der Urkunde. Alle drei Urkunden wurden auf Grund des Ansuchens ihrer Besitzer ausgestellt, bzw. auf das Ansuchen der Vertreter der Gemeinde, in die sie zogen, auch wenn dies in der letzten nicht ausdrücklich angeführt wurde. Nach der Erklärung, sich als rechtschaffene Untertanen (*zimmī*) des Sultans zu verhalten, versprechen die Vertreter der osmanischen

---

[24] Siehe die Unterschiede in der Datierung der Urkunde Nr. II — am 10. Februar wurde der ungarische und am 12. Februar der türkische Text geschrieben, Nr. III — am 18. Mai der ungarische und am 19. Mai der türkische Text.

[25] Die Rundschrift des Stempels der Urkunde Nr. III befindet sich z. B. auf dem Stempel des Statthalters von Kanizsa Ahmed Pascha aus dem Jahre 1618 (Fekete, L.: *Türkische Schriften aus dem Archiv des Palatins Nikolaus Eszterházy.* Budapest 1932, Nr. 7); auf dem des Statthalters von Ofen Murteza Pascha aus dem Jahre 1626, ebenda, Nr. 10—12; auf dem Brief des Kaimmakam Receb Pascha aus dem Jahre 1630, ebenda, Nr. 17; auf dem Brief von Murteza Pascha aus dem Jahre 1634, ebenda, Nr. 31; auf der Bescheinigung Sinan Paschas aus dem Jahre 1604 (Blaškovič, J.: *Rimavská Sobota...,* Nr. 5, S. 116). Leider gehört die Sphragistik nicht zu den entwickelten Geschichtshilfswissenschaften in der Osmanistik.

Macht „auf ihren türkischen Glauben und auf ihre Ehre", daß sie osmanischerseits, vor allem die verschiedenen Abteile der osmanischen Armee, niemand belästigen oder ihnen Unrecht zufügen würde. Die mit dem *pençe* (im Text: mit unserem Wappen) und dem Stempel versehenen Schutzbriefe wurden „zwecks größerer Sicherheit" ausgestellt, was davon zeugt, daß die Untertanen ohne ein solches Dokument verschiedentlichen Mißhandlungen ausgesetzt oder in die Gefangenschaft verschleppt werden konnten. Interessant ist die in der Urkunde Nr. III angeführte Bedingung: „es wird ihnen niemand Unrecht antun, wenn sie keine Waffe mit sich führen und auf dem uns unterworfenen Gebiet wohnhaft sein werden", welche sich auf das noch 1669 vom Statthalter Mehmed Pascha herausgegebene Verbot bezieht, während die zweite Bedingung das freie Abwandern auf königliches Gebiet verhindern sollte.

Die Herausgabe der Schutzbriefe der Statthalter von Nové Zámky soll zur Ausweitung der Quellenbasis zur Geschichte dieser Grenzprovinz, als auch der osmanischen Diplomatik beitragen, die in der letzten Zeit den Umkreis ihres Interesses bedeutend ausgeweitet hat.

148

I

Der Sekretär des Statthalters von Nové Zámky Mustafa Aǧa stellt diese Schutzurkunde aus und gestattet es dem Untertan Paul Madacz, wohnhaft in Horné Žemberovce, seine Ehefrau Barbora Palotai, eine Adelige aus Krupina, auf das den Osmanen unterworfene Gebiet zu bringen und sichert ihnen ihren Schutz zu.

Nové Zámky, 31. Januar 1677
Orig.: MOL Budapest, R 315, Nr. 107 (20,8 × 31 cm)

Mi az Hatalmas, és Gyozhetetlen Török Csaszarnak az Dunan innend levö minden Hadainak igazgato Szerdaryanak, Ersék Uÿvar ver Varanak Heli Tartoyanak, és paranczoloyanak, Mahmud Passanak, Tihaya bekÿe leven, Muztafa Aga.

Stempel: Bende-i Mustafa
Pençe: Ahkār el-ʿibād Mustafa Kethüda

Jelente Fölsö Semberben lakozó Madacz Pal nevu postaya altal, az mi Hatalmas és Gyözhetetlen Török Czaszarunknak feyet haitot igaz adozo és szolgalo iobbagi levén mivel kedig nÿstelen legín leven holdulotlan helirul ugimint Korpona varasabul, meg hazasodot. az Nemös Palotai Istvan lejanyat Nemös Palotai Borbalat, felesegül maganak eliedcven azon Palotai Borbalatt hodult helire Fölsö Semberre, a vagi Bako Banjara el fogja hozni és holdult helyen fog vele lakni, mint hogi azon Palotai Borbala is Giozhetetlen Török Csaszarnak fejet haitot és eggiüt, Madacz Pallal adozó és szolgalo iobbagyok lesznek és kivanvan tülünk uri hit levelünket, minek okaÿert szabodsagot advan, hogi valamikor ha akarya hozni Karponarul. feleseget, Palotai Borbalat, szabadon ki hozhassa, Fogadom és Török Hitemre, böczületömre, hogi a mi Török reszünkrül senkitül semmi bantassok nem leszen se Palota Borbalanak, se Madacz Palnak, melinek nagyob bizonsagara, adtok ezön uri Czimerös Hit Levelünket pöczetünkel meg erössittetöt//hogi szabadon lakhassanak, akar holis holdott helien Palotai Borbala uraval Madacz Pallal együiüt Török partrul semmi bantassok nem leszen fogadjuk az mi Török Muhomat Hitünkre, és ha az mi rendünkön levö vitezeinktul valami bantassok tortenne Mis tartozunk melledtök fel tamadni és mindön oltalommal lönni. Mint a fele igaz adozo és szolgalo jobbagyok mellet.
Actum Arcze Ersek Uyvar die 31 Janvar Anno Domini 1677

No 1677. I/31.

R 315. Nr. 107

hogi zza̋ada̋en lekhassanak, soha̋ halás haldasz hazza̋em.
ya̋bra̋ Kű bala̋ wra̋wat Madacs pallet ßöűs tote
spre plahoms sza̋umbra, El ha̋ a̋ mo rondwa̋lon
sut wölla̋wb tal wela̋mi da̋n ta̋sse sar ya̋nwe
tás sar wsswrl malla̋sa̋ til aamad m̋. El mon
sza̋n olwatomma̋ lönn̋. mint a̋ sza̋ isza̋t
rolosa̋. El ssolga̋la̋ So sza̋ga̋la̋ malla̋

Albam Astsa̋ (s)sal uy wa̋r 31 dis Janwar
Anno Domini 1 6 7 9

Wir sind Mustafa Aga, Sekretär[1] des Mahmud Pascha, Statthalter und Befehlshaber der Grenzfestung Nové Zámky und der verwaltende Serdar[2] sämtlicher Heere des mächtigen und unbesiegbaren türkischen Kaisers, (welche) sich diesseits der Donau befinden.

Stempel: Sein (Allahs) Diener Mustafa.

Pençe: Der geringste der Diener (Allahs) Mustafa Kethüda.

Der Bewohner von Horné Žemberovce[3] namens Paul Madacz hat uns per Post mitgeteilt, daß er ein uns wirklich huldigender steuerzahlender und dienender Untertan unseres mächtigen und unbesiegbaren türkischen Kaisers ist, und da er bis heute ein unverheirateter Junggeselle war, verehlichte er sich (mit der Maid) aus einem nicht unterworfenen Ort, und das aus der Stadt Krupina.[4] Er heiratete die Tochter des Adeligen Stefan Palotai, die Adelige Barbara Palotai. Jetzt will er diese Barbara Palotai in einen unterworfenen Ort, nach Horné Žemberovce oder nach Pukanec[5] bringen und in diesem unterworfenen Ort wohnen. Da auch Barbara Palotai ihr Haupt vor dem unbesiegbaren türkischen Kaiser neigte, werden beide gemeinsam wohnen und zusammmen mit Paul Madacz zu unseren steuerzahlenden und dienstbaren Untertanen werden. Er forderte von uns die herrschaftliche Schutzurkunde und aus diesem Grunde gewährten wir ihm die Freiheit (d.h. die Genehmigung) seine Ehefrau Barbara Palotai aus Krupina frei herzuholen, wann immer er es möchte. Auf meinen türkischen Glauben und auf meine Ehre sichere ich zu, daß ihnen von unserer türkischen Seite niemand Unrecht zufügen wird, weder Barbara Palotai noch Paul Madacz. Zwecks größerer Sicherheit haben wir ihnen diese herrschaftliche, mit unserem Wappen versehene Schutzurkunde ausgestellt, die wir mit unserem Stempel bestätigten, damit Barbara Palotai mit ihrem Gatten Paul Madacz wo immer auf einem unterworfenen Ort frei gemeinsam leben können. Ich gelobe auf unseren türkischen mohamedanischen Glauben, daß ihnen von unserer türkischen Seite niemand Unrecht antun wird. Sollte es geschehen, daß ihnen die Helden unserer Staatsordnung in irgendeiner Weise Unrecht antun

---

[1] Tihanya bek — *kethüda bey* (*kâhya bey* — volkstümliche Aussprache tihaya) hier im Sinne von Sekretär oder Adjutant des Statthalters, der während dessen Abwesenheit die Geschäfte führte.

[2] *serdar* — Oberbefehlshaber einer militärischen Expedition (*sefer-i hümayun*), hier Oberbefehlshaber der osmanischen Einheiten jenseits der Donau.

[3] Horné Žemberovce (ung. Felső Zsember), Dorf im Komitat Hont, heute Žemberovce, Kreis Levice. DM f. 76a, Dorf Gorne Jenberofçe.

[4] Krupina (ung. Korpona, deutsch Karpfen), königliche Freistadt im Komitat Hont, heute Stadt, Kreis Zvolen.

[5] Pukanec (ung. Bakabánya, deutsch Pukanz), königliche Freistadt im Komitat Hont, heute Kreis Levice.

sollten, verpflichten wir uns sich ihrer anzunehmen und ihnen vollen Schutz als den wirklichen steuerzahlenden und dienstbaren Untertanen zu gewähren.

Aufgezeichnet in der Festung Nové Zámky, am Tage des 31. Januar im Jahre des Herrn 1677

II

Der Kaimmakam Mehmed Ağa, Stellvertreter des Statthalters von Nové Zámky Küçük Hasan Pascha, stellt einen Schutzbrief für Lorenz und Jakob Pataki, sowie für deren zehnjährigen Bruder Johann Ruža aus, die von der Schüttinsel ins Dorf Imeľ gezogen sind und osmanische Untertanen wurden.

Nové Zámky, 1. muharrem 1090 — 12. Februar 1679
Orig.: MOL Budapest, R 315, Nr. 113 (20×31,2 cm)

My̌ Kaimakam Mehemet Aga a Nagysagos Küczök Haszan Pasa helibe mostanj Ersek uy̌ varanak Feö paranczoloja es hely̌ tartoja leven

Stempel: Er-rāci ez-zill es-samad
          celle Hasan yār-i Muhammad
Pençe: Ahkār el-ʿibād kāimmakām-i Uyvār hālā

Der türkische Text: Komoran adasından İme nam karıyesine gelüb tavattun edüb ve raiyetluk kabul eden Pataki / Lörinc esmer alluk ve uzun boylu oğlan ve karındaşı Pataki Yakab uzun boylu / esmer oğlan ve bir dahi karındaşı Ruja Yançi on yaşında oğlancık nam zimmiler tarafımızdan / aman kağıdına taleb olmağın mezburun zimmilere tarafımızdan işbu aman kağıdını verilmiştir / Gerekdirki âhirden rencide-ü-remide olunmıya fi 1 muharrem sene 1090

Der ungarische Text:

Jelentek az Imej birak, hogi a Czallo közbül iünek kj lakni Hozzaiok iobaj / sarga Pataki Lörincz, magos lagin barna szinö, az öcze Pataki iakab magos / legín, és Rusa Janczj tisz esztendös koraban, hogj az urj hatalmas török Csa/szarunknak igazan adozo fizetö iobagiok lesznek, En is fogadom az en igaz / urj török hitmere és urj tiszteseges böczületemre, hogj ezen levelemet / mutato harom iobagj legienek, az mj török rendünktül és kj iaro csatazo / vitezinktül semmi nemö bantasok és rongalasok nem leszen, bekevel / lakhatnak imön mölinek nagiob bizonsagara és el hitelire attam / nekik Ezen Urj Czimeres és Peczetemel megerösitet hitlevelemet / a kj ezen irta török irasunkal is nevek szerint megh iratatanak.
Actum Ersek Uj Vara die 10. febr(uarii) Anno 1679

153

R315 Nr. 113

154

Wir, der Kaimmakam Mehmed Ağa, in Vertretung des gnädigen Küçük Hasan Pascha, des derzeitigen Oberbefehlshabers und Statthalters der Festung Nové Zámky.

Stempel: Der sich in den Schatten (d.h. unter den Schutz) des allmächtigen Gottes zurückgezogene Hasan, Muhammads Gehilfe sei gepriesen.[1]
Pençe: Der geringste der Diener (Allahs), Mehmed, der derzeitige Kaimmakam von Nové Zámky.[2]

Der türkische Text: Von der Komoran-Insel[3] sind in das Dorf namens Ime(ji)[4] die Untertanen mit dem Namen Lorenz Pataki, ein braunhäutiger, von der Sonne gebräunter Jüngling, von hoher Gestalt und dessen Bruder Jakob Pataki, ein hoher (d.h. erwachsener) braunhäutiger Jüngling sowie noch ein sein Bruder Janči Ruža, ein zehnjähriger Knabe, gekommen, haben sich hier angesiedelt und nahmen den Stand der Untertanen an. Da sie von uns eine Schutzurkunde forderten, wurde den erwähnten Untertanen unsererseits dieser Schutzbrief ausgestellt. Es ist notwendig, damit sie auch von der anderen Seite niemand belästigt und ihnen keinerlei Unrecht zufügt.
Am 1. mᵘharrem[5] des Jahre 1090 (12. Februar 1679).

Der ungarische Text: Die Richter aus Imeľ meldeten, daß von der Schüttinsel als Untertanen zu ihnen wohnen kamen Lorenz Pataki, ein erwachsener Jüngling von brauner Hautfarbe, dessen Bruder Jakob Pataki, ein hoher Jüngling und Janči Ruža im Alter von zehn Jahren (mit dem Versprechen) steuerzahlende, wirkliche Untertanen unseres herrschaftlichen, mächtigen türkischen Kaisers zu sein. Auch ich gelobe auf meinen herrschaftlichen wahren türkischen Glauben und auf meine herrschaftliche rechtschaffene Ehre, daß diese drei untertanen Jünglinge, welche sich mit diesem Brief ausweisen (unsere) Untertaten wurden und daß ihnen niemand Unrecht antun und sie niemand von unserer türkischen Staatsordnung, noch von unseren patrouillierenden kämpfenden Helden belästigen wird, und daß diese in Ruhe im Imeľ wohnen können. Zwecks größerer Sicherheit und Glaubwürdigkeit stellte ich ihnen diesen Schutzbrief aus, bestätigt mit meinem herrschaftlichen

---

[1] Ein Wortspiel: Hasan, der Enkel des Propheten Muhammad, ist der Namensvetter des Statthalters von Nové Zámky.

[2] Kaimmakam — Stellvertreter des Statthalters zur Zeit von dessen Abwesenheit, oder zur Zeit zwischen der Abberufung des alten und Antritt des neuen Statthalters.

[3] Die türkische Benennung der Schüttinsel (Komoran oder Komaran adası, ung. Csallóköz, deutsch Schüttinsel).

[4] Ime — heute die Gemeinde Imeľ (ung. Imely), Kreis Komárno. DM f.53a: İmö.

[5] Muharrem — der erste Monat des muslimischen Kalenders.

Wappen und meinem Stempel. Auf diesem von unserer Hand geschriebenen türkischen Brief sind auch ihre Namen geschrieben.
Geschehen in Nové Zámky am 10. Februar[6] des Jahres 1679

III

Der Statthalter von Nové Zámky Mehmed Pascha stellt eine Schutzurkunde für Martin Mesaroš und dessen Familie aus, die aus Sereď nach Šintava, auf das den Osmanen unterworfene Gebiet übersiedelt sind.

Nové Zámky, 1. cemaziyelevvel 1092 — 19. Mai 1682

Orig.: MOL Budapest, R 315, Nr. 118 (19,5 × 30,5 cm, Ränder beschädigt)

En az Tekintetes es Nagyczagos Hatalmas Mehmet Passa az Hatalmas Gyözhetetlen Uralkodo Török Csasarunk Egik Hadi Tanacsa Ersek Uj Varanak Egik Helitartoja s Gondviseló Ura

Stempel: Tevekküllü alalláh fi küllí el-umur abduhu Muhammad (Mitte)
(rundherum): Ey bar Hoda behakk-e hesti
Şiş çiz mara meded feresti
ʿelm-o-ʿamel-o-ferah desti
İman-o-aman-o-ten durusti
Pençe: Ahkär el-ʿibād Mehmed Paşa Sahh

Der türkische Text: Sered kalʿasından orta boylu kır sakallu / kara benizlü Masaroş Martin ve avratı beyaz / Magoç ve oğlu Masaroş D'urka nam zimmiler / Şente varoşına gelüb tavattun etmeğin / işbu aman kağıdı verildi. / Fi gurre-i cemaziyelevvel sɔne 1092.

Der ungarische Text:
Adom tuttar(a) Mindeneknek Valakiknek illik Ezen Uri Hitlevelemnek rendeben Ki valkepen az Mi Török partunkon levö Meltosagos Tistben Heliheztetet Uri szemelieknek Hatalmas Pasanak, Bekeknek, Alai Bekeknek, Lovas es Gialogh Agaknak Erdőt, Mezőt jaro, Csata probalo Vitéz Kalahuszainknak, Hogj Ezen alab magh Nevezet Szemelieket, ugi mint Mésaros Martont, Feleczeget Magocz Assont Fejer hossu kepű az Assoni, Az uranak fele, szakalla eös, Kereghdét kepű feketesegh leven es fiat Gyurkat melliek Hatalmas Csasarunknak fejet haitvan megh hodultak Szeredbül Ssentere jünek Uj Lakojul ismerjek Hatalmas Csasarunknak

---

[6] Der Unterschied zwischen dem Datum unter dem türkischen Text (12.2.) und dem ungarischen Text (10.2.) zeugt davon, daß zuerst der ungarische Text verfaßt wurde, und nachher schrieb der Kaimmakam oder dessen Schreiber den Genehmigungsanhang auf Türkisch dazu.

igaz hodulo fejet haitot jobbaginak lenni, szabadjarasok veletek lehessen minden
haborgatás nekül. Mÿs fogadgiuk az mi igaz tista Török hitünkre ssenkitül semmi
bantasok nem lesen. Csak fegiever nalok ne legien es hodult heljen lakjanak,
melinek nagiob bizonisagara attam nekik ezen Uri hit Levelemet es szokot elö
peczetemelis megh erösiven. Költ Ersék Uj Varban, die 18. Mai Anno 1682.

<div align="right">Idem qui supra

m.p.</div>

Ich, der wohlgeborene und gnädige Mehmet Pascha, einer der militärischen Berater
des mächtigen und unbesiegbaren regierenden türkischen Kaisers, einer seiner
Statthalter und einer der Herren Fürsorger der Festung Nové Zámky.

Stempel: Ich vertraue auf Allah (den Schöpfer) aller Dinge (d. h. der ganzen Welt).
(Mitte)   Dessen Diener Mehmed.
(rundherum): Oh, allmächtiger Gott, ich schwöre auf Dein absolutes Dasein, ich
            bitte, mir mit sechs (nützlichen) Sachen beizustehen: mit Taten,
            Weisheit, Wohlhabenheit, Glauben, Sicherheit und Gesundheit.
Pençe: Der geringste der Diener (Allahs) Mehmed Pascha. Richtig.

Der türkische Text: Die Untertanen Martin Mesaroš, von mittelgroßer Gestalt mit
grauem Bart und schwarzem (von der Sonne gebräuntem) Gesicht und dessen
Ehefrau, von weißer Hautfarbe, Magoč[1] und dessen Sohn Ďurka[2] kamen aus der
Festung Sereď[3] in die Stadt Šintava[4] und siedelten sich dort an. Deshalb wurde ihnen
diese Schutzurkunde ausgestellt.

Am ersten Tage (des Monats) cemaziyelevvel[5] des Jahres 1092.

Der ungarische Text: Ich gebe bekannt den Inhalt dieser meiner herrschaftlichen
Schutzurkunde allen, denen sie bestimmt ist, vor allem den herrschaftlichen
Personen auf unserer türkischen Seite, die hohe Ämter bekleiden: dem mächtigen
Pascha, den Begs, den Alaybegs,[6] den Befehlshabern der Kavallerie sowie der
Infanterie, unseren kampferfahrenen Kalahusen, die in den Wäldern und auf den

---

[1] Magocz (magos) mit der Bedeutung „geehrt, ehrwürdig" kommt als Personenname schon im 16.
Jahrhunder vor.

[2] Ďurka — Deminutiv zum Personennamen György (Georg).

[3] Sereď — kaiserliche Festung am rechten Ufer des Flusses Váh, heute Stadt im Kreis Galanta.

[4] Šintava — (ung. Sente),Städtchen am linken Ufer des Flusses Váh gegenüber der Stadt Sereď liegend,
den Türken unterworfen und im *Defter-i mufassal-i eyalet-i Uyvar*, BA, TD Nr. 698. f. 192 × 235 als
„varoş" eingetragen. Heute Dorf im Kreis Galanta.

[5] *cemaziyelevvel* — der fünfte Monat des muslimischen Mondkalenders.

[6] *Alaybeg* (tür. *alaybeği*) — Befehlshaber der Sipahis.

158

Feldern patrouillieren, daß die unten erwähnten Personen: Martin Mesaros, dessen Gattin Frau Magocz, eine Frau mit weißem länglichem Gesicht, ihr Gebieter hat einen halbgrauen Bart und ein rundes, von der Sonne gebräuntes Gesicht und sein Sohn Georg, als neue Einwohner aus Sereď nach Šintava kommend, das Haupt neigend unserem mächtigen Kaiser gehuldigt hatten. Anerkennt sie als wahre huldigende Untertanen unseres mächtigen Kaisers, damit sie sich ungestört, mit euch frei bewegen können. Auch wir geloben es auf unseren reinen türkischen Glauben, daß ihnen niemand Unrecht zufügen wird, wenn diese keinerlei Waffe mit sich führen[7] und auf dem uns unterworfenen Gebiet wohnen werden. Zwecks größerer Sicherheit habe ich ihnen diese herrschaftliche Schutzurkunde ausgestellt, die ich vorne wie üblich auch mit meinem Stempel bestätigt habe.

Gegeben in Nové Zámky, am 18. Mai[8] des Jahres 1682.

<div align="right">Idem qui supra</div>

---

[7] Der Statthalter von Nové Zámky Seydi Mehmed Pascha hat im Jahre 1669 den Untertanen verboten Schuß- sowie Stichwaffen zu tragen. Siehe *Theatrum Europaeum. X.* Frankfurt 1699, S. 34—35.

[8] Der Unterschied in der Datierung unter dem türkischen und ungarischen Text wurde dadurch verursacht, daß zuerst der ungarische und nachher der türkische Genehmigungsanhang geschrieben wurde.

THE STRUGGLE BETWEEN GREAT BRITAIN AND FRANCE TO INFLUENCE THE CHARACTER OF GOVERNMENT IN EGYPT, 1801—1803

KAROL SORBY, Bratislava

This is an analysis of the political development in Egypt in 1801—1803 when a sharp struggle went on between British and French diplomacy to gain a decisive influence in that country. The British intended to form a strong, stable government in Egypt, capable of defending the country against the expected renewed French aggression. The French were intent on getting the British out and reinstating their own influence. Both the diplomacies focused their efforts on winning the Mamlūks over to their side — against the designs of the Sublime Porte — but without success, for by then the latter represented a historically outdated conception. The ensuing political anarchy permitted new social forces to come to the scene.

The French occupation of Egypt was part of a large-scale international struggle for power, colonies and new markets. The idea to turn Egypt into a French colony was not new: it had been proposed to Louis XIV by the philosopher Leibniz, but then it found no response. The situation was different following the French revolution: Napoleon's victory over Austria in Italy and the signing of the Treaty of Campofornio in October 1797, brought closer a direct confrontation of two adversaries of long-standing. The French considered an invasion of the British Isles, but because of the risk involved in this plan, decided it would be better to attack some sensitive spot of British colonial empire. Napoleon and Talleyrand suggested occupation of Egypt; this was approved by the Directory of the French Republic, with these goals in view:

1) to strike a direct blow at Great Britain by obtaining mastery of the best route to India,
2) to found a flourishing colony and to exploit the great resources of Egypt,
3) to provide for the scientific exploration both of ancient and modern Egypt.[1]

Following an adventurous sailing through the Mediterranean, the French army landed near Alexandria which it occupied on July 2, 1798. The expedition also included a large group of scholars who were to have ensured an all-round survey of Egypt. After a strenuous march of a fortnight, the French army came close to Cairo. On the left bank of the Nile, not far from the Pyramids, the Mamlūk army commanded by Murād Bey, was awaiting it. The decisive battle in which the flower of Islamic mediaeval chivalry encountered the strongest army of the time, was fought on July 21, 1798. Despite the valour and courage of its soldiers, the Mamlūk army was

---

[1] Rivlin, H. A.: *The Agricultural Policy of Muḥammad Alī in Egypt.* Cambridge, Massachusetts 1961, p. 7.

utterly defeated and the battle clearly showed that its mode of fighting had not the least chance of success against contemporary European armies. Murād Bey with the remnants of his army withdrew into Upper Egypt and Ibrāhīm Bey, Shaykh al-Balad[2] with his faithful fled to Syria. On July 25, 1798, victorious Napoleon triumphantly entered Cairo at the head of his army.[3]

Napoleon's great victory, however, was overshadowed by three facts: a) The destruction of the French fleet at Abū Qīr by Admiral Nelson on August 1, 1798, left the French occupation forces at the mercy of the British who were in complete control of the seas and able to cut off all supplies and reinforcements from France. b) The hostility of the Egyptian population was never removed. European civilization and attempts at reform were not only disliked by the Egyptians, but were factors largely responsible for two extremely bloody insurrections in Cairo. c) The hostility of the Sublime Porte upon whose support Napoleon had counted, but the Turks persisted in their demands for his evacuation of Egypt.[4]

Napoleon did not intend to wait for initiatives on the part of his adversaries: he left in Egypt only the indispensable garrisons and undertook a march to Syria. This expedition which ended in an unsuccessful siege of Akka, meant a loss for the French army of at least one-third of its men (as a result of diseases and epidemics) and for Napoleon personally, a failure of his plans for establishing an empire in the Orient.[5] The French army returned to Egypt in June 1799 and in July a Turkish army of 18 thousand men was landed at Abū Qīr by the British fleet. On July 25, 1799, Napoleon attacked the Turks and won a brilliant victory. In the meantime, Napoleon had obtained newspapers which contained news of the latest developments in Europe. He decided to return to France and on August 23, 1799, he and several of his principal generals embarked secretly on the Muiron and left Egypt and the remnants of his once great army under the control of General Kléber.[6]

The French in Egypt were divided into two parties: the first, headed by Kléber and supported by the majority of the army, favoured the abandonment of Egypt; the second, headed by General Menou, favoured remaining in Egypt and fulfilling the programme of converting Egypt into a French colony. The first party had a decisive preponderance and thus Kléber began to negotiate with the Turks. Accordingly, under the terms of the Convention of al-Arīsh signed January 24, 1800 by the French and Turkish plenipotentiaries in the presence of Sidney Smith, an armistice of three

---

[2] Title of the Mamlūk governor of Cairo, the highest Mamlūk office, inofficial ruler of Egypt in the 18th century. *Hitti, Philip, History of the Arabs.* 9th ed. New York, MacMillan, St. Martins Press, 1968, p. 721.

[3] Certain sources give the day July 24, 1798. Taken over from ar-Rāfiī, Abdurrahmān, *Tārīkh al-haraka al-qawmīja wa tatawwur nizām al-hukm fī Misr* (History of the National Movement and Development of the Government System in Egypt). 4th ed. Cairo 1955, Part I, p. 93.

[4] Rivlin, H. A.: op. cit., p. 9.

[5] Yahyā, Jalāl, *Misr al-hadīta 1517—1805* (Modern Egypt 1517—1805). Alexandria 1969, p. 423.

[6] Rivlin, H. A.: op. cit., p. 10.

months was declared and preliminary steps for French evacuation were initiated.[7]

However, the British government had no interest in the return of such a large French army to Europe where war was raging and therefore agreed to an evacuation of the French only as prisoners of war. When Kléber learned of British opposition to the evacuation, he was angered by the humiliation which the British wished to impose upon him and his troops. He issued an order of the day to his troops stating that such insolence could only be answered by fresh victories.[8] This he did at the Battle of Heliopolis (Ayn Shams)[9] on March 20, 1800, when the French defeated another large Turkish army. To be disencumbered, Kléber ceded Upper Egypt to Murād Bey: the relevant agreement on a truce and payment of a tribute to the French was signed on April 5, 1800. Kléber, however, was not in luck's way for on June 14, 1800, he was assassinated by a fanatic. The command of the army passed on to the senior officer by service, who happened to be General Menou. French troops, wholeheartedly devoted to Kléber, never became reconciled to Menou, a Baron of the *ancien régime* in France, who was well-known for his colonial views and was the laughing stock of the army because of his obesity, his conversion to Islām, and his marriage to a very young Egyptian girl.[10]

Kléber's death was followed by nine-month period of peace during which Menou began to put down sturdy roots for a permanent occupation of Egypt by France. This period was terminated by a new invasion by the British and Turks: but Menou took no decisive counter-measures relying on aid promised him by Napoleon. Two battles were fought not far from Alexandria (March 13 and 21, 1801) but these brought no decisive outcome. In this serious situation, Menou left the initiative to his adversaries. The balance of strength became altered towards the end of June when General Beliard capitulated in Cairo with his army of some 14 thousand men and began negotiations on evacuation. On July 10, Beliard with his officers and men went to Rosetta and in August 1801, sailed for home.

General Menou with his army of 10 thousand strong still held his own at Alexandria. Then General Hutchinson encircled Alexandria — and although Napoleon appealed to Menou to resist as long as possible so that he might have a stronger position in the peace negotiations — he too capitulated on September 2, 1801.[11] From the original French army of some 40 thousand men, only 24 thousand

---

[7] Considerable credit goes to Commodore Sir Sidney Smith for Napoleon's failure to take Akka. Taken over from Holt, P. M., *Egypt and the Fertile Crescent 1516—1922*. Ithaca, New York, Cornell University Press 1967, p. 159.

[8] Ghorbal, Sh.: *The Beginnings of the Egyptian Question and the Rise of Mehemet Ali*. London, George Routledge and Sons, Ltd. 1928, p. 116.

[9] Northeastern suburb of present Cairo.

[10] Rivlin, H. A.: op. cit., p. 12.

[11] Harrāz, as-Sajjid Rajab: *Al-madkhal ilā tārīkh Miṣr al-ḥadīt 1517—1882* (Introduction to the Modern History of Egypt 1517—1882). Cairo 1970, p. 151.

soldiers and officers returned. At the conference in London in November 1801, Great Britain and France agreed to recognize the re-establishment of Turkish sovereignty in Egypt and this recognition was also included into the text of the peace treaty signed at Amiens on March 25, 1802.[12]

British policy towards the Ottoman Empire was determined by a treaty of alliance[13] concluded with the design to drive the French out of Egypt. By this treaty both parties recognized and confirmed each other's territorial claims and George III bound himself to respect all the territories of the Ottoman Empire without exception, such as they had been prior to the French incursion into Egypt, in other words, once the French would be driven out, to return Egypt to the Sultan and leave its defence to the Turks.[14]

Already at the time of the first common actions of the British and Ottoman armed forces against the French, the idea was born to set up in Egypt — following the withdrawal of all the belligerent armies, i.e. French, British and Ottoman — a strong government, capable of warding off every new aggression. British commanders who had witnessed the inefficiency of Turkish commanders and officers, the chaos and disorganization of the Ottoman army, did not believe the Turks would succeed in setting up a strong and stable government in Egypt.[15] In their view, the only force capable of carrying out this role were the Mamlūks. To ensure Egypt's self-defence, the British — bound as they were by the treaty to hand Egypt over to the Ottomans — had to endeavour to achieve reconciliation between the Turks and the Mamlūks. That is why, British policy was marked by continuous attempts at achieving agreements between the Sublime Porte and the Mamlūks whom initially only British commanders, and only gradually also politicians, considered as the true force in the country. It was imperative to put an end to the enmity between the Turks and the Mamlūks for this gave rise to anarchy only and could not lead to the formation of a stable and strong government, capable of defending the country against aggressors.[16]

Right on the arrival of the British expeditionary force to Egypt, both the commander of the territorial forces General Abercromby and the commander of the naval forces Admiral Keith complained of the impossibility to coordinate battle operations of British and Ottoman units. The British Ambassador in Istanbul, Lord Elgin, informed his governemnt[17] of the dissatisfaction of these commanders with

---

[12] Ghorbal, Sh.: op. cit., p. 151.

[13] Hurewitz, J. C., *Diplomacy in the Near and Middle East. A Documentary Record: 1535—1914.* Vol. I, Doc. 25 — Defensive Alliance: Great Britain and the Ottoman Empire, Jan. 1799, pp. 65—67.

[14] Article II of the relevant treaty. Hurewitz, J. C., op. cit., p. 66.

[15] Shukrī, Muḥammad Fuād: *Miṣr fī maṭla al-qarn at-tāsi ashar 1801—1811* (Egypt at the Beginning of the 19th century). Cairo 1958, p. 78.

[16] Ibid., p. 78.

[17] Elgin to Grenville, Feb. 9, 1801 (Elgin, Ambassador of Great Britain in Istanbul, Grenville, Minister

their Turkish ally. He wished to present an "objective" picture of the situation to his government, in order that the latter might be able to take up a firm stand during the negotiations concerning postwar arrangement of Egypt. Elgin wrote: ". . . But if we owe no share of our success to the Turks, we shall assuredly have more latitude in determining the arrrangements which it may be advisable to establish in Egypt, whether in reference to the Turkish Government, to the Beys, or to our own immediate interests."[18]

The new commander of the British expeditionary force, General Hutchinson,[19] assessed his allies as follows: "Our Allies,the Turks,are in a deplorable state of weakness, suspicious of their friends and fearful of their enemies, without talent to plan, or vigour to execute it; they set not the smallest value upon time, so that, whenever you attempt a combined operation with them, you cannot place the smallest reliance on any promise they may make."[20]

The course of armed encounters clearly showed that to defeat the French army would be a hard and complex problem. Consequently, Hutchinson, seeing that he could not seriously count with his Turkish ally, searched every possibility of reinforcing his position. He decided to deprive the French of their home ally, the Mamlūks[21] and to win them over to his side with promises of amnesty and restoration of their former power in the country. At the time Hutchinson was as yet unaware of the fact that the majority of the French just yearned to be back home as soon as possible.[22]

Hutchinson for the first time pointed out the necessity of retaining Alexandria in British hands also after handing Egypt over to the Turks in his dispatch to his government: "I cannot doubt that you must be perfectly aware that it will be necessary to leave British garrisons at Alexandria and other places, otherwise the Turks alone will not long hold Egypt. I doubt whether they could retain it, even against the remains of the Mamlūks and the inhabitants of the country, who, though they hate the French, dislike the Turks extremely, and do not at all wish to be under their dominion."[23]

---

of Foreign Affairs in W. Pitt's (Jr.) Cabinet). In: Douin, G. — Fawtier-Jones, E. C.: *L'Angleterre et l'Egypte. La politique mameluke (1801—1803)*. Publications spéciales. Le Caire, Société royale de géographie d'Egypte 1929. Doc. 1. pp. 1—4.

[18] Ibid., p. 4.

[19] General Ralph Abercromby, commander of the British Expeditionary Force, was gravely wounded the battle near Alexandria on March 21, 1801, and died shortly after. Taken over from Ghorbal, Sh.: op. cit., p. 136. Mentioned also by Marlowe, John: *Anglo-Egyptian Relations 1800—1953*. London, The Cresset Press 1954, p. 20.

[20] Hutchinson to Dundas, April 3, 1801. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc.. 2, p. 5 (Dundas, Minister of War in W. Pitt's (Jr.) Cabinet from 1794).

[21] Agreement Kléber-Murâd concluded April 5, 1800. Text of agreement given by ar-Rāfiī: op. cit., Part 2, pp. 360—364.

[22] Rivlin, H. A.: op. cit., p. 11.

[23] Hutchinson to Dundas, April 3, 1801, Douin—Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 2, p. 5.

Fears from a return of the French to Egypt and his mounting conviction of the Turks' incapacity to defend themselves, resulted in Hutchinson's change of view on the question of setting up a government which would take over power after the handing over of Egypt and the departure of the British army. He was aware that it would be extremely difficult to put the country into order seeing that the Turks, without money, without any resources, plundered everything that came their way. The Ottoman army, resembling more gangs of bandits than a regular army, committed every injustice and violence against the population, and he himself could prevent this solely at the cost of conflicts with the Turkish command, while simultaneously acting against his own instruction which 'did not permit him to interfere with affairs proper to the Ottoman Empire.[24] The prevailing view among British commanders was that if the Turks do not set up a balanced political system in Egypt — which appeared unrealistic — this country would fall a second time a prey to the French, for the Ottoman army was incapable of resisting any French attack. Hutchinson argued that Great Britain wanted to return Egypt to the Turks, although it had not for long belonged to them any more and wrote further: "I fear that Egypt will be a subject of much more embarrassment to us than we are aware of. If France is enabled to maintain the superiority which she has acquired on the continent of Europe, it will be difficult to prevent this country from again falling into her hands; there are many reasons for supposing this to be a very probable event, above all, when we consider that Turkey in her present state of weakness wants a protector, and who has so natural and so powerful an interest to become so as France, who ought certainly to wish to prop what remains of a tottering fabric, in order to prevent a more active nation from getting possession of the trade of the Levant and depriving her of that which was once her most beneficient commercial resource."[25] Such an appraisal of the situation discomfitted both the British and the Turkish Government: the British because it had bound itself to return Egypt into such incapable hands, and the Turkish because it became assailed by doubts as to the intentions of the British with regard to their adhering to the terms of the 1799 treaty.

In May 1801 the British Government transmitted new instructions to Elgin and to Hutchinson. Elgin had to advise Ottoman ministers that once the French are driven out, the British Government was firmly resolved to hand Egypt over to them, but a British garrison would be left on the coastal part of the country until the signing of the peace treaty, in order to protect Egypt against France's usurpatory designs.[26] The

[24] Hutchinson to Elgin, April 25, 1801. Douin—Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 3, p. 8.

[25] Ibid., p. 9.

[26] Hawkesbury to Elgin, May 19, 1801. Douin—Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 6, pp. 12—13. (In March 1801 Pitt's Cabinet was replaced by Addington's: Lord Hawkesbury — Minister of Foreign Affairs, Lord Hobart — Minister for War and the Colonies.)

instructions to Hutchinson held that once the French are driven out of Egypt, due consideration would be given to the idea as to the strength of the garrison to be left there in order to prevent any attempt on the part of the French at a new invasion. Lord Hobart further wrote that "... In considering this subject, it must be kept in mind that our sole object is to guard against the designs of the French Government upon Egypt, and that we are neither bound by our engagements to the Turks, nor led by any views of our own to look beyond that object."[27]

Such was the line of conduct that the British government outlined or even set down for their ambassador, commander of the expeditionary force and the other agents involved, which they were bound to adhere to in the question of evacuation and handing over of Egypt to the Turks following the final victory over the French army. It involved a refraining from interfering into the internal affairs of Egypt as one of the provinces of the Ottoman Empire and the obligation of returning Egypt to that empire in accordance with the guaranties embodied in the 1799 treaty. Not to interfere meant not to seek ways to set up a government in Egypt following the departure of the British troops which the military and part of British politicians considered — in contradiction of this line of conduct — to be the primary task.[28]

It soon became evident that the promises of the British government not to interfere in Egypt's internal affairs would not be kept. The Sublime Porte herself had a share in this for she asked Great Britain for cooperation in studying measures to ensure an efficient defence of Egypt.[29] Under these circumstances Elgin designedly refrained from transmitting to the Porte his government's firm decision of returning Egypt to the Ottoman Empire and thanks to this, Great Britain could, under the new conditions,[30] conveniently reformulate its attitude in the question of the defence of Egypt following the departure of the French. Hawkesbury informed Elgin that His Majesty's Government agreed to leaving part of their units in Egypt until a final peace treaty be concluded. He stated that the British Government, to settle Egypt's internal affairs, wished to act in the role of a mediator among the various parties and that it would exert maximum efforts to resolve and put an end to the existing conflicts. He then continued: "We ought always to bear in mind that whatever may be the result of the military operations in Egypt, the French Government will probably never abandon the idea of establishing themselves, at some convenient opportunity, in that country. Their object will be for the purpose to create and

---

[27] Hobart to Hutchinson, May 19, 1801. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 5, p. 11.

[28] Elgin to Hawkesbury, May 31, 1801. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 7, pp. 13—15.

[29] Reis effendi to Elgin, May 31, 1801. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 8, p. 17. (Reis ül-kuttāb, abbrev. to Reis Effendi title of the Minister of Foreign Affairs in the Ottoman Empire.)

[30] Assassination of Czar Paul I (May 24, 1801) and the related political changes in Europe in favour of Great Britain.

entertain divisions amongst the different sects and parties there. We must endeavour to counteract these attempts!"[31]

This marked the beginning of Britain's official interference in Egypt's internal affairs under the pretext of mediation between the Sublime Porte and the Mamlūks and the aim of setting up a strong government capable of defending Egypt against the French, but subject to British influence.

Hutchinson considered the decision to return Egypt to the Turks to be an indispensable step for British interests. He therefore focused on implementing the line indicated in Huskisson's private letter to Abercromby,[32] demanding that everything be done to win over the Mamlūks regardless of the complications this might provoke. Hutchinson stated: "I was bound to consider this letter as an instruction to Sir Ralph",[33] in which the Government implied that he should win the Mamlūks over to his side, even though it would not be to the Turks' liking.

The opportunity to carry out this "line" presented itself soon enough. He received a letter from Bey aṭ-Ṭanbūrjī informing him of the death of Murād Bey and suggesting that the Mamlūks would be ready to join the British army on condition that their amnesty and protection would be guaranteed, for they have no trust in the Turks and their promises.[34] In order to deprive the French of a powerful ally — the Mamlūks — who supported them through their cavalry and their knowledge of local conditions, Hutchinson wrote by return of mail to aṭ-Ṭanbūrjī from Rosetta: ". . . I was empowered by the British Government to grant you amnesty and protection and also security for your property and that of your followers."[35] This letter of Hutchinson's played an important role in the subsequent development of the situation: in view of the formal guarantee of security which it carried, the British Government could not leave it out of count either in relation to the Beys, or to the Sublime Porte. Although most British politicians were ignorant for a long time of its content, it nevertheless came to be their justification for the substitution of a policy of "indifference" for one of "interference", while at the same time their efforts at achieving an agreement between the Mamlūks and the Porte were essentially designed to reinforce British power positions in eastern Mediterranean.

In accordance with this line, Hutchinson was determined to make good his promises to the Mamlūks and elaborated a plan to settle the conflicts in Egypt. This plan foresaw a return of conditions to the state that had prevailed prior to the year

---

[31] Hawkesbury to Elgin, July 28, 1801. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 20, pp. 49—50.

[32] Huskisson to Abercromby, Dec. 23. 1800. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 36, pp. 83—85. (Huskisson, Undersecretary for War in W. Pitt's (Jr.) Cabinet.)

[33] Hutchinson to Elgin, July 25, 1801. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 19, p. 41.

[34] Ibid., p. 41 (The letter from aṭ-Ṭanbūrjī reached Hutchinson on May 5, 1801).

[35] Ibid., p. 41. Hutchinson to aṭ-Ṭanbūrjī, May 5, 1801 (Traduction d'une lettre du Général Hutchinson' adressée à Osman bey). Op. cit., Doc. 4, pp. 9—11.

1798 and was in fact a plan for the future government of Egypt, whose outline ran as follows:

1st The Turks should possess exclusively Alexandria, Rosetta and Damietta, and should keep a garrison in the citadel of Cairo;

2nd A Pacha should be named, as formerly, by the Porte, who should decide all disputes betwixt the Beys, should appoint the Chief, in case of vacancy, and should have the general government of the country;

3rd The *miri,* or tribute paid by the Beys to the Porte, should be augmented and should be paid without any deduction whatever, into the hands of the Receiver General appointed by the Porte;

4th The Beys should be reinstated in all their property and should have the entire management of it as formerly, subject, however, to certain limitations in regard to the taxes or rents to be levied on the inhabitants, and under the obligation of keeping up a certain number of men, in proportion to their respective properties.[36]

This plan then implied a return of true power in Egypt into the hands of the Mamlūks with the proviso that the domination of the Ottoman Empire, officially represented by the Sultan's viceroy, would be nominally maintained. Under the circumstances, this plan manifestly advantaged the Mamlūks, for Hutchinson was convinced that they alone were capable successfully to defend Egypt. Yet, initially, the Beys considered it actually disadvantageous to them because it considerably limited their power and influence in relation to the state of things before the French incursion.

Hutchinson repeatedly intimated to the Qapūdān Pasha[37] what close attention the British Government devoted to this matter and how much it desired to protect the Mamlūks. Both Qapūdān Pasha and the Grand Vizier apparently agreed, and even went so far as to make solemn promises to the Beys.[38] Relying on the treaty of alliance, they did not count with interference by the British and assumed that once the French were driven out of the country and after the departure of the British forces, conditions in Egypt would be arranged according to the notions of the Porte regardless of the promises made under compulsion.

It is clear that the promises made by Turkish dignitaries were mere manoeuvrings through which they attempted to get rid of British pressure. The Grand Vizier just as the Qapūdān, was essentially against any return of power to the Mamlūks and against British interference into the question of setting up a government in Egypt. The instructions of the Sublime Porte required them to ensure a complete integration of

---

[36] Colonel Robert Anstruther to Hobart, May 8, 1802. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: Doc. 106, pp. 242—243. Enclosed was "Col. Anstruther's Report", May 8, 1802, Doc. 107, pp. 243—244.

[37] Title of Ottoman Grand Admiral (Minister of the Navy).

[38] Shukrī, Muḥammad Fuād: op. cit., p. 95.

Egypt into the system of the Ottoman Empire, and in the interest of an implementation of this requirement, the greatest possible number of Mamlūk Beys had to be arrested and sent to Istanbul.

On the evening of July 14, 1801, Mamlūk Beys informed Hutchinson that "... as the Grand Vizier had not performed his promise, and as there was neither security for their lives nor property, they were determined to assemble in a body, march to Upper Egypt, and there defend themselves against the Turks as long as they could".[39] The Beys' decision worried Hutchinson considerably, for he was losing them at a time when General Menou was still fortified at Alexandria and there was nothing to prevent the French from bringing in new French units. As it was clear that no friendly relations could be established between the Turks and the Mamlūks, Hutchinson concentrated his efforts on preventing an eventual reunion of the Mamlūks with the French. Hutchinson protested against the way of acting of the Grand Vizier who, despite his promise to restore property to the Mamlūks, "does not allow them to take possession of their own houses, rather forces them out of Cairo".[40] He officially asked the Porte to give a written pledge to the Mamlūks through the office of the Grand Vizier that all their possessions would be restored to them. He warned that it was a great mistake to think that conditions in Egypt would be stabilized by removing the Beys; quite the contrary, that would be a way to civil war in which the Turks would lose Egypt and the British would be loath to come a second time to win it for them.[41] The Grand Vizier assured Hutchinson that the Mamlūks would have their houses and possessions restored to them and confirmed this at a public meeting held at Cairo on July 22. The Beys expressed their satisfaction to Hutchinson and at the moment everything seemed to be in the best of order. He wrote: "They have since informed me that they are satisfied, and everything appears for the moment to be quiet and arranged."[42] He left Cairo on July 27, 1801, for Rosetta. He informed in detail lord Hobart[43] of his activities and the British Government, anxious to achieve a permanent settlement, took Hutchinson's plan as its own official policy in Egypt.

Elgin's and Hutchinson's reports convinced the British Government that the setting up of a stable government in Egypt was closely connected with the solution of the Mamlūk problem. The report on the guarantees given by Hutchinson to the Mamlūks in accordance with Huskisson's recommendations to Abercromby elicited considerable interest in British Government circles.[44] As the range of these guaran-

[39] Hutchinson to Elgin, July 25, 1801. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 19, p. 42.
[40] Hutchinson to Reis Effendi, July 17, 1801. Douin—Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 16, p. 36.
[41] Ibid., p. 36.
[42] Hutchinson to Elgin, July 25, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 19, p. 44.
[43] Hutchinson to Hobart, Sep. 21, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 35, pp. 80—82.
[44] Hutchinson to Hobart, June 2, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 9, pp. 17—18.

tees was not known in London, Hobart "admonished" Hutchinson "... that as the British faith must be scrupulously kept in this and in every instance where it may be found expedient to make this country a party, it will be proper that the greatest caution should be observed to confine such engagements to cases of indispensable necessity".[45]

On a request of the Sublime Porte, the British Goverment studied the question of setting up a government in Egypt, adhering to the principle of "mediating among diverse groups and parties" as evident from Hawkesbury's letter to Elgin: "It appears, however, to be the obvious policy of this country, to act, as far as possible, in the character of mediators between the different parties in Egypt, and to endeavour by every effort in our power to bring them to an amicable settlement."[46] A general plan was elaborated to that effect, known as "Projet pour l'administration de l'Égypte après l'Expédition des Français",[47] in the introduction to which the situation in the country before the incursion of the French, was characterized as follows: a) nominal sovereignty of the Sublime Porte, b) unlimited power of the Mamlūks in the country, c) misery and starvation of most of the inhabitants.

The plan foresaw a radical change of the conditions. The government to be formed should support and protect all the Egyptians (including Christians) in the interests of promoting agriculture and commerce. Mamlūk forces should concentrate on the defence of the country. The new system should be an efficient guarantee against any one single group growing strong enough to be able to act arbitrarily, as the Mamlūks had done earlier. Extortion, spoliation, expropriation and oppression of the population must be stopped, for solely the introduction of this new system, based on respect for the basic rights of the inhabitants, would permit the Porte economically and militarily to reinforce the country. At the same time, the presence of a British army in Egypt would be a guarantee that these principles, agreed upon, would be respected.

The British Government expected that the Sublime Porte would assent to the submitted draft which, in their view, followed the consolidation of Turkish power in the region. And the British Government conditioned their participation in the settlement of affairs in Egypt by the Porte's acceptance of the project which demanded

1. that the rights, privileges and territorial jurisdiction of the Mamlouks shall be ascertained; that the nature and extent of their military service shall be defined, and that the perfomance of that service shall be made the condition of their tenures;

2. that the revenue of the State, whether derived from the soil, from the duties

---

[45] Hobart to Hutchinson, July 22, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 17, p. 38.

[46] Hawkesbury to Elgin, July 28, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 20, p. 49.

[47] This plan, project or report is anonymous and undated, and was enclosed with Hawkesbury's letter to Elgin of July 28, 1801. Op. cit., Doc. 21, pp. 50—54.

upon trade or from whatever source it may be drawn, shall now be placed under fixed regulations, which shall establish the rates and proportions to be paid to the State under each head, and which shall preclude, by severe penalties, other than the regulated dues;

3. that a stated portion of the public revenue of Egypt should be appropriated for the pay and disbursements of the regular military establishment to be formed under the direction and control of British officers;

4. that the disciplined corps of Turkish subjects now in Egypt should continue to be employed there and make a part of this new establishment;

5. that new corps should be raised in Albania and the other European States of the Grand Signor, as well as in Egypt, for this service and that these levies should be continued until the establishment shall be completed;

6. that the chief command over the whole of this regular army should, if possible, be vested in a British officer, and that no payment should be made from the funds alloted for the disbursements of this army, but upon the orders he may issue;

7. that this officer, being duly authorized for that purpose, should be instructed to make respectful remonstrates to the representative of the Porte in Egypt, upon all occasions where it should appear that measures were pursuing in violation of the principles now to be laid down, with respect to the privileges of the Mamlouks, the recognized rights of the people, or the collection and application of the military appropriation;

8. that promotion in this regular army should be made upon the recommendation of this British officer, and that all military detail should depend upon him;

9. that during the continuance of the present war, the Fort of Alexandria should be garrisoned by troops in the service of Great Britain, to be paid by the Porte, and that the money for this purpose should be drawn from the appropriated military fund mentioned before.[48]

The commentary appended to this draft states that: a) The British army at the present moment expends great efforts to drive the French out of Egypt, but in future the Porte cannot count with her intervention; b) The conquest of Egypt by France meant damage to the fundamental interests of the British Empire and therefore the Government profits by this occasion to place into the hands of the Porte means enabling her to frustrate France's aggressive plans without the help of Great Britain.

In view of the information supplied by Lord Elgin, the British Government surmised that the Porte would accede to this plan, which simultaneously would have ensured a preponderant British influence in Istanbul and priority of British trade in the Levant.

However, the British plan had no prospects of success: Egypt would have come

---

[48] Ibid., pp. 52—53.

totally under the military and economic dependence of Great Britain and even the costs involved in the implementation of this plan would not be borne by the British. The Ottoman Empire would have been deprived of even the negligible influence which it had wielded in Egypt prior to the incursion of the French. The Sublime Porte had no intention of acceding to such a solution and insisted on Egypt's full integration into the Empire's system. When asking through Lord Elgin concerning British Government's view on the future arrangement of Egypt, the Porte wished in reality to find out to what extent Great Britain counted with the Mamlūks and what she intended to give them. The British proposals did not correspond at all with the Porte's notions regarding the settlement of the Egyptian question, quite the contrary, they proved to be in direct contradiction to them.

Reports on contacts between the British and the Mamlūks coming from Egypt — and in particular those on the activities of General Hutchinson — gave substance to the Porte's fears. The Mamlūks openly declared that "... so soon as the British shall quit the country, they will drive out the Turks".[49] The Grand Vizier was well aware of the danger lurking behind the promise he had made to the Mamlūks of restoring their property and privileges: he tried to minimize the bearing of this act of his, to convince the imperial Dīwān of the lack of significance of his assurances and to ascribe everything to pressure on Hutchinson's part.[50] Qapūdān Pasha categorically denied his share in making promises to the Mamlūks.

The British considerably stepped up their diplomatic activity following the final victory over the French in Egypt.[51] They tried to assert their conception at the conference held, on the initiative of the Porte at Istanbul on September 14, 1801, and which had on its programme an investigation of the conditions for setting up a new government in Egypt. But here they met with a persistently rejecting stand of the Sublime Porte,[52] which may be summarized as follows:

1. The Mamlūks are a foreign element in Egypt: they usurped power and throughout the 18th century they had fought against the legal representatives of the Sublime Porte in Egypt.

2. The Sublime Porte must take effective measures to ensure that the Mamlūks would not represent a threat to it in future. They may enter the Sultan's service as officers, but may not stay in Cairo where they might be a potential source of conflicts. It is absolutely impossible to restore to them their former possessions, for they would thereby again regain the factual power in the country.[53]

---

[49] Keith to Elgin, Aug. 1, 1801. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 23, p. 57.

[50] Elgin to Hawkesbury, Oct. 19, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 40, p. 94.

[51] General Menou with his army capitulated in Alexandria on Sep. 2, 1801. Taken over from Marlowe, J.: op. cit., p. 22.

[52] Protocol from the conference held in Istanbul Sep. 14, 1801. Douin—Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 33, pp. 69—78.

[53] Ibid., p. 73.

Elgin realized that his interventions of behalf on the Mamlūks had no prospects of success. He found himself in an awkward situation: he did not know the exact range of Hutchinson's engagements and therefore declared that he would acquaint him with the stand of the Porte. Ottoman ministers took Elgin's statement as an agreement to revise the promises given to the Mamlūks in Cairo and to bring Hutchinson to negotiate and settle this matter directly with the Grand Vizier. Elgin himself did not ascribe any such binding value to his statement and proposed that he would go to Egypt in the hope to successfully find means to ward off the impending crisis.[54]

In October 1801, the Porte decided radically to settle the Mamlūk problem. The Grand Vizier and the Qapūdān Pasha received precise instructions how to restore anew a fully real integration of Egypt within the Ottoman Empire. As already mentioned, the greatest possible number of Mamlūk Beys were to be arrested and sent to Istanbul: they were to have been scattered throughout the whole Empire, with the provision that they would be given properties as they had in Egypt.[55]

Hutchinson had an inkling of the Porte's designs and therefore warned the Beys of possible intrigues on the part of the Turks. He advised the Bey aṭ-Ṭanbūrjī and four further Beys who had paid a visit to the Qapūdān Pasha on October 15, and then had pitched their camp in the midst of Turkish units, to move into the close vicinity of British units. However, the Beys "trusted the Qapūdān Pasha". "They told me," Hutchinson wrote, "that they were unwilling to give offence to the Capitan Pasha, who had made them the fairest promises and given them the most solemn assurances of amnesty and protection."[56] This ill-founded confidence or undue self-assurance of the Beys permitted the Grand Vizier and the Qapūdān Pasha to carry out their planned complot.

On October 20, 1801, the Grand Vizier invited all the Beys staying in Cairo to his house under the pretext that distinctions would be conferred upon them. Eleven Beys, including also Shaykh al-Balad came, but instead of honours, imprisonment awaited them.[57] The Grand Vizier immediately sent a punitive expedition to Upper Egypt to capture the remaining Beys. On October 22, Qapūdān Pasha lured several Beys into a trap near Alexandria, in which five were shot dead and the others wounded. These were taken aboard a ship to be transported to Istanbul.[58]

As soon as the news of these conspiracies reached Hutchinson, he sharply protested against such methods of dealing and insisted that all the imprisoned Beys be set at liberty. He warned the Qapūdān Pasha: "I was determined to have them dead or alive, for which purpose I should immediately get the troops under arms, and

---

[54] Elgin to Hawkesbury, Oct. 19, 1801. Ibid., Doc.. 40, p. 98.
[55] Shukrī, Muḥammad Fuād: op. cit., p. 12.
[56] Hutchinson to Hobart, Dec. 24., 1801. Ibid., Doc. 66, p. 160.
[57] Holloway to Elgin, Oct. 22, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 41, p. 101.
[58] Details on the course of events at Alexandria — Qapūdān Pasha Ḥusayn to Qāʾimmaqām Pasha,

that, if he means resistance, he had better prepare for defence".[59] Qapūdān Pasha and subsequently also the Grand Vizier saw themselves forced, under these circumstances, to release the Beys.

True, Hutchinson acted here on his own, yet within the accepted conception, when he insisted on the Beys' being set free. When those at Istanbul learned of what had taken place in Egypt, they qualified it as a contravention of the treaty and asked Lord Elgin for an explication.[60] Elgin assured Reis Effendi that the British Government had no intention to interfere in the internal affairs of the Ottoman Empire and that Hutchinson would be reprimanded. Hutchinson himself was obliged to leave Egypt for health reasons — he left on November 11, 1801 and his command was taken over by Lord Cavan.[61]

On October 1, 1801, Great Britain and France concluded a preliminary truce[62] which became a prelude to the definitive peace treaty concluded at Amiens in March of 1802. A preliminary truce was also concluded between France and the Ottoman Empire on October 11, 1801 in Paris, when also Colonel Sébastiani's journey to the Ottoman Empire was approved and the proposal submitted that Napoleon would act as mediator between the Sublime Porte and the Mamlūks.[63] The British inferred from all this that Napoleon was intent to prevent at all cost the establishemnt of a steady government in Egypt in order to be able, at an opportune moment, to occupy it again. Therefore Elgin decided to pay a visit to Egypt in person in order definitely to settle by agreement with Lord Cavan, the Grand Vizier and the Qapūdān Pasha, the Mamlūk problem before the peace conference would convene at Amiens. However, the Sublime Porte set itself resolutely against such a visit;[64] consequently, Lord Elgin designated A. Straton, secretary to the British Embassy in Istanbul, for this task.[65]

The Turkish conspiracy against the Mamlūks, which clearly revealed the failure of all efforts at mediation, provoked a real fury among British politicians.[66] Moreover, in a letter to the English King George III, Sultan Salīm III[67] explicitly stated the Sublime Porte's determination completely to expulse the Mamlūks from Egypt. This tendency ran directly counter to the aims of British policy at a time when the Preliminaries of Peace had been concluded between Great Britain and France. As

Oct. 23, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 43, pp. 104—110; and also Stuart to Hutchinson, Oct. 23, 1801, Doc. 42, pp. 101—103.

[59] Hutchinson to the Grand Vizier. Ibid., Doc. 44, pp. 110—111; Doc. 46, pp. 112—113.
[60] The Porte to Elgin, Nov. 12, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 51, p. 123.
[61] Shukrī, Muḥammad Fuād: op. cit., p. 108.
[62] Hobart to Hutchinson, Oct. 12, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 39, p. 93.
[63] Elgin to Hawkesbury, NOv. 22, 1801, Ibid., Doc. 55, p. 135.
[64] Elgin to Hawkesbury, Dec. 12, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 60, p. 148.
[65] Ibid., p. 148.
[66] Hawkesbury to Elgin, Jan. 27, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 79, p. 211.
[67] Salīm III to George III, Nov. 23, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 57, pp. 136—143.

a matter of fact, Article Five of this agreement corroborated the return of Egypt to the Ottoman Empire;[68] consequently, the British had to act fast to resolve the question of its defence. British mediation for settling conflicts between the Sublime Porte and the Mamlūks and for setting up a strong, stable government in Egypt, entered its second stage with Straton's journey to Egypt.

This trip had the approval of the Sublime Porte. In a note sent to Straton,[69] the Porte formulated its demands as follows: the Beys now under the protection of the British army shall be handed over without exception to the Grand Vizier so that they could be moved to Istanbul; they will not be deprived of property and in addition, will receive rents and titles.

Elgin gave Straton a set of double instructions — the ones official, the others confidential. In the former,[70] Elgin asked Straton to study in detail the events that had taken place in Egypt and to discuss them with British officers, in order to grasp the core of the problem. Elgin stressed that it had always been the goal of the British Government to restore Egypt to the Ottoman Empire and therefore it is out of place to deal with the idea of its being handed over to the Mamlūks. The Sublime Porte was determined to get the Mamlūks out of Egypt, consequently, Straton must exert maximum efforts to reach a settlement that would correspond to the designs of the Sublime Porte and the British Government. He should convince the Beys that by their stubborn resistance, they expose themselves to a great danger.

Elgin expounded the aims of Straton's mission in more detail and more clearly in his confidential instructions.[71] He stated that the signing of the Preliminaries of Peace in London had been a ratification of the promise to return Egypt and to refrain from interfering in the internal affairs of the Ottoman Empire. The promises made by Hutchinson to the Beys are in opposition to the official line of British policy and interfere with the Porte's sovereignty. The latter has the right to protest against such contacts as undermine its authority and are in contradiction with the assurances of the British Government: so long as the Mamlūk question is not definitely settled, the Porte feels imperilled. Under the circumstances, it is incumbent upon British policy to resolve the conflicts between the Porte and the Beys before the British army leaves Egypt, so that the country would not be left in a state of anarchy and the good name of Great Britain would be preserved.[72]

Straton had for task to convince the Beys that they exposed themselves to danger by their insistence to remain in Egypt, for with the departure of the British army they would lose British protection and the Turks would resort to any expedient to liquidate them. While still under British protection they had to await the outcome of

[68] The Porte to Elgin, Nov. 12, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 51, p. 123.

[69] Porte's Note to Straton, Dec. 10, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 62, pp. 151—153.

[70] Elgin to Straton, Dec. 12, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 61, pp. 149—151.

[71] Elgin to Straton, Dec. 12, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 65, pp. 157—159.

[72] Ibid., p. 158.

mediation and in case it proved negative, Straton had to promise them in Elgin's name that they would be amically received either in Great Britain or in its colonies, e. g. in India, where they would receive the same annual incomes as those promised them by the Porte for fulfilling their military duties, and in addition, they would enjoy British protection and all the advantages of British subjects.[73]

In a message to the Government explaining the fundamental aim of Straton's mission and the reason for the confidential instructions, Elgin remarked: "It had indeed occurred to me that, if no arrangement should be found practicable on the plan insisted upon by the Porte... in that case, the Beys might be invited to retire to England, or more particularly to India, where their military talents and services would amply compensate for the expanse of maintaining them."[74] Such an arrangement would be acceptable to both the British and the Ottoman Government.

Objectively considered, it should be observed that Straton's mission had minimum chances of success, for a) settlement of the conflict between the Porte and the Mamlūks that would prove satisfactory to both parties was just impossible because of the extreme standpoints of the two; b) removing the Beys out of Egypt was likewise impossible, for the latter — in accordance with Hutchinson's promise — demanded such a mediation on the part of Great Britain as would restore to them real power in the country.

Straton arrived in Alexandria on January 10, 1802, and immediately met the commander of the British expeditionary force to inform him of the aims of his mission. Lord Cavan refused the Porte's request to hand over the Mamlūk Beys with the excuse that he was prevented by the obligations entered into by his predecessor Hutchinson.[75] Straton showed Cavan his confidential instructions and wished to know in what manner would it be possible to convince the Beys to leave Egypt under those conditions. He asked Cavan so to use his influence on the Beys that in the interest of their own safety, they would accede to the proposed conditions, whereby they would make it easier for the British Government to make good its promises to the Sublime Porte. Cavan declared "that he neither could nor would use any violent means to send the Beys out of Egypt, or even to retain them at Gizeh, longer than they should think proper".[76] He agreed only to recommend the Beys to accept the conditions.

In order to bring this matter to an end, Cavan and Straton left for Cairo where they held numerous meetings with the Grand Vizier and the Mamlūk Beys between January 20 and 24, 1802. Cavan and Straton showed Qā'immaqām Pasha's letter (with the Porte's official standpoint)[77] to the Beys, but they adamantly refused to quit

---

[73] Ibid., p. 159.

[74] Elgin to Hawkesbury, Dec. 12, 1801. Ibid., Doc. 64, p. 156.

[75] Straton to Elgin, Jan. 29, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 75, pp. 180—187.

[76] Ibid., p. 181.

[77] Qā'immaqām Pasha to Cavan (Q = Deputy to the Grand Vizier). Ibid., Doc. 63, pp. 153—156.

Egypt and expected Great Britain to back up their standpoint. They demanded that the whole of Upper Egypt be given them and Cavan endeavoured in vain to convince them that their opposition to the Porte was senseless and their requests excessive. The Grand Vizier naturally rejected the Beys' demands and the latter interrupted the negotiations and decided to leave Cairo. Cavan tried to persuade them to stay on and warned them that "Leur départ pour la Haute-Égypte sera considéré par les Turcs comme un acte de désobéissance et comme un commencement de guerre civile",[78] but all to no avail.

The Beys, Ibrāhīm and al-Bardīsī, explained the reasons for their departure saying that there was no sense in staying on when the Grand Vizier had declared that the Beys would not get land in Egypt. They would remain in Upper Egypt until the British, who had promised them protection, do succeed in ensuring them a secure place of stay in Egypt.[79]

The Grand Vizier decided to drive the Beys out of Upper Egypt and demanded Cavan to reinforce his punitive expedition with British units. Cavan "declined complying with this request, on the principle of his not being authorized to send troops up to the country without special instructions to that effect".[80] When Ṭāhir Pasha, the commander of the Albanian units and simultaneously of the punitive expedition endeavoured to persuade the Beys to return and submit to the Grand Vizier who would pardon them and guarantee their lives and property they replied: "Les Anglais, quoique amis de la Porte, ont eu beaucoup de peine à nous mettre en liberté, et malgré tous leurs efforts ils n'ont pu obtenir aucun établissement pour nous; après cela, comment voulez-vous que nous ajoutions foi a vous ou a vos promesses ?"[81]

The departure of the Mamlūk Beys to Upper Egypt was more than a portent of impending civil war. When the Mamlūks were leaving Gizeh, they numbered some 2,000 and the Bey al-Alfī in Upper Egypt had some 500 Mamlūks. Ṭāhir Pasha was preparing to march against them with an army some 5,000 strong and was accompanied by a flotilla of river gun-boats.[82] And what the British had feared most, came to pass: Straton's mission had failed, Egypt was on the brink of civil war, the government was extremely weak, the country practically defenceless against outside aggression . . . and the date of the peace conference was irrevocably approaching.

The civil war really broke out within a short time, but the policy of the British Government did not change: it remained on the positions of a search for reconciliation between the Sublime Porte and the Mamlūks. An agreement was not to be

---

[78] Lord Covan's notes relating to various matters, from his discussion with the Beys, Jan. 24, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 69, p. 171.

[79] Beys to Stuart, Jan. 27, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 72, p. 177.

[80] Straton to Elgin, Jan. 29, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 75, p. 185.

[81] Bey Ibrāhīm to Stuart, Jan. 29, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 74, p. 179.

[82] Straton to Elgin, Jan. 29, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 76, p. 186.

arrived at on the basis of removing the Beys from Egypt, but on the basis of Hutchinson's plan. The British Government saw no contradiction between achievement of this goal and the return of Egypt to Turkey, because it looked at the issue through the prism of its own imperial interests.

It was to be expected that the French Government would try to exploit the situation to draw political capital from it, argumenting that France had occupied Egypt in order to protect Turkish interests against the Mamlūks, while the rebelling Mamlūks take support in British help. It was up to Elgin to dispel any such suspicions in the Porte. Shortly after, George III sent a reply to Salīm III on which he insisted that ". . . it has never been Our intention to interfere in the internal affairs of Egypt, except in as far as respects the fulfilment of engagements which may have been contracted in Our name, but to leave it in all other respects absolutely and entirely at Your Majesty's disposal".[83] The aim of this letter was to indicate that Great Britain, despite its engagement to return Egypt to the Ottoman Empire, considered it imperative to settle the Mamlūk question on the basis of their continued presence in Egypt and not their removal from the country as the Porte desired.

The last stage in the series of mediations for an acceptable solution of the Egyptian question in accordance with Britain's imperial interests was Stuart's mission. In case this failed, it was practically certain that Egypt would fall a prey to anarchy or civil war. According to the terms of the Treaty of Amiens, the British Government was bound to withdraw its forces from Egypt and hand the country over to the Turks. Britain's insistence on a renewal of mediation was dictated by the urgency to arrange affairs in Egypt prior to a definite evacuation of the expeditionary force.[84] It was necessary to find means to meet three goals simultaneously, viz. to fulfil the obligation towards the Porte (return of Egypt), while preserving "British honour" and also make good the promises made to the Mamlūk Beys.

General Stuart held the following views on the setlement of the Egyptian question: to confide the government of the country to the Mamlūks with the proviso that they would pay a higher tribute to the Sublime Porte than in the past, the guarantor being Great Britain.[85] Stuart saw quite a number of advantages in such an arrangement, e.g. averting the civil war, strengthening the defence capacity of Egypt, ensuring British influence in the country, being some of the major ones. As a matter of fact, it was expected that following the evacuation of British troops, the Mamlūks would start fighting to drive the Turks out of Lower Egypt.[86] The setting up of a Mamlūk government in accordance with the British conception was held to prevent civil war and be an assurance of protection and promotion of British interests.

---

[83] George III to Salīm III. Ibid., Doc. 85, p. 217.

[84] Hobart to Stuart, May 10, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 104, pp. 240—242.

[85] Stuart to Hobart, April 29, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 98, pp. 233—234.

[86] Shukrī, Muḥammad Fuād: op. cit., p. 121; also Cavan to Hobart May 5, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 99, p. 234.

The British Government accepted Stuart's plan and gave him instructions which stated that: "...you have been selected... for the purpose of endeavouring to effect an amicable arrangement between the representatives of the Ottoman Government in that country and the Beys".[87] Although there existed real danger that all efforts at settling the conflict might fail, yet there was also hope of achieving agreement. The mission was to remind those concerned that if no agreement is reached through Britain's mediation, the conflict between the Turks and the Mamlūks, once the British are out of the country, would turn into a war of extermination which will only bring destruction to both parties.

Stuart reached Istanbul on July 19, 1802. The Sublime Porte naturally rejected all the British proposals and insisted on its standpoint expressed in its note sent to Straton:[88] not to permit under any circumstances restoration of their property to the Beys, nor their former power, for that would mean a revival of indefinite difficulties for the Empire. If the Mamlūks decide to fight, they will be exterminated in armed conflicts. If they leave Egypt peacefully, they will be granted amnesty, honourable functions and annuities in some other part of the Ottoman Empire.[89] Commenting Turkish policy in Egypt, Straton wrote that the Beys' persistent presence in Egypt was counter to the Porte's power interests.[90] The only way to a reestablishment of peace — according to Straton — was the liquidation of one of the rival parties, and consequently Stuart's mission was doomed to failure.

Before leaving Istanbul, Stuart was given an accompanying letter by the Porte for the Viceroy in Cairo, Khusraw Pasha, which contained its standpoint towards the question of the Beys.[91] The Sublime Porte empowered Khusraw to ensure safe-conduct to the Beys — if they agree to the conditions, and give them the necessary travelling papers. After the Beys had left, he could accept the remaining Mamlūks for service in the army. Explaining the causes of the failure of his mission in Istanbul, Stuart wrote that it had been an error not to have conditioned the departure of British soldiers by an agreement between the Mamlūks and the Turks.[92] Nevertheless, he remained an optimist and when leaving Istanbul, he hoped to be more successful in Egypt.

By the time Stuart disembarked in Alexandria on August 27, 1802, the situation in Egypt had considerably changed. The Mamlūks, retreating into Upper Egypt, on seeing the determination of the Porte to exterminate them at every cost, turned

---

[87] Hobart to Stuart, May 10, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 104, pp. 240—242.
[88] Porte's Note to Straton, May 8, 1802. Ibid., Doc..109, pp. 245—248.
[89] Straton to Hawkesbury, Aug. 3, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 119, p. 262.
[90] Ibid., pp. 261—263.
[91] Qā'immaqām Pasha to Khusraw, July 30, 1802, Ibid., Doc. 120, pp. 263—265.
[92] Stuart to Hobart, Aug. 17, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 126, pp. 272—274.

round and marched northwards towards Cairo. In several violent battles they defeated the Ottoman army, inflicted heavy losses on it and forced it to retreat.[93]

Stuart became aware that if his mission was to succeed, he would have to adjust his steps to the new situation. It was now clear to him that the Beys would not agree to their departure from Egypt on which the Porte insisted with such vehemence. He informed Lord Hobart regarding the new development,[94] and that same day also wrote to Reis Effendi that in view of the prevailing situation, the proposals for ceding Upper Egypt to the Beys would be a more appropriate base of agreement.[95] Khusraw, despite defeats of his armies, refused all the proposals for agreement. It was quite clear to Stuart that the Beys would not negotiate any more regarding their departure from Egypt, and on the other hand, that the Turkish dignitaries would conceal the true state of affairs from the Porte. He saw that the Sublime Porte was determined to enforce its designs through force of arms, as was evident also from the landing of some 6,000 Albanian soldiers at Abū Qīr and Rosetta and the arrival of a further contingent of 8,000 soldiers from Syria to Damietta during the course of August and September 1802.[96] Stuart's position became complicated also by Lord Cavan's resignation from the post of commander of the British expeditionary force in Egypt. He sent details on the events to Lord Elgin,[97] leaving to him the duty of carrying on further negotiations with the Porte in Istanbul. Following Cavan's departure from Egypt on October 10, 1802, General Stuart became the commander of the expeditionary force. He asked from his Government new instructions in keeping with the new conditions.[98]

Such was the situation when Sébastiani came to Alexandria.[99] His mission and the announced arrival of the French Consul Drovetti were to Stuart visible evidence of aggressive intents of the French towards Egypt. Expressing his conviction that the French intend to renew their positions and influence, he pointed out that while they will have to start building up those positions, a simple hint from his Majesty's Governemnt would suffice for Egypt to fall into British hands.[100] Stuart wished his Government to force the Porte to accept the British proposals, by postponing the date of evacuation of the British from Egypt until they be accepted. But in view of French diplomatic activity and the intransigeance of the Sublime Porte in the question of the Mamlūks, the British Government gave orders for evacuation,[101]

---

[93] Stuart to Hobart, Aug. 28, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 129, pp. 276—277.
[94] Stuart to Hobart, Sep. 3, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 130, pp. 277—278.
[95] Stuart to Reis Effendi, Sep. 3, 1802, Ibid., Doc. 131, pp. 278—279.
[96] Stuart to Elgin, Sep. 29, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 133, p. 282.
[97] Ibid., p. 283.
[98] Stuart to Hobart, Oct. 19, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 148, pp. 297.
[99] Stuart to Hobart, Oct. 16, 1802, Ibid., Doc. 146.
[100] Stuart to Hobart, Oct. 18, Ibid., Doc. 146, pp. 293—295.
[101] Hobart fo Stuart, Nov. 26, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 170, pp. 338—339.

with the justificatory argument that as Stuart's mission had failed, further stay of the British army in Egypt lacks all legal basis.

As France wished to regain its former influence in the area of the Mediterranean and Levantine ports, it succeeded in embodying in Article 4 of the Preliminaries of Peace, the formulation that Great Britain is forbidden to prolong the stay of its units in Egypt. Napoleon thereby wished to disrupt British plans for winning over the Mamlūk Beys, fearing lest a strenghtening of British influence would damage his designs. At the time before the conclusion of the Treaty of Amiens, Napoleon supported even the total expulsion of the Beys from Egypt, so that the Porte would have an opportunity of creating a strong "Ottoman" government.[102] He hoped that if he succeeded in winning the Porte's friendship, such a government would protect French interests. That is the reason why he sent colonel Horace Sébastiani to Istanbul with a letter for Salīm III. [103]

In conversations with Reis Effendi and members of the Ottoman dīwān, Sébastiani pointed to the dangers to which the Ottoman Empire was exposed in Egypt. Reis Effendi asked Sébastiani that at the peace conference at Amiens, France would devote appropriate attention to this question and back up the Sublime Porte in its efforts at a total liquidation of the Mamlūks' power and their definitive expulsion from Egypt. An agreement was reached on the formulation of the relevant article as it should be embodied in the text of the peace treaty.[104]

However, Napoleon's attitude towards the Mamlūks gradually altered and the above article did not appear in the definitive wording of the peace treaty. Following the signing of the peace treaty, Napoleon insisted on its immediate implementation, i.e. on forcing the British propmtly to evacuate their forces from Egypt and further places which they occupied in the eastern Mediterranean. He felt sure that he would easily renew good relations with the Mamlūks and that he would be to rely on them in reinforcing French influence and extending French commerce. Expulsion of the Mamlūks from Egypt ceased to be his aim, quite the contrary, France also began to persuade the Sublime Porte of the necessity to come to terms with the Beys. Napoleon's interest in this issue might perhaps be explained by the fact that he followed the activity of the British in Egypt in expectation of a new war.[105]

Napoleon's stand towards Egypt — even after the peace conference of Amiens — remained essentially passive and did not go beyond the framework of interest in details of the development of the situation. True, he gave the Beys promises to mediate their return to their former power positions, but did not allow himself to be

---

[102] Shukrī, Muḥammad Fuād: op. cit., p. 146.

[103] Ghorbal, Sh.: op. cit., p. 146.

[104] Douin, G.: *L'Egypte de 1802 à 1803*. Publications spéciales. Le Caire, Société royale de géographie d'Egypte 1925. Doc. 2, p. 3 (Sébastiani's report on trip to Istanbul).

[105] Broke out in May 1803. Taken over from Manfred, A. Z.: *Napoléon Bonaparte*. Bratislava, Pravda 1974, p. 382.

drawn into any concrete action. That is to say, such an action would of necessity have been aimed against the Sublime Porte's interests and Napoleon was anxious to prevent at all cost that in case of a new war, Turkey would side with his enemies. He confined himself to cautioning the Porte concerning the danger that threatened her in Egypt from the British side

Following the conclusion of the Treaty of Amiens, diplomatic relations were reestablished between France and the Ottoman Empire and already in March 1802, General Brune was named to be the new Ambassador in Istanbul.[106] In autumn of that same year, Napoleon decided to send again Sébastiani to the Near East in order to convince himself how the British implemented the peace treaty.[107] Having also commercial interests in view, he named the citizen Drovetti, a judge of Turin, to be France's commercial attaché in Alexandria.[108]

The instructions which Napoleon gave to Sébastiani make clear his desire to speed up evacuation of British troops from Egypt and to win over the sympathies of the Mamlūk Beys, but in a manner not to arouse the anger of the Porte. In other words, Napoleon wished to mediate an agreement between the Sublime Porte and the Mamlūks in order to be able to rely on the latter — once they attained power — in extending and consolidating commerce and French political influence in Egypt.[109]

Sébastiani arrived in Alexandria on October 16, 1802, and immediately despatched a letter to the commander of the British expeditionary force, General Stuart, as a "plenipotentiary minister for the Levant" with the request for a meeting. During the course of the meeting Sébastiani asked an explanation why the British, in contradiction of the peace treaty, were still in occupation of Egypt and what reasons prompted them to protract this occupation. He stressed that Napoleon unconditionally insisted on compliance with treaty obligations and desired an immediate departure of British armies from Egypt. Stuart replied elusively that the delay need not evoke any fears, nevertheless, he admitted that he had as yet received no instructions regarding their departure, but that he assumed that the British army would leave Egypt only after the conclusion of a commercial treaty between Great Britain and France. Sébastiani was satisfied with this reply and considered his task — to become acquainted with British designs in the question of occupation — to be completed.[110]

That same day Sébastiani had a meeting with the Governor of Alexandria Khūrshīd Pasha and Qapūdān Bey, commander of Ottoman naval forces in

---

[106] Brune was later raised to the rank of Marshall.

[107] Bonaparte to Talleyrand, Aug. 29, Douin, G.: op. cit., Doc. 4, p. 5.

[108] Arrêté, Saint-Cloud, 28 vendémiaire an XI (Oct. 20, 1802). Douin, G.: op. cit., Doc. 6, p. 8.

[109] Horace Sébastiani, Chef de brigade du 9 régiment de dragons et envoyé du Premier Consi ، dans le Levant, au Ministre des Relations extérieures, 28 vendémiaire an XI (Oct. 20, 1802). Douin, G. op. cit., Doc.7, p. 8.

[110] Stuart to Hobart, Oct. 18, 1802. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 146, p. 294.

Alexandria and informed them of the arrival of the French commercial attaché. Both were happy at this news and did not conceal their ill-will at the persistent presence of the British. Sébastiani assured them that "the terms of the peace treaty do not allow the British to prolong their stay any longer".[111]

On October 20, Sébastiani, accompanied by officers of the frigate that had brought him in, set out for Cairo. Along the way he followed the state of fortifications and "spoke with shaykhs and other prominent personages in towns through which he passed: everywhere he met with admiration and respect for France".[112] During his meeting with the Viceroy Khusraw Pasha in Cairo on October 27, Sébastiani conveyed to he Napoleon's wish to ensure peace and prosperity to Egypt: for that reason Napoleon had empowered him to offer his services to the Pasha in mediating an agreement with the Mamlūks. Khusraw politely declined the offer stating that the instructions he had from the Sublime Porte bound him to carry out a war of extermination against the Mamlūks and do not permit him to enter into any negotiations with them. Sébastiani pointed to the defeats of the Turks in recent fightings and the poor moral state of the Ottoman army and cautioned that a determination to continue the struggle with the Mamlūks would lead to the loss of Egypt.[113] Ultimately both came to the conclusion that negotiations on these issues have to be carried out in Istanbul. The following days Sébastiani made a thorough "sightseeing tour" of Cairo and its environs, on September 2, made a farewell call on Khusraw and the next day sailed from Bulāq to Damietta, whereby his mission to Cairo was accomplished. At Damietta he received a letter from al-Bardīsī to which he gave immediate reply with the explanation that he was unable to resolve the conflict between the Turks and the Mamlūks in Cairo, and the question must be negotiated in Istanbul, adding that Napoleon would do all he could to help them.[114]

Sébastiani's mission in Cairo and the friendly reception he was officially given on the part of Khusraw, provoked considerable uneasiness among the British,[115] for they crossed their plans and frustrated their efforts for these two reasons: a) they underlined the demand that the British, should, in accordance with the terms of the peace treaty, immediately leave Egypt and b) they showed French efforts at renewing commercial relations and thereby strengthening their influence in Egypt, and efforts at winning the Mamlūks to their side.

Sébastiani's report on his official journey was published in France.[116] It described his activities, his meetings with the shaykhs, the misunderstanding between Stuart

---

[111] Rapport de Sébastiani au Premier Consul, date présumée (janvier 1803). Douin, G.: op. cit., Doc. 8, p. 14.

[112] Ibid., p. 17 (complete report, pp. 11—26).

[113] Ibid., p. 19.

[114] Ibid., p. 25.

[115] Stuart to Elgin, Nov. 25, 1802. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc.161, p. 326.

[116] Published by "Moniteur", 10. pluviôse an XI (Jan. 31, 1803).

and Khusraw and contained important details on the state of fortifications, garrisons and arms. Concerning the armed forces, he wrote that the Turks have some 16 thousand men in Egypt, the majority of whom are Albanians under the command of Ṭāhir Pasha, adding that it is hardly possible to call these forces any army, for the soldiers lack arms, have no proper organizations, and the men have no confidence in their officers and commanders: they expend their energy and strength in crimes and debauch. The commanders differ in nothing from the soldiery in their complete ignorance of even elementary principles of military art and strategy. Their only interest is how to rake in money quickly and get rich so as to be able to spend their old age in peace and security. British forces were said not to exceed 4,500 men; they occupied Alexandria and the surrounding fortresses, of which, however, they took no care at all. The Mamlūk army was given as counting some 300 Mamlūks and some 7,000 Bedouins, commanded by Beys al-Bardīsī, Ibrāhīm and al-Alfī. They also have an artillery unit — 24 Frenchmen who stayed in Egypt following the evacuation of the French army. The Mamlūks are in full control of Upper Egypt and the population prefers them to the Turks. They have beaten the Turks in all the battles thus far. To conquer Egypt, a contingent of 6,000 French would be fully sufficient.[117]

Sébastiani's report provoked a great commotion in all the political circles, particularly in London and in Istanbul. And especially in the latter town it became the subject of commentaries of all the diplomats. General Brune wrote that all of them pick out proofs from the report in order to convince the Sublime Porte of "France's evil intentions" towards Egypt. Brune was obliged to explain and contradict these views, but all to no avail. The report convinced everyone that France intended to attack Egypt once more.[118]

At the time when the British Government issued instructions for evacuating Egypt, Stuart had already had occasion to make contact with the Beys proceeding into Lower Egypt. The Mamlūk army counting some 2,000 men and 4—5 thousand Bedouins were encamped not far from Damanhūr.[119] Bey al-Alfī paid a visit to Stuart and informed him that despite Mamlūks' victories, their situation was becoming critical, for because of the incessant fighting, they could not make up for the losses in men and material. In the name of the Beys he again asked Stuart to intervene on their behalf with the Sublime Porte.[120] Stuart was in an awkward position, for his instructions did not permit him to undertake anything whatever, on the other hand, Khusraw declared that he was strictly forbidden to negotiate about the Mamlūks or with them even though they would stand at Cairo's gates. He sent a further proposal to Khusraw for a cessation of the fighting as a first step towards a peaceful settlement.

The proposal for this truce, however, arrived too late: two armies were converging

---

[117] Sébastiani's report to the First Consul, Jan. 1803. Douin, G.: op. cit., Doc. 8, p. 26.
[118] Brune to Talleyrand, 19. ventôse an XI (March 10, 1803). Douin, G.: op. cit., Doc. 20, p. 39.
[119] Stuart to Elgin, Nov. 14, 1802. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 155, p. 317.
[120] Stuart to Brownrigg, Nov. 24, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 168, pp. 336—338.

on the Mamlūks — one commanded by Yūsuf Bey, the other by Muḥammad Alī. The strategic target of the operation was to encircle Damanhūr where the main body of the Mamlūk troops were encamped and to deal them a decisive blow. The battle took place on November 21, 1802. Yūsuf Bey made a violent attack, but the Mamlūks were too experienced to be caught napping: they made excellent use of the terrain, of the moment of surprise and also of their cavalry. They "parried off" the brunt of the attack and then went into a counter-attack. The battle ended in a crushing defeat of the Turks.[121]

In the view of many contemporaries, the battle near Damanhūr meant the beginning of a period when Muḥammad Alī designedly exerted an influence on events in Egypt.[122] It appears evident that had he taken part in the battle, its outcome would have been different. He refrained on purpose from joining in the battle in order to save the Mamlūks from certain defeat. He was led to adopt this line of conduct by a conviction that Khusraw was incapable of coping with the situation: he had to contest for power with the Mamlūks, and on the other hand, he could not command obedience of officers and soldiers demanding pay, for his treasury was "bare". He judged that it would prove more opportune to him if, instead of sharing in the liquidation of the Mamlūks, he allowed the struggle for power at this stage to be decided in Cairo, for he clearly saw how this match of strength should end.[123]

Al-Alfī brought a letter to Stuart signed by Beys Ibrāhīm and al-Bardīsī, in which the Beys assured him that despite their victory over the Turks, they wished to come to an agreement with the Sublime Porte and asked for his mediation.[124] They empowered al-Alfī to agree to a settlement which Stuart might achieve on their behalf. Having no instructions, Stuart did not dare to take a decisive standpoint, whereby he probably missed the last real possibility of achieving a peaceful settlement for which he had tried so hard. He considered it his duty to inform Elgin of the latest development in the situation,[125] and consequently sent his aide-de-camp Lord Blantyre to Istanbul to brief him in detail. In the instruction which he gave him, he stressed the urgency to settle with the Sublime Porte the question of the Beys who "are ready to accept any conditions barring expulsion from Egypt".[126] Stuart did not omit to write to the Grand Vizier regarding Blantyre's mission to Istanbul, which meant "... to inform Elgin in detail regarding the situation in Egypt". At the same time he asked the Grand Vizier to exert his influence to stop the fratricidal struggle and bring about a peaceful settlement of the conflict.[127]

---

[121] Missett to Stuart, Nov. 22, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 165, p. 331.

[122] Shukrī, Muḥammad Fuād: op. cit., p. 21.

[123] Ar-Rāfiī: op. cit., Part 2, pp. 298—299.

[124] Beys to Stuart, Nov. 21, 1802. Douin — Fawtier-Jones: op. cit., Doc. 164, pp. 329—331.

[125] Stuart to Elgin, Nov. 21, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 161, p. 326.

[126] Stuart's Instructions to Blantyre, Nov. 21, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 162, p. 327.

[127] Stuart to the Grand Vizier, Nov. 26, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 171, pp. 339—240.

When the news of Khusraw's meeting with Sébastiani reached Istanbul, the Sublime Porte became visibly apprehensive. It was not difficult to guess at the designs France had in view when Sébastiani in the name of the First Consul offered mediation for a settlement of the conflicts between the Turks and the Mamlūks. The Porte realized that the internal affairs of Egypt had to be settled as early as possible. It was under the impression that a rapid evacuation of the British army would free its hands and permit it freely to act in Egypt.

Negotiations that led to an agreement regarding the settlement of the Egyptian problem between Great Britain and the Ottoman Empire were initiated in Istanbul on December 19, 1802. Reis Effendi tried to influence the British stand by pointing to France's interest in re-establishing Mamlūks' power, referring in this to the results of Sébastiani's mission and statements made by Napoleon himself, that he intended to utilize his influence for a return of power to the Beys in Egypt. Elgin made use of the opportunity and asked that a peaceful agreement be concluded between the Turks and the Mamlūks on the basis of British proposals, that would mar all efforts at a renewed influence of France in Egypt.[128]

The arrival of Lord Blantyre at Istanbul[129] speeded up the conclusion of the agreement. Blantyre confirmed that the French were endeavouring to intervene into Egyptian affairs and, consequently, Elgin insisted that the agreement be concluded before the arrival of the French Ambassador to Istanbul. The next round of negotiations took place on January 3, 1803, and the Sublime Porte under the pressure of the circumstances, agreed to leave the Mamlūks in Egypt. The Turkish reasons for acceding to this settlement may be summarized as follows : 1) to get rid at all cost of the British occupation army ; 2) to preclude French intervention in favour of the Mamlūks ; 3) to gain timer for a definitive liquidation of the Mamlūks.

In this light, Turkish readiness to compromise was but a tactical maneuvre and Reis Effendi presented it as a toleration of promises given by British officers to the Beys and by which the British Government felt bound in some measure. He declared that the Sublime Porte authorized the Mamlūks to stay in Egypt, set apart for them the Asuan province and decided to double the income that had originally been promised them "... on condition of their remaining quiet and not interfering in the Government of the country..."[130] He further stated that "... it was an arrangement made exactly corresponding with the desire of the Beys themselves, which had been transmitted by them in the form of a petition to the Grand Vizier by General Stuart".[131] The Sublime Porte refused to leave the whole of Upper Egypt to the Beys

---

[128] Memorandum form Lord Elgin's meeting with Reis Effendi, Dec. 10, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 179, pp. 347—350.

[129] Elgin to Hawkesbury, Dec. 24, 1802. Ibid., Doc. 182, p. 352.

[130] Minutes of the Conference held with the Reis Effendi, on the January 3, 1803. Ibid., Doc. 185, pp. 355—356.

[131] Ibid., p. 356 (Stuart's letter to the Grand Vizier referred to — see note 127).

in order to maintain its control over the way of access to the port Qusair near the Red Sea. Elgin did not insist on ceding the whole of Upper Egypt to the Beys principally because Stuart in his instructions to Blantyre had written that the Beys would accept any settlement as long as they would not be asked to leave Egypt.

Finally, on January 5, 1803, Elgin received a note that the Sublime Porte will cede the revenues of the Asuan Province to the Beys instead of the incomes which it would have paid them and will lower their annual tribute.[132] When the French Ambassador Brune arrived in Istanbul on January 6, 1803, the agreement had already been signed.

It is of course clear, that the concessions made by the Sublime Porte had been dictated by the Mamlūks' recent victories and this quick agreement was in its eyes a mere truce, a pause in the exterminating fight against the Mamlūks. The Sublime Porte made a virtue out of necessity and presented its weakness as a piece of good will to come to an agreement taking into consideration "engagements" on the part of Great Britain. In reality, it was anxious to get rid as fast as possible of the British occupation army and avoid complications that would certainly have sprouted if the French Ambassador had found that he still had a possibility of interfering into the internal affairs of Egypt in favour of the Mamlūks.

The Sublime Porte officially informed the British Government of the conclusion of the agreement;[133] at the same time, the Grand Vizier sent new instructions to Khusraw, and in a letter to Stuart,[134] expressed his wish that he would acquaint the Mamlūk Beys with the agreement.

Lord Blantyre returned to Alexandria on March 3, 1803, and submitted a detailed report to Stuart on the agreement of January 3—5, 1803. Stuart was well aware that the choice of the Asuan Province which has but a narrow strip of fertile land between the western bank of the Nile and the desert, to be ceded to the Mamlūks, was but a further proof of the dishonest intentions on the part of the Sublime Porte. He declined "the honour" to present this agreement to the Beys and on March 11, 1803, sailed away from Alexandria. The following day also the British units embarked for home. Stuart left in Egypt only a small group under the command of Major Missett who had to employ all his influence to mar French contacts with the Turks and the Mamlūks. In his instructions he also recommended him not to get mixed up in conflicts between the Turks and the Mamlūks and not to meddle in their internal affairs, unless he gets instructions on the matter from London.[135]

The responsibility of the failure of Stuart's mission and for the devolopment of the

---

[132] Porte's Note, Jan. 5, 1803. Ibid., Doc. 186, p. 357.

[133] The Grand Vizier to Hawkesbury, January 1803. Ibid., Doc. 191, pp. 368—373.

[134] The Grand Vizier to Stuart, January 1803. Ibid., Doc. 192, pp. 373—376.

[135] Stuart to Missett, March 8, 1803. Douin, G.: *L'Angleterre et l'Egypte. Vol. II. La politique mameluke (1803—1807).* La Caire, Doc. 2, p. 2.

situation lay, to a great extent, with the British Government. Instead of utilizing the victories of its armies to arrange conditions in Egypt, as desired also by commanders of the expeditionary force, with a view to the tense international situation, the British Government confined itself to giving recommendations to the Sublime Porte which, naturally, just ignored them. The Sublime Porte succeeded in exploiting the conflicting interests of France and Great Britain at the peace conference in order to be released of its obligations towards its ally, Great Britain, and to enforce its own settlement of the Egyptian question. The British considered the agreement of January 3—5, as their failure and therefore they focused on extending direct contacts with the Mamlūks.

The aims of British and French policy towards Egypt differed essentially: while the British Government wished to have an assurance that following the evacuation of its troops Egypt would be capable to defend its territory and ward off every new aggression, the French — from the time of the conclusion of a preliminary peace treaty with the Ottoman Empire — strove to renew their commercial relations with Egypt and win political influence in order to be able to mar the designs of the British in the region.

Under the circumstances, the French could not be the carriers of an active policy towards Egypt because the Egyptian question was to them of secondary importance: their efforts were concentrated on gaining supremacy on the Continent and achieving a decisive victory over England. Carriers of an active policy in Egypt were the British, who strove to set up a strong, stable government in that country, one that would be capable to foil an eventual new aggression from France. British policy in the Near East — determined by efforts not to permit a threat to Britain's "vital interests" (principally India) — gradually turned indirectly against the Ottoman Empire which, through its inner weakness, did not provide guarantees that it could successfully defend its possessions.

French policy towards Egypt, limiting itself to mere promises, to feigning of good intentions and to repeating of phrases of devotedness, friendship and Napoleon's affection for the Mamlūk Beys — hence, essentialy passive — had no prospects of success. As a matter of fact, at that time Napoleon saw no real possibility of conquering Egypt a second time and thus, he confined himself solely to a destruction of what the British laboriously tried to build and to patch up. Yet, despite that, the Beys did not break completely their relations with French agents, for a spark of hope still glowed faintly in them that Napoleon might, after all, intervene in their favour with the Sublime Porte for a return of their former property and privileges.

But neither did the British policy — even though active — achieve its aim, and this despite numerous plans of British diplomacy in Istanbul and Cairo for setting up a firm government with the Mamlūks at its head, capable of defending Egypt against the French. Therefore, the British gradually came to the view that an indispensable measure would be to intensify direct contacts with the Mamlūks.

ON THE GENESIS AND FORMATION OF NATIONAL HISTORIOGRAPHIES IN THE COUNTRIES OF SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA, 1945—1975

VIERA PAWLIKOVÁ-VILHANOVÁ, Bratislava

This contribution seeks to reflect the tremendous upsurge of historical research and writing in some countries lying to the south of the Sahara Desert from their meagre origins after World War II to the unparalleled growth of African historical studies between 1960 and 1970s. By combining a historical narrative with an analysis of main contributions of African historians to the development of African historical studies, it attempts to trace the genesis and evolution of some African national historiographies and to outline some of the basic trends and distinctive developments of African historical tradition in West Africa.

Any attempt to analyse the genesis, development and nature of African historical studies since World War II must be an act of presumption and selection. The sheer amount of historical research and writing in African countries makes any analysis a tremendously difficult task.

The emergence and formation of historical studies in countries of sub-Saharan Africa is a relatively new phenomenon closely related to the rediscovery and decolonization of African history through an elaboration of a new approach to the study of African past, one that would be diametrically different from any previous presentation marked with Eurocentric and racist tendencies. The change of intellectual climate which has facilitated the increase of scholarly interest in African history, owed much to the change in the political situation of sub-Saharan Africa. The general development of academic interest in Africa in the period after 1945 and the political emancipation of Black Africa were closely connected. The political independence of many African countries in the late fifties and early sixties led to a rediscovery of African history and played a crucial part in the development of African historical studies in emerging independent African states. In connection with the current of decolonization, the history of Black Africa was fully rehabilitated as an academic discipline, elevated to a fully academic status, recognized as a university speciality and chairs dedicated to African history were established in universities in Europe, America, and last but not least in Africa itself.[1] Revolution in

---

[1] *The Historian in Tropical Africa.* Studies presented and discussed at the Fourth International African Seminar at the University of Dakar 1961. Edited with an introduction by J. Vansina, R. Mauny

the study of African history in the last thirty years or so, and especially the tremendous upsurge of historical research and writing in the countries lying to the south of the Sahara, have led to an enormous increase in African publishing and, above all, to the successful development of schools of historical scholarship within Africa itself. Actually, the dialectical connection between political and academic developments can be clearly distinguished in most African countries. Since their birth in the period following Wold War II until the end of the seventies, African historical studies have passed through profound changes and made a tremendous qualitative and quantitative progress in Africa.

Many aspects of the genesis and formation of African national historiographies have not been adequately studied as yet. Considerable attention to a systematic study of this important phenomenon has been devoted by Soviet Marxist historiography of Africa. In addition to partial studies, Soviet historians of Africa have presented the results of their systematic efforts in an excellent team work *Istoricheskaya nauka v stranakh Afriki,*[2] which was a pioneering synthesis. In this collective work, a team of authors from the Soviet Union and the GDR, noted for their knowledge of particular areas and periods of African history, have joined forces to present a detailed survey of the growth of a tradition of historical research and writing in the countries of sub-Saharan Africa. This work contained an appraisal of the origins of historical tradition in the works of African amateur historians, a clear, concise discussion of the writings and arguments of the main African scholars in the growth of African historical studies and an outline of some of the basic trends in the development of African historical studies in different parts of the continent. The recent new monograph on the process of formation of national historiographies in the countries of sub-Saharan Africa from the pen of D. P. Ursu,[3] only goes to underline the standing interest and significance of the study of this topic. Both Soviet works paid great attention to ideological struggle in the study of African history, to the influence exerted on African historical studies by Western historiography of Africa and Marxism, and to the perspectives opened to progressive historical studies in different African countries. Some research has been carried out on this subject in other European socialist countries.

The present study should be considered as an "interim" report on the ongoing

---

and L. V. Thomas. London, Oxford University Press for the International African Institute 1964; Ranger, T. O. (Ed.): *Emerging Themes of African History.* Proceedings of the International Congress of African Historians held at University College, Dar es Salaam, October 1965. Nairobi, East African Publishing House 1968; Fyfe, Ch. (Ed.): *African Studies Since 1945. A Tribute to Basil Davidson.* London, Longman 1976.

[2] *Istoricheskaya nauka v stranakh Afriki* (Historical Studies in African Countries). Moscow, Nauka, Central Department of Oriental Literature 1979.

[3] Ursu, D. P.: *Sovremennaya istoriografiya stran tropicheskoi Afriki 1960—1980* (Contemporary Historiography of Countries of Tropical Africa 1960—1980). Moscow, Nauka 1983.

research in this field. It makes no claim to complexness. It has rather for aim to provide information on the birth and basic developmental trends of the formation of historical studies in some countries in West Africa — both Anglophone and Francophone, and on key problems and issues which at one stage of the development of African national historiographies formed the subject matter of historical research and writing,and to outline the principal directions followed by the different emerging national historiographies of West Africa since the end of the fifties till the end of the seventies. Limitations of space and time prevented this author from attempting an appraisal of the origins of historical tradition in the works of African non-professional historians. It is only a modest attempt to trace the growth of a tradition of professional historical research and writing in some countries of West Africa and to present a classification of basic methodological trends and schools during the period in question. In an effort to confront the specific features in the development of historical research and writing in Africa with the trend in the rest of the world, African historical scholarship is assessed against the background of the struggle between the two opposing ideologies, Marxist and various non-Marxist concepts, and all African theoretical concepts and hypotheses are tested against the Marxist-Leninist theory of the development of mankind and the growing influence of the ideas and methods of historical materialism. The aim is to present a number of factors characteristic of the formation of African national historiographies, and through an understanding of the issues involved, to arrive at a certain systematic classification and developmental assigning of the profiling signs of the developmental process, outlining also their correlations with the development of international Africanist historical scholarship.

A growth of political consciousness in African colonies following World War II, an intensifying national liberation movement and an upsurge of African nationalism induced among African intellectuals — historians, sociologists, ethnographers, philosophers, scholars and artists generally — efforts at coming to know and rehabilitate African history and culture, their own cultural values, on which it would be possible to build a national awareness and pride. The fate of national African historiographies in sub-Saharan Africa was closely linked with the struggle of African intellectuals for overcoming backward or reactionary notions from the colonial times about Africa as a continent without its own history and culture, for national liberation, cultural emancipation of Black Africa and enfranchisement from its spiritual dependence on European culture and history. It was a struggle marked by search for its own identity and an effort at expressing its individuality in relation to the outside world. Decolonization of African history proved to have been a factor of extraordinary importance in creating a national consciousness and an ideology of a national liberation movement in the struggle for doing away with the direct colonial rule of imperialism.

After achieving political independence, practically all the African countries began

to devote special attention to promoting and deepening of national awareness, pride and consciousness as part of the so-called spiritual decolonization. Hence, in the second stage of the national liberation movement, after achieving political independence, African historical science served the tasks of a social and national consolidation and found a wide field of application in the complex of an ideological influencing of the masses at large according to the political orientation of the various countries.[4] African past came to be an important source of national pride in which the African régimes then in power sought support for their policies and that explains why African historical writings focused principally on topics which — as African historians asserted — were relevant to the spiritual needs of their nations and significantly contributed to their "cultural" nationalism. One feature figuring in this motivation was the stress laid on the educational importance of history. The newly-emerged African states set before their young, evolving historical scholarship the task to examine primarily such topics as would be likely to arouse a feeling, a sense of national pride, solidarity and unity in the population, particularly among the young. Among priority tasks, pride of place went to a reconstruction of their glorious precolonial past and the fates of eminent personages in African history such as rulers of precolonial African empires and leaders of the anticolonial resistance.

---

[4] In his opening speech to the International Congress of African Historians held at University College, Dar es Salaam, in October 1965, the President of Tanzania, Mwalimu Julius Nyerere, stressed "Africa's need, and interest in Africa's history". According to him, "a knowledge and understanding of African history is important for the growth of our continent", "Our present-day attitudes and reactions cannot be properly understood without reference to the economy, social organization and religious basis of the society of fifty years ago; and so on back through time. But equally, I believe that great light can be thrown on the recent past, and then backwards, by an understanding of the aspirations and attitudes of present-day Africa". See R a n g e r, T. O. (Ed.): *Emerging Themes of African History*, op. cit., pp. 1—6; "L'histoire africaine doit être une source d'inspiration pour les générations qui montent, pour les politiciens, les poètes, les écrivains, les hommes de théâtre, les musiciens, les savants de toutes sortes et aussi tout simplement pour l'homme de la rue. . . Cette Histoire, elle sera écrite surtout par des Africains qui auront compris que les gloires comme les misères de l'Afrique, les heurs comme les malheurs, les fastes comme les aspects populaires et quotidiens constituent tout ensemble un terreau substantiel dans lequel des nations nouvelles peuvent et doivent puiser des ressources spirituelles et des raisons de vivre", quoted from K i - Z e r b o, J.: *Histoire de l'Afrique noire. D'Hier à Demain*. Paris, Hatier 1972, pp. 30—31. See also K i - Z e r b o, J.: *L'Histoire, Levier fondamental*. In: Présence Africaine, 1961, No. 2, pp. 144—147 and his *Histoire et conscience nègre*. In: Présence Africaine, 1965, No. 16, and *Enseignement et culture africaine*. In: Présence Africaine, 1961, No. 36. These problems were discussed by other African historians, e.g. I k i m e, O.: *History and the Problems of Nation-Building: The Nigerian Situation*. In: Nigerian Libraries. Bulletin of the Nigerian Library Association, *9*, 1973, No. 3; A j a y i, J. F. A.: *History in a Developing Society*. Congrès International des Africanistes. Deuxième session. Dakar, 11—20 Décembre 1967. Paris 1972; B i o b a k u, S.: *Les responsabilités de l'historien africain en ce qui concerne l'histoire de l'Afrique*. In: Présence Africaine, 1959, No. 27; A c h u f u s i, M.: Devoirs et responsabilités des historiens, Ibid; O g o t, B. A.: *Historians and East Africa*. In: *Africa Discovers Her Past*. London 1970.

"Revolution in the research of African history" over the past 25—30 years resulted in an immense promotion of historical research and writing in African historical studies in the various countries of sub-Saharan Africa. The achievement of independence and the consequent radical, nay revolutionary changes in the political, social and cultural development of sub-Saharan Africa ushered in optimum conditions also for the advancement of historical studies. During this relatively brief span of time, African historical studies have passed through deep and revolutionary changes and achieved an enormous qualitative and quantitative growth.

One of the weighty initial deficiencies of historical studies in Africa was a total lack of basic heuristic and material works and editions of documents, which in other historiographies had appeared already in preceding centuries. African historical studies had no such works at their disposal and had to create them "on the way". The results of extensive researches in this branch of African studies permitted to set up entire systems of basic concepts on the historical development of the African continent and to make the primary source materials available to others. Collection of oral historical traditions and their analysis, extensive archaeological research and utilization of ethnographic, anthropological and linguistic studies, and even of notions provided by non-social sciences gradually led through Africanization of African history to its decolonization and to a novel interpretation of pre- but also colonial history.

In an effort at "decolonizing" African history, African historians carried out also a decolonization of the source base, brought in a new factographic and source material and on this basis endeavoured to present a new interpretation of facts and a new explanation of historical phenomena and events, to reject and refute all Eurocentric conceptions, falsifications of African history and false treatment and presentation of the historical process on the African continent. The progressive development of African historiography, however, may not be seen to reside exclusively in an uncovering of new sources and facts, for it is simultaneously characterized by an elaboration and improvement of historical conceptions and the processing of new theoretical conclusions. For the most part, African historians set themselves, and dealt with methodological and theoretical problems within the process of some concrete work with their own historiographic materials. A glance at past African production reveals that much has been achieved in both these fields and that the positive gains in the factographic component had not been marred by any backwardness in analysis and generalization of facts, although African historians, despite their proclaimed "African approach" to an interpretation of the historical development on the African continent, have not as yet arrived at a unified conception regarding the historical development and methodology of historical studies.

By the selection of topics and the mode of their processing, African historiography has made striking progress also along the professional line. Positive results have been

achieved in all the periods of history, although African historians have attained the greatest success in their surveys of Africa's precolonial history thanks to their exploitation of new types of sources, particularly oral historical traditions. In the domain of precolonial history, they examined in particular questions relating to the origin of states and statehood in Africa, researched the socio-economic and socio-political structures of African societies in the precolonial era, problems of slavery and the slave-trade, precolonial commerce and trade routes, etc. New methodological or working premises yielded positive results also in the solution of such recurring topics and key issues in African history as are those of colonialism, its impact, with all the relevant aspects, and also of anticolonialism — the anticolonial and national liberation movements. It is easily understood why the very course of history which, in the late fifties and early sixties, had led to a political emancipation of African nations and to a national liberation revolution in South Africa and Guinea-Bissau against the last forms of colonial rule, should have directed historians-Africanists' interest to the process that had elicited these changes on the African continent. The rise of African nationalism following World War II and the continued decolonization of Africa since the end of the fifties have provoked a new approach to the study of colonialism and the national liberation struggle.[5] This new presentation of African history during the past thirty years has resulted in a diametrically opposite assessment and interpretation of colonialism — its nature, its place within a broader context of African history and its impact on African societies — and also of anticolonialism — the diverse forms of African anticolonial struggle and African reactions to colonial conquest and to the colonial reality in all its complexity.[6]

Historians of Africa from practically the whole world, representing various schools of thought, took part in the Africanization of African history, in the elaboration of a new view of this history. Hence, African historical studies present a perceptible thematic and methodological polarization corresponding to different political and ideological persuasions and commitments of the authors. For the sake of convenience, present-day African historiography might be divided into two parts: works written by Africans themselves, and those from the pen of historians of non-African origin. Among these, African historians came to represent a steadily growing group

[5] *Emerging Themes of African History*, op. cit., Introduction, pp. 14—15, 17—18.

[6] See Zotova, Y. N.: *Problems of History of Colonialism and National-Liberation Movement in the Journal of African History (1969—1970)*. In: *Africa in Soviet Studies*. Annual 1972. Moscow, Nauka 1975, pp. 222—231. Cf. with Ajayi, J. F.: *Colonialism: An Episode in African History*. In: Gann, L. H. — Duignan, P. (Eds.): *Colonialism in Africa 1870—1960. Vol. 1. The History and Politics of Colonialism 1870—1914*. London, Cambridge University Press 1969, pp. 497—508; Ajayi, J. F. A.: *The Continuity of African Institutions under Colonialism*. In: *Emerging Themes of African History*, op. cit., pp. 189—200; Lonsdale, J.: *The Emergence of African Nations*. Ibid., pp. 201—217; Boahen, A. A.: *The Colonial Era: Conquest to Independence*. In: *Colonialism in Africa 1870—1960. Vol. 2. The History and Politics of Colonialism 1914—1960*. London, Cambridge University Press 1970, pp. 503—524.

and their attitudes, views, approaches began more and more to influence and direct the development in African historical research and the present and future lines of study and interpretation of African history. A review of historical writing and research for the given period in Africa goes to show that emerging historical studies on this continent play a role of growing significance in the development of African historiography.

Nevertheless, not even these African historians are unified either ideologically or methodologically. Their methodology, world outlook and the consequent methodological approaches to African history have been considerably influenced by their training. The great majority of African historians of the first generation had studied at West-European and American universities and still maintain strong contacts with Western — British, American and French — Africanist scholarships. This has led some Western Africanists to assert that "the new Western historiography of Africa will have much in common with African historiography" and that "African historical studies in Europe and America are concerned with the same issues and approaching them from the same angles as African historical studies in Africa".[7]

Western and African historians studied in common at universities, they participated in common research projects and published team works. African historical writings gradually passed from a descriptive, fact-summarizing stage, to a higher one, to an elaboration of a synthesizing, complex view of the history of the African continent. This process in which an extraordinarily significant role has been played precisely by African historians of Africa, is culminating at the present time in a gradual publication of the *General History of Africa*, in eight volumes, under the aegis of UNESCO. This work is to be the most complete synthesis of the existing system of notions and of the contemporary state of our historical knowledge of the history of the African continent as a whole, from the remotest past down to the present, a picture of Africa's historical evolution as seen primarily by Africans themselves. The concept involved in this collective work of enormous importance clearly shows the priority of African scholars in the scientific research in the field of African history.[8] Today, universities and departments of African history exist in practically all the African countries. African historians are organized in the Association of African Historians, founded at a congress of the historians of Africa in December 1972 in the capital of Senegal, Dakar. Its aim is to coordinate research in the field of African history. Since 1973, this Association publishes its own journal

---

[7] See Oliver, R.: *Western Historiography and Its Relevance to Africa.* In: *Emerging Themes of African History*, op. cit., pp. 57—58, X—XI.

[8] The UNESCO project of a General History of Africa was discussed by the present author in Pawliková, V.: *Problémy africkej historiografie* (Problems of African Historiography). In: Historický časopis, *23*, 1975, No. 4, pp. 543—565, esp. pp. 563—565.

entitled Afrika Zamani, in the capital of Cameroon, Yaoundé. Historical scholarship in Africa is showing steady progress from the professional aspect, with an increasing number of professional historians and improvement of their professional training.

The origin and development of national African historiographies was not, and naturally could not be uniform, nor did it proceed at an equal pace, all of which, resulting as it did from the socio-historical conditionedness of the various countries, is just inconceivable. The standard of social development in these countries is far from uniform, the process of social differentiation is growing and so do also class contradictions. The scientific research base of African historiographies is being extended, which is taking place under constantly growing social antitheses and sharper class struggle. It may essentially be said that three principal historical schools have been formed in African historical studies, where one may roughly distinguish East-African from West-African historical studies and, within the latter, to differentiate between historical writings by authors writing in English and those writing in French. A special chapter is represented by South-African historiography written under conditions of a political and racial oppression which does not favour the development of its own historical studies. The above factors — linguistic and geographical — are but formal, external manifestations of deeper, inner disparities between African — Anglophone and Francophone — historical writings conditioned primarily by different historiographical traditions prevalent in the region with which the historical studies took contact and on which they drew, and which ultimately led to methodological divergences in an approach to a study of the African past. A detailed treatment of the basic trends in the formation of national historiographies in various parts of Anglophone and Francophone Africa would go beyond the framework of this paper; moreover, this aspect is dealt with in more detail in certain Soviet works.[9] Differences among the various historical schools refer to their theoretical and methodological approach to some of the problems of African history, to the assessment of the world historical process and Africa's role in it and also to the choice of themes as such. As a rule, African historians cannot be said to be moved by clear-cut, crystallized political or ideological principles, and although they frequently stress their independence from political and ideological trends and advocate a specific African approach to African history and its new interpretation, they make up a fairly heterogeneous group and often stand for rather divergent and even

---

[9] See e.g. Kochakova, N. B.: *Problemy kolonializma i antikolonialnoi borby v istoriografii angloyazychnykh stran Tropicheskoi Afriki* (Problems of Colonialism and Anti-Colonial Struggle in Historiographies of English-Speaking Countries of Tropical Africa). In: *Problemy kolonializma i stanovlenie antikolonialnykh sil* (Problems of Colonialism and the Formation of Anti-Colonial Forces). Moscow, Nauka 1979; Ursu, D. P.: *Stanovlenie Natsionalnoi istoriografii v strankakh Tropicheskoi Afriki* (Formation of National Historiography in Countries of Tropical Africa). In: Voprosy istorii, *8*, 1979, pp. 70—84.

opposite views on some of the points referred to above, i.e. methodology, view of the world historical process and Africa's role in it. Perhaps the single factor uniting them was their nationalism, their patriotism. Although African historical studies in the Anglophone and Francophone parts of Africa were faced at their birth with identical problems — i.e. positively to prove the existence of African history and revaluate Africa's role in the world historical process and her contribution to the history of mankind — the results achieved so far permit to make out certain differences. Essentially, it may be said that historians from Anglophone Africa inclined rather towards partial topics, towards a detailed reconstruction of history of definite ethnical groups, traditional African societies and states in concrete historical periods, while those from the Francophone regions, grouped around the journal Présence Africaine, placed right from the beginning into the forefront of interest the question of the content of African past and of an overall apprehension of development of African nations; they gave proof of efforts at elaborating a synthesizing, global conception of the history of the African continent as a whole, or at least the history of a greater cultural-historical entity, efforts at proving Africa's cultural advancement and a genetic link between Black Africa and the authors of ancient civilizations, primarily ancient Egyptians, Sumerians and Assyrians. This division is, of course, a very relative one and does not exclude interest on the part of Francophone historians in partial problems and topics, and vice versa, interest in general views in Anglophones. A typical representative of the above trend was the Senegalese author Cheikh Anta Diop who through his works, such as Nations Nègres et Culture, Afrique Noire Pré-Coloniale, Antériorité des Civilisations Nègres: Mythe ou Vérité Historique? etc., exerted a significant influence on the formation of West-African Francophone historiography. In these, Diop endeavoured above all to present his own conception of the historical development of the African continent and to throw light on the problem of genesis of African cultures in relation to the culture of ancient Egypt.[10] He set down and dealt with four basic circuits of questions which were picked up and were further studied in Francophone African historical writings of the sixties and seventies:

1. Formulation of an overall conception of historical development of Black Africa in close relationship with tabling and processing of methodological and theoretical questions;

2. Method of collecting and utilizing various historical sources to the history of

---

[10] Diop, Ch. A.: Nations Nègres et Culture. Paris, Prèsence Africaine 1955; Diop, Ch. A.: Antériorité des civilisations nègres: Mythe ou vérité historique? Paris 1967; also his Unité culturelle de l'Afrique Noire. Domaines du patriarcat et du matriarcat dans l'antiquité classique. Paris 1959; Afrique Noire pré-coloniale. Paris 1960; Apports et perspectives culturels de l'Afrique. In: Présence A ricaine, 1956, No. 8—10, pp. 339—346; L'Unité culturelle africaine. In: Présence Africaine, 1959, No. 24—25, pp. 60—65, and Histoire primitive de l'Humanité: Évolution du monde noir. In: BIFAN, 24, Sér. B, 1962, No. 3—4.

Africa, primarily oral historical traditions, and reports and testimonies of ancient authors;

3. Research into the history of African cultures and contacts between ancient Egypt and Black Africa;

4. Research into socio-economic and socio-political structures of African societies in the precolonial era and their impact on the contemporary development of African countries.

African Francophone historical production is too abundant and since the second half of the fifties it progressed too profusely to permit a thorough analysis in this brief review. This paper shall be restricted to an enumeration of the most outstanding works and names which show best the trend along which Francophone African writings proceeded during the past two to three decades.

One of the great methodological milestones in emerging African national historiographies has been the growing recognition in the utilization of oral historical evidence in historical research. Francophone historians, similarly as their Anglophone colleagues, devoted considerable care to problems of collecting, storing and utilizing African oral and written sources, to principles of a critical approach to the utilization and evaluation of oral traditions, and to the establishment of a chronology on the basis of purely oral traditions, etc. Large-scale projects were set afoot, particularly in connection with the preparation of the eight-volume *General History of Africa* under the auspices of UNESCO. This gave rise to the problem of a new interpretation of existing sources, long known and utilized before. The methodological and theoretical aspects in the utilization of African sources, particularly oral ones, were chiefly dealt with by Joseph Ki-Zerbo from Burkina Faso and Théophile Obenga from the People's Republic of Congo.[11] Engelbert Mveng from Cameroon, on the contrary, was concerned with a systematic advancement of a further category of sources to African history, viz. to reports and testimonies by ancient authors.[12]

As intimated by the very titles of his works, Théophile Obenga, following Ch. A. Diop's lead, likewise investigated cultural contacts between ancient Egypt and

---

[11] Ki-Zerbo, J.: *La tradition oral en tant que source pour l'histoire africaine*. In: *La tradition orale. Problématique et méthodologie des sources de l'histoire africaine*. Niamey 1972. See also his *Histoire de l'Afrique Noire*. Introduction, op. cit. Obenga, T.: *Méthodologie en Histoire Africaine: Source locales*. In: Africa, Roma, *25*, 1970, No. 4.

[12] Mveng, E.: *Les sources de l'histoire Africaine: Agatharchide de Cnide*. In: Présence Africaine, 1965, No. 55; *Les sources de l'histoire Africaine. II. Homère*. In: Présence Africaine, 1966, No. 60; *Les sources antiques pour l'histoire de l'Afrique Noire*. Dakar 1967; *Dossier culturel pan-africain*. Paris 1966. Mveng has also written a number of important works on African art and African culture such as *L'Art de l'Afrique Noire*. Paris 1964; *L'Art africain d'hier et l'Afrique d'aujourdhui*. In: Présence Africaine, 1963, No. 46; *Structures fondamentales de l'art négro-africain*. In: Présence Africaine, 1964, No. 49; *Panafricanisme et culture*. Paris 1965.

Black Africa, and Diop is also the author of a Preface to Obenga's greatest work *L'Afrique dans l'antiquité. Egypte Pharaonique — Afrique Noire.*[13]

A characteristic trait of the great majority of historians engaged in research into the socio-political and economic structures of African societies was a categorical denial of the existence of antagonistic classes and of exploitation in the relations of traditional African societies. A diametrically opposite attitude in this point was expressed by another Senegalese historian, P. Diagne, in his book *Pouvoir politique traditionnel en Afrique Continentale. Essai sur les institutions Précoloniales*, which strikingly differs from the rest of writings on this issue and in fact ushered in a new approach to or a new stage in Francophone African historiography.[14] This work represents an interesting attempt at an elaboration of a typology of social structures in precolonial West Africa and testifies to the spread and deeper impact of fundamental Marxist teachings on African historical studies. A certain evolution of views on this topic may also be noted in Ch. A. Diop's later works,[15] and the influence of Marxist theory on social development is likewise apparent in Joseph Ki-Zerbo's conception.[16] An attempt at applying Marxist-Leninist theory of social development in the role of a methodological and general theoretical basis for an explication of the historical development of Africa was also made by another Senegalese author M. Diop. In his early work, *Contribution à l'étude des problèmes politiques en Afrique Noire*, M. Diop reproduced commented views of classics of Marxism-Leninism on problems of social development as applied to African experience.[17] He saw the causes of Africa's backwardness to reside in three factors:

---

[13] Obenga, Th.: *L'Afrique dans l'antiquité. Egypte Pharaonique — Afrique Noire.* Paris 1973. See also his *L'Afrique dans l'antiquité.* In: Présence Africaine, 1969, No. 72; *Africa in Antiquity.* In: Africa Quarterly, *18*, 1978, No. 1, pp. 5—19; *Contribution de l'Egyptologie au développement de l'Histoire Africaine.* In: Présence Africaine, 1975, No. 94; *Méthode et conception historique de Ch. A. Diop.* In: Présence Africaine, 1970, No. 74; *Les 20 ans de "Nations Nègres et culture" (1954—1974).* In: Présence Africaine, 1974, No. 89. Obenga has also produced some regional studies such as *Le Royaume de Makoko.* In: Présence Africaine, 1969, No. 70; *Le Royaume de Kongo. I. Peuples et entités politiques en présence.* In: Africa, Roma, *24*, 1969, No. 4 and *Le Royaume de Kongo. II. Le kikongo: fondement de l'unité culturelle.* In: Africa, Roma, *25*, 1970, No. 2, etc.

[14] Diagne, P.: *Pouvoir politique traditionnel en Afrique Occidentale. Essai sur les institutions politiques précoloniales.* Paris 1967. Also his *Contribution à l'analyse des régimes et systèmes traditionnels en Afrique de l'Ouest.* Im: BIFAN, *32*, Sér. B, 1970, No. 3.

[15] Diop, Ch. A.: *Histoire primitive de l'Humanité: Évolution du monde noir*, op. cit., pp. 3—4; also his *Antériorité des civilisations Nègres: Mythe ou vérité historique?* op. cit., pp. 90—92. Diop's views are analysed in a great detail by the Soviet Africanist L. E. Kubbel in his study *Dokolonialnaya Afrika v trudakh Sh. A. Diopa* (Precolonial Africa in Ch. A. Diop's Works). In: Sovetskaya Etnografiya, *4*, 1969.

[16] See Hrbek, I.: *African History as a Field of Ideological Struggle.* In: *Theories of Non-Marxist Socialism in African and Arab Countries.* Prague, Academia, Dissertationes Orientales, *38*, 1978, pp. 160—176.

[17] Diop, M.: *Contribution à l'études des problèmes politiques en Afrique Noire.* Paris 1959.

in Africa's isolation from the rest of the world, in slavery and slave-trade (he probably has in view primarily the latter), and in imperialism. He developed his view on the class character of precolonial African societies in a greater depth of insights in his second work *Histoire des classes sociales dans l'Afrique de l'Ouest. 1. Le Mali; 2. Le Sénégal.*[18] Of interest to the issues followed here, is especially the second part of the work in which the author devoted attention to the role of Islam at the time of the colonial expansion and shortly before. In his interpretation, Islam in Africa was patriotic and nationalistic, it was an ideology of anticolonial struggle and resistance, an "ideology of social liberation". Similarly as the majority of West-African historians, M. Diop assesses Islam in a very positive manner.

M. Diop, P. Diagne, T. Obenga or the historian from Niger Boubou Hama — author of the work *The Gao Empire. History, Customs and Magic of the Songhai*[19] — have ranged themselves, by part of their works, behind the trend that might be termed "general methodological and theoretical", but simultaneously they were also representatives of the movement concerned with a research of the historical development of definite African societies, or of certain regions during the precolonial era. Practically all the prominent historians of Francophone Africa were also authors of works devoted to a reconstruction of precolonial history of a given ethnic group or region.[20] Boubou Hama, already mentioned, and the Mali historian Amadou Hampaté Ba, author of a two-volume history of the Fulani State in Masina,[21] are great connoisseurs of oral traditions and performed a tremendous piece of work in their collection and publication. Boubou Hama pursued also the study of theoretical and methodological questions of historical research which he propounded in his work *Research of the Basis and Genesis of African Unity.*[22] This work shows most clearly the eclecticism so typical of African historians grouped around the journal Présence Africaine. Hama here spoke clearly of the need for authors to distance themselves from all ideologies and to preserve the specificity of the African continent, its world outlook and its right to choose its own way, of the

---

[18] Diop, M.: *Histoire des classes sociales dans l'Afrique de l'ouest. 1. Mali; 2. Le Sénégal.* Paris 1971—1972.

[19] Boulnois, J. — Hama, B.: *Empire de Gao. Histoire, coûtumes et magie des Sonraï.* Paris 1954; also *L'Empire Songhay: Ses ethnies, ses légendes et ses personnages historiques.* Paris 1974 and *L'Esprit de la culture sonraïe.* In: Présence Africaine, 1957, No. 14—15; *Contribution à la connaissance de l'histoire des Peul.* Paris 1968.

[20] Niane, Dj. T.: *Recherches sur l'Empire du Mali au Moyen Age.* In: Recherches Africaines, 1959, 1960, No. 1—4; Diagne, P.: *Royaumes Serères. Les institutions traditionnelles de Sine-Saloum.* In: Présence Africaine, 1965, No. 54; Cissoko, S. M.: *Traits fondamentaux des sociétés du Soudan Occidental du XVIIIe au début du XIXe siècle.* In: BIFAN, *31*, Sér. B, 1969, No. 1; Mveng, E.: *Histoire du Cameroun.* Paris 1963.

[21] Ba, Hampaté A. — Daget, J.: *L'Empire Peul du Macina.* Paris 1962.

[22] Hama, B.: *Enquete sur les fondements et la genèse du l'Unité Africaine.* Paris 1966.

need to seek for some sort of a third road for Africa. An endeavour to emphasize the exceptionality of the historical development of the African continetnt, of the "African way of development" and to set it apart from the history of the rest of the world, was also apparent in other conceptions, although less prominently. These and similar views betray the influence of the cultural and political movement called Négritude and the overall orientation of Francophone African historians and intellectuals associated with the journal Présence Africaine.[23] The conceptions stressing the specificities of the African historical development and refuting the existence of antagonistic classes, class relations and exploitation in precolonial African societies simultaneously deny the possibility of applying the Marxist theory of social development to Africa. This fact also is underlined by prominent ideologists of diverse variants of African socialism, such as e.g. Léopold Sédar Senghor, the former Tanzanian president Julius Nyerere, and others.[24] The influence of similar notions may also be noted in the periodization of African history as attempted by the Congo historian Théophile Obenga in his works *Esquisse d'une morphologie de l'histoire africaine*,[25] and in the successful attempt — the second after Diop's — at a synthesizing view of the history of the Black Continent from the earliest times up to the present, from the pen of Joseph Ki-Zerbo.[26]

The above enumeration of the most important names and works goes to show that historical studies in Francophone African countries devoted minimum attention

---

[23] Philosophical and ideological sources of Négritude are analysed by Klíma, V.: *Politics and Poetry — the Subjects of Senghor*. In: *African Culture and Integration*. Dissertationes Orientales 36. Prague, Academia 1976, pp. 46—81. The influence of Négritude on historians from Francophone African countries is critically examined by Kubbel, L. E.: *Istoricheskaya nauka v Verkhnei Volte, Gvinee, Kamerune, Kongo, Mali, Nigere, Senegale* (Historical Studies in Upper Volta, Guinea, Cameroons, Congo, Mali, Niger, Senegal). In: *Istoricheskaya nauka v stranakh Afriki*, op. cit., pp. 25—83 and Hrbek, I.: *African History as a Field of Ideological Struggle*, op. cit., pp. 161—172.

[24] Senghor, L. S.: *Nation et voie africaine du socialisme*. Paris, Présence Africaine 1961; Senghor, L. S.: *Négritude et humanisme*. Paris 1964; Nyerere, J. K.: *Uhuru na Umoja* (Freedom and Unity), 1967; also his *Uhuru na Ujamaa* (Freedom and Socialism), 1968 and *Ujamaa: Essays on Socialism*, 1969.

[25] Obenga, Th.: *Esquisse d'une morphologie de l'histoire africaine*. In: *Présence Africaine*, 1972, No. 83. His periodization of African history was based on two principal theses: the historical development of Africa and of Europe were diametrically different, and there was a direct continuity between the culture of ancient Egypt and contemporary African cultures. See Kubbel, L. E.: *Istoricheskaya nauka v Verkhnei Volte, Gvinee, . . .*, op. cit., pp. 53—54.

[26] Ki-Zerbo, J.: *Histoire de l'Afrique Noire*, op. cit., Introduction. *Les tâches de l'histoire en Afrique*, esp. pp. 25—31 — Les cadres géographiques, Les cadres chronologiques, La conception de l'histoire. See also Kubbel, L. E.: *Istoricheskaya nauka v Verkhnei Volte, Gvinee. . .*, op. cit., pp. 48—56, cf. with Hrbek, I.: *African History as a Field of Ideological Struggle*, op. cit., pp. 172—176. While Ki-Zerbo in his earlier works has to some extent still overestimated the geographical factors and had been an adherent of geographical determinism, in his later work, the Introduction and Conclusion to the First Volume of the *UNESCO General History of Africa*, Paris 1975, he launched a sharp critique against geographical determinism and showed a very positive evolution towards historical materialism.

at the given period to the theme of colonialism and anticolonialism, and in fact there existed practically no work by Francophone African historians, either material or theoretical, specifically devoted to this topic. An exception were relevant chapters in the work already referred to: History of Black Africa by Joseph Ki-Zerbo, or History of West Africa by the Guinean historian Djibril Tamsir Niane and the well-known French Marxist historian J. Suret-Cabale, written as textbooks for middle schools, or the History of West Africa from the pen of S. M. Sissoko.[27]

Ki-Zerbo elaborated his own periodization of African history, drawing attention also to the uneven nature in the historical development of the African continent which makes periodization a difficult task. His concept derives from the dynamism of African development and underlines the motive forces in the evolution of mankind, particularly the socio-economic factors. His periodic division of Africa comprises six principal stages — Paleolithic civilizations, characterized by a leading role of Africa; the Neolithic revolution and its consequences (the demographic factor, population migration, etc.); the Metal revolution or a transition from a kin group structure to kingdoms and empires; centuries of adjustment; the first contacts with Europe, the slave trade and its consequences (15th—19th cent.); European colonial expansion and African reactions until national liberation movements during the period following World War II; the period of independence and its problems.[28] In conformity with the prevailing trend in African historiography, Ki-Zerbo devoted no more than thirty odd pages to the years 1900—1945 (the book counts 700 pages besides picture supplements) and to the entire twentieth century up to the achievement of independence only a little over one hundred pages of printed text. In a special chapter he also paid attention to problems facing independent Africa. In Chapters 9 and 10, characteristically entitled: L'Afrique arrachée aux Africains, and L'Age d'or des étrangers, he outlined the history of European colonial expansion and imperialist partition of Africa from the African viewpoint. Though he did not ignore the methods and practices employed by the various colonial powers on occupied territories, yet his interest lay primarily in the African side of the story, how the European impact acted on African societies and what changes it wrought among them. In the chapter devoted to colonial occupation and African anticolonial resistance, he pointed to the psychological aspects of African resistance, criticizing the view according to which all patriotic feeling and emotion were foreign to Africans and underlined the fact that anticolonial and national liberation movements had

---

[27] Ki-Zerbo, J.: *Histoire de l'Afrique Noire*, op cit.,; Niane, J. T. — Suret-Canale, J.: *Histoire de l'Afrique Occidentale.* Paris, Présence Africaine 1961; Cissoko, S. M.: *Histoire de l'Afrique Occidentale.* Paris, Présence Africaine 1967; Assoi Adiko, Clerici, A.: *Histoire des Peuples Noirs.* Paris, Ceda 1963.

[28] Ki-Zerbo, J.: *Histoire de l'Afrique Noire*, op. cit., Introduction, Les cadres chronologiques, pp. 26—27.

existed in Africa without interruption in various forms from the very beginning of colonial expansion until the achievement of independence.[29]

Towards the end of the sixties, but particularly in the seventies, conformably to the overall trend in African historiography, interest in problems of the anticolonial resistance and protest became aroused also in Francophone African historians. These had somewhat traditionally devoted considerable attention to the role of Islam in the history of Western Sudan and West Africa in general. This tradition was carried on also by the new generation of historians, such as Sekene-Modi Cissoko, A. Samb, A. Sylla, Cheikh T. Sy, or F. Sako, who, however, in contrast to earlier authors, e.g. B. Hama, see in Islam primarily an ideology of anticolonial resistance and social liberation.[30]

The 70s witnessed an expansion of the scientific-research base in Francophone Africa. The role played at the birth and the first beginnings of historical studies proper in this part of Africa by the journal Présence Africaine, was gradually taken over by l'Institut fondamental d'Afrique Noire at Dakar and the journal Bulletin (BIFAN) it has been editing, by the journal Notes Africaines published also at Dakar, and by new local centres of historical research, such as the National University in Cameroon, or the Institute of Human Sciences at Bamako where also the journal Etudes Maliennes has been published. The extension of the scientific research base was accompanied by a parallel extension of the themes of research by the new generation of African historians. Characteristic became an inclination towards a study of African anticolonial resistance and protest in all forms, particularly of early or primary African anticolonial resistance, but numerous works also dealt with various aspects of African secondary resistance, with the origin and development of political consciousness, of political organizations and some studies discussing problems of contemporary Africa have also appeared.[31] The

---

[29] Ibid., III. La Résistance Africaine, pp. 413—425.

[30] C i s s o k o, S. M.: *Les origines de l'«affaire» du Logo (1872—1875).* In: BIFAN, *36,* Sér. B, 1974, No. 2; S a m b, A.: *L'Islam et l'histoire du Sénégal.* In: BIFAN, *33,* Sér. B, 1971, No. 3; also his studies *Sur El-Hadj Omar (à propos d'un article d'Yves Saint-Martin).* In: BIFAN, *30,* Sér. B, 1968, No. 3; *La vie d'El-Hadj Omar par le Cheikh Moussa Camara.* In: BIFAN, *32,* Série B, 1970, No. 1—3, and *Touba et son Maghal.* In: BIFAN, *31,* Sér. B, 1969, No. 3; S y l l a, A.: *Les persecutions de Seydina Mouhamadou Limamou Laye.* In: BIFAN, *33,* Sér. B, 1971, No. 3; Sy, Ch. T.: *Ahmadou Bamba et l'islamisation des Wolof.* In: BIFAN, *32,* Sér. B, 1970, No. 2; S a k o, F.: *L'occupation de Tombouctou et la bataille de Tin-Bella.* In: Etudes Maliennes, 1970, No. 1, and Cissé, B.: *Un grand résistent malien: Fihroun.* In: Etudes Maliennes, 1974, No. 10.

[31] S i n d a, M.: *Le Messianisme congolais et ses incidences politiques. Kimbanguisme — Matsouanisme — Autres Mouvements.* Paris 1972; C h o m é, J.: *La passion de Simon Kimbangu. 1921—1951.* Bruxelles 1959; Sy, Cheikh T.: *La confrérie sénégalaise des mourides.* Paris 1969; G l é l é, M. A.: *Naissance d'un Etat noir (L'évolution politique et constitutionelle du Dahomey, de la colonisation à nos jours).* Paris 1969; T r a o r é, B.: *L'évolution des partis politiques au Sénégal depuis 1946.* In: *Forces politiques en Afrique Noire.* Paris 1966; N d i a y e, J. P.: *La jeunesse africaine face à l'imperialisme.* Paris, F. Maspero 1971, etc.

only known effort — and not very successful one — to provide a synthesizing view of African resistance to foreign domination and occupation since the earliest times up to African movements of resistance to European colonial expansion and occupation of Africa came from the pen of a historian from Burkina Faso, Nazi Boni. This work which appeared posthumously in 1971, was, despite its title, geographically restricted to the region of North and West Africa (Western Sudan) and made no attempt to offer a more analytical and comparative treatment and a theoretical assessment of the much debated phenomenon.[32]

Similarly as in Francophone Africa, also the Anglophone countries of West Africa the choice of themes reflected principal trends in African historical research and writing of the sixties and seventies. It is not the aim of the present study to analyse specific works, rather to stop by certain conceptual questions and basic trends of research into precolonial and colonial history and anticolonialism in African historical writings. It should be stressed right at the start that the theme of colonialism was listed among the key subjects of African historical research in Anglophone countries. During this period — the 60s and 70s — the study of colonialism and anticolonialism in these countries passed through a development which, in its essential traits, conformed to the fate of the entire historical studies. This was due in no small measure to the fact that African historians determining the basic trend of research, held key positions and functions in the control of historical studies as a whole. One of the most prominent African historians, Prof. K. Onwuka Dike from Nigeria, saw the role of African historians in that they would write a truly objective history of the African continent, that they would positively prove that African history is truly a history of African peoples and not that of foreign conquerors from Asia and Europe and insisted that even when portraying European contacts with Africa, they would focus primarily on the role played in them by Africans. His work *Trade and Politics in the Niger Delta 1830—1885* is a brilliant example of such a new African approach to the topic and still belongs among the best works of African historical writings.[33] Dike's work and that of his Nigerian colleague S. O. Biobaku *The Egba and Their Neighbours, 1842—1872*, were at the birth of professional historical studies in Nigeria.[34] The African approach to an interpretation of colonialism and the colonial era of African history consisted, in the first place, in a revaluation and an emphasis of the role of African peoples as the principal and active makers of history and that not only during the precolonial period, but also during the colonial domination of imperialism. The history of the colonial era began

[32] B o n i, Nazi: *Histoire synthétique de l'Afrique résistante. Les réactions des peuples africains face aux influences extérieures.* Paris, Présence Africaine 1971.

[33] D i k e, K. O.: *Trade and Politics in the Niger Delta, 1830—1885. An Introduction to the Economic and Political History of Nigeria.* Oxford, Clarendon Press, Oxford Studies in African Affairs 1956.

[34] B i o b a k u, S. O.: *The Egba and Their Neighbours, 1842—1872.* Oxford, Clarendon Press 1957.

to be presented from the African point of view, and the European impact was analysed from the aspect of its action on African societies and the changes it induced in them. Among basic topics of African historiography in the sixties were African reactions to European colonial penetration and occupation, stress being laid on African initiative throughout the colonial era. Interest in problems relating to colonialism in Anglophone countries of West Africa dates back right to the very beginnings of professional historical studies, but the main principles of approach to the study of this theme were elaborated only in the sixties. If in the mid-fifties, the African approach to colonialism in the understanding of Nigerian historians (primarily K. O. Dike's) meant signified interest in African reactions to European activities and penetration in Africa, in the sixties Dike set before historians the task to re-assess the place and significance of the colonial era within the entire context of African history.

During the second half of the sixties, the main principles of approach to an interpretation and assessment of colonialism — of its nature, its impact on Africa and its place and role within the wider context of African history became crystallized in West African Anglophone historiographies. The most eminent African historian of the colonial era, the Nigerian J. F. Ade Ajayi summarized the main principles of the Nigerian school for an interpretation of colonialism in his paper presented to the International Congress of African Historians held in the capital of Tanzania Dar es Salaam in October 1965 and in a study published in the first volume of a collective work on colonialism in Africa in five volumes.[35] According to Ajayi, two myths survive concerning African history: colonial historiography maintained and nurtured the concept of African history as a process affected solely by external interventions, the Africans created nothing positive or great, they were uniquely objects, not subjects of history and the history of Africa began only at the moment that this continent was discovered by Europe, or with the arrival of colonialism. Africa, as a continent without history, was a clean board — tabula rasa — on which colonial powers could scribble as they pleased. The opposite extreme in his view, is a nationalistically and romantically tuned conception of certain African historians and politicians who proclaim that Africa had indeed had a long and glorious past, but the relatively short colonial era was so effective that it destroyed it completely and succeeded in paralyzing the Africans. The myth about a nonexistence of African history and that about its glorious past constitute two counterpoles of the same theory of disruption, both consider the colonial era and the nineteenth century in general, to be a key point which had brought in an absolute rupture between what had been prior to the coming of colonialism and what is there today and both myths take it for granted, even though for different reasons, that during the colonial era, the

---

[35] Ajayi, J. F. Ade: *The Continuity of African Institutions under Colonialism*, op. cit.; Ajayi, J. D. Ade: *Colonialism: An Episode in African History*. In: *Colonialism in Africa 1870—1960*, Vol. 1, op. cit., pp. 497—509.

Africans were completely passive. Ajayi's own conception, on the contrary, stresses the continuity of African history, the continuity and vitality of African institutions during the colonial era. Despite all the changes that colonialism brought in in its wake in the political economic, social or cultural sphere, its impact should not be overestimated: the colonial era was but a brief episode against the background of the whole of African history. As we know more about the nineteenth century than about the preceding ones, the tendency has ensued to overestimate the range of the social and political transformations in the nineteenth century, to describe that century as one of enormous political activity on the part of Africans and this solely as an immediate reaction to European activity in Africa prior to the colonial division of the continent. Such views negate African initiative in African history. Changes were always inherent to African societies and even during the colonial era these never lost the possibility and the ability to decide on their own destiny, to adjust themselves to the altered conditions. The weightiest and most important consequence that colonialism brought in with it was the loss of political sovereignty. Hence, historians of Africa ought to concentrate their interest on "how, with what means and in what way", various African societies succeeded in surviving European occupation and adjusting themselves to the new altered conditions. Was the loss of political sovereignty totally destructive to African societies? Did they lose completely the possibility to choose what to preserve from their own culture and civilization and what to accept from the other? Ajayi set before historians of Africa the task to study how African societies reacted to the European impact, to analyse all the forms of African reactions from resistance to collaboration, but particularly African reactions to the changes ushered in by colonialism, and Africans' adaption to these changes, i.e. to follow up the policy of self-preservation during the colonial era (politics of survival on the African side) as an expression of African initiative. Within the frame of reference of this policy of self-preservation or survival, Ajayi set down the necessity to investigate the character of the inner policy of various African societies and to note how the inner political situation influenced their relation to colonialism and colonial administration, the mutual relationships among African societies, and especially how the mutual ratio of forces among them and in relation to colonialism influenced their decision to accept the latter or to resist colonial domination, to devote attention to the way Africans — both individually and collectively — reacted and adapted themselves to the new technical, cultural and other expedients.[36] Of an undeniably positive value was Ajayi's demand to study colonialism and African reactions to it within the context of African history, against the background of the preceding historical development of African societies and within the framework of a concrete historico-political situation of one or another African society. These new

---

[36] See Ajayi, J. F. Ade: *The Continuity of African Institutions under Colonialism*, op. cit., pp. 199—200.

working and methodological premises elaborated by Ajayi in his conception of African policy of self-preservation or survival opened the way for extensive research in the intentions set down above and this not solely at the Ibadan University, but also further centres of historical research, both in Africa and outside it.

Right from the start, Nigerian historians devoted maximum attention to the study and interpretation of a whole complex of problems connected with the role of colonialism and colonial régimes in setting up new strata and groupings in Africa. This attention was focused mainly on questions of genesis and formation of the so-called élite and the middle class, i.e. the intelligentsia, the Civil Service and political personalities. Being influenced by Western sociologic theories, they completely ignored the question of formation of a working class. The problem of the genesis and formation of new élites was studied in connection with an evaluation of the role and activities of Christian missions in Africa. The African approach to this interpretation resided primarily in a critique of the theses on a civilizing mission of European powers in Africa, in an assessment of the role played by Christian missions in African history and in the colonial occupation and in an analysis of the policy enforced by colonial powers in the domain of education and culture.

The most significant work on the activity of missions in West Africa again came from the pen of J. F. Ade Ajayi. He presents an analysis of the missionary activities in Nigeria and to a lesser degree also in Sierra Leone, Ghana and Dahome over a period of fifty years, from 1841 up to the imposition of a colonial régime.[37] His colleague Ayandele carried this analysis of missionary activities in the Niger up to the year 1919. Ajayi's work stimulated the East-African historian A. Temu to write a similar study on the reactions of Kenyan peoples to the activities of Protestant missions during the period 1874—1929, in which he subjected their civilizing mission among the inhabitants to a sharp criticism.[38]

Various aspects of missionaries' activities in connection with the founding of the Nigerian theatre and the setting up of higher education in Nigeria were dealt with by both J. A. Adedeji and A. Fajana.[39] In the sixties, the bearing framework was elaborated at the Univeristy of Ibadan, of the so-called Ibadan approach to a study of the system of indirect rule as one aspect of British colonial policy — a topic that had been the domain of colonial and Western historiography. The principal aim of works

---

[37] Ajayi, J. F. Ade: *Christian Missions in Nigeria, 1841—1891: The Making of a New Élite.* London, Longmans Green 1965. See also Ayandele, E. A.: *The Missionary Impact on Modern Nigeria, 1842—1914. A Political and Social Analysis.* London, Longmans Green 1966.

[38] Temu, A. J.: *British Protestants Missions.* London 1972.

[39] Adedeji, J. A.: *The Church and the Emergence of the Nigerian Theatre, 1866—1914.* In: Journal of the Historical Society of Nigeria, 6, 1971, No. 1 and Fajana, A.: *Colonial Control and Education: Development of Higher Education in Nigeria 1900—1950.* In: Journal of the Historical Society of Nigeria, 6, 1972, No. 3. See also Ekechi, F. K.: *Missionary Enterprise and Rivalry in Igboland 1857—1914.* London 1972.

on this topic was to show to what extent colonial policy changed in response to African reactions to it and to what extent it reflected its own impact on the political economic and social life of the Africans. Chronologically, the great majority of the works were restricted to the so-called Lugard period, i.e. the period from the imposition of colonial rule up the early thirties when the colonial administration undertook the first steps to reform the colonial régime. The sharpest critique aimed at the system of indirect rule came from A. E. Afigbo in his work *The Warrant Chiefs: Indirect Rule in Southeastern Nigeria, 1891—1929*.[40] In a subsequent study, included in a collective work *History of West Africa*, he criticized the surviving tendency to differentiate between British indirect rule and the practices of other colonial governments, as if Great Britain had better understood and tolerated the interests of African peoples and their social and political institutions. As a matter of fact, despite certain disparities, the colonial policy of the various colonial powers eventually led to the same result — a disruption of traditional political and social institutions and cultural values.[41] This priority interest on the part of Nigerian historians in problems of colonialism did not exclude research into precolonial history. As in the other parts of sub-Saharan Africa, so also in Nigeria, large-scale projects got under way, having for aim to publish basic sources to precolonial history of the principal Nigerian ethnic groups. A characteristic feature of such projects was an interdisciplinary approach; publications of documents comprised not only basic written sources, but also oral historical traditions and used as sources the results of archeological research, linguistic studies, art, ethnography, etc. As early as the second half of the fifties, plans were elaborated under the direction of K. O. Dike and S. O. Biobaku for a complex research of history of the whole of Nigeria, with a view to building up a source base. The plans foresaw the reconstruction of the historical development of all the regions of present-day Nigeria. From among them, mention should be made of the plan for the reconstruction of the history of the Benin kingdom from the year 1956 and the plan for research of the history of the Yoruba, of the same year, which resulted in the publication of the work *Sources of Yoruba*

---

[40] Afigbo, A. E.: *The Warrant Chiefs: Indirect Rule in Southeastern Nigeria 1891—1929*. New York, Humanities Press 1972. See also Anene, J. C.: *Southern Nigeria in Transition, 1885—1906: Theory and Practice in a Colonial Protectorate*. Cambridge University Press 1966.

[41] Afigbo, A. E.: *The Establishment of Colonial Rule, 1900—1918*. In: Ajayi, J. F. Ade — Crowder, M. (Eds): *History of West Africa*, Vol. 2. London, Longman 1974, pp. 424—483. Problems of indirect rule were also studied by some other Nigerian historians, namely Ikime, Obaro: *Reconsidering Indirect Rule: The Nigerian Example*. In: Journal of the Historical Society of Nigeria, 4, 1968, No. 3; Igbafe, P. A.: *British Rule in Benin: Direct or Indirect?* In: Journal of the Historical Society of Nigeria, 3, 1967, No. 4; Atanda, J. A.: *The New Oyo Empire. Indirect Rule and Change in Western Nigeria, 1894—1934*. London 1973. British and French systems of colonial rule were compared by Asiwaju, A. I.: *Western Yorubaland under European Rule. 1889—1945. A Comparative Analysis of French and British Colonialism*. London 1976.

[42] Biobaku, S. O. (Ed.): *Sources of Yoruba History*. Oxford, Clarendon Press 1973. See also

History.[42] Careful attention was also paid to the collection and conservation of Arabic documents and writings in various West-African languages, such as Hausa, Fulani, Kanembu, Mandingo, etc.

The second most important historiography in Anglophone West Africa, Ghanian historiography and also further historiographies of sub-Saharan Africa, followed more or less the same pattern as that in Nigeria. The principal attention was focused on the study of national history which also corresponded to the needs of the newly· emerged sovereign state which had just succeeded in liberating itself from the colonial domination. Research took as its immediate aim to reconstruct precolonial history of the entire country and the individual regions inhabited by the main ethnic groups, especially as regards the origin of the state, trade contacts and routes; the investigations also bore on traditional economics, culture, art — music, dancing, drama. Ghanian languages, traditional social and political structures of the most important Ghanian ethnic groups — the Ashanti, Dagomba, etc. A part of this research was an intensive collection and utilization of oral historical sources and existing Arab manuscripts. Among favourite topics were a reconstruction of the history of ancient African empires and the lives of famous personages in African history, of rulers and leaders.

Ghanian historians inclined towards partial themes. The major part of historical writings of the sixties and seventies consisted of works devoted to certain regions, linking a reconstruction of the political history and socio-economic structure of precolonial states with an analysis of their mutual relations with Europeans. Similarly as their Nigerian colleagues, Ghanian historians, too, strove after an African approach in the treatment of each topic; they were especially eager to show the influence exerted by the African party on the elaboration and implementation of the policy by the Europeans towards African societies. A typical example of this approach is K. Y. Daaku's monograph *Trade and Politics on the Gold Coast 1600—1720,* which shows a manifest influence of K. I. Dike's pioneering work *Trade and Politics in the Niger Delta.*[43] F. Agbodeka, too, set himself similar aims in his work on the Confederation of the Fanti in the 60s of the 19th century.[44] And this author followed up this design also in his further monograph *African Politics and British Policy in the Gold Coast 1868—1900* — viz. to study the diversity in African reactions and their influence on British policy towards this country, and within the

---

Biobaku, S. O.: *The Origin of the Yorubas.* Lagos 1960; Biobaku, S. O.: *Myths and Oral History.* In: Odu, 1955, No. 1; *The Problem of Traditional History with Special Reference to Yoruba Traditions.* In: Journal of the Historical Society of Nigeria, *1,* 1956, No. 1 and *The Yoruba Historical Research Scheme.* In: Journal of the Historical Society of Nigeria, *1,* 1956, No. 1.

[43] Daaku, K. Y.: *Trade and Politics on the Gold Coast 1600 to 1720. A Study of the African Reaction to European Trade.* Oxford 1970.

[44] Agbodeka, F.: *The Fanti Confederacy 1865—1869. An Enquiry into the Origins, Nature and Extent of an Early West African Protest Movement.* In: Transactions, VII, 1964.

context of this diversity, to concentrate particularly on one concrete reaction — movement of protest against British usurpers.[45] A work with an unusually sharp anticolonial charge was that by Ama Ata Aidoo, *The Asante Succession Crisis 1883—1888*.[46]

A leading role in the research of the colonial era belonged to Adu Boahen.[47] Boahen, in contrast to his Nigerian colleague J. A. Ade Ajayi, ascribed a great and revolutionary significance to the colonial era within the context of the historical development of the African continent. True, he did admit that, in comparison with the preceding period of independence, the colonial era lasted but a brief lapse of time, yet he held that the influence of colonialism on Africa had been stupendous in its results. Colonialism had affected Africa immeasurably more and essentially more deeply than all the other external factors and forces to which Africa had until then been exposed — the influences from Asia and Indonesia, the influence of the Romans and Carthaginians, the influence of the Arabs and of Islam, etc. The influence of colonialism was not uniform, it oscillated from region to region, affected more the coastal regions than those in the interior, urban centres more than the countryside. "By disrupting the existing political organization and setting up new independent states, colonialism engendered new classes of Africans, introduced monetary economy, and above all, by extending education and the Western (i.e. European) style of life, colonialism brought Africa on the road of development which essentially differs from the preceding types."[48] Boahen was the first African historian who attempted in this work to work out a periodization of the colonial era, which he divided into three stages:

1. The period 1874—1920 — was one of occupation of Africa by European powers.

2. The period 1920—1945 — was one of consolidation of colonial régimes in Africa.

3. The period 1945—1960 — was a classical period of decolonization, or one of transfer of political institutions into the hands of the Africans. Here he uses the term of the well-known political scientist David Apter — political institutional transfer.[49]

Boahen set out to prove that the initial period of colonialism was not one of pacification, as some Western historians of Africa have tried to present it, but

---

[45] Agbodeka, F.: *African Politics and British Policy in the Gold Coast 1868—1900*. London 1971.

[46] Aidoo, A. A.: *The Asante Succession Crisis 1883—1888*. In: Transactions, *13*, 1972, No. 2.

[47] Boahen is the author of the book *Ghana: Evolution and Change in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries*. London 1975 and other important works such as *Topics in West African History*. London 1968; *Britain, the Sahara and the Western Sudan. 1788—1861*. Oxford 1964; Boahen, A. A. — Webster, J. B.: *History of West Africa since 1800*. New York 1970, etc.

[48] Boahen, A. A.: *The Colonial Era: Conquest to Independence*. In: *Colonialism in Africa 1870—1960*, Vol. 2, op. cit., pp. 503—524, esp. pp. 523—524.

[49] Ibid., p. 503.

a period of colonial occupation and conquest during which African anticolonial resistance was totally broken, crushed. At the same time, however, the foundations of economic development and exploitation were laid down during this period, roads and railways were constructed, cultivation of export products — cacao and cotton — was introduced, and European business firms and banking societies appeared in steadily growing numbers on the African commercial field.

A characteristic feature of the second period, according to Boahen, was an endeavour on the part of colonial powers to ensure peace and order, a further development and utilization of the colonies' economic possibilities, certain social services were introduced in the health and education sectors. The methods employed by the various colonial powers to achieve these ends differed among themselves, as differed also their consequences for the African populations of the colonies. New social classes were formed — an educated African élite, hired labourers migrating from the countryside to towns, and the agricultural class — cultivators of cash crops. The third period was continuation and development of the preceding one, but differed from it in that ideas and notions came to be born in African colonies about regaining political independence.

As stressed by the Soviet Africanist N. B. Kochakova, in her stimulative study, in contrast to his Nigerian colleagues, Boahen considered changes in the socio-economic structure in African societies and national liberation movements as important factors in the historical development during the colonial era.[50] In his study *The Colonial Era: Conquest to Independence*, Boahen endeavoured to outline the principal traits of the anticolonial and national liberation movement during the interwar period and after World War II. In it he made a point of the oft neglected fact that the anticolonial protest during the interwar period had not been the domain exclusively of African intelligentsia — the educated African élite in his terminology. The dissatisfaction of the African masses found an expression in demonstrations in towns and rebellions in the countryside. All the forms of protest during the period had for aim a reform of the colonial régime, not its liquidation, and their main weakness lay in the fact that they were mutually isolated, uncoordinated, failing to establish a united front, nevertheless they built in the population a new consciousness of a common condition, interest and aim and thus transformed grievances into a mass commitment and a wholesale active participation.

Boahen rightly considered the postwar period to be a qualitatively new stage in the development of the national liberation movement. World War II affected Africa far more than World War I had done and led to a step-up of the liberation struggle and

---

[50] Kochakova, N. B.: *Istoriki-afrikantsy v angliiskikh koloniyakh Zapadnoi Afriki v 19. v. Natsionalnye istoriografii Nigerii i Ghany* (African historians in English colonies of West Africa in the 19th century. National historiographies of Nigeria and Ghana). In: *Istoricheskaya nauka v stranakh Afriki*, op. cit., pp. 84—154, esp. pp. 136—137.

a growth of political consciousness in African colonies, especially in the many thousands of war veterans who, once demobilized, took an active part in the struggle against imperialism and the colonial oppression for a total liquidation of the colonial system.

In this connection, Boahen stressed the importance of African political parties, that had mushroomed in colonial Africa between 1944—1960, as the leading force of the national liberation movements in Africa. Their formation and activities significantly contributed to the process of decolonization of Black Africa, though "The ideals of democracy, freedom and self-determination, the principles enunciated in the Atlantic Charter and embodied in the UN Charter, the formation of the United Nations itself, which provided a forum for the attacks on the colonial system and on the colonial powers — all these forces helped in shaping the future."[51]

CONCLUSION

The achievements of African historical scholarship in the study of Africa's past and the stock of results so far achieved in emerging West African national historiographies are considerable and assert to the growing centrality of African professional historians to the development of African history. Though African historians often claim independence from political and ideological trends and stress a special African approach and a new African interpretation of African history, as a group they are quite diversified. African historical studies have developed according to the different social, economic, political and cultural settings in which they have been carried out. Different, not to say, contradictory theoretical and methodological approaches can thus be distinguished among historical schools in Africa which determine the collection of data, the topics dealt with and the treatment of them. Differences among the various historical schools in West Africa and in Africa in general, refer not only to their methodological and theoretical approaches to some problems and topics of African history, but also to the assessment of the world historical process and Africa's role in it. The underlying ideology which conditions an African scholar's ideological orientation is no doubt to influence his or her choice of topic and of the methods of investigation, i.e. a particular approach to the task of collecting data, the basis and techniques of analysis and interpretation of the historical material and the logic of reasoning employed in the process of historical research and writing.

A polarization is noticeable in the African historical scholarship according to different political and ideological commitments and persuasions of the African historians. A growing trend towards radicalization of African historical scholarship can be distinguished. In the words of Ali A. Mazrui, "In the African context,

---

[51] Boahen, A. A.: *The Colonial Era: Conquest to Independence,* op. cit., pp. 512 and 517.

214

especially, there is definitely a transition under way from 'bourgeois' scholarship to radical or Marxist approaches".[52] The new generation of African historians reveal generational differences in their methodological concerns, orientations and approaches. The growing methodological orientation to Marxism is characteristic of the younger generation of African historians. Class analysis, class struggle, the study of imperialism and of African class formations, including a shift of focus from the activities of African ruling classes, leaders and élites towards masses and ordinary peoples, are now widely regarded by younger African historians as the most relevant approaches to the study of Africa's past.

Emerging African national historiographies no doubt suffer from some limitations and deficiencies but they have also achieved many noteworthy results. The main representatives of the rapidly developing West-African national historiographies have moreover during their field researches amassed a lot of valuable material and thus put our knowledge of African history on a firmer factual basis.

---

[52] Mazrui, Ali, A.: *Subjectivism and the study of current history: political, psychological and methodological problems.* In: *The Methodology of Contemporary African History. The General History of Africa.* Studies and Documents 8. Paris, Unesco 1984, p. 41.

REVIEW ARTICLE

ISLAM AND SOCIO-POLITICAL CHANGE IN TURKEY

,NAĎA ZIMOVÁ, Prague

After the national liberation struggle at the beginning of the 1920s, the newly proclaimed Turkish Republic changed the priorities of government: the abolition of the Sultanate was rapidly followed by the abolition of the Caliphate in 1924. The secular nature of the Turkish state was stressed and the principle of secularism was made one of the fundamental components of the Kemalist ideology.

The religious policy of newly established Turkish state represented, in fact, the only wide-ranging secular programme ever implemented by a Muslim country. Hence, during the period of the presidency of Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, a revolutionary series of reforms involving the Kemalist programme of secularization entailed the closing of the medresses, the establishing of a unified secular state system of education, the prohibition of the dervish orders, and the introduction of civil, criminal and commercial codes along the European lines. In 1928, the Arabic script was replaced with the Latin characters. The status of women in the Turkish society was changed. In 1934 they acquired the right to vote and to be elected to the parliament. It was after Atatürk's death in 1938 that the Turkish government began to retreat from the Kemalist programme of secularism and Islam gradually started to re-enter the public life in subsequent decades.

The recent events in the Muslim World as well as the newly emerging scholarly understanding of the socio-political dynamics of religion in general and Islam in particular have influenced the growing literature on this subject in the past few years. This short review article is intended to analyse two recent publications which, in their different ways, throw light on the aspects of the multiple functions that Islam has performed in Turkey's socio-political development.

Binnaz Toprak, in her study[1] based on a doctoral thesis submitted to the Political

---

[1] Toprak, Binaz: *Islam and Political Development in Turkey.* Leiden, E. J. Brill 1981, VII + 164 pp.

Science Department of the Graduate School and University Center of the City University of New York, examines religion and political development as interdependent variables. In other words, what Toprak is concerned with is the type of relationship of interdependence in which "religion both affects the course of political development and is affected by it" (p. 124). Raffi Pogosovich Kondakchyan's monograph,[2] elaborated on the basis of the comprehensive theory of historical materialism, is one of those historical studies which not only presents and assesses new, revealing material on little-known historical events, but systematically stresses their significance for the Turkey's present internal development.

The main concept of Toprak's study is based on a topical rather than a chronological approach. Thus, the introductory Chapter One is devoted to a theoretical analysis of the religious issue in political terms, as well as to the interaction between politics and the religious subsystem in general. Moreover, she also presents several interpretative cases of the concrete interdependence of religious and political development. These cases often exceed the Turkish context and their validity in this respect is dubious. Both authors begin with a detailed description of the history and role of Islamic institutions, and then move on to an analysis of the value structures in the socio-political sphere of the traditional Ottoman society. Kondakchyan, moreover, examines the place of the Muslim clergy during the Young Turks period and shows that despite some modernist and secularist tendencies the religious basis of the state remained untouched at that time.

Both authors are interested in the role of religion in the revolutionary mobilization of the Turkish peasantry during the national liberation struggle in the years 1919—1922. Islam has always played an important role in the social and political transformation of the majority of the Middle Eastern countries. One can find a broad spectrum of mere programmes, reform movements and political parties that seek religious motivations for their actions in this area. According to V. I. Lenin ". . . political protests in religious guise are common to all nations at a certain stage of their development...".[3] The rallying of nationalist forces against a common enemy through an emphasis on faith was a successful tactic of the Kemalist movement in Turkey, which, in its initial phases, was strongly religious in character, as well.

This tactical attitude of the Kemalists towards the Islamic religion was to some extent motivated by certain aspects of the general situation of the Turkish society at the time. Though approximately one-fourth of the members of the First Grand National Assembly were religious leaders, the entire Muslim clergy in Turkey did not support the nationalists' aim, as Kondakchyan rightly points out (p. 48). This was

---

[2] Kondakchyan, R. P.: Turtsiya: *Vnutrennyaya politika i islam* (Turkey: The Internal Politics and Islam). Yerevan, Izd. AN Armyanskoi SSR 1983, 237 pp.

[3] Lenin, V. I.: *A Draft Programme of Our Party.* In: *Collected Works.* Vol. 4. Moscow 1964, p. 243.

revealed with renewed force when the civil war between the nationalists and the so-called "Army of the Caliphate" broke out in 1920. Following the Şeyhü'l-Islam Dürrizade's fetva against the Kemalists, the nationalists launched a new revolutionary struggle in which Turkish secularism manifested itself for the first time as political force.[4]

In dealing with the problem of the Muslim faith and national consciousness among the Turks, some scholars[5] stress the commitment to secularization as an imperative for the process of modernization and national and state independence. In this line of research, Toprak discusses in the chapter entitled "Islam and Nation-Building" the incompatibility of the Islamic ideology and traditions with the interests of the Kemalist nationalists. When describing the series of secular reforms undertaken after the establishment of the Republic, she shows the secularization programme as passing through a four-phase course: symbolic, institutional, functional and legal secularization.

In the section entitled "The Religious Policy of the Turkish Government after the Establishment of the Republic and the Place of the Muslim Clergy" R. P. Kondakchyan argues that the secular nationalist ideology had left many parts of Turkey untouched, including numerous villages of east and southeast Anatolia (p. 84). In terms of the Turkish peasantry, the Kemalist secular policy was not entirely successful.

While Toprak devotes (in the final chapter) her attention to the role of Islam and the debates over secularism at both the electoral and parliamentary levels, R. P. Kondakchyan discusses in detail the policy of the Republican People's Party in religious matters and the place of the Muslim clergy after the Democrats came to power in 1950. Both of them draw attention in their own fields to the emergence of an explicitly religious party — the National Salvation Party — in recent years (i.e. after 1973).

In one way or another, both authors touch on the separation of religious and state affairs. They rightly recognize its limitations and contradictions in the Turkish context, since the religious institutions were not really separated from the state, but rather were placed under its control.[6] The elimination of the clergy from political activism did not eliminate their role as a factor of Turkish social life; instead it reduced their status and eliminated their influence in political affairs. Though in terms of the ideology of the newly established Turkish national bourgeoisie secularism played a predominant role at that time, it did not succeed in eliminating

---

[4] Jäschke, G.: *Nationalismus und Religion im türkischen Befreiungskriege*. WI, XVIII (1936), pp. 54—69.

[5] Cf. Kili Suna: *Kemalism*. Istanbul 1969, p. 84.

[6] See also Jäschke, G.: *Turecko*. Prague 1942, p. 36.

the Islamic roots from Turkish social life and culture, as I. L. Fadeeva in her review of Toprak's study rightly points out.[7]

Finally, we wish to stress that we were most impressed by both authors' conclusions: both of them emphasized that although the Kemalist secular politics had really threatened the dominant position of the value system of the traditional Islamic society, they did not succeed in creating a new overall ideological framework which could have had a decisive popular appeal, even in the countryside. Both Toprak and Kondakchyan, in different ways, show the variety of the Islamic impact on Turkey's political and social life. Moreover, they provide us with a very sober evaluation of the present-day role of religion in the Turkish society.

---

[7] See I. L. Fadeeva, the review of Binnaz Toprak: Islam and Political Development in Turkey, published in Narody Azii i Afriki, 6, 1984, p. 194.

BOOK REVIEWS

Ďurišin, Dionýz: *Theory of Literary Comparatistics*. Bratislava, Veda, Publishing House of the Slovak Academy of Sciences 1984. 334 pp.

Dionýz Ďurišin belongs among world renowned theoreticians of literary comparatistics. His very first book on comparative literature entiled *Problémy literárnej komparatistiky* (Problems of Literary Comparatistics) was characterized by Mikuláš Bakoš as not "an everyday" book of Slovak literary scholarship in 1967. That work, however, made a contribution not only to our own literature, but also to the literary scholarship on a worldwide basis. This came to be evident in the course of subsequent years when various revised versions, always improved, of the theory of literary comparatistics were successively published in German, Hungarian and Russian.

This unprecedented penetration of Slovak literary scholarship to the book market of other socialist countries was fully justified. G. Ziegengeist, a foremost literary scholar of the GDR, considered Ďurišin's book "an impulse to a further theoretical self-awareness in the domain of direction and goal" of a comparative literary investigation amog German scholars. Similarly, initiators of the Hungarian and Russian translation submitted Ďurišin's versions of the theory of literary comparatistics to their readers with like views. These versions, always originally adapted, were meant to help in deepening knowledge, mastering verified methods in investigation and leading to a mutual theoretical understanding among scholars in their study of this interliterary issue in its most diverse aspects and domains. Ďurišin's works have provided readers in various countries with a Marxist theoretical equipment, defined the object and aim of the investigation as also the methodico-methodological procedures.

In 1974, Ďurišin's book *Sources and Systematics of Comparative Literature* appeared in Bratislava in a rather restricted number of copies and solely for the

needs of an exchange service. Although far more partial than Durišin's other books (it dealt solely of certain sources of the theory of comparative literature, the methodical problems and of conditions and prospects in the development of Slovak literary comparatistics), it sprang quite a surprise among Western experts in this domain. Henry H. H. Remak wrote in Neohelicon, III, 1975, No. 3—4, p. 114: "I am very pleased to have the opportunity of stating . . . how great a respect I have for the recent works on the discipline of Comparative Literature written by Dr. Durišin. . ." Such words from a prominent representative of the American school of literary comparatistics may not be taken as a mere expression of courtesy, but in all seriousness, for they are the opinion of numerous Western comparatists. Marxist-founded comparatistics in Durišin's presentation and processing meant an unusual novum to them in that part of the methodological instruction which is termed Typological Affinities; they were further interested in the philosophical depth, systemic justification of the object and aim of literary comparatistics, very deep processing of questions relating to artistic translation as part of literary comparatistics, to the category of the particular and the general and to certain aspects of comparative analysis. Durišin even succeeded in influencing the morphologic system of wold comparatists. Some of them currently make use of such terms as "innerliterary" and "interliterary" aspects of relations as far more fitting to similar phenomena than those employed earlier in French or American schools of literary comparatistics. The work under review will certainly mean a further contribution in this domain.

The various translations into foreign languages referred to above always spelt an enrichment of the original work from the year 1967. The latter bore primarily on Slavonic literatures of the 19th century, Durišin's field of work from the 50s and 60s. The translation into German from the year 1972 provided material that was close to German literary scholars. Further books and studies, originals and translations into foreign languages meant a material, but above all a methodico-methodological expansion and deepening of the topic. However, Durišin's works were still destined to researchers from the European cultural area and to literatures from this area.

The book on the theory of literary comparatistics here reviewed is meant to fill also further functions besides those of Durišin's previous studies. It is apt to address itself to a far broader circle of literary comparatists. It will find readers practically in the whole world, as English is at present the language most commonly used among these scholars, whether working in Europe, America, Australia or also in countries of Asia and Africa. Literary scholars in developing countries have of late effectively joined in studies from a comparative standpoints and their investigation (or investigations of members of other nations and states insofar as they deal with this topic) may bring in many new aspects for a knowledge of the essence of the literary phenomenon in its broadest apprehension and widest relations of the literary process — which forms in fact the goal of literary investigation in general. Oriental

scholarships in fact dispose of the earliest literatures of all, possess an immense wealth of mediaeval literature (in contrast to European scholarship) and thus a thorough and unbiased knowledge of them may significantly enrich the world's literary theory, e.g. in the domain of poetics or genology. Ďurišin's involvement in the international comparatist life during the 60s and 70s, his interest in literary activity of the present and the past in the extra-European areas have now brought him to deal in the present book also with literatures written in extra-European languages, or to launch scientific works of a comparative nature about these literatures. In various examples, Ďurišin points to the pioneering work of Soviet orientalist scholars and literary comparatists in this field — primarily N. I. Konrad and V. M. Zhirmunsky, but also to works in Czechoslovak comparatistics, further to the most important efforts of various national associations of comparative literature insofar as they referred to studies of oriental literatures.

Another new trait in the work under review is a substantial shortening of those parts which materially went in to supplement theoretical considerations, but to the majority of readers would only mean a heavy list of foreign names and works. In this version, too, the process of development of Slovak theory of literary comparatistics remains clearly set out, showing the English-speaking world the distinctive individuality of our literature.

The author has included in this English version five totally new chapters: The Category of the Individual and the General in the Interliterary Process, Literature and Other Arts, Specific Forms of Interliterary Communities, "La Littérature Comparée", "La Littérature Générale", and The Contradictory Problems of the Theory. In these, he responds to the development of literary comparatistics of the past few years on a worldwide scale, to its achievements, but likewise to its deficiencies and errors. As a scholar, he consistently applies the principle of "feedback" to his scientific results and adjusts his views in the light of the latest, more systematic investigations.

The book under review is as yet the most thoroughly processed of Ďurišin's theoretical works. It not only represents an enrichment of Slovak Marxist comparatistics, but is also a guarantee of its propagation, and will probably win over new adherents for comparative investigation and its Marxist orientation. A slightly altered Slovak version of this work appeared in Bratislava in 1985.

It is to be regretted that a selective bibliography, an author and a subject index, present in practically all Ďurišin's books, are missing from the present one. This omission is a major drawback in this truly unusual publication to students of comparative literature.

Marián Gálik

Harris, Roy (Ed.): *Approaches to Language*. Oxford, Pergamon Press 1983. 182 pp.

In this volume published as Vol. 4 of the series Language and Communication Library, the editor has collected eight contributions in an effort to turn our attention to what is common to various disciplines engaged in the study of language. The range of questions discussed in the volume is very wide indeed, including the relation of language and speech, language as a social phenomenon and as a means of cognition as well as linguistic relativity and communicative efficiency of various languages.

In his introductory paper titled *Language and Speech* (pp. 1—15), R. Harris returns to the eternal question of the relation between language and speech. Proceeding from European tradition, he ponders over the problem of the origin of language, reassesses the content of the terms language and speech and makes an attempt at their precise delimitation. He criticizes generativists for their contribution to the perpetuation of the terminological chaos in linguistics (due to introducing the notions of performance and competence). The opposition of language and speech is discussed upon several levels. Upon the physiological level, speech is just an implementation of language because man possesses language even if he has lost his ability to vocalize. Upon the semiotic level, the configurations of acoustic signals are no manifestations of the logoid ability of man. A configuration of sounds becomes a word sentence or part of a word through its membership in the set of analogous configurations that likewise function as signs. From the point of view of this contrast, speech denotes total speech activity while language refers only to what makes this activity verbal signalization so that only a part of a speech act belongs to language while the rest belongs to speech. Upon the executive level, the sending of a message (speech) contrasts with the message itself (language). And, finally, upon the sociological level, individual verbal practices (as speech) contrast with the verbal practices accepted by the community (as language).

The author points out to inconsistencies in translating Saussure's terms language, langue and parole into English. In his opinion phonetics is part of linguistics and the contrast of phonetics versus phonology may be regarded as another manifestation of the opposition speech — language. Harris' appreciation of the written form of language departs from what is common in present-day linguistics. In his opinion, the written language cannot be characterized as secondary when compared to the acoustic language. This seems to be true of most present-day European languages as well as of many literary languages of Asia (e.g. Chinese, Japanese, Arabic). The contrast of language and speech might further be extended so as to include, e.g. potentiality — actuality, linearity — nonlinearity, etc.

F. P. Dinneen concentrates upon the analysis of the linguistic philosophy of the mediaeval Modistae (13th—14th centuries). The Modistae have set themselves the task to clarify ambiguities and to reconcile differences between the things on the one

228

hand and our ideas of them on the other. In the author's view, the teachings of the Modistae have to some extent preserved their validity till this day; analogous notions are found in the domain of case grammar. F. P. Dinneen appreciates case grammar for its ability to discover lexical and semantic gaps in language. His paper is titled *Language and Linguistics* (pp. 17—29).

J. Bruner concentrates upon an important psychological problem — that of language acquisition (pp. 31—60) and stresses the role of pragmatics in this process. Both Bruner and Dinneen appreciate the cognitive primacy of activity that has been stressed by other linguists as well, e.g. by V. Skalička. According to J. Bruner, a crucial role in the acquisition process is played by the learning of speech acts and of various types of situations. Syntactic and semantic correctness is secondary and the parents are first of all partners for their children.

D. A. Allport investigates aphasia in his article (pp. 61—94) in his attempt to find a reply to the question whether human intellectual faculties depend upon the natural language. Remarkably enough, the mental representation of written words turns out to be independent and so are word meanings. As a result, the author arrives at a conclusion that the so-called cognitive codes, i.e. deep structures are not included in the natural language. Quite the contrary, they are shared by mechanisms participating in our nonlinguistic sensoric and motoric interactions with our physical environment and are dependent upon them. D. A. Allport discusses the status of semantic components using several types of speech errors as arguments.

M. Dummett in his contribution (pp. 95—125) pays attention to philosophical and logical aspects of the notion of truth in language and stresses that the idea of truth cannot be separated from that of meaning. He believes that the primary carriers of meaning are sentences, not words. It ought to be added, however, that much depends upon our definition of meaning versus sense.

The paper *Language and Social Action* (pp. 127—141) written by R. Harré proceeds from Austin's theory of speech acts. Since not only language but all of human activity is structured, the notion of meaning can also be employed in social semantics.

E. Ardener's contribution (pp. 143—156) may be briefly characterized as a criticism of the linguistic interpretation of Whorf's theory. However, it is Ardener's ideas concerning the "density" of grammatical categories that are interesting from the viewpoint of general linguistics. In accordance to these ideas, the grammatical categories have a statistical nature manifested in the distinction of core and periphery, in the fuzziness of their boundaries.

In the last study P. Mühlhauser (pp. 157—177) raises a question that has long been avoided by most linguists. He casts some doubts upon the assumption that all languages and linguistic forms are equal. He has chosen the New Guinean Tok Pisin (i.e. Pidgin English) to prove his case that the only reliable statements about good or bad language can be obtained in the area of the lexicon. Although it is very hard to

judge about the communicational efficiency in the field of morphology and phonetics, the level of syntax (as well as that of vocabulary) no doubt may be judged as more or less developed in various languages.

Although the authors of various contributions disagree on some issues, all papers are notable for their complex, interdisciplinary approach to language.

Viktor Krupa

Jackendoff, Ray: *Semantics and Cognition.* Cambridge, Mass., The MIT Press 1983. 283 pp.

This remarkable contribution to psycholinguistics is an attempt to penetrate into the essence of human thought via linguistic structure. In the pursuit of this goal, the author has rejected existing theories of semantics and emphasized its role as a link joining the theory of language with the theories of other cognitive capacities. Studying semantics coincides with studying the structure of thought in the opinion of Jackendoff who believes that formal logic is not of much use in his endeavour and neither are the standard notions of truth and reference.

In Part One of the book the author sets forth his basic ideas concerning semantic structure as well as sense and reference. He lists six constraints on the semantic theory and proposes a single level of mental representation for both semantic and conceptual structures. Another important issue is that of the nature of information conveyed by language. Jackendoff concludes that this information is not about the real world, at least not directly since the environmental input is organized by the human subject to such an extent that this organization is not even experienced as part of the act of thinking and is ascribed to the environment. "We are constructed so as normally be unaware of our own contribution to our experience," writes Jackendoff (p. 27). In Konrad Lorenz' terminology, this is the reverse side of the mirror, part of our biological heritage. Thus the information conveyed by language is not about the real world but about the projected world. In addition to the real and projected world, the linguist has to distinguish the so-called mental information and linguistic expressions as well. One of the tasks of the theory is then to explain the mutual relationships of these domains. Jackendoff believes that the mapping between the real and the projected world is nonisomorphic and yet it is hard to believe that the nature of this mapping is arbitrary.

The mental information is described in terms of the Gestalt theory as a whole that is greater than the sum of its components. This paradox is explained by the author in such a way that only those components that are independently projectable can result in parts perceived. In the light of what has been said above reference is defined as projection and does not rely on physics as the ultimate source of ontological insight.

To be honest, there is a relationship between the external world and the information conveyed by language only this relationship is mediated and skewed by the subject's attitude and his biological background.

Part Two deals with cognitive foundations of semantics. The introductory chapter on the individuation of object in the visual field is followed by a discussion of the basic categories of conceptual structure, i.e. thing, place, direction, action, event, manner, and amount (Jackendoff's careful notation is simplified here). Since all major word classes admit the same range of modification types, a plausible theory cannot make a sharp distinction between their syntactic properties. Referential and nonreferential uses of phrases are distinguished with the aid of the referentiality principle according to which, "Unless there is a linguistic marking to the contrary, all phrases that express conceptual constituents are referential" (p. 70).

As for the relation of the syntactic level with the semantic level of sentence structure, Jackendoff suggests that every major phrasal constituent corresponds to a conceptual constituent (p. 76).

In the chapter on categorization, tokens and types are distinguished. Types have no projection and phrases expressing them are nonreferring. This distinction seems to closely parallel that of substance and phenomenon.

Part Three of the book is confined to word meanings. Jackendoff argues that word meanings must have internal structure, which is not new, but this structure cannot be viewed as a set of necessary and sufficient condition. Lexical items are assumed to have semantic decompositions but semantic description cannot do without the notions of normality, typicality and centrality. Jackendoff applies preference rules to the analysis of word meanings. The nature of these rules is psychological. They are ubiquitous but they have been recognized as a unified phenomenon only by the adherents of Gestalt psychology (pp. 156—157).

In Part Four, the author has come to the conclusion that space is a sort of a universal model with all events and states. In this respect Jackendoff disagrees with those who are inclined to characterize it rather as a metaphor. The primacy of the spatial field lies in its importance to vision, touch and action. As such it existed long before language and its perseverance is due to the evolutionary conservatism in cognition according to which existing structures are adapted to new purposes instead of developing new mechanisms. By the way, the same idea has been expressed by J. Piaget under the label of reproductive assimilation.

Despite the fact that the philosophical foundations of Jackendoff's theory would not be accepted by everybody, I think that all linguists who would care to read this book, would appreciate its wealth of stimulating ideas.

Vikto Krupa

Geneticheskie, arealnye i tipologicheskie svyazi yazykov Azii (Genetic, Areal and Typological Links Among the Languages of Asia). Ed. by V. M. Solntsev. Moscow, Nauka 1983. 272 pp.

This volume comprises papers devoted to interrelations among the languages of Asia. All three types of interrelations are discussed, i.e. genetic, areal and typological interrelations. They are summarily characterized by V. M. Solntsev in the preface (pp. 3—7).

The attention of the contributors concentrates largely although not exclusively upon the interrelations among the languages of Southeast Asia and Far East, one of the central subjects being their structural similarity.

V. M. Solntsev in his paper (pp. 8—18) describes the linguistic picture of the whole Southeast and East Asia. He points out to the remarkably homogeneous typological development of these languages and arrives at the conclusion that they have not been satisfactorily studied and described so far, which hampers the understanding of their genetic links.

S. E. Yakhontov concentrates upon the genetic interrelations within Southeast Asia (pp. 19—33). He discusses all the genetic hypotheses and warns that phonetic correspondences due to massive borrowing are virtually indistinguishable from correspondences due to the genetic identity of the languages under comparison. The absence of affixal morphemes in the languages of Southeast Asia makes all attempts at discovering and proving the existence of genetic links extremely difficult. Anyway, he feels inclined to accept Benedict's thesis of genetic proximity of Thai and Austronesian languages. Vietnamese, on the other hand, is characterized as Austroasiatic. There are no doubts about the position of the Munda languages after the work carried out by H.-J. Pinnow who has classed them with the Austroasiatic family. Yakhontov concludes his paper with the statement that Thai is probably related to Austronesian while Miao-Yao is linked to Austroasiatic.

G. A. Klimov investigates the interrelations between the Caucasian languages (pp. 34—40). He pays attention to the facts of sentence structure and does not exclude the possibility of their ultimate genetic unity although at present only the typological parallelisms seem to be obvious enough.

Y. Sirk sketches a brief survey of the comparative investigation in the Austronesian area (pp. 42—53). Together with R. Blust he criticizes the tendency to reconstruct as many proto-phonemes as possible and, instead, is willing to admit the existence of doublets. In his opinion, research should concentrate upon subgroups instead of whole families at present.

G. A. Zograf investigates the morphological comparison of related languages in the light of areal linguistics (pp. 54—68), confining his attention to the languages of India.

232

Section One of the volume is concluded by T. S. Sharadzenidze who launches an attempt to examine convergence of languages and language unions (pp. 69—79). He believes that the notion of language union has proved to be sterile because, in his view, convergent development does not lead to clearcut, stable language groupings. He is of the opinion that linguistics does not have methods that would help us either to recognize the mixed character of a language or at least to distinguish all the various strata within it.

Papers in Section Two concentrate upon the evaluation of particular language data from the viewpoint of genetic, areal and typological comparison.

Y. L. Blagonravova assesses the position of Thai languages in the genetic classification (pp. 80—91). She points out the obstacles in the comparative study of the Southeast Asian languages as well as some ways of overcoming them.

V. I. Tsintsius utilizes typology in his endeavour to find out whether the shared features of two languages are due to areal or genetic causes (pp. 92—102). He works with data from Nivkh and Tungus-Manchurian languages.

Problems of a massive borrowing and its consequences to Japanese are studied by V. M. Alpatov (pp. 103—114) who distinguishes two subsystems in Japanese.

A. L. Ogloblin in his contribution (pp. 115—130) describes linguistic contacts in the area of Java, especially between Javanese and Sundanese and between Javanese and Madurese.

Two papers discuss data from the Indo-Iranian area, i.e. the paper by D. I. Edelman (pp. 121—138) focusing upon verbs and that by A. M. Oransky (pp. 139—148) on lexical contacts.

Facts on phonology are discussed by S. A. Starostin as well as by V. B. Kasevich and D. I. Elovkov in their respective articles titled On Tones in Old Chinese (pp. 149—157) and Typological and Areal Aspects in the Analysis of the Phonological Structure of the Khmer Language (pp. 158—169).

E. D. Savenkova's paper does not directly concern Asian languages (pp. 170—175). It concentrates upon the question of the genetic affiliation of Etruscan. The author employs techniques of positional statistics thus continuing the work of A. M. Kondratov.

The third and last section of the book includes papers on typology and is opened by N. F. Alieva's study on reduplication in the languages of Southeast Asia (pp. 176—181). The authoress defines her conceptual apparatus in advance and applies it to Austronesian and Austroasiatic (Mon-Khmer and Vietnamese) languages. She has selected two parameters, i.e. type of reduplication and degree of stability of the reduplicated morpheme. This scheme is easily applicable to other language groupings and may be modified or extended when necessary.

V. D. Arakin (pp. 182—192) defines various types of attributive syntagms in Austronesian languages. The constituents of these syntagms are defined in both syntactic and semantic terms. According to the author, the types established might

serve as a basis for a partial reconstruction of Proto-Austronesian syntax, being at the same time typologically characteristic of the whole Austronesian family.

Another widespread feature of the languages of Southeast Asia and Far East is composition. In his paper N. V. Omelianovich (pp. 193—202) stresses that compounds account for more than 50% of all words in Chinese texts and some 20—30% in Burmese texts.

L. G. Zubkova is known for her phonotactic studies of Austronesian languages. In her present paper (pp. 203—217) she describes vocalic and consonantal structure of root word in Indonesian, Javanese and Tagal languages. She arrives at the conclusion that the phonotactic similarities typical of the three Austronesian languages are due to their common origin and regards the specific segmental organization of word as a marker of its syntagmatic integrity.

I. G. Melikishvili applies statistical methods to the study of Caucasian, Old Armenian and Indo-European languages (pp. 218—229).

G. F. Blagova investigates nominal declination of the Turkish languages and dialects of Central Asia (pp. 230—241). Her article is complemented by two linguistic maps of the area.

L. I. Shkarban calls for an application of the systemic approach to morphology in Indonesian languages (pp. 242—264) and concentrates upon the problem of root words and their status within the system of grammar.

T. L. Vetoshkina focuses upon the dialectological subdivision of the Semito-Hamitic family (pp. 265—270) and launches an attempt to evaluate the position of the Cushitic branch within this family.

This collective work will be appreciated by scholars who specialize in general linguistics because the individual papers introduce new data into linguistic trade, data that are valuable for comparative studies, typology and investigation of the interrelations of various languages.

Viktor Krupa

Langdon, Robert — Tryon, Darrell: *The Language of Easter Island. Its Development and Eastern Polynesian Relationships*. Laie, The Institute for Polynesian Studies 1983. 82 pp.

In the Introduction (pp. 1—2) the authors state that the language of Easter Island, known also as Rapanui, has received but little attention in linguistics. In this book they make an attempt to examine it in comparison with other Polynesian languages. However, linguistic data may shed light upon the origin of Rapanui only when complemented with historical and ethnological facts, according to Langdon and Tryon. They believe that the linguistic data admit of two hypotheses, i.e., (1) Rapanui is directly descended from Proto-Eastern Polynesian, (2) Rapanui is

a member of a putative subgroup together with East Futunan, East Uvean and Rennellese (p. 2). In the opinion of the authors, the hypothesis No. 2 is more plausible when non-linguistic data are taken into account.

Chapter 1 (pp. 3—14) surveys history of Easter Island since its discovery by Europeans. Conflicting views concerning its settlement are quoted and one of the most important assumptions is that some Polynesian areas have been settled more than once, which is no doubt plausible. Langdon and Tryon seem to prefer Blixen's view according to which Rapanui does not share some of the morphological innovations typical of Proto-Eastern Polynesian or Proto-Nuclear Polynesian (p. 12).

In Chapter 2 (pp. 15—20) Langdon and Tryon discuss phonological evidence, especially the question of the glottal stop. They stress the fact that the glottal stop is a highly unstable phoneme and should be assigned no key role in the search for the origin of Rapanui. The morphological evidence discussed in Chapter 3 (pp. 21—24) also seems to be rather inconclusive. Upon the level of syntax, Rapanui differs from the other Eastern Polynesian languages in that it does not display the active — passive dichotomy (cf. Chapter 4, pp. 25—28).

A good deal of attention and space has been paid by the authors to the vocabulary (pp. 29—48). The latter seems to indicate contacts with such diverse Polynesian languages as East Futunan, Marquesan and Tahitian (p. 48).

The crucial chapter is titled Discussion and Conclusions (pp. 49—64). The authors maintain that Easter Island could not have been settled directly from the Proto-Eastern Polynesian homeland (probably identical with the Society Islands). They believe that Rapanui is a language of Futunic origin with a heavy overlay of Eastern Polynesian borrowings. An important role in the settlement of Easter Island has been played, according to the authors, by the Tubuai group, especially by Ra'ivavae. Besides, Langdon and Tryon assume that when Polynesian settlers came to Easter Island in the 16th century, they found pre-Polynesian inhabitants there. This, however, remains a hypothesis which will have to be corroborated by linguistic and non-linguistic data which, however, have not been presented by the authors. And yet their publication does have its value as a challenge to future research.

Viktor Krupa

Hawkins, Emily A.: *Pedagogical Grammar of Hawaiian. Recurrent Problems.* Hawaiian Studies Program. University of Hawaii — Mānoa 1982. 194 pp.

The number of publications dealing with the Hawaiian language has been steadily increasing in the recent years. E. A. Hawkins' book is, however, the first text of Hawaiian for advanced students.

235

At the very beginning the author complains about a shortage of linguistic data and descriptions of Hawaiian as it is spoken today by the old generation. Another problem of this northernmost Polynesian language is the lack of a single standard, which results in linguistic conflicts between young and old generations.

E. A. Hawkins has published her grammar for teachers and independent autodidacts. She has collected her data in the Hawaiian class at the university. As far as literature is concerned, she leans upon S. H. Elbert and M. K. Pukui's Hawaiian Grammar, W. H. Wilson's thesis, W. D. Alexander's Hawaiian Grammar and her own Hawaiian Sentence Structures, implying that a preferential treatment has been given to those points for which there are some linguistic descriptions available. This means that some grammatical issues have remained unexplained and the task to illuminate them has been left to the teacher.

Another serious linguistic problem is posed by the fact that Hawaiian is spoken largely by the generations of parents and grandparents. Young people usually acquire their knowledge of Hawaiian at school. This is not surprising in a country where the Hawaiians account only for several per cent of the total population. Their language is obviously dying out as a first language, despite the efforts of schools and the university.

E. A. Hawkins has divided her book into 13 chapters. Chapter 1 (pp. 1—15) deals with determiners. This label covers articles and demonstratives. The author states that students need adequate explanation of the use of both definite and indefinite articles that are no simple equivalents of their English pendants. According to E. A. Hawkins, the article *he* is predominantly used in predicate noun phrases. On the other hand, the so-called definite article *ka ~ ke* is described as neutral in all positions excepting the predicate where it is definite. It is in the predicate position that *he* and *ka ~ ke* may be regarded as opposites in terms of the category of definiteness. In a word, *he* introduces new information while *ka ~ ke* marks the known concept. The chapter is complemented by a brief explanation of the meaning and use of demonstratives as well as of the optional nature of plural marking in Hawaiian.

Another typical feature of Hawaiian is the widespread use of directionals *mai, aku, iho, a'e* (Chapter 2, pp. 16—26). The author also turns our attention to some peculiarities of the use of the directionals in storytelling. Strictly speaking, the centre of the network of spatial coordinates is the character chosen by the storyteller (instead of ego in normal conversation) though many authors violate this rule.

Chapter 3 (pp. 27—37) sketches a classification of verbs into intransitive, transitive and stative verbs. Passivization is defined as a device of lessening the importance of the agent and of increasing the importance of the action. The agent may be emphasized by moving it into the initial position and supplying it with the prepositive particle *na*. With stative verbs, however, only the cause can be expressed (particle *i*), not the agent.

In the chapter devoted to verb markers (pp. 38—53), E. A. Hawkins incorporates

generic sentences into the tense/aspect system. Timeless or generic sentences are marked with *he* or are not marked at all. Another peculiarity usually not mentioned in textbooks is the possessivization of the subject to the nominalized verb. The whole construction acquires the meaning of "and then" and is quite common in literature.

The chapter on prepositions (pp. 54—62) is useful especially because of the explanation of the use of particles 'o, *iā* ~ *iō* as well as *i* versus *ma*.

Nominalization is discussed in Chapter 6 (pp. 63—68). The nominalizer may be omitted and in such case nominalization is marked only analytically, i.e. via the determiners, demonstrative or possessive pronouns.

The next chapter (pp. 69—81) discusses nominal sentences. The predicate normally precedes the subject in nominal sentences. Thus Hawaiian consistently puts the most important part of the sentence first. This rule is violated only by the presence of a pronoun in the equational sentence.

Various means of negating the predicate or other parts of the sentence are briefly discussed in Chapter 8 (pp. 82—89).

One of the most difficult points is the use of postpositive particles *ai, nei, ana, ala* (pp. 90—98). According to the author's findings, *ai* is mutually exclusive with *ana, ala,* and *nei,* and occurs in subordinate sentences only if a subject is present.

In Chapter 10 (pp. 99—107) the functional sentence perspective is dealt with. One means of slightly emphasizing a phrase is placing it first, with a short pause to follow. Another type of emphasizing is topicalization by means of either subordinating the entire sentence under 'o . . . *ka mea* or by fronting the phrase under emphasis without the following pause. The pronoun subject is placed immediately after the topic.

Subordinate clauses are discussed in some detail in Chapter 11 (pp. 108—132) and classified according to their equivalents in English. Another syntactically relevant chapter is that devoted to conjunctions (pp. 133—144). Finally, Chapter 13 represents an attempt to explain the use of adverbial particles *nō, ho'i* and *wale* (pp. 145—152).

Each chapter contains exercises, translations, transpositions, insertions and other drills. A valuable part of the textbook is the appendix (pp. 153—188) that includes a selection of Hawaiian texts exemplifying several styles.

There is also a glossary of grammatical terms (pp. 189—190), references (p. 191) and an index (pp. 193—194).

Although the book has been compiled for use in schools, autodidacts who have some experience with Hawaiian, can also use it to brush up their knowledge of this important Polynesian language.

Viktor Krupa

Firth, Raymond: *Tikopia-English Dictionary. Taranga Fakatikopia ma Taranga Fakainglisi.* Auckland—Oxford, Auckland University Press—Oxford University Press 1985. 615 pp.

The author, one of the most renowned Polynesian scholars, has decided to publish this dictionary as a record of the Tikopia language, to serve the islanders by pointing out to their cultural heritage embodied in their language and, finally, as a contribution to Polynesian studies. This publication, however, is no simple dictionary. Rather it reflects the personality of Raymond Firth who has dedicated decades of his life to a complex study of the society and culture of the island of Tikopia in the rapidly changing Pacific world.

As the author stresses, his dictionary is the work of a social anthropologist. This should be regarded as advantage especially in the research of vocabulary of a language spoken by members of a separate cultural domain which Tikopia no doubt represents. As a consequence of this, translating from the Tikopia language into English requires extensive knowledge of the social organization, history and culture of the island.

It is generally the aim of a dictionary to give a synchronous characteristics of a language. The author of this dictionary, however, has made an effort to record the far-reaching changes that had modified the way of life of the Tikopians as well as their language. Firth had to carefully weigh the question of inclusivity. He is right in including numerous traditional lexemes. This should not be regarded as a mere compliment to the past but as a sheer necessity, in view of the fact that the poetic language is an important part of the social communication of the islanders.

The author has spent more than ten years compiling this dictionary, many years after he became acquainted with Tikopia in 1928—1929. His dictionary is based upon several types of data — data elicited from informants, texts of various kinds, direct long-termed contacts with persons native to Tikopia. In addition, he has also had at his disposal some word lists and vocabularies of the Tikopia language as well as some modern printed texts.

The author has given much thought to the organization of the entries and has opted for the nesting principle, which is a prevalent practice with the Austronesian languages. He is well aware of problems involved in distinguishing homonymy from polysemy and marks transitory or questionable instances as well. No entry in this dictionary is regarded as a simple semantic equation. Its users will appreciate ample examples that focus on the social background, culture and figurative use of the language.

Since Tikopia has no standard language variant, the author relies on the majority view or on the opinions of elderly persons with a reliable knowledge of the past usage. Unfortunately, the present dictionary may soon become a monument to Tikopia of the past since the process of vocabulary loss is increasingly fast. This is just

one aspect of the overall process of a fairly fast language change (cf. numerous loanwords).

The author amply uses a fairly rich notational apparatus to compress information on the individual lexemes. The vowel length is indicated very carefully, which is not always the case with the dictionaries of Polynesian languages.

Firth's extensive introduction is complemented with Abbreviations and References (XX), Bibliography of Firth's works (XXI—XXII) as well as with a list of other works (XXII—XXIII). These are followed by Notes on the Structure or Tikopia Language (XXIV—XLVII). These Notes include chapters on phonology and orthography (remarks on some of the phonetic features are especially useful, e.g. on *l* and *r*, on the vowel length, on geminate consonants), morphology (reduplication, affixes, pronouns, etc.), and on syntax (word order, phonetic characteristics of the utterance). Finally, there are also several paragraphs that deal with semantics against the social and cultural background, and with the changes in the vocabulary.

The discussion of semantics is complemented with three schemes on pp. 613—615. The first scheme is a graphic representation of reef-land divisions on Tikopia. The second scheme sketches temporal subdivisions of day and night, whereas the third scheme is a drawing of a fish indicating its main anatomical features in Tikopia.

The dictionary comprises some 4,000—5,000 entries. Most of them are quite extensive because they do not include only English equivalents but also cross-references, grammatical characteristics, examples of English translations and necessary explanations. The actual number of lexemes greatly exceeds that of entries because causatives, reduplications, nominalizations, etc. are listed together upon the nesting principle.

Firth's dictionary may briefly be characterized as a well-planned, carefully organized and highly informative contribution to Polynesian studies in general and to our knowledge of Tikopia in particular, as a work produced by an absolutely competent scholar.

Viktor Krupa

Rehg, Kenneth L. (with the assistance of Damian G. Sohl): *Ponapean Reference Grammar.* Honolulu, The University Press of Hawaii 1981. 393 pp.

Ponapean ranks among the most important Micronesian languages spoken by some 15,000 inhabitants of the island of Ponape but also elsewhere. The speech of three neighbouring atols (Ngatik, Pingelap, Mokil) is closely related to Ponapean and all the variants are termed Ponapeic by the author.

K. L. Rehg's ambition was not to write an exhaustive grammar of Ponapean but to

describe the major grammatical features of the language. His book is intended chiefly for the bilingual native speakers of Ponapean, but other students of the language can also find it helpful.

Since the text has been written in the first place for lay public, the author deliberately tries to avoid technical terms or at least to minimize their usage. He proceeds in a systematic way so that understanding the material in one chapter helps to master information in the next chapter, etc.

The grammar is divided into seven chapters. Chapter 1 (pp. 1—19) supplies background information on the island, its people, culture, language, external influences as well as previous linguistic studies of Ponapean. In Chapter 2 (pp. 20—65) Rehg describes phonetics and phonology of Ponapean. He discusses pronunciation of Ponapean sounds, their variation, as well as syllabic structure and various sound rules.

Word structure is presented in Chapter 3 (pp. 66—115) in which morpheme is defined and morphemes are classified into various types. Rehg's distinction of free and bound morphemes as well as that of roots and affixes is based on distribution; meaning plays a subordinate role in this classification. Very much the same is true of the author's description of word, types of words (simple, complex and compound words) and word classes. Only two major word classes are postulated for Ponapean, i.e. nouns and verbs. Here, however, semantic criteria are employed and nouns described as designating a person, place or thing while verbs are characterized as referring to an action, event, state, condition, or quality. Conversion and derivation are described as two main means of modifying word class characteristics.

Chapter 4 (pp. 116—192) deals with nouns and noun phrases, the next chapter discusses verbs and verbal phrases (pp. 193—275).

The extensive Chapter 6 (pp. 276—358) describes sentence structure including basic sentence types, intonation features, functional sentence perspective, negation as well as compound and complex sentences.

One of the most remarkable features of Ponapean is the category of courtesy analogous to that in Japanese, Samoan, Javanese and in some other languages. This category is discussed in the last chapter titled Honorific Speech (pp. 359—376).

Appendix furnishes information on Ponapean orthography (pp. 377—382) including a summary of recommendations for practical uses.

The volume contains a brief bibliography (pp. 383—386) and an index of grammatical markers and terms (pp. 387—393).

The grammar is complemented by a Ponapean dictionary published as a separate volume by Rehg and Sohl. The data for this dictionary were gathered largely during elicitation sessions in 1971—1975. Another important source is represented by dictionaries compiled in the past by L. H. Gulick, Fr. P. Cantero and A. Burdick. Every entry has been checked by at least two native speakers of Ponapean.

The present dictionary comprises some 6,750 Ponapean entries without being

exhaustive. Personal names, place names and most foreign words have been left out, alongside with affixed words the meaning of which is predictable.

The data are arrayed in entries that may display as many as eight parts, i.e. headword, alternate spellings, usage label (archaic, honorific, polite, slang), grammatical label (abridgments for nouns, verbs, adjectives, pronouns, numerals, negators, affixes, etc.), definitions (given in English), examples, loan sources (usually English, German, Spanish, Japanese), and crossreferences. Since derivation is very productive in Ponapean, the compilers have excluded affixed words with predictable meanings. This means, unfortunately, that persons who want to use the dictionary, must be familiar with the system of affixation in Ponapean.

Another problem that had to be solved is that of dialectal variation. In view of the fact that there are two major dialects (Kiti and Northern), the authors had to make their choice, and preference has been given to the Northern dialect.

Part Two of the dictionary comprises an English-Ponapean Finder List including 4,200 entries (pp. 123—254).

The compilers have defined their goal as that of presenting an accurate and economical account of the major lexical facts of the Ponapean language. They regard their work as an intermediate step toward producing a comprehensive dictionary of Ponapean. The individual entries are compiled in a manner that is very thorough and careful for a dictionary of this kind.

Rehg and Sohl's dictionary together with their reference grammar may be characterized as a solid piece of work that has contributed much to our knowledge of Ponapean and to the advancement of Micronesian and Austronesian studies.

Viktor Krupa

Pham Minh Tan und Tran Duy Tu: *Gesprächsbuch Deutsch-Vietnamesisch.* Leipzig, VEB Verlag Enzyklopädie 1983. 186 S.

„Das vorliegende *Gesprächsbuch Deutsch-Vietnamesisch* ist ein Hilfsmittel, das zur Aneignung praktischer Kenntnisse des Vietnamesischen dienen soll," so die Autoren im Vorwort.

Es ist festzustellen, daß in letzter Zeit im Rahmen der methodischen Literatur, die den Fragen des Fremdsprachenunterrichts gewidmet ist, in der DDR eine angemessene Aufmerksamkeit auch der vietnamesischen Sprache gewidmet wird. Zur Entwicklung von Angewohnheiten der Umgangssprache sind Konversationsbücher wie das vorliegende von großer Bedeutung. Es soll allen Interessenten zur Vervollkommnung der eigentlichen Umgangssprache dienen. Das Gespräch, wie bekannt,

ist ohne Partner, ohne Gesprächsgenossen nicht denkbar. Es ist daher richtig, daß sich die Autoren um eine beiderseitige Konzeption des Gesprächs bemühen (jeder Frage, Anrede oder Bitte folgt die dazugehörige Antwort), auch wenn dieses Prinzip noch konsequenter hätte eingehalten werden können. Ein Gesprächsbuch wird seiner Bestimmung voll gerecht nur wenn es auf Dialogen beruht, auf einem natürlichen Dialog mindestens zweier Personen.

Ein Gespräch über dieses oder jenes Thema kann freilich bei weitem nicht die ganze notwendige Lexik umfassen. Es ist daher richtig, daß die Autoren einem jeden Thema ein Verzeichnis von ergänzender Lexik beigefügt hatten, wobei sie die Fortsetzung oder eine andere Variante des Gesprächs ins Auge faßten. Aus praktischen Gründen ist der deutsche Teil dieses Verzeichnisses in alphabetischer Reihenfolge geordnet. Die Übersetzung aus dem Deutschen ins Vietnamesische ist auf gutem Niveau, ohne die Struktur und den Stil der vietnamesischen Sprache zu verletzen. Bei der Bearbeitung einzelner Themen bemühten sich die Autoren an die realen Situationen des heutigen Lebens heranzukommen und in ihnen vor allem das festzuhalten, was den praktischen Interessen des Benützers entspricht. Ein Vorteil des rezensierten Gesprächsbuches ist, daß es dem Benützer die Möglichkeit überläßt, das Thema nach dem eigenen Stand der Kenntnisse zu erweitern oder es zu reduzieren, bzw. es nach seinen Fähigkeiten zu aktualisieren und improvisieren.

Das *Gesprächsbuch Deutsch-Vietnamesisch* setzt grundlegende grammatische und lexikalische Kenntnisse voraus, und versucht diese, nicht durch Übersetzen von Wörtern, sondern von Gedanken in einer lebendigen Form in der Praxis anzuwenden.

Ján Múčka

Chan Ping-leung et al. (Eds.): *Essays in Commemoration of the Golden Jubilee of the Fung Ping Shan Library (1932—1982). Studies in Chinese Librarianship, Literature, Language, History and Arts.* 2 Vols. Fung Ping Shan Library of the University of Hong Kong. Hong Kong 1982. 439, 359 pp.

This unusual publication, silk-bound and printed on art paper appeared on the occasion of the 50th anniversary of the foundation of the Fung Ping Shan Library associated with the University of Hong Kong, a very important institution at the crossroads between the Chinese and the "Western" world. It constitutes a significant and praiseworthy contribution to sinological studies.

To attempt an objective and responsible assessment of all the studies in the two volumes would be a daring and arduous task that would tax to the utmost even the most erudite reader and experienced researcher. And indeed, the five sections — Library Science, Linguistics, Literature, History and Arts comprise both the

traditional and the modern period, the extensive territories of China, and as regards the first section, it deals with North America, Europe, Australia, Japan and Hong Kong.

The greatest number of studies in the English and the Chinese volume are devoted to matters relating to sinological libraries in the PRC and outside its territory. The introductory study in the Chinese volume gives a detailed briefing on the development, present state and prospects of the Fung Ping Shan Library; the others pass in review numerous sinological libraries in the U.S.A., Canada, Europe (in Western countries, in the USSR and Czechoslovakia), in Australia and partly also in Japan. Those interested in the research of more recent history and literature will gain profit from three studies introducing Hong Kong and North American journals. Personally I was most impressed by a study dealing with 20 translations by Lin Shu. It both helps somewhat to complete the most through monograph (at least as far as I know) by R. W. Compton: *A Study of the Translations of Lin Shu, 1852—1924*, unpublished PhD. Dissertation, Stanford 1971, and brings more precision into certain data, e.g. names of operas in European languages from translations of the book by G. Davidson, *Stories from Opera*.

The study dealing with translations by Lin Shu ought to have been included among those concerned with literature and language, edited by the well-known comparatist Dr. Wong Tak-wai. Dr. Wong devoted considerable efforts to obtain an impressive sample of articles both in English and Chinese versions by contributors from various countries. Special mention should be made of Wang Ching-hsien's (C. H. Wang) *The Weniad: A Chinese Epic in Shin Ching*— an outstanding piece of comparative literary criticism, its counterpole in the creative realm, being the *Aeneid* by Virgil. About the work of the great Roman poet only a few words are said, which is ultimately correct; attention is devoted to poems Nos. 236, 237, 241, 245 and 250, in the traditional order from *The Book of Poetry*. Professor Wang changes the canonical order of the five poems and states the correct sequence to be 245, 250, 237, 241 and 236, asserting that only in this way are they delineating an epic fable and constituting the substance of an epic. *The Book of Poetry* is here shown from one of its aspects, viz. as a source of epic poetry which found its expression in later Chinese poetic works even though the epic component never came to match the lyric one by its significance. *A Study of the Flood Myth of the Yao People: A Comparative Approach* by Chan Ping-leung is an exemplary illustration of the way how materials from diverse mythologies can be successfully compared; the author gives proof of adequate knowledge and the necessary selfrestraint. This last attribute could hardly be applied to the study by Susanna Li which is overladen with the Western structuralist theory and the author, herself a "captive of the language" (semantic, verbal and syntactical aspects of the metaphorical principle), attempts to explain, though in vain, "Reading of Readings" of the analysed text — *Hsi-yu pu* (Supplement to the Pilgrimage to the West) by Tung Yüeh. William Tay's *The*

Poetics of Juxtaposition: Haiku, Chinese Poetry and Ezra Pound is of a different brand, differently written, with adequate theoretical knowledge and comprehensibility — a priority higher than scholars are often aware of. Many readers of sinological literature do not stand mere philosophizing and are deterred by turns of phrases or arcane expressions comprehensible to only a handful of specialists. It may easily happen that, excepting the editor and perhaps a few friends or interested colleagues, nobody reads similar texts, which is neither the aim of a scientific treatise nor yet the author's aim.

The volumes under review contain comparative studies of a typological, and also of a more or less demonstrably genetic-contact nature. Among the former belongs *Sir Orfeo and Pai Yuan Chuan* by So Kei-hong, as also *Baroque Poetics of Metasensuality: A Reading of Li Ho's Poetry by Wong Tak-wai*; the latter takes contact with the author's well-known and comprehensive essay *Toward Defining Chinese Baroque Poetry,* Tamkang Review, VIII, April 1977, 1, pp. 25—72 and his PhD. dissertation thesis: *Baroque as a Period Style of Mid-Late T'ang Poetry,* University of Washington 1980. The genetic-contact study *A Passage to Humanism: Chinese Influence on Emerson* by Wong Kin-yuen appears to the present reviewer as somewhat similar to the book *The Roots of Whitman's Grass* by T. R. Rajasekharaiah, that is to say in its endeavour to prove at all cost an impact where it need not be, or is not at all, although the study itself may be a meritorious one. Tu Kuo-ch'ing's *Li Chin-fa and Kambara Ariake: The First Symbolist Poets in China and Japan* is in a way a continuation of the author's study *The Introduction of French Symbolism into Modern Chinese and Japanese Literature,* Tamkang Review, X, Spring and Summer 1980, 3—4, pp. 343—367. It is of value as material source for a comparative study of Chinese and Japanese symbolism. Students of modern Chinese poetry should read Gaylord Leung's study on Wen I-to's treatment of love. Dr. Leung's extensive knowledge of the romantic background and sources, his sensitive treatment of the subject make of it a valuable work, similar to his studies dedicated to the poet Hsü Chih-mo. And finally, at least two more studies from this section should not escape investigators' attention: *A Journey to Morality: Chang Heng's The Rhapsody on Pondering the Mystery* by D. T. Knechtges and *The Problem of the Authenticity in the Works of Ts'ao Chih* by H. H. Frankel. The former represents a supplement to the author's works particularly his book *The Han Rhapsody. A Study of the Fu of Yang Hsiung (53 B. C.—18 A. D.),* London—New York 1976, and the studies and translations by D. Hawkes, showing the different attitude to life and death by Chang Heng and by the poets of Ch'u-tz'u. The latter takes contact with the author's study from 20 years ago *Fifteen Poems by Ts'ao Chin: An Attempt at a New Approach,* JAOS, *84,* 1964, pp. 1—14. Both are in their way an important contribution to the topic studied.

Evidently in an effort at preserving a certain proportionality in the quantity of papers, the least section contains studies devoted to history and art. Some of them

are among the best in the whole book. Through the essay *Wang O's Contribution to Chin History,* Chan Hok-lam takes contact with another likewise noteworthy essay entitled *Chinese Official History at the Yüan Court: The Composition of the Liao, Chin and Yüan Histories,* see Langlois, J. D., Jr. (Ed.): *China under Mongol Rule,* Princeton 1981, pp. 56—106. The same, to my view, holds also for Ho Kuan-piao's study on those Ming scholars who refused to accept office under the Ch'ing Dynasty, Chao Ling-yuan's study on Kung Tzu-chen's historiographical ideas and Yü Ying-shih's *Tai Chen and the Chu Hsi Tradition.* Those interested in modern Chinese intellectual history may find F. Gilbert Chan's *Liao Chung-kai and the Chinese Revolutionary Leadership, 1905—1925* to be profitable reading.

If the works on Chinese art are not reviewed here it does not imply that they fail to achieve the standard of the other contributions, but is rather an admission on the part of the present reviewer that he does not feel competent to express his aesthetic or scholarly judgment on their priorities or deficiences.

Marián Gálik

Spaar, Wilfried: *Die kritische Philosophie des Li Zhi (1527—1602) und ihre politische Rezeption in der Volksrepublik China.* Veröffentlichungen des Ostasien-Instituts der Ruhr-Universität Bochum, Bd. 30. Wiesbaden, Otto Harrassowitz 1984. 608 pp.

This is one of those books that set themselves as aim to study the numerous discussions and campaigns in the People's Republic of China. Its main goal is to trace out the views of Chinese ultra-leftists connected with the "Gang of Four", eventually their opponents after 1976, particularly in connection with the so-called struggle between the Confucianists and the Legalists during the course of Chinese history down to the present times, a foremost philosopher, historiographer and literary critic of his time, an outstanding and fearless opponent of Confucian orthodoxy, was considered in the 70s as a legalist, and reportedly formed "the progressive" part of a philosophical message aimed against the then ruling neo-Confucian philosophy of Zhu Xi (1130—1200).

The book is divided into three parts, the first of which is fairly brief, of a general character and acquaints the reader with the various campaigns mounted between 1973—1977. The other two are rather extensive. Of these, one presents historical material for discussion, deals with the various periods of research interest in Li Zhi's life and work (since 1916 till 1977), gives his genealogy, biography and informs the reader with his various works, whether his own, or edited or commented by him, but also with such where his authorship is uncertain or that have been attributed to him, although he had nothing in common with them. This most audacious rebel from among all Chinese thinkers, a critic of certain aspects of Confucian teaching, despite

245

prohibitions, burring of his works, punishments meted out to those found to possess and read his books, he enjoyed unusual popularity for centuries and his name was a guarantee that he would be sold and read. That is why works were attributed to him that he could have neither written, edited nor even commented. This is probably the most valuable part of the book for it strives objectively to present a true image of Li Zhi and some of the translations, whether concerned with the criticism of Confucius, historical or literary writings, will serve also other investigators interested in these domains of Li Zhi's work.

The third part of the book is made up of reflections on the reception of Li Zhi's philosophical, historical, pedagogical and literary work in the People's Republic of China, with reference to various problems, deficiencies and errors that occurred in this reception.

This is a well researched book and shows that the author is well read in the subject and has an unusually wide range of vision in it. The bibliography, notes and glossary take up more than half the entire text. Each work has to be judged in its own right, in the way it was written with due respect to the author's designs and aims. Nonetheless, one may figure that the book may have been written differently and especially less attention might have been devoted in it to the "political reception" which, any way, smacks rather of suspicion and is hardly serious seeing the doubtful scientific criteria at play. The sinological community might draw greater profit from a critical processing of Li Zhi's "critical philosophy" as an unusual philosophical, historio-graphic and literary and critical monument of his time.

Marián Gálik

Lee, Feigon: *Chen Duxiu. Founder of the Chinese Communist Party.* Princeton, New Jersey, Princeton University Press 1983. 279 pp.

Following the work by Thomas Kuo, *Ch'en Tu-hsiu and the Chinese Communist Movement* (1975) and the older master thesis by Julie Lien-ying How, *The Development of Ch'en Tu-hsiu's Thought* (1949), and finally following a revival of interest in Chen Duxiu's life and achievement in the People's Republic of China, the reader has at his disposal the book under review which surprises primarily by its material wealth. The Bibliography (pp. 245—270) comprises Chinese, Japanese, English and Russian works and thus gives proof of the author's broad scope of knowledge.

Of the seven chapters making up the book, six analyse the same number of periods in Chen Tuxiu's 62-year long life pilgrimage. In the view of the present reviewer, the most interesting are Chapter Two entitled Awakening Youth and Chapter Three called Revolutionary Teacher in Anhui, presenting his childhood and early manhood between the years 1879 and 1911. The reason is that little was known precisely of

this sector in his life, very significant for his further development, for as the author justly remarks, "Chen Duxiu's life has always been clouded by an air of mystery" (p. 23). This patient and painstaking work in tracing various facts, relations activities of this prominent man in China's modern history will certainly be of help to further investigators, particularly if they try more systematically and with a broader take to analyse the years 1915—1922, the period of the May Fourth Movement, one of the key events in the recent past. Not only was Chen Duxiu an outstanding man of his times, but he also influenced in a grandiose manner the development in China's new culture in various domains and has come to be an inseparable figure in that country's political history.

The very title of the book betrays that in drawing Chen Duxiu's portrait, the author was more concerned with a politico-cultural biography. In it he laid stress on his work as a representative of the literary revolution, of vernacular and social literature, and on his role of founder of the Chinese Communist Party. Such a choice is the author's unquestionable right, but alongside certain advantages of such mode of treatment, it also entails certain drawbacks. It provides the political and cultural historian with important material, but anyone wishing to understand the motives behind his activity is left with unanswered questions relating to deeper reasons for his way of acting. The new Chinese history, particularly that of the ideological and intellectual develop-ment of modern Chinese leading personalities clearly shows that Marxism-Leninism was the most attractive teaching from all in the West and thus pinpointing stimuli of this kind and an analysis of this development are of immense importance for an understanding of everything that has happened in this country over less than one hundred years.

Lee Feigong knew Chen Duxiu incomparably better than he knew Trotsky or Lenin. It is very probable that Chen never correctly understood either the one or the other.

Some of the items in Lee Feigong's information are not fully exact. Thus, Chen Duxiu and Su Manshu (1884—1918) did not publish "the first translation" of V. Hugo's novel *Les Misérables* but only part of the adapted translation, and it was not "because of the appeal of his (i.e. Hugo's, M. G.) romantic style to their revolutio-nary tempers" (p. 54), but because they both felt that this novel, or at least its part in their adapted version, might serve their anarchist ambitions and anti-Manchu attacks.

Marián Gálik

Aliev, S. M.: *Neft i obshchestvenno-politicheskoe razvitie Irana v XX veke* (Oil and Socio-Political Development of Iran in the 20th Century). Moscow, Nauka 1985. 302 pp.

The book by Prof. Aliev looks at the significance of the oil factor in Iran's modern history, and clearly shows that ever since the beginnings of the extraction and export of this raw material, the problem of oil was closely related to the overall economic and socio-political life in this country. This analysis of the principal problems in the history of 20th century Iran under the visual angle of "*naptha*" opens new insights into certain significant phenomena and events, and shows their direct bond with problems of extraction, processing and export of oil.

The first part of the book is to a major extent devoted to the activity of the Anglo-Persian Oil Company (APOC, since 1934 Anglo-Iranian Oil Company, AIOC), which obtained extensive concessions at the beginning of the 20th century for extraction of oil and which, supported more and more by the British Government, consolidated its positions in the region, intervened more and more intensively into Iran's inner affairs and grossly encroached on its sovereignty. The use of APOC as a bridgehead of British interests in the Persian Gulf has come to be a classical instance of setting up colonial influence by way of promoting "legitimate trade", military "pacification" of unrests and political intrigues as was the case also in other regions of incipient colonial empires.

In the subsequent section the author goes on to show how the relations between Great Britain and Iran began gradually to deteriorate, culminating in the conflict between the Iranian Government and the APOC which resulted in the signing of a new agreement. The latter, however, only partially met its justified claims and APOC preserved its exclusive position of a "State within a State".

A more intensive revival of the struggle for Iran's rights to its natural resources came about after World War II, particularly through the movement for nationalization of the oil industry, led by the representative of national bourgeoisie M. Mosaddeq. The author devotes here considerable attention also to the role played in the political life of the Iranian society of that time by the popular masses at large, particularly urban populations and makes a point of the fact that great credit for the victory of the movement for nationalization of the AIOC which brought M. Mosaddeq to the head of a new Iranian Government, went to the Iranian proletariat and the country's progressive forces representing its interests. The struggle against the AIOC gradually grew into an anti-imperialist and democratic movement on an all-national scale and the author assesses it as "one of the brightest pages in the postwar history of the Iranian society" (p. 133).

Unfortunately, Mosaddeq's government attributed an exaggerated significance to receipts from the oil industry, saw in them a panacea, a cure-all and failed to set down a constructive social, economic and political programme. It represented in the first

place the interests of national bourgeoisie, gradually toned down its anti-imperialistic and democratic attitudes, whereby it simultaneously lost the support of the progressive part of the public. In its struggle for power with the ruling court, it came into conflict also with rightist forces and in the coup of August 1953 it was finally brought down. When characterizing the revolution, the author states that the true cause of Mosaddeq's fall had not been his effort at depriving the Shah and the army of political power, but rather his refusal to meet British and American demands in matters of oil and the fear of these two countries that under Mosaddeq's leadership Iran might get completely free from under their influence, which ultimately led them to take direct action in the conspiratory preparations of the coup.

The fall of Mosaddeq's government meant the beginning of a new stage in Iran's economic history. A new oil agreement was concluded between the Iranian Government and the principal oil monopolies represented by the International Oil Consortium (IOC) which led to a reinforcement of the influence of Western countries, specifically of the U.S.A. in all the spheres of the socio-economic life of Iran.

A significant role in the inner development at this time was played by the so-called "white revolution" — a reform movement related primarily to the Shah's personal initiative. The author devotes here considerable attention to the inner, as well as outward preconditions of this "revolution" personally sponsored by the Shah, to its socio-economic content and goals, and arrives at the conclusion that although certain antifeudal and democratic measures came to be carried out under its influence, the general impact on an improvement of the material and social standing of the great majority of the working people proved to be small indeed and the reforms were meant in reality to serve mainly to reinforce the totalitarian-bureaucratic traits of the Shah's and his court's dictatorial régime.

The author then goes to show how at the turn of the 60s and 70s the role played by the oil industry in the Iranian economy and politics had increased, but at the same time he observes that the Shah's régime failed to utilize the oil conjuncture to regain full sovereignty over the country's natural resources, and Iran's exploitation by forces of imperialism went on deepening. The growth of oil revenues brought advantages primarily to the Shah's court and the élite in national bourgeoisie, while the gap between the rich and the poor under conditions of an accelerated development of capitalism became ever wider.

In the chapter devoted to the oil explosion of 1973 and its effects on the policy and social development in Iran, the author underlines several negative influences exerted by the intensively increasing revenues from oil on Iranian economy. He also draws several valuable and generally valid conclusions; for instance, he points out that "industrialization and the creation of a modern economic infrastructure in a developing country urgently presumes the implementation of an entire complex of economic, social, political and cultural measures. . . without which a setting up of

new industrial branches and their autonomous, self-sufficient growth is impossible" (p. 208).

In the closing chapter, the author presents an interesting analysis of the antimonarchistical and antiimperialistical Iranian revolution of the years 1978—1979, takes notes of its causes, specificities, the overall character and immediate consequences. He again devotes major attention to the oil factor, but draws attention also to the significance of the strike movement among Iranian workers and, within the broad frame of reference of the world revolutionary process, considers the 1978—1979 Iranian revolution to have been an expression of the dissatisfaction of developing countries and of their efforts to do away with the persisting unjust system of international economic relationships.

Prof. Aliev's book draws on an abundant spectrum of materials and documents, many of which are relatively little known, and enriches our view of the development in 20th century Iran. The stress which the author lays on the economic background of social and political phenomena imparts to the picture of the Iranian society which he sketches, real strength and conviction. From the methodological aspect, the book may be taken as a guide to be followed in elucidating the complex peripeteia of the more recent political development in the majority of developing countries in general.

Ján Voderadský

Kemal Paşa-Oğlu Şemsüddin Ahmed (Ibn-i Kemal): *Tevârih-i Âl-i Osman. II. Defter* (Die Geschichte der Dynastie Osman. II. Band). Hrsg. von Şerafettin Turan. Ankara, Türk Tarih Kurumu Basımevi 1983. LII + 265 S. TTK Yayınları XVIII. Dizi — Sa. 2ª.

Zu den bedeutendsten osmanischen Historikern am Ende des 15. und zu Beginn des 16. Jahrhunderts gehört zweifelsohne Ibn-i Kemal (gest. 1535), der gleichzeitig auch ein bekannter islamischer Gelehrter und Literat war. Er entstammte einer alten osmanischen Familie, die dem Staat einige bedeutende Menschen gab. Sein Großvater Kemal Pascha diente zur Zeit der Regierung Sultan Mehmed II. (1451—1481) als Statthalter und Großwesir. Şemsüddin Ahmed selbst diente zuerst als *Sipahi*, später dann, nach seinem Studium in der *Medrese*, wurde er Richter *(Kadı)* in Edirne, nachher Militärrichter *(Kadıasker)* und in seinen letzten Lebensjahren sogar der höchste geistliche Repräsentant im Osmanischen Reich — *Şeyhülislam*.

Außer theologischen und literarischen Arbeiten, is er auch Verfasser eines umfangreichen historischen Werks *Tevârih-i Âl-i Osman* (Die Geschichte der Dynastie Osman), das aus zehn voneinander unabhängigen Teilen oder Bänden *(Defter)* besteht, die der Regierung der einzelnen osmanischen Sultane vom ersten Osman bis zu Süleyman dem Prächtigen gewidmet sind.

Der hier rezensierte II. Defter ist in der Reihenfolge bereits das dritte veröffent-

lichte Werk der *Tevârih-i Âl-i Osman,* das von Ş. Turan vorbereitet wurde. Der VII. Defter (in zwei Teilen — Faksimile mit Index und eine wissenschaftliche Transkription) erschien in den Jahren 1954 und 1957. Der I. Defter erschien im Jahre 1970. Ein Teil des X. Defter wurde als Faksimile mit dessen französischer Übersetzung noch im vorigen Jahrhundert vom französischen Orientalisten Pavet de Courteille unter dem Titel *Histoire de la campagne de Mohacz par Kémal Pacha Zadeh, I—II.* Paris 1859 veröffentlicht.

Die Bedeutung von Ibn-i Kemals Werk für die osmanische Geschichtsschreibung kann aus zwei Aspekten betrachtet werden. Erstens ist es ihm gelungen ein, den persischen Bearbeitungen der osmanischen Geschichte, vor allem jedoch dem Werk von Idris Bitlisi *Die acht Paradiese,* ebenbürtiges Werk zu verfassen. Zweitens führte Ibn-i Kemal in die osmanische Geschichtsschreibung eine neue Konzeption, bzw. Methode der Bearbeitung historischer Begebenheiten ein. Er betrachtet sie in ihren gegenseitigen Zusammenhängen und ist bemüht, diese in eine Beziehung von Ursache und Folge zu bringen. Im Unterschied zu seinen Vorgängern widmete er eine erhöhte Aufmerksamkeit auch den Begebnissen außerhalb der islamischen Welt, vor allem in Europa.

Im Vorwort (S. VII—XXXIX) befaßt sich der Herausgeber vor allem mit den Handschriften des II. Defter in türkischen Bibliotheken. In der Istanbuler Sammlungen sind drei Exemplare dieses Bandes (Nur-i Osmaniye, Nr. 3078 (N) und im Millet Kütüphanesi Ali Emiri Nr. 26 (M-1) und Nr. 30 (M) erhalten. Auf Grund eines inhaltlichen und sprachlichen Vergleichs der Handschriften konnte der Herausgeber feststellen, daß die Handschriften M und N unabhängige Kopien jenes Originalexemplars sind, das dem Sultan Bayezid II. gegen das Ende seiner Regierungszeit (1501—1510) vorgelegt wurde. Die Handschrift M-1 ist die spätere Kopie (von Anfang des 20. Jahrhunderts) des Exemplars N. Deshalb wählte Ş. Turan als Grundlage für seine Herausgabe die älteste Handschrift M (aus dem Ende des 17. Jahrhunderts) aus und vervollständigt, bzw. korrigiert diese mit Hilfe des Exemplars N.

Im weiteren befaßt er sich mit den Quellen des II. Defter von Ibn-i Kemals Werk. Auf Grund verschiedener Erwähnungen Ibn-i Kemals im Text seiner Chronik ist es Ş. Turan gelungen folgende im Werk verwendete Quellen zu identifizieren: die Seldschukische Geschichte von Ebû'l-ʿAlâ ben Havl, die anonyme bulgarische Geschichte, die wahrscheinlich zur Zeit Mehmeds II. aus dem Griechischen ins Türkische übersetzt wurde, *Kitab-i Cihân-nümâ* von Mehmed Neşri, die anonyme *Tevârih-i Âl-i Osman,* sowie verschiedene geschichtliche Erzählungen *(Râviler).* Im Schlußteil des Vorwortes widmet sich der Herausgeber den Besonderheiten und der Bedeutung des II. Defter von *Tevârih-i Al-i Osman,* indem er auf verschiedene Spezifika im Inhalt des Werkes hinweist, und auf dessen Chronologie, die sich auf Neşris sowie auf des Verfassers (Ibn-i Kemals) Verse anlehnt.

Der Text der kritischen Herausgabe (S. 1—208) wurde vom Herausgeber

sorgfältig vorbereitet worden. Unter dem Strich führt er nur textologische Anmerkungen an, sachliche Anmerkungen und Erläuterungen folgen nach dem Text (S. XLII—LII).

Umfangreiche und mit Sorgfalt ausgearbeitete Indizes (S. 215—265) — Index der Namen, der Orte sowie der historischen Ausdrücke — erleichtern die Handhabung des Textes.

Die Herausgabe des II. Defter von Ibn-i Kemals Werk ist eine wertvolle Bereicherung der kritischen Ausgabe osmanischer Historiker und es ist dem Herausgeber dafür zu danken und der Hoffnung Ausdruck zu verleihen, daß es ihm gelingt, durch kritische Ausgaben auch zu weiteren Bänden von Ibn-i Kemals Werk Zutritt zu verschaffen.

Vojtech Kopčan

Das osmanische „Registerbuch der Beschwerden" (Şikāyet Defteri) vom Jahre 1675. Hrsg., eingeleitet und mit siebzehn Fachkollegen gemeinsam übersetzt von Hans Georg Majer. *Band I: Einleitung, Reproduktion des Textes, Geographische Indices.* Wien, Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften 1984. 68 S. + 248 Taf.

Man kann mit Hans Georg Majers einleitendem Satz in seinem Vorwort zum Buch voll übereinstimmen, daß „Die Edition des Wiener *Şikāyet Defteri* für die Osmanistik in mehrfacher Hinsicht ein Novum ist, vielleicht sogar ein Beginn: Es ist das erste Defter des *Dīvān-i hümāyūn,* das vollständig veröffentlicht wird, das erste, das der weiteren Fachwelt durch Übersetzung erschlossen wird; es ist das erste mal, daß sich ein so großer Kreis von Osmanisten zu einer gemeinsamen Arbeit zusammengefunden hat, und das ist das erste Mal, daß im Fach versucht wird, eine so schwierige und umfangreiche Arbeit in einer äußerst knappen Zeitspanne (seit 1981) zu bewältigen."

Der Gegenstand der Analyse und der Herausgabe war der Cod. mixt. 683 der Österreichischen Nationalbibliothek, Wien, von dem man ursprünglich dachte, es gehe um ein *Mühimme Defteri,* aber erst nach einem eingehenden Studium erwies sich dieses als ein *Şikāyet Defteri,* eine Art von *Dīvān-i hümāyūn Defter,* das bislang noch keiner genauer untersucht hat.

Das Defter bringt auf 450 Seiten an die 2800 Einträge, die von verschiedenen Schreibern der *Dīvānī-*Schrift niedergeschrieben wurden. Diese wurden von den Mitarbeitern (ein jeder von ihnen bearbeitete eine bestimmte Anzahl von Seiten) in leserliche arabische Schrift umgeschrieben, die im Institut für Geschichte und Kultur des Nahen Orients sowie für Turkologie an der Universität München gesammelt wurden. Dann übersetzten die Mitarbeiter diese Texte, die anschließend in der

Münchener Zentrale adaptiert, vereinheitlicht und durch Register vervollständigt wurden. Dies geschah, natürlich, unter wechselseitiger Zusammenarbeit beim Lesen der Texte, deren Übersetzen und der Identifizierung der Orts- und Personennamen, vor allem der nicht türkischen.

Mit Hinsicht auf den Umfang des Textes und die Vielfältigkeit der Problematik, die das Defter beinhaltet, verzichteten die Mitarbeiter auf eine wissenschaftliche Bearbeitung und entschlossen sich den Text lediglich mit Indices zu versehen. Ebenfalls mit Hinblick auf den uneffektiven Aufwand an Arbeit, den eine Bearbeitung der im Defter erfaßten Dorfnamen aus dem ganzen Osmanischen Reich mit sich bringen würde, entschlossen sie sich davon abzusehen und dem Faksimile-Band nur ein Verzeichnis der „Verwaltungseinheiten und größeren Orte" anzuschließen. Aufgenommen wurden alle Verwaltungseinheiten *(Nahiye, Kaza, Sancak, Eyalet)* und größeren Orte, die mit ausreichender Sicherheit gelesen werden konnten. Im vorbereiteten Übersetzungsband wird ein Personenregister, ein Sachregister, ein Glossar und die Bibliographie eingereiht werden.

Die kurze Einleitung, die ebenso wie das Vorwort der Feder H. G. Majers entstammt, befaßt sich im ersten Teil mit den osmanischen Handschriften, vor allem mit jenen Defter, die nach Kara Mustafas Niederlage bei Wien als Kriegsbeute in die europäischen Sammlungen gelangten. Zu diesen erbeuteten Exemplaren gehört auch die herausgegebene Handschrift der Wiener ÖNB, Cod. mixt. 683, deren Weg in diese Bibliothek jedoch nicht eindeutig geklärt ist.

Wir möchten auch weitere Defters aus deutschen Sammlungen anführen, die während der Kriege im 17. und 18. Jahrhundert als Kriegsbeute gewonnen wurden. Nach L. Fekete: *A berlini és drezdai gyüjtemények levéltári anyaga.* Levéltári Közlemények, 6, 1928, S. 264—267 werden folgende Defters angeführt: Dresden, Sächsische Landesbibliothek, Eb. 378 vom Typ *Mühimme Defteri* (muh. 1071 — şab. 1076); Eb. 372 aus dem Jahre 1091 H. (1680—1681), *Maliye Defteri* Eb. 358. In Göttingen (Universitätsbibliothek?), zwei Defters vom Typ *Mühimme* —Turc. 29 (220 fol., 28 × 15 cm), Turc. 30 (109 fol., 28 × 15 cm), die der Bibliothek des Kustos der Wiener Hofbibliothek A. F. Kollár, des Herausgebers der zweiten Ausgabe von Meninskis *Institutiones linguae Turcicae,* entstammen. Der Titel *Protocollum correspondentiae Turcarum Veziri cum praecipuis aulis* stammt von Kollár. Diese zwei Defter enthalten ungefähr 500 Abschriften von Sultans- und Großwesirs-Schreiben, adressiert an den Kaiser, verschiedene europäische Herrscher und Fürsten, Siebenbürger Fürsten, den ungarischen König, Kosakenhetman, die Krimchane usw. Die beiden Defter umfassen den Zeitraum von 1640—1687. (Siehe M. Köppel: *Untersuchungen über zwei türkische Urkundenhandschriften in Göttigen.* Bremen 1920 (Dissertation).) Beide Defter sollen während des zweiten Weltkrieges vernichtet worden sein. J. Blaškovič und Z. Veselá veröffentlichten mehrere Urkunden aus diesen Defter.

Einen wertvollen Beitrag zur Defterologie bildet jener Teil der Einleitung, in dem

sich H. G. Majer um eine formale und inhaltliche Unterscheidung der *Mühimme Defterleri* und der *Şikāyet Defterleri* bemühte. Ähnlich wertvoll ist auch die eingehende Analyse des Wiener *Şikāyet Defteri*, das er als ein echtes *Şikāyet* und keine Nebenform charakterisiert.

Interessant ist auch die inhaltliche Analyse des Registerbuchs der Beschwerden, sowie die Angaben über die Beschwerdeführer und ihre Beschwerden. „Die meisten Beschwerden kommen von einzelnen Muslimen (840 Fälle) oder mehreren Muslimen (120 Fälle) oder einer Ortsbewohnerschaft (399 Fälle). Es folgen Militärangehörige (416 Fälle), *Kādīs* (267 Fälle) und andere Angehörige der *ʿIlmīye* (131 Fälle). Danach rangieren Frauen (154 Fälle), in drei Fällen Nichtmusliminnen. Nichtmuslime wenden sich einzeln in 111 Fällen, gemeinschaftlich in 53 Fällen an den *Dīvān*. Träger kleiner Ämter (86 Fälle), Stammesvertreter (39 Fälle) und Juden (36 Fälle) sind ebenfalls vertreten. Zahlenmäßig nicht bedeutend, aber aufschlußreich, sind schließlich noch folgende Fälle: Mönche in zehn Fällen. Metropoliten in sechs Fällen, Patriarchen in fünf Fällen, rumänische Bojaren in zwei, Dolmetscher und Gesandte in je einem Fall" (S. 23). Dem Herausgeber zufolge lassen sich die Beschwerden in zwei große Komplexe einteilen: Rechtverletzungen durch Privatpersonen und Rechtverletzungen durch Amtsinhaber. Im Falle der Rechtverletzungen durch Privatpersonen handelte es sich um Beschwerden über Zahlungsverweigerung, über Lebenswandel, Handelsdelikte, Erbstreit, Entführung, Diebstahl, Einbruch, Wegelagerei, Raub und Mord. Amtspersonen wieder verletzten das Gesetz durch Willkür, Bedrückung durch unrechtmäßige oder zu hohe Angaben, durch Einquartierung und Verpflegung.

Das herausgegebene Defter bringt ein riesenhaftes Material zur Erkenntnis des inneren Lebens des Osmanischen Reiches fast in allen Sphären — in der wirtschaftlichen, gesellschaftlichen sowie politischen.

Der Herausgeber reihte in den ersten Band auch die in arabische Schrift umgeschriebene Texte ein. Es geht um 18 Einträge betreffend verschiedene Übertretungen des Rechts, über die die Einwohnerschaft von Mazedonien Beschwerde führte. Der umgeschriebene Text kann als ein geeignetes Hilfsmittel für die Bekanntmachung mit den Dukten verschiedener Schreiber dienen.

Zum sorgfältig ausgearbeiteten Register der Verwaltungseinheiten (S. 33—53) möchten wir hinzufügen, daß Yanova (rum. Ineu, ung. Jenő) in der zweiten Hälfte des 17. Jahrhunderts eine Zeit lang Sitz des Statthalters des Eyālet Temesvár und keine selbständige Provinz gewesen war.

Außer dem Hauptregister sind im ersten Band noch das Verweisregister in arabischer (S. 55—64), griechischer (S. 65—66) und kyrillischer Schrift (S. 67—68) zu finden.

Der erste Band des rezensierten Werkes, das unter der Leitung von H. G. Majer von Fachleuten aus Deutschland, Österreich, England, der Türkei, Jugoslawien und Holland vorbereitet wurde, ist nicht nur ein gutes Beispiel internationaler Zusam-

menarbeit von Osmanisten, sondern auch ein wertvoller Quellenbeitrag zur osmanischen Geschichte in der zweiten Hälfte des 17. Jahrhunderts.

Vojtech Kopčan

Woodhead, Christine: *Taᶜlīkī-zāde's Şehnāme-i hümāyūn. A History of the Ottoman Campaign into Hungary 1593—1594.* Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Bd. 82. Berlin, Klaus Schwarz Verlag 1983. vii + 421 pp.

The book is a revised doctor's thesis submitted at the University of Edinburgh in 1979. Its core is given by a critical edition of the work *Şehnāme-i Hümāyūn* from the pen of the *şahnameci* (a court historian writing panegyrical annals of various sultans of the Ottoman dynasty) Taᶜlīkī-zāde. This particular *şahnameci*, the fourth in a line, Mehmed ibn Mehmed al-Fenārī by name, was active in this function since the year 1590. Prior to that in the years 1562—1574 he had held the function of secretary to the later sultan Murad III, at that time governor of Manisa, then he became a scribe at the central cancelary in Istanbul (1574—1590). He also served a time as a campaign clerk, *sefer katibi*, during the Ottoman-Safavid war of 1578—1590.

While holding these various function, Taᶜlīkī-zāde wrote several works, six of which have been preserved. Most of them are written in rhymed prose, the so-called *inşa*, and the last one was dedicated to sultan Mehmed III' campaign into Hungary (1596) all in verse. The majority of them, however, represent eulogic descriptions of Ottoman expeditions in the Persian-Ottoman wars (1584—1585) and the Ottoman-Habsburg — the so-called Fifteen-year war (1593—1606).

The undated manuscript *Şehnāme-i Hümāyūn* (123 Fol.) which unique of its kind, is deposited at the Türk ve İslam Eserleri Müzesi, Istanbul, No. 1963.

The first part of the book informing on the aims of the editorial series and the content of this work, has a brief Introduction (pp. 1—5) in which the author provides basic data on works of the type *Şehnāme* and their writers *(şehnāmeci)* within Ottoman historiography of the second half of the 16th century. She likewise presents data about Taᶜlīkī-zāde and his works, particularly his *Şehnāme-i Hümāyūn.* However, most space in this section is taken up by a detailed contact of the work, for in view of the character of the work, the author has rightly decided not to translate it into English.

The concise historical background (pp. 21—25) is, however, fairly superficial in view of its extent and betrays that the author is not familiar with the causes and the course of the Ottoman-Habsburg wars.

In the contents of this work as also in the edited text (p. 170) also mentions the fortress of Supotika. However, it is *not* Subotica in Yugoslavia (Hungarian Szabad-

ka), but Sobotka (Hungarian Szabadka), a smallish fortress in the sanjak of Fiľakovo (Turkish Filek) some 2 km to the north-west of the small town of Rimavská Sobota which the imperial armies commanded by the first captain of Košice Christopher Tieffenbach conquered about November 9 or 10, 1593 (see also Hammer, GOR IV, p. 222). The author also reports an "alternative account" of this siege in Peçevī II, pp. 140—141, from which it is evident that since Peçevī speaks of the conquest of Fiľakovo and Siçen (Hungarian Szécsény), Sobotka must have been somewhere in the vicinity of these centres of sanjaks.

The Turkish name of the fortress of Komárno (Hung. Komárom, German Komorn) is Komarān, as is usually given by vocalized texts, and not Komrān as rendered by the author, evidently according to Danişmend. In addition, the author might have made an attempt at identifying all the geographical names mentioned in the text of *Şehnāme-i Hümāyūn*. For instance Sanmartin (Hung. Szentmártonhegy) — the explication given by the Turkish author that "Sanmartin was a papal fief" would be obvious if the author of the book under review had known that Pannonhalma (Szent-Mártonhegy) was one of the oldest Benedictine abbacies in Hungary and its superior (abbot) was directly responsible to the pope. The vague term *kaľenün valısı pōrtukāl* is probably a distortion of the word *porkolab* in the sense of administrator of a fortress. Further unidentified localities: Kuvarlak Taşlıca — Tashlidja — today the townlet Plievlja some 5 hours distant from Milšavo; Marçil — Marcali in the environs of the Balaton Lake; Kupan — Koppány; Sementurna — Simontornya; Tihun — Tihány; Çeşnek — Szesznek; Vajun — Vászony, etc.

Of undeniable value are the author's linguistic and literary notes on the section Taʿlīkī-zāde's literary style (pp. 71—91), which are in fact the first detailed analysis of the *inşā*-test. Similarly, also the Conclusion (pp. 93—96) brings numerous new insights regarding the style and content of Taʿlīkī-zāde's work. It is likewise possible to subscribe to the author's appraisal of this work: "The *Şehnāme* is thus an exemplary work, which reinforces the military self-image of the Ottoman State. It is a story of excitement and daring" (p. 95).

This commented critical edition of *Şehnāme-i Hümāyūn* (pp. 103—421) brings the text in Latinized transcription with a relatively restricted critical apparatus. The latter is confined to a) corrections of grammatical irregularities, scribe's errors and the like, b) an identification of Quranic quotations and Arabic proverbs, c) calculation of the correct classical metre for each separate foot of verse, d) provision of rudimentary chronology with reference to Danişmend, e) provision of encyclopaedic and other references where appropriate.

Despite the above remarks, the publication of *Şehnāme-i Hümāyūn* constitutes a valuable contribution to our knowledge of both the Ottoman history of the late 16th century, and of Ottoman court literature.

Vojtech Kopčan

Griswold, William J.: *The Great Anatolian Rebellion 1000—1020/1591—1611*.
Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Bd. 83. Berlin, Klaus Schwarz Verlag 1983.
xxiv + 333 pp.

On the basis of extensive material — archival and manuscript, Ottoman and
European — and abundant literary references, W. J. Griswold as the third author
after A. S. Tveritinova and M. Akdağ, has attempted to process in monograph form
the weighty problem of the Ottoman history at the turn of the 16th—17th century
— the Celâlî rebelions. The author may be said not only to have extended the source
base about the uprisings in comparison with his predecessors, but to have brought the
events up to the year 1609 when the construction of the Blue Mosque was
symbolically use to celebrate the suppression of the rebellion, and he has made
a parallel investigation of the separatist endeavours in Syria. In this manner
a well-grounded work, rich in events has come to life bringing not only new facts, but
also new conclusions and evaluations from the domain of Ottoman political history
at this period.

Similarly as the majority of works in the edition of Islamkundliche Untersuchun-
gen, Griswold's book, too, is a revised doctoral thesis defended at the UCLA in
1966. As has already been observed, it takes note primarily of the political aspects of
Celâlî rebellions within the context of their internal Ottoman and interregional
relations.

The first chapter Interregional Diplomacy and the Battle of Mező-Keresztes
outlines the international complications of the Ottoman Empire towards the end of
the 16th century — the wars with the Persians and the Habsburgs and their
consequences for the internal situation in the empire, particularly in the economic
and the military sphere. Special attention is here devoted to the Ottoman detach-
ments that deserted from the battle of Mező-Keresztés towards the end of October
1596 against whom very *stern* measures were taken on the injunctions of the grand
vizier Cağalazade Sinan pasha in order to preserve discipline. The offenders were to
have been imprisoned, then executed and their possessions and land confiscated in
favour of the state treasury. However, the majority of them did not wait for the
sentence to be carried out and ran away to Anatolia where in virtue of their
considerable military experiences they played a significant role as commanders in the
ranks of insurgents against the Ottoman central power. In view of the foreign-politi-
cal situation prevailing in the Ottoman empire — war with the Habsburgs and the
continuing enmity with Persia — as also the situation prevailing in Anatolia, the
author considers the punitive orders of the grand vizier as regards the deserters to
have been a "very serious error". In addition, the Ottoman ruling faction failed to
discern the true essence of the Celâlîs movement. The latter was not motivated
religiously nor separatistically; they fought for their own recognition within the
framework of the existing political system. It would be equally wrong to ascribe to

this movement any attempt at social reforms, at liberating the reaya from under the power of their feudal lords or at any land reform.

The movement of the Celâlîs at the time of their greatest expansion (1596—1606) is the subject of the second chapter The Rise of the Great Celâlîs (pp. 24—59). The author first deals with the person of Kara Yazıcı who certainly meant a change in several respects, in the leadership of the insurgents. Following the failure of the regular army to suppress the insurgents militarily and as a result of the deteriorating situation on foreign battlefields as also the dreaded possibility of an alliance between the Celâlîs and Persia, the government in Istanbul contrived to win over Kara Yazıcı into their service and nominated him Sancakbeyi of Amasya and Çorum. However, when he refused to carry out Porta's orders, an army was sent against him which defeated him in the summer of 1601.

However, Kara Yazıcı's defeat and death did not entail the end of the Celâlî movement. Its leadership was taken over by his younger brother Deli Hasan who made proof of even greater military skill and valour at the head of the insurgents than his brother had done. Following repeated failures of the Ottoman armies against Deli Hasan and further insurgent leaders and evidently also on their initiative, a tactical rapprochement came about, openly suggested by the sultan's court, between the two sides. Deli Hasan was nominated beylerbeyi of Bosna in 1603 and sent to the Hungarian battlefields, where, however, he with his army did not distinguish himself in any particular way. Of more importance to the sultan's court at that time were the Persian offensive in the east and the numerous insurgent groups in Anatolia. This precarious situation forced the Ottoman ruling circles to assign these dangers in a hierarchical order, although not a correct one. In contrast to some earlier works, Griswold does not consider the Celâlîs to have been the most dangerous to the Istanbul government, for these did not disrupt either the integrity or the sovereignty of the Ottoman Empire, nor did they threaten it ideologically or religiously. Yet, the Ottoman governing class never succeeded in coming to terms with the Celâlîs.

At the time of wars waged by the Porta against the Habsburgs and her internal enemies, the Kurdish emir of Kilis and later beylerbeyi of Aleppo Canbuladoğlu Hüseyin Pasha succeeded in setting up firm foundations of family power, which were not shaken even by his execution. His nephew Canbuladoğlu Ali Pasha profiting by favourable external and internal conditions — wars waged by the Porta on three fronts — and with the participation and understanding of European states, contrived to set up an independent state in Syria. Again, the idea of an independent state in Syria did not die out even after the defeat and execution of Ali Pasha and was realized ten years later by Man'oğlu Fahreddin to the south of Beyruth, thereby laying down the foundations of modern Lebanon. These topics are dealt with in Chapter Three The Canbulads of Northern Syria (pp. 60—109) and Chapter Four Canbuladoğlu Ali Pasha and the Kingdom of Syria (pp. 110—156), which bring in

a number of new concepts and point to wider affinities of many of the events and belong among the best in the book.

Chapter Five The Celâlî Rebellion of Kalenderoğlu Mehmed (pp. 157—208) in which Griswold treats of the final stage of the Celâlîs is likewise significant from the historiographic point of view, for it summarizes a period not investigated as yet in any detail. At this time the Celâlîs continued to press for acceptance of themselves and their followers into the Ottoman system. Simultaneously, the conception began to be formed in the Porta of a harsher attitude towards the insurgents which, however, because of war with Persia, hurt against lack of men and money. Nevertheless, the rulers of the Ottoman state, particularly the grand vizier Kuyucu Murad Pasha continued to practise the tactics of bestowing high dignities to outstanding insurgent leaders. However, when the grand vizier had sufficient forces and under favourable circumstances, he did not hesitate to give battle to the insurgents and after their defeat and the flight of Kalenderoğlu with his adherents he continued to liquidate the Celâlîs until the bitter end.

The Celâlîs Revolt is the title of the Chapter Six which summarizes the consequences of Celâlîs Revolts as a lesson to the ruling class in their internal and foreign policy, in the military sphere and in the construction of the Blue Mosque as a memorial to the victory over the insurgents.

In Bibliographic Study the author presents a list of source material and literature which he has used, but which ought to be extended at list by the work of V. Mutafčieva—S. Dimitrov: *Sur l'état du système des timars des XVIe—XVIIe siècles,* Sofia 1968, the first part of which brings an analysis of two *yoklama defters* from the years 1014 and 1016 H. and source materials published by Y. Yücel: *Osmanlı Devlet Düzenine ait Metinler I—II.* Ankara 1974—1980.

Vojtech Kopčan

Allouche, Adel: *The Origin and Development of the Ottoman-Safavid Conflict (906—962/1500—1555).* Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Bd. 91. Berlin, Klaus Schwarz Verlag 1983. vii + 202 pp.

The origins of the Ottoman-Safavid conflict have not been adequately processed in professional literature. Consequently A. Allouche's work representing his revised doctor's thesis submitted to the Faculty of the Middle East Center, University of Utah in 1980, is to be welcome.

The first two chapters present a review of the political evolution of the Ottoman Empire following the conquest of Constantinople and the growth of Safavid power up to the coronation of Shah Ismail (1501). The author states that Ottoman expansion at this period (1501) was dictated by territorial, political and economic

imperatives. This expansion threatened equally Muslim States in Asia as adversaries in Europe. As a result a rapprochement took place between Mamluk rulers and Uzun Hasan who endeavoured to safeguard the remnants of beyliks and the Trebizond principality from Ottoman pressure. Europe failed to set up any effective coalition against this Ottoman pressure even though the Roman pope, the city-state of Venice and the Hungarian king. However, an unexpectedly strong adversary to the Ottomans appeared in the east — the Safavids.

The complex process of transformation of the Safavid Sufi order into a political organization which was initiated by sheykh Cüneyd and culminated in the setting up of the Safavid dynasty by Shah Ismail, is the subject of investigation of Chapter Two. A significant role in this process was played by the fact that sheykh Cüneyd succeeded in winning over the Turkomans professing extremist shia beliefs or "folk shiism". He and his successors contrived to turn this power of the nomadic Turkomans to their advantage by transforming it into a militant and aggressive force. A further factor of significance in the ascent of the Safavids was the extremist view of the kızılbaş (red head — as adherents of the Safavids called themselves) which led them to deify their leaders, which helped them in their fighting with the dynasty of the Akkoyunlu (White Sheep) in eastern Anatolia. Following the founding of the Safavid dynasty in Iran, the 12 Shia Imams Shiism was accepted as the official religion of the country and the dynasty became a threat to the Ottomans professing the Sunna.

However, in contrast to earlier literature which considered the protracted struggle between the Ottoman Empire and Persia lasting almost two hundred years to have been a religious conflict, the author rightly looks for reasons of this confrontation in the political domain. He arguments first, that prior to the foundation of the Safavid dynasty, Shah Ismail had focused his attention primarily on Anatolia. Safavid leadership planned to join in the rebellion in Anatolia (1500) but was prevented from effectively participating by the decisive measures taken by the Ottomans to hinder the movements of Safavid followers. Secondly, the proclamation of 12 Shia imams Shiism as a State religion in Iran was made mostly to provide a legal administrative framework for the new State. Nevertheless, extremist Shiism continued to predominate in the country up to the mid-16th century.

Although the religious factor in this conflict is undeniable — the author continues — the origin and development of the conflict should be sought within the geopolitical patterns of the Middle East at the end of the 15th century and beginning of the sixteenth, including the relations of these antagonists with the other Muslim powers in the area on the one hand, and with Western Christendom on the other.

The conflict between the Ottoman Empire and the Safavids began with the offensive by the latter who made use of the presence of their adherents (kızılbaş) in Syria and Anatolia and their alliance with the Mamluks. However, the Safavids did not feel quite at ease, unrestrained, for they were threatened by the Uzbeks in the

260

east and thus the Ottoman-Safavid conflict embodies several internal and foreign-political components that have to be taken into account in its evaluation. Starting from this aspect, A. Allouche goes to prove that the expedition by the Ottoman Sultan Selim I (the Grim) against Persia in 1514 cannot be considered as a campaign against "heretics", but as a military-political measure against Safavi activity in Anatolia and a transfer of hostilities on enemy territory. As a direct result of this campaign — the author goes on — Sultan Selim I was able to defeat the Mamluk ruler in 1516—1517 and conquer Syria and Egypt and extend Ottoman suzerainty to the Muslim Holy Places of Mecca and Medina.

In the closing chapter the author is concerned not solely with the Ottoman-Safavid conflict and the eastern policy of Ottoman sultans, but also with the European policy of sultan Süleyman. While the author's analyses reveal that he is well oriented in problems of Middle East politics of the Ottoman Empire, Safavids and Mamluk rulers, his excursions into European politics betray considerable gaps in both an overall apprehension of the issues and in particular details. In the first place, he is not familiar with more recent literature or, to be more exact, with literature other than in English and French bearing on this question; he would have found an excellent summary of it in the study by Gy. Káldy-Nagy: *Suleimans Angriff auf Europa.* Acta Orientalia ASH, *18,* 1973, No. 2, pp. 163—212, which would have helped him to avoid errors and mistakes of a fundamental nature. For instance the Hungarian king Louis II had not the Ottoman messenger Behram çavuş murdered as claimed by J. von Hammer and after him also the author of the book under review, but only imprisoned. The author explains sultan Süleyman's campaign into Hungary in 1526 as follows: "The Ottomans had first the challenge of the Habsburgs who, under the leadership of Louis II, King of Hungary (1515—1526), were menacing the Danubian borders of the Empire" (p. 135); clearly, this needs no further commentary.

However, the central point of the author's work is the eastern policy of the Ottoman Empire and here his conclusions insofar as Sultan's policy is concerned, are correct: He "chose to adopt a policy of containment vis-à-vis Iran rather than to attempt to systematically conquer this country".

As a further reservation concerning this work, we might mention the fact that the author has failed to make use of all the published sources relating to this issue, whether they be Persian documents as given in the book by L. Fekete: *Einführung in die persische Diplomatik. 101 persische Dokumente.* Budapest 1977, or those referred in the works by B. Fragner and R. Schimkoreit that appeared in the same edition Islamkundliche Untersuchungen as his present book. In dealing with the Ottoman Mamluk relationships, he overlooked a earlier work by H. Jansky and more recent studies by C. J. Kerslake. As regards cooperation between Persia and the European countries, the author is unaware of the existence of B. von Palombini's work: *Bündniswerben abendländischer Mächte um Persien 1453—1600.* Wiesbaden 1968, and even of L. Tardy's work published in English: *Beyond the Ottoman*

Empire. 14th—17th Century Hungarian Diplomacy in the East. Szeged 1978. An enumeration of further omissions of important literary references would be superfluous. Nor may we agree with the Arabic transcription of Turkish names in the book, for there exist universally accepted rules for such a transliteration.

Vojtech Kopčan

McGowan, Bruce W.: *Sirem Sancağı Mufassal Tahrir Defteri* (A Revenue Survey of the Sirem Sancak). Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları XIV. Dizi — Sa. 2. Ankara, TTK Basımevi 1983. cxxii + 542 pp. 16 maps, charts.

The practice of editing Ottoman revenue surveys, important sources for the economic history of the Ottoman Empire, has its oldest tradition in Hungary where as early as 1872, Á. Szilády published specimens from the *defter-i mufassal* of the *sanjak* Novigrad from the year 1579 with an accompanying Hungarian translation (*A defterekről.* Budapest 1872). There then followed an extensive collection of various types of defters concerning Hungary, compiled by A. Velica and E. Kammerer under the title *Magyarországi török kincstári defterek I—II.* Budapest 1886—1890. Velics translated either completely or in part 550 Ottoman defters, deposited principally at the Österreichische Nationalbibliothek in Vienna and in Hungarian libraries. This tradition was then interrupted for over fifty years and publication of Ottoman revenue surveys was resumed only in 1943 when L. Fekete published the *defter-i mufassal* of the *sanjak* Estergon in a Hungarian translation with an introduction, a map and a facsimile (*Az esztergomi szandzsák 1570-évi adóösszeírása.* Budapest 1943). This edition proved an incentive to the setting up of a special committee of the Turkish Historical Society for the purpose of publishing and encouraging the publication of Ottoman surveys in 1947. This Committee's activity resulted in the publication of defters by Turkish historians — H. İnalcık, Ö. L. Barkan, T. M. Gökbilgin and indirectly also of a further member of this committee T. Halasi-Kun (processed the revenue survey for the Segedin sanjak) and his pupils at the Columbia University G. Bayerle (*Ottoman Tributes in Hungary. According to Sixteenth Century Tapu Register of Novigrad.* The Hague—Paris 1973) and B. W. McGowan.

This activity was carried on in Hungary by L. Fekete's monumental work *Die Siyāqat-Schrift in der türkischen Finanzverwaltung I—II.* Budapest 1955 which now constitutes a basic handbook on the *Siyāqat* writing; further, by L. Fekete's and G. Káldy-Nagy's edition of the Buda Cash Books (*Rechnungsbücher der türkischen Finanzstellen in Buda (Ofen) 1550—1580. Türkischer Text.* Budapest 1962) and

262

Fekete's last work on the revenue survey of the Hatvan *sanjak* (*A hatvani szandzsák 1550-évi adóösszeírása*. Jászberény 1968). His pupil G. Káldy-Nagy published revenue surveys of sanjaks of Mohács (*Baranya megye XVI. századi török adó-összeírásai*. Budapest 1960) and of Budin (*Kanuni Devri Budin Tahrir Defteri — 1546—1562*. Ankara 1971) and (*A Budai szandzsák 1559 — évi összeírása*. Budapest 1977) and his latest survey of the Gyula *sanjak* (*A gyulai szandzsák 1567 és 1579-évi összeírása*. Békéscsaba 1982). Two others of Fekete's pupil did valuable work in this field — E. Vass published surveys from the environs of the town Kalocsa (*Kalocsa környékének török kori adóösszeírásai*. Kalocsa 1980) and G. David, making use of Ottoman surveys and further source material wrote an outstanding monograph of the Simontornya sanjak (*A simontornyai szandzsák a 16. században*. Budapest 1982).

From other countries, the most numerous publications on Ottoman revenue surveys come from Yugoslavia, appearing in the edition *Monumenta Turcica* and *Posebna izdanija Orientalnog instituta u Sarajevu, Turski dokumenti za istorija na makedonskiot narod,* published at Skopje since 1971 (5 volumes have appeared so far) and in various individual editions. A few surveys have appeared in Bulgaria within the series *Turski izvori za bălgarskata istorija* (published since 1954). In Albania, S. Pulaha published a survey of the Shkodra *sanjak*. *Defter-i mufassal-ı vilayet-i Gürcistan* was published in three volumes by S. S. Djikija (Tbilisi 1947—1958).

Even this brief and naturally incomplete list shows that the largest number of Ottoman revenue surveys have been processed and published from the territory of former Hungary, although the latter had been under Ottoman rule for a relatively short period of time in comparison with Balkan countries.

The book under review enriches the list of available surveys with that of the important *sanjak* Srem in southern Hungary. As the basis of his work, the author took the *defter-i mufassal* deposited at Başvekalet Arşivi, Istanbul, TD No. 549 from the reign of sultan Selim II, but without a more precise dating (according to McGowan from the first three years of his rule 1566—1569).

The extensive introduction to the publication deals in detail not only with the revenue survey of this *sanjak*, but also with its history, demographic transformations, its administration and various aspects of its economic life.

In his analysis of the surveys he makes a point of their significance as they permit to reconstruct the life of this Ottoman *sanjak* during the eighty-five years following its occupation by the Ottomans. The consequences of Ottoman expansion in Srem, similarly as in other regions of southern Hungary, were incomparably greater than in the frontier regions in the west or north of the country. Not only was there a considerable moving of the population, but also the way of life underwent a c ange. Hence, McGowan presents the history of Srem prior to its occupation by the Ottomans, for the Hungarian-Ottoman confrontation intervened into the life on this

territory from early 15th century. Srem is mentioned as an Ottoman *sanjak* only in the year 1543, although parts of it had already been controlled by Ottoman garrisons much earlier. The author also took note of the problem of migration of the Serbs and Vlahs to Srem and rightly saw the reasons for this migration in the economic advantages provided by the Ottoman administration to immigrants (lower taxes). In a special study McGowan has shown that taxation rates in the Srem *sanjak* were lower than in the neighbouring *sanjaks* of Semendire and Gyula, but not as favourable as in the Segedin *sanjak* (see *Food Supply and Taxation on the Middle Danube, 1568—1579.* Archivum Ottomanicum, *1,* 1969, pp. 139—196).

On the basis of data from revenue surveys and modern economic literature the author comes to the conclusion that "on a per capita basis, food production in Srem was much higher than per capita food supply in a number of modern poorer nations" (p. LXIII). Of interest are the author's analyses of the shares of the various payments in farm produce, animals, transit dues and internal customs in the total revenue from the *sanjak* of Srem.

Administratively the *sanjak* was divided into sixteen *nahiye* and four *kaza,* the centres of which were Ilok, Nemçi, Varadin and Dimitrofça. The area of the *sanjak* according to the revenue survey was larger than that of the original Hungarian *zhupanate* and the seat of the *sanjakbey* was Dimitrofça (Mitrovica). McGowan takes note also of the nature of the settlement and the economic activity of the *sanjak* (size of towns, division of villages according to production — cereals, pig keeping, cattle rearing, etc.). The results of his rather detailed investigation of such items as the docks, fairs and markets of Srem reveal interesting insights. As a matter of fact, incomes from towns in the Sava valley were substantially higher than those from Danubian docks, fairs and markets.

In the closing part of the introduction, the author deals with the question of personal names, place names and Slavonic personal names. In dealing with the transcription of place and personal names, he had recourse to data from further Ottoman revenue surveys as also from historical geography, maps and other relevant works.

The second part of the introduction brings a Directory of Localities (pp. LXXXIII—CXXII). Here, place names are listed in the order in which they occur in the text and are subdivided into *nahiyes.* The entry for each place name has been compressed into a meaningful and economical form. Inhabited places are shown in capital, while uninhabited in lower case letters; in the first brackets, the same place name is transcribed in Arabic script. Then follows the location of the place. If the location of the place is expressed simply as being near some other place and if no other data is given, this signifies that the justification for this statement of location is to be found in the text itself. Within a second parenthesis and following the location data there appear earlier and later versions of the place name cited. Pre-Ottoman place names are as a rule identified with D. Csánky's work: *Magyarország történeti*

264

földrajza a Hunyadiak korában II. Budapest 1895, eventually with the work by D. Popović: *Srbi u Sremu do 1736/7.* Beograd 1950.

To our view, the Directory of Localities as given here is not very useful for practical purposes. When looking for some locality from Srem, mentioned on some other sources, e.g. in deeds or chronicles, one would have to scan attentively the entire list of settlements. An alphabetical arrangement with references to the page in the edition, as is the case, for instance in G. Bayerle's work, would have been far more suitable.

The text of the defter starts with Kanunname (pp. 1—6), followed by the localities, names of adult inhabitants and sources of income of the Ottoman financial administration or *sipahis* according to the various *nahiye* (pp. 7—318).

A Selected Vocabulary (pp. 319—537) is designed to assist two kinds of readers: 1. those who wish to exploit this document but who have no knowledge of the Ottoman language and 2. those who know Ottoman and who intend to work with other similar, but unedited documents (i.e. *mufassal tahrir defter's*).

The Index of Undifferentiated South Slav Personal Names (pp. 539—542) lists over 300 South Slav names which often could not be identified with certainty, that is which often could not be differentiated from another name because of scriptual insufficiency or ambiguity.

The maps appended to the book record: 1. The Administrative Subdivision of Sirem; 2. The Towns of Sirem; 3. Fortifications and Police; 4. Markets, Fair and Docks; 5. Soils of Sirem; 6. Largest Villages; 7. Poorest Villages; 8. Most Prosperous Villages; 9. Grain Surplus Villages; 10. Grape Surplus Villages; 11. Pig Surplus Villages; 12. Sheep Surplus Villages; 13. Villages paying heaviest cash taxes; 14. Service Communities with Tax Privileges. The charts represent I. Sources of State revenues in the Sanjak of Sirem and II. Estimated relative value of the agricultural products of Sirem by mid-twentieth century standards.

McGowan's edition of *defter-i mufassal* of the *sanjak* Sirem is a significant enrichment of the source base to the economic history of the Middle Danubian region during the time of Ottoman dominion. It is felt rather a pity that this extensive survey was not published earlier.

Vojtech Kopčan

Strohmeier, Martin: *Seldschukische Geschichte und türkische Geschichtswissenschaft. Die Seldschuken im Urteil moderner türkischer Historiker.* Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Band 97. Berlin, K. Schwarz Verlag 1984. 273 S.

Es gibt nicht viele, und vor allem nicht zu viele kritische Arbeiten, die der türkischen Geschichtsschreibung gewidmet wären. Eine jede Bestrebung ist daher

zu begrüßen, die uns ein kritisches Bild der türkischen Geschichtsschreibung als Ganzes oder der Geschichtsschreibung der einzelnen Epochen liefern würde. In synthetischen Arbeiten über die türkische Vergangenheit begegnen wir oft einer mehr oder weniger kritischen Übersicht der bisdahin erreichten Ergebnisse, diese jedoch können, natürlich, keineswegs die Aufgabe spezieller historiographischer Arbeiten erfüllen.

Strohmeiers Buch ist mehr als dessen Titel und Untertitel versprechen. Im ersten Teil befaßt er sich nämlich mit ernsten Fragen, wie es z. B. das Entstehen nationaler Historiographien im Prozeß der Bildung nationaler Staaten oder im Prozeß der Entkolonisierung der Fall ist. Der Autor will hier erfassen, auf welche Art die Geschichtsschreibung im Verlauf dieses Prozesses von politischen und ideologischen Strömungen beeinflußt wurde und, vice versa, wie die Geschichtsschreibung das historische Bewußtsein der Staatsbürger dieser neuen Länder zu gestalten half.

Dieser Teil des Buches, betitelt Die Anfänge und die Entwicklung der modernen türkischen Geschichtswissenschaft (1859—1980), bringt eine Übersicht der gesellschaftlich-politischen Gegebenheiten, unter denen sich in der zweiten Hälfte des 19. Jahrhunderts und am Anfang des 20. Jahrhunders die osmanische bzw. türkische Historiographie entwickelte. Der Autor widmet seine Aufmerksamkeit den grundlegenden Veränderungen in der Auffassung der Berufung der Geschichtsschreibung, den heimischen sowie ausländischen Anregungen, sowie deren Hauptdarstellern. Mit Recht widmet er sich vor allem Ziya Gökalp (1875—1924), dem geistigen Vater des türkischen Nationalismus und dessen Schüler Mehmed Fuad Köprülü (1890—1966), welcher, von der zu ihrer Zeit entwickeltsten und anregendsten französischen Historiographie inspiriert, zum Gründer der modernen türkischen Historiographie wurde. Strohmeier widmet seine Aufmerksamkeit auch jenen Persönlichkeiten, die scheinbar abseits der Hauptlinie der Entwicklung standen, trotzdem jedoch einen bedeutenden Beitrag zur Gestaltung der türkischen nationalistischen Historiographie leisteten. Es geht um die Konzeption des Anadolismus (Anadolculuk) des Mükrimin Halil Yınanç (1898—1961), die mit Atatürks Vorstellung von Anatolien, als der Urheimat der Türken eng verbunden ist und die in den späteren Arbeiten über die Seldschukische Geschichte eine bedeutende Rolle spielte.

Weiter befaßt sich der Autor mit der Entwicklung der geschichtlichen Forschung in der Türkischen Republik. Mit dem Zerfall des Osmanischen Reiches und der Entstehung der Republik kam die Notwendigkeit der Suche nach einer neuen Identität auf. Bei dieser Suche und bei dem Kampf mit den osmanischen und islamischen Traditionen fiel eine gewaltige Rolle der Historiographie zu, die ein neues Bild der Vergangenheit schaffen sollte, das den neuen Verhältnissen entsprechen würde. Mehrere Faktoren trugen dazu bei, eine neues Geschichtsbild zu schaffen, das seinen Ausdruck in der Türk Tarih Tezi fand. Außer einer positiven Einwirkung enthielten diese Thesen auch viele falsche Vorstellungen und wissen-

schaftlich nicht nachweisbare Behauptungen, die zwar mit der Zeit in den Hintergrund traten, sporadisch jedoch noch immer auftauchen. Die geschichtliche Forschung bekam eine große Unterstütztung vom Staat und außer der Universitäten als Forschungszentren, entstanden Institutionen, die sich der Erfüllung der neuen Aufgaben der Geschichtsschreibung annahmen (*Türk Tarihi Tektik Cemiyeti*, später auf *Türk Tarih Kurumu* umbenannt). Die erstrangige Aufgabe dieser Institutionen war es neue Lehrbücher für Gymnasien zu verfassen, später auch das Organisieren des wissenschaftlichen Lebens, von Kongressen und anderen Aktionen.

Die identitätsstiftende Funktion der Geschichtsschreibung ist im allgemeinen positiv aufgenommen worden. Die Ergebnisse der historischen Forschung in der Türkischen Republik, vor allem jedoch einige Teile der *Türk Tarih Tezi* wurden zum Gegenstand der Kritik europäischer Historiker und Orientalisten. Diese versuchten zu erklären, warum wissenschaftlich unbegründete Theorien entstanden sind.

Das Buch bringt eine nützliche Übersicht über geschichtliche Forschungen in der Türkischen Republik bis zum Ende der siebziger Jahre, in der der Autor eingehende Informationen über das Studium und die geschichtlichen Forschungen an den türkischen Universitäten, in wissenschaftlichen Institutionen sowie in historischen Periodika bietet. Der Versuch „neue Tendenzen" der historischen Forschung in der Türkei darzustellen könnte jedoch etwas inhaltsreicher sein.

Erst der zweite Teil des Buches, Die Seldschuken in der türkischen Geschichtsschreibung des 20. Jahrhunderts, pertraktiert die im Titel angekündigte Problematik der Seldschukischen Geschichte in der türkischen Geschichtsschreibung. Durch die Schaffung einer säkularisierten türkischen Republik wurde eine außerordentliche Aufmerksamkeit der Geschichte der anatolischen Seldschuken (1077—1302) gewidmet, weil diese, im Unterschied zur älteren osmanischen Geschichtsschreibung, die sich vor allem der Geschichte der osmanischen Dynastie widmete, zu einem Bestandteil der nationalen Geschichte wurde. Am Beispiel der Seldschukischen Geschichte zeigt Strohmeier, wie die historische Forschung, oder genauer deren Themen die politische und ideologische Entwicklung in der Türkischen Republik widerspiegelten. Er analysiert eingehend die Werke jener türkischen Historiker, die sich um das Studium der Seldschukischen Geschichte am meisten verdient haben: İbrahim Kafesoğlu, Mehmed Altay Köymen und Osman Turan. Das gemeinsame Zeichen dieser Historiker, natürlich nicht in einem gleichen Maße, sieht der Autor in ihrer nationalistischen Auffassung der türkischen Geschichte und in der Tendenz die Vergangenheit zu idealisieren und zu verherrlichen, womit er freilich keineswegs ihre Verdienste um das Erkennen der Seldschukischen Geschichte herabsetzen will.

Den Autor interessierte auch die Frage des Einflusses dieser Historiker auf die türkische Öffentlichkeit. Auf Grund einer Analyse von populär-wissenschaftlichen Arbeiten sowie Lehrbüchern dieser Autoren weist Strohmeier auf die großen Unterschiede zwischen den Konzeptionen von O. Turan und I. Kafesoğlu hin.

Während ersterer die Aufgabe des Islam in der Geschichte der Türken hervorhebt, ist der zweite ein Anhänger des Türkentums, also des vorislamischen Erbes. Im Unterschied zu diesen beiden Autoren ist das Werk von Mehmed Köymen am meisten von den Konzeptionen des Begründers des modernen türkischen Staates Kemal Atatürk geprägt.

Strohmeiers Buch ist die bislang eingehendste Analyse der türkischen Geschichtstchreibung über die Seldschukische Geschichte und ein guter Leitfaden durch die Probleme der Entstehung und Entwicklung dieser Historiographie.

Vojtech Kopčan

Mashtakova, Y. I.: *Turetskaya literatura kontsa XVIII — nachala XIX vv.* (Turkish Literature of the End of the 17th — Early 19th Century). Moscow, Nauka 1984. 204 pp.

The Soviet turkologist Yelena I. Mashtakova, an expert in Ottoman literature, states in the introduction to her latest work that the transitory period between mediaeval and modern Turkish literature has received scant attention thus far. as a result of which a distorted view has come to prevail regarding a decadent nature of Turkish literature of this period. The author polemizes with this view and sets herself as the aim of her study to prove that even at the time marking a general decline of the Ottoman Empire, valuable literary works were written, embodying new elements and preparing the ground for the coming of the new literature.

In the first chapter of the monograph (pp. 8—35), Y. I. Mashtakova determines the characteristic signs of this transitory period in the history of Turkish literature. This period lasts here half a century longer than in a number of great literatures of the East where it was confined to approximately one century. This is related to the slower pace of development of the Ottoman society and the onset of bourgeois relationships. The author points to the significance of reforms which, despite their superficial character as regards the domain of culture and the way of life, nevertheless contained the nucleus of the future deeper cultural shifts. True, the socio-political and economic crises did condition an orientation towards mysticism, but on the other hand, they reinforced certain critical trends. Satire penetrated especially into prose works in which also an orientation towards realism became most strongly manifest.

Chapter Two (pp. 36—161) sets out the principal tendency in the development of Turkish literature during the transitory period. A striking feature is the democratizing process in literature, especially evident in the enforcement of an artisan milieu in poetry, its concretization, activation of relationships between written literature

and folklore, where together with new topics, also the spoken, vernacular language enters literature.

Mashtakova devotes particular attention to the enrichment of the genre system of Turkish literature during the transitory period. The meeting of written and oral literature gives rise to new genres, where prose undergoes greater changes as to genre, as it did not enjoy such old and strong traditions as poetry. Historiographic style acquires features of fiction, as shown by an imagery processing of episodes, a linguistic characteristic of personages, attempts at an insight into their psychology, the use of satirical means of moulding their character.

In the domain of artistic prose, we have the work by Ali Aziz *Muhayyelāt*, representing a join tradition of mediaeval prose with folklore. Mashtakova analyses the manner in which Ali Aziz processes the sources that constitute the basis of his work. She insists that the world of magic and real life mutually supplement each other and form a harmonic unit. The results of her analysis permit her to polemize with the interpretation of Namık Kemal and numerous contemporary Turkish literary scholars who consider this work of Ali Aziz's to be an embodiment of mediaeval aesthetics and antiquated literary practice.

The author of this monograph also follows up the conditions that gave rise to a work which played a decisive role in spreading enlightening ideas during the subsequent period, the period of the genesis of a new Turkish literature. During the transitory period, the function of publicist genres was played by tracts *(rysāle)*, namely politico-economic, memoir writings *(lājyha)* and envoys' books *(sefāretnā-me)*. From among these, Mashtakova devotes attention to a tract by İbrahim Müteferrika and a pamphlet by Ahmed Resmi, which are closely related by their ideology.

The mutual relation between culture and ideology is dealt with in Chapter Three, the closing one in the publication under review (pp. 162—183). The author focused here on the weighty problem of the role which the West played in the birth of new ideas among the Turks, to which is related the question of enlightening trends in Turkish literature. Through an analysis and comparative study of accessible sources Mashtakova came to the conclusion that a change in the type of this literature does not appear to be the outcome solely of the impact of European political doctrines, philosophical teachings and cultural-aesthetic conceptions, but that it had come about through a gradual restructuring of Turkish literature in which a series of phenomena of a pre-Enlightenment character became moulded, a character organically bound with the history of the Ottoman society itself.

In the conclusion of the publication (pp. 184—187), the author summarizes the partial data from the various chapters, pointing to the indispensable need of a comparative study of the typology of the transitory period between the Middle Ages and the modern times in other literatures of the Near East. Although at the given period the Turkish literature had already overtaken literature of the Arab

countries and of Persia, such a comparative study would permit to reveal the inner analogy among them and the existence of closely related ideational and artistic trends, a common degree of their literary development.

The book is provided with a list of literary references and an author index. Y. I. Mashtakova's monograph represents a significant revaluative contribution to the inadequately surveyed period of Turkish literary history and provides a number of stimuli for further study not only to Turkologists, but also to literary scholars, historians, philosophers and linguists.

Xénia Celnarová

Siedel, Elisabeth: *Sabahattin Ali, Mystiker und Sozialist. Beiträge zur Interpretation eines modernen türkischen Autors.* Berlin, Klaus Schwarz Verlag 1983. 387 S.

Der Persönlichkeit und dem Werk des Schriftstellers Sabahattin Ali (1907—1948) kommt in der neuen türkischen Literatur ein wichtiger Platz zu. In seinem Werk widerspiegelte sich die geistige Krise der türkischen Intellektuellen zwischen zwei Epochen in der Geschichte des Volkes, als auch der ideologische Kampf, der sich im Rahmen des bourgeoisen Staates abspielte. Der strikt opositionelle Standpunkt der offiziellen Politik gegenüber, seine Kritik der Praktiken der Darsteller des herrschenden Regimes als auch die unverborgenen Sympathien zu den marxistischen Ideen brachten Sabahattin Ali einen zweimaligen Aufenthalt im Kerker, Angriffe der Reaktion und, nach seinem vorzeitigen, bislang ungeklärten Tod, auch das Publikationsverbot seiner Werke ein. Erst in der Mitte der sechziger Jahre trat der Istanbuler Verlag Varlık zur Reedition seiner Werke heran, nach und nach begannen sich auch die Literaturgeschichte und Kritik für ihn zu interessieren. Doch obwohl seit der Zeit, da die Mauer des Stillschweigens um Sabahattin Ali durchbrochen wurde, bereits zwanzig Jahre verflossen sind, widmete die türkische Literaturwissenschaft der beletristischen und publizistischen Tätigkeit Sabahattin Alis nicht die Aufmerksamkeit, die er mit seinem Beitrag für die türkische Kultur mit Recht verdient hätte.

Elisabeth Siedels Monographie stellt zweifelsohne den bislang vollständigsten, in breiteren Zusammenhängen aufgefaßten Blick auf diese bemerkenswerte, gleichzeitig jedoch widerspruchsvolle Persönlichkeit der türkischen Literatur dar. Die Absicht der Autorin zum Problem nicht einseitig heranzutreten, kann bereits im ersten Teil der Monographie (A. Biographischer Abriß, S. 1—64) markant zum Vorschein, der keineswegs eine einfache Aufzählung von biographischen Daten darstellt, sondern konsequent die Gestaltung der Weltanschlauung des Schriftstellers verfolgt und diesen individuellen Prozeß der ideologischen Heranreifung gleichzeitig in Zusammenhänge bringt, und ihn mit dem ideologischen Klima in den ersten Jahrzehnten der Existenz der Türkischen Republik konfrontiert. E. Siedel

verfolgt die Aktivierung sozialistischer Ideen in der Türkei, die auch nach dem Verbot linksgerichteter Parteien im Jahre 1925 nicht nachgelassen hat. Sie hebt die Tatsache hervor, daß obwohl die prosozialistischen Autoren in den zwanziger und dreißiger Jahren in Minderheit waren (am stärksten war der Flügel der Kemalisten vertreten), die Qualität ihrer Werke nicht hinter jener in anderen Strömungen entstandener Werke zurückgeblieben war (S. 20).

Sabahattin Alis erste Kontakte mit sozialistischen Ideen wurden von seinem Lehrer an der Pädagogischen Schule in Istanbul, Sadrettin Celâl Antel vermittelt. Doch erst die Zusammenarbeit mit der Redaktion der literarischen Monatsschrift Resimli Ay, um die sich seit 1928 die bedeutendsten linksorientierten Autoren gruppierten (z. B. Nâzım Hikmet, Sadri Ertem, Suat Derviş), wies den weiteren Weg des bisdahin zum Mystizismus und Introspektion inklinierenden jungen Schriftstellers voraus. Sein Aufenthalt in Deutschland in den Jahren 1929—1930 ermöglichte ihm den Kontakt mit der deutschen Literatur und über deutsche Übersetzungen auch mit der europäischen Klassik. E. Siedel betont, daß nicht nur die Werke des europäischen Realismus sein Denken beeinflußten, aber auch das Studium marxistischer Literatur wirkte auf seine politische Orientierung. Die Autorin macht gleichzeitig darauf aufmerksam, daß Sabahattin Ali nie im wahren Sinne des Wortes politisch tätig war, er wendete die Ideen des Marxismus in seinen Arbeiten, vor allem in den Zeitungsartikeln aus den Jahren 1945—1948 an (S. 29—30). Hier demaskierte er die reaktionäre Theorie über die sogenannte kommunistische Gefahr, deren Ziel es war, die fortschrittliche Entwicklung im Land aufzuhalten und die radikalen Kritiker zum Schweigen zu bringen (S. 62). Leider bleibt die Publizistik Sabahattin Alis dem breiten Interessentenkreis schwer zugänglich, da es eine kritische Gesamtausgabe seiner journalistischen und literaturkritischen Artikel bislang nicht gibt, was auch E. Siedel im zweiten Teil ihrer Monographie (B. Textmaterial und Forschungsstand, S. 65—89) einleitend feststellt.

Im Unterkapitel, das den türkischen Herausgaben der literarischen Werke Sabahattin Alis gewidmet ist, adressiert die Autorin dem Verlag Varlık, wo in den Jahren 1965—1966 der literarische Nachlaß des Schriftstellers in sieben Bänden erschien, eine kritische Anmerkung, die das Weglassen von vier kurzen Prosastücken betrifft, welche der Schriftsteller in seinem letzten Buch Sırça Köşk (1. Ausgabe 1947) veröffentlichte und die ihren revolutionären Inhalts wegen auf dem Index geraten sind (S. 66—67). Die Studie von Tahir Alangı, die diese erste Wiederausgabe der Werke Sabahattin Alis einleitete, stellt die erste umfangreichere, in der Türkei erschienene Abhandlung über das Leben und Werk des Schriftstellers dar.

Die überhaupt erste Monograpie über Sabahattin Ali entstand bereits 1948 in Moskau (E. I. Maschtakowa: Twortschesskij putj Sabachattina Ali), wurde jedoch nicht publiziert. Im Jahre 1959 erschien in Moskau die Arbeit von R. Fisch (Sabachattin Ali — Kritiko-biografitschesskij otscherk), die E. Siedel im Vergleich

zu den Abhandlungen einiger türkischer Kritiker als objektiver bewertet, sie wirft dem Autor jedoch eine Schablonenmäßigkeit seiner Schlüsse und eine Überinterpretation im Fall der Bewertung Bedri's aus dem Roman *İçimizdeki Şeytan* (S. 76) vor.

Als „ein politisches Kuriosum" bezeichnet die Autorin die Monographie von Mustafa Kutlu (*Sabahattin Ali*, Istanbul 1972), der „Sabahattin Ali in erster Linie als antiwestlichen, antiintellektuellen Kämpfer für die traditionellen Werte der Anatolier" betrachtet (S. 78). Der Ansicht der Autorin zufolge führte Kutlu zu einer solchen Interpretation die Kritik des Schriftstellers an der kemalistischen Elite und ihrem Programm der Verwestlichung.

Den Kern des hier rezensierten Werkes von E. Siedel stellt die kritische Analyse der literarischen Werke von Sabahattin Ali dar. Die zwei Haupttendenzen im Schaffen des Schriftstellers, und zwar die Flucht vor einer bedrohlichen äußeren Wirklichkeit einerseits und seine Auseinandersetzung mit den sozialen Bedingungen der unteren Schichten andererseits (S. 105), bedingten die Gliederung des untersuchten Materials in zwei Teile (C. Der Mystiker Sabahattin Ali, S. 90—193; D. Die Auseinandersetzung mit der Außenwelt, S. 194—298).

Von introspektivem Charakter ist vor allem das dichterische und das frühe erzählerische Schaffen Sabahattin Alis, sowie sein Roman *Kürk Mantolu Madona* (1. Ausgabe 1943). Die Anfänge seines Schaffens wurden stark vom islamischen Mystizismus beeinflußt. E. Siedel macht auf die Tatsache aufmerksam, daß der Mystiker Sabahattin Ali mit seiner Auffassung des Liebesobjekts als eines Traumbildes und mit seiner Sehnsucht nach utopischem Glück dem Helden von Nizâmīs Epos *Lailī u Maǧnūn* nahe steht (S. 147). Die Parallele zu Maǧnūn ist auch im Roman *Kürk Mantolu Madona* in der Gestalt des Helden Raif angedeutet (S. 163). Schon der Titel des Romans („Madonna im Pelzmantel") drückt das Avancement der Frau, der Liebe des Helden zu einem heiligen Geschöpf aus, und dieser Motivation entspricht auch der Name der Heldin — Maria.

Auf Analogien der Protagonisten des Romans *Kürk Mantolu Madona* mit Turgenjewschen Helden weist L. O. Alkajewa in ihrer, dem Romanschaffen von Sabahattin Ali gewidmeten Studie hin (In: *Is isstoriji turetskogo romana. 20—50-je gody XX weka*. Moskau 1975, S. 95—132. Über die Wirkung russischer Klassiker auf das Schaffen Sabahattin Alis ebenfalls L. O. Alkajewa: Russkaja klassika v Turziji. In: *Russkaja klassika w stranach Wostoka*. Moskau 1982, S. 96—107). Von Sabahattin Alis Kontakt mit der Novelle *Klara Militsch* von I. S. Turgenjew, wahrscheinlich über eine deutsche Übersetzung, zeugt auch Raifs Aussage, welch tiefe Wirkung auf ihn dieses Werk des russischen Klassikers ausgeübt hätte, aber auch die Übereinstimmung der Kompositionsvorgänge, sowie die Analogie der Sujetsituationen. E. Siedel widmet ihre Aufmerksamkeit in ihrer Arbeit nur den typologischen Zusammenhängen zwischen den Typen, die außerhalb der Legalität

bei Sabahattin Ali und Maxim Gorki stehen (Über die Beziehung Sabahattin Alis zum Maxim Gorkis ist eine Erwähnung im Artikel von S. N. Uturgauri: Gorkij i turetskaja literatura. In: *Gorkij w literature sarubeschnogo Wostoka*. Moskau 1965, S. 214).

E. Siedel motiviert den Hang zum Mystizismus im Schaffen von Sabahattin Ali, zur Flucht vom Leben durch Gesellschaftsfaktoren. Diese spielten zweifelsohne eine sehr bedeutende Rolle bei der Gestaltung der Persönlichkeit des Künstlers. Die Behauptung der Autorin, daß das Schlüsselerlebnis, das Sabahattin Alis pessimistische Weltanschauung wesentlich beeinflußt hat, die Niederlage des Osmanischen Reiches im Ersten Weltkrieg gewesen ist (S. 101—102), scheint uns allzu einseitig zu sein. Nicht der eigentliche Untergang des Imperiums, sondern dessen langandauernde Agonie zeichnete viele Schriftsteller der Generation von Yakup Kadri Karaosmanoğlu und älterer, sie rief in deren Schaffen eine Flucht von der Realität in die Welt der Träume, von der Apologie des Lebens zur Verherrlichung der Vernichtung hervor. Diese Richtung zur dekadenten Kunst hin dauerte in einem abgeschwächten Maße auch noch nach der Entstehung der Türkischen Republik an und mündete in den dreißiger Jahren in eine scharfe Polemik mit den Anhängern des Realismus und des engagierten Schaffens. Zu dieser Zeit ging jedoch Sabahattin Ali, anscheinend auch dank der erwähnten Zusammenarbeit mit der Redaktion der Zeitschrift Resimli Ay, bereits endgültig „vom Ästhetizismus zur Ethik", wie E. Siedel ein weiteres Unterkapitel ihrer Monographie betitelte, über.

Die sozial-kritische Tendenz beginnt bei Sabahattin Ali seit den dreißiger Jahren zu dominieren und mit Ausnahme des Romans *Kürk Mantolu Madona* und eines kurzen Prosawerks *Bir Aşk Masalı* sind alle Werke, die in den vierziger Jahren entstanden, von einem ausgeprägten sozialen Engagement. Die Autorin macht auf die Tatsache aufmerksam, daß mit dem Antritt dieser zweiten Tendenz sich auch der Stil des Schriftstellers ändert (S. 196). Seine Werke hörten auf sich auf dem Widerspruch zwischen der Außen- und Innenwelt aufzubauen, sie beruhen nun vielmehr auf dem Antagonismus zwischen der Welt der Reichen und Mächtigen und deren Gegensatz (S. 211).

Ein ganzes Kapitel der Monographie (II. Die Utopie von der befreiten Gesellschaft) widmete die Autorin der Analyse der revolutionären Ideen, die im letzten Werk von Sabahattin Ali beinhaltet sind, in der Erzählungssammlung *Sırça Köşk*. Unsere Aufmerksamkeit verdient die Gegenüberstellung der Ansicht Sabahattin Alis über das revolutionäre Potential der unteren Schichten mit dem, wie es dies in seinem Film- und Literaturschaffen Pier Paolo Pasolini aufgefaßt hat.

Sich auf den pessimistischen Unterton auch in einigen späteren Werken des Schriftstellers berufend, zieht E. Siedel Sabahattin Alis Glauben an die Weltrevolution oder an die Verwirklichung revolutionärer Änderungen in der Türkei in Zweifel. Sie äußert jedoch auch einen Gedanken, der mit der Ansicht sowjetischer

Turkologen korrespondiert: „Die Antizipation der utopischen Zukunft in den revolutionären Parabeln zeigt, daß Sabahattin Ali in der letzten Phase seines Werkes vom sozialistischen Realismus beeinflußt wurde" (S. 272).

Am Schluß (S. 299—300) führt E. Siedel das parallele Sich-Bemächtigen des Maǧnūn-Stoffes zwischen Sabahattin Ali, Louis Aragon und Nâzım Hikmet an: die Sehnsucht nach persönlichem Glück und einer harmonischen Gesellschaft sind für sie nicht voneinander zu trennen.

Den vorletzten Teil der Monographie bildet ein Literaturverzeichnis (S. 301—340), das das Verzeichnis der Werke Sabahattin Alis umfaßt (hier werden sämtliche literarische Werke, literaturkritische Beiträge, Interviews, Übersetzungen aus dem Deutschen ins Türkische mit den dazugehörenden bibliographischen Daten chronologisch angeführt), weiter Übersetzungen von Werken Sabahattin Alis in verschiedene Sprachen und eine Liste der angewandten Literatur. Indizes schließen die Monographie ab.

Noch eine kleine Korrektur: auf S. 249, in der Anmerkung 4, führte die Autorin Kemal Bilbaşars Werk *Çancının Karısı* fälschlich als Roman aus dem Ende der fünfziger Jahre an. Es handelt sich hierbei um eine Erzählung, die zum ersten Mal in der Zeitschrift Yeditepe, Jahrgang 1953, Nr. 47 und 48 veröffentlicht wurde. Einige Motive der Erzählung weitete Bilbaşar im Roman *Cemo* (1. Ausgabe 1966) aus.

Xénia Celnarová

Allen, R.: *The Arabic Novel. An Historical and Critical Introduction* (Journal of Semitic Studies, Monograph No. 4). Manchester, University of Manchester, 1982. 181 pp.

The material contained in the present works is a considerably expanded and rearranged version of a series of three lectures given at the University of Manchester in 1980.

Allen's monograph is one of the few comprehensive studies written outside the Arab world that presents a critical survey of the development of the Arabic novel. Most studies in English tend to be too restrictive in the sense that they concentrate on a single country, especially Egypt, or a single author.

The aim of the Allen's monograph is to serve as an introduction to the matter only. A truly comprehensive study that would involve all manifold aspects of the Arabic novel — its rise, development and basic features — is still to be written. The investigator, no matter whether an Arab or a foreigner, will have to solve, first of all, the problem of definition of the novel which calls for some workable criteria for identifying the rather obscure and highly variable phenomenon of the novel genre. The extremely high rate of its variability may be attested both historically (incidentally, in the latter dimension, not even the starting point of the novel is clearly

defined) and synchronically. Each investigator will have to face what Wayne C. Booth very suitably calls 'chaotic diversity among the things called novel' *(The Rhetoric of Fiction*, Chicago 1961, p. 36).

The book is divided into five chapters as follows: I. The novel: definitions and origins; II. The early development of the Arabic novel tradition; III. The period of maturity; IV. Eight Arabic novels: *Tharthara fawq al-Nıl* by Najıb Maḥfūẓ; *Mā tabaqqā lakum* by Ghassān Kanafānı; *ᶜAwdat al-ṭā'ir ilā al-baḥr* by Ḥalım Barakāt; *Ayyām al-insān al-sabᶜa* by ᶜAbd al-Ḥakım Qāsim; *Mawsim al-hijra ilā al-shamāl* by al-Ṭayyib Ṣāliḥ; *al-Safına* by Jabrā Ibrāhım Jabrā; "Quartet" by Ismāᶜıl Fahd Ismāᶜıl: *Kānat al-samā' zarqā'; al-Mustanqaᶜāt al-ḍaw'iyya; al-Ḥabl; al-Ḍifāf al-ukhrā; al-Nihāyāt* by ᶜAbd al-Raḥmān Munıf; V. Conclusion.

Apart from Preface, written by C. E. Bosworth, and Introduction, the book has a very useful Bibliography (The novelists and novels; translations of the novels; other works — in Arabic and in Western languages).

Allen's work is a valuable study of the development of the novel genre in the Arab world. It shows the very various aspects of interaction between the Arabic literary tradition and the partly fruitful, partly unsuccessful attempts to move in new directions.

Furthermore, in the monograph the reader will find a valuable information about critical views of a number of Arab intellectuals, authors and critics on the development and present state of the Arabic novel. The outstanding Palestinian poet, novelist, artist and critic, Jabrā Ibrāhım Jabrā, is one of the most frequently quoted.

Allen's monograph is an important step forward in the study of the novel tradition in the Arab world and it will be read with profit by all those who are interested in modern Arabic literature, both scholars and amateurs.

Ladislav Drozdík

Weil, J. W.: *Mädchennamen — verrätselt. Hundert Rätsel-Epigramme aus dem adab-Werk Alf ğāriya wa-ğāriya (7./13. Jh.)* (Girl Names in Riddles. One Hundred Riddles-Epigrams from a Work of adab Alf jāriya wa jāriya (7th/13th century)). Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Bd. 85. Berlin, Klaus Schwarz Verlag 1984. 181 pp.

The present monograph contains one hundred girl names in verse riddles in a Romanized transcription followed by an excellent German translation. The textual corpus stems from a unique manuscript deposited in the National Library of Austria (Österreichische Nationalbibliothek (No. 387)) in Vienna. The author of *K tāb alf jāriya wa jāriya (The Book of Thousand and One Girl)* is ᶜAlı b. Muḥam.nad b. ar-Riḍā b. Muḥammad al-Ḥusaynı al-Mūsawı aṭ-Ṭūsı (al-maᶜrūf bi-) b. aš Šarıf

Daftarxwān al-ʿAdilī. Born in Ḥamāh (Syria), he is known, in different sources, under slightly varying names (Daqarxwān, Damīrxān, Daftarxān, etc.).

The text edited and translated in the monograph corresponds to Chapter 3 of the Arabic manuscript. Some parallels are quoted from other chapters of the manuscript. Since these verses do not belong to the thematic domain of girl names and have only to complete the general picture, they are given in German translation only.

This poetic collection, entirely devoted to girls, their names, skills and talents, and to their very various attributes, is a work of *adab* literature. The universal poetic and imaginative value of the verses included calls for the edition of the whole textual corpus of the manuscript in one single volume. The text edited and translated could serve as a basis for a series of annotated translations designed for a broader audience.

In its present form, Weil's monograph is a valuable scholarly contribution to the study of the mediaeval Arabic literature.

Ladislav Drozdík

Agius, D. A.: *Arabic Literary Works as a Source of Documentation for Technical Terms of the Material Culture.* Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Bd. 98. Berlin, Klaus Schwarz Verlag 1984. 375 pp.

The aim of the present monograph is to record and analyse material-cultural terms as occurring in literary and quasi-literary works. The lexical material, gathered in this way, has to supply for the deficiency of the extant Arabic lexicons observable in the domain of material culture.

The monograph is based on four works: al-Jāḥiẓ's (d. 255/868—9) *Kitāb al-buxalā'*; al-Muqaddasī's (d. 378/988—9) *Aḥsan at-taqāsīm fī maʿrifat al-aqālīm*; al-Hamaḏānī's (d. 398/1007—8) *Maqāmāt*; and aṭ-Ṭaʿālibī's (d. 429/1037—8) *Laṭā'if al-maʿārif*.

The lexical material obtained includes names of textiles, household furniture, pottery, leather, parchment paper and products of craftmanship in general.

The material-cultural records from the *adab* literature, as limited as they may appear, enable the reader to determine the period in which they were used and, what is equally important, they are shown in their respective contexts.

In discussing the quality of Arabic dictionaries in the West, the author makes no mention of the Bocthor's *Dictionnaire français-arabe* (Paris, 1828, 2nd ed.). The *Dictionnaire* is one of the most fascinating lexicographical achievements ever made under the immediate impact of the European culture and technology on an educated native speaker of Arabic, lately interpreter and lexicographer. Bocthor's *Dictionnaire*, together with Bustānī's *Muḥīṭ*, is one of the main sources of Dozy's lexicon and, moreover, one of those sources that most perceptibly supply Dozy's lexicon with its early-nineteenth century atmosphere.

Agius' idea to record the material-cultural terms from the works of *adab* literature is truly ingenious. It is not quite clear why the inquiry had to be reduced to only four 'literary and quasi-literary works'. The methodology adopted, irrespective of the amount of lexical material collected, proved quite convincingly to be sound and workable.

Ladislav Drozdík

Corriente, F.: *Gramática Árabe.* 2.ª edición corregida. Madrid, Instituto Hispano-Árabe de Cultura 1983. 396 pp.

Corriente's *Gramática Árabe* is a manual based upon sound scientific and pedagogical principles. It is divided into 27 lessons: lessons 1—2 are devoted to the phonological description (fonologia), lesson 3 to the Arabic script (grafonomia), and lessons 4—27 are concerned with morphology and syntax (morfosintaxis).

Further, the book contains several valuable additions: verbal paradigms, key to the exercise, Arabic-Spanish and Spanish-Arabic vocabularies and two indexes. The Introduction (Prefacio) offers useful information about the linguistic status of Arabic.

The phonological part of the book presents a precise and informative picture of the sound system of Arabic, both segmental and suprasegmental. While describing the 'velarized' (ḍ), viz. oclusiva dental sonora 'velarizada' (22), the autor makes no hint to the fricative realization of this phoneme which is postulated by the orthoepic standard of Modern Written Arabic in the greatest part of the Arab world. The occlusive featuring of this phoneme occurs only in the urban centers of Egypt and the Syro-Palestinian linguistic area. This presentation of facts is seemingly due to the Orientalistic tradition world-wide perpetuated in the centers of Arabic studies. A break-through, however, would be very welcome.

The description of the Arabic syllabic structure (35) is, despite its concise presentation, quite satisfactory. Nevertheless, the dividing line between some types of syllables in pausal positions seems to be, to a considerable extent, arbitrary and doubtful, notably in /qa: — rrat/ "continent" or in /duway — bbat/ "small beast", as against an equally possible segmentation /qa:r — rat/ and /duwayb — bat/ resp. As far as the final /-t/ is concerned, it does not seem to be quite suitable for a pausal presentation, not even for purposes of a syllabic description. The 'feminine' /-t/ is somewhat misleadingly noted throughout the book, as in /jari:da^t/ "periodical, newspaper" (73), /qati:la^t/ "a dead (woman)" (77), etc. This way of writing, it is true, reminds the student that in what is usually termed 'contextual position' the final /t/ reappears. Nevertheless, as an unwanted result of the latter, a third way of writing has been created, 'semi-pausal' or, alternatively, 'semi-contextual', contrasting with the true pausal /jari:da/ and the true contextual /jari:dat/.

The grammatical part of the book presents concise, but nevertheless exact and

reliable information about the linguistic structure of Modern Written Arabic. While describing annexion constructions with an expanded governing noun, such as *ḥimāru wa kalbu muḥammadin* "the donkey and the dog of Muhammad" (61), it would have been perhaps worthwhile stating that, in Modern Written Arabic, similar construction are no longer regarded as totally inadmissible, notwithstanding the fact that they still evoke a certain feeling of substandardness.

The description of implicit, annexion-featured definiteness is kept in traditional lines: 'Se observará también que, aunque toda rección produce determinación morfológica del regente, que ya no puede tener morfema de indeterminación ni, en general, ser determinado de otro modo, para que el sintagma resultante funcione sintácticamente como determinado es preciso que el regido (o el último de ellos, si hay cadena) sea determinado inherentemente o por artículo' (61).

Although this statement has a great informative power that is, moreover, sanctioned by a long grammatical tradition, it overtly fails to eplain the difference between a syntagmatic and a paradigmatic definiteness value in annexions with an indefinite final term. The nonfinal term(s) if an annexion the final terms of which is indefinite should be regarded as indefinite, in a syntagmatic context (viz., *baytu rajulin kabīrun, masājidu madīnatin kabīratun*) while, from a paradigmatic point of view, it (they) should be regarded as definite (viz., triptotizing of diptota: *masājid-u, -i, -a madīnatin*, etc.; the relation between the latter process and the definiteness state of the underlying noun is firmly established in all grammatical descriptions of Arabic and, so far, no other explanation has been proposed).

It must be recognized, however, that in a pedagogically oriented grammar, like the present one, the latter presentation of facts might be felt as an undue complication.

The suffix *-a(t)* (viz. /-aᵗ/) is mostly presented as a feminine suffix (el morfema femenino singular; cf. §§ 13(c), 39, 41, 42). Only § 44 points to the derivational function of this suffix, viz. units nouns, grammatically coinciding with feminines.

No mention can be found of other derivational values, like:

— collectiveness, abstractnes, as in: *al-muslima* "Muslimdom, Muslims"; *xayyā-la* "cavalry", etc.;

— intensiveness, as in: *ᶜallām* "knowing thoroughly" — *ᶜallāma* "most erudite, very learned" (Wehr); *rāwin* "transmitter, relater (Blachère's "transmetteur" (of poetry)) — *rāwiya* (Blachère's "grand transmetteur"), etc.

Corriente's grammar is a valuable pedagogical tool provided with a number of useful innovations in both the grammatical and textual part of the book.

Ladislav Drozdík

278

Krahl, G.—Gharieb, M. Gharieb: *Wörterbuch Arabisch-Deutsch* (Modernes Arabisch. Herausgegeben von Prof. Dr. Wolfgang Reuschel und Dr. Günther Krahl). Leipzig, VEB Verlag Enzyklopädie 1984. 848 + 14 pp.

The long series of German-origin Arabic lexicons, noted for their excellence, has recently been extended by a valuable middle-sized lexicon of about 25,000 entries. It contains words and expressions of all domains of everyday life besides terms covering various aspects of social and cultural life, sport, science and technology. Regional differences in lexical usage are taken into account, too.

Constituting part of an extensive and self-contained series of college-level textbooks, devised for the instruction of Modern Written Arabic (Modernes Arabisch), the present lexicon cannot and should not be a symmetric counterpart of Krahl's *Deutsch-Arabisches Wörterbuch* (Leipzig, VEB Verlag Enzyklopädie 1964 (12,000 entries)). Despite this, the sound lexicographical presentation and the unique mastership in selecting and evaluating the lexical material characterize both lexicons alike.

No lexicon of Arabic proved so convincingly that the arrangement of entries according to the traditional root system, maintaining the lexical and semantic integrity of the entries quoted, can be made so easily accessible and understandable by means of a simple, but nevertheless efficient system of reference: e.g. the plural form *'ābār*, under **'-b-r*, is referred to the correct **b-'-r* (p. 17); the Form VIII derivatives, disfigured by a process of assimilation, such as *'ittijāḥ, 'ittiḥād*, etc., quoted in alphabetic order, are referred to their actual roots **w-j-h*, **w-ḥ-d*, resp. (p. 18).

The inclusion of an uncommonly great number of proper names, such as *'Aflāṭūn* "Plato"), *al-Baṭālisa, al-Baṭālima* "Ptolemäer" ("Ptolemies"), etc., is another valuable feature of the lexicon since it solves for the user the problem of identification which is not always easy and self-evident. In the last case it would have been even worthwhile quoting a nondynastic *Baṭlīmūs* "Ptolemy", the famous Alexandrian astronomer and mathematician, who, in our century of tremendous cosmological discoveries, became once again the name that deserves to be kept in mind. The same can be said of the *nisba baṭlīmūsī* "Ptolemaic; Ptolemaist" and related expressions, like *an-niẓām al-baṭlīmūsī* "Ptolemaic system of astronomy" as against the heliocentric theory of *an-niẓām al-kūbirnīkī* "Copernican system".

In the era of off-shore drilling platforms and a world-wide search for oil, the inclusion of *Wortverbindungen* like *bi'ta tanqībiyya* "Bohrtrupp" ("drilling, prospecting expedition"); *nāqilat bitrūl (naft)* "Tanker" ("tanker, oil tanker"); *talawwut al-bī'a* "Umweltverschmutzung" ("pollution of environment"); *at-talawwut al-baḥrī* "die Verschmutzung des Meeres" ("pollution of sea"), etc. — is decidedly more than a mere coincidence. The human contribution to some of these processes could have perhaps better be marked by the Form II alternants of the verbal noun.

Despite its relatively small size, the lexicon contains a surprisingly great number of lexical units, inclusively of the necessary minimum of lexical and structural alternants, like *musajjil/jihāz tasjīl (aṣ-ṣawt)* "(tape) recorder"; *'idmān al-xamr, al-'idmān ʿalā l-xamr, al-'idmān ʿalā l-mašrūbāt ar-rūḥiyya* "alcoholism".

German equivalents of Arabic words and expressions are, in general, very precise and they are carefully oriented towards the lexically most typical and relevant features. Nevertheless, some single items seem to have a somewhat 'normative' ring when presented as completely devoid of their polysemy and less ambiguous than they actually are, e.g. *jalīd* "Eis" ("ice"), in a more realistic presentation, is rather "ice; snow" as it is, after all, corroborated by *jalīdī* "Eis-; Schnee-" ("ice (adj.), ice-covered; snow (adj.), snow-covered"). Similarly: *zaḥḥāfa* "Schlitten; Egge", apart from "sledge, sled; leveler" signifies also "ski" (Wehr, 432); *zallāqa* "Schlitten", besides "sledge, sled" means also "skate" (Khatib, 552), etc. Of course, Arabic has a quite acceptable excuse for this 'winter sports' polysemy which is, furthermore, paralleled by a spectacular synonymy:

zallāqa, mizlaqa, mizlaja "skate";

zallāqa, mizlaqa, zaḥḥāfa, zallāja, mizlaja "sled, sledge, sleigh";

zaḥḥāfa, zallāja "ski" of course, when disregarding descriptive terms of the type: *mizlaj xašabī ṭawīl li-l-'inzilāq ʿalā t-tlj* (Doniach, 1156; 'ski'); *xašabat al-'inzilāq ʿalā t-talj (al-jalīd)* (Schregle, *Deutsch-arab.*, 999: 'Schi'/'ski'); *mizlaq li-t-tazaḥluq ʿalā l-jalīd* (Doniach, 1155: 'skate'), etc., etc.

Or:

'inzalaqa (tazallaja, tazaḥlaqa)ʿalā t-talj (al-jalīd); tazallaja, tazaḥlaqa "to ski";

'inzalaqa ʿalā l/jalīd (at-talj), tazaḥlaqa ʿalā l-jalīd; 'inzalaqa, tazallaja, tazaḥlaqa "to skate";

tazaḥlaqa ʿalā l-jalīd; 'inzalaqa "to sled, ride sled", etc. (for references, see our paper *Descriptive Terms in the Lexicographical Treatment of Modern Written Arabic*. In: *Graecolatina et orientalia*, 15—16 (in print)).

Some minor notes:

'fādat al-'iʿtibār "Rehabilitierung" should perhaps better be rendered, in an economic and highly selective presentation, by 'reconsideration' ("Neubetrachtung, nochmalige Berücksichtigung"). Of course, the term can occasionally be used, together with *radd al-'iʿtibār*, in the sense of *'iʿādat al-ḥuqūq, 'fādat al-karāma al-'insāniyya*. In the series of *'iʿāda(t)*-expressions we were somewhat surprised at the omission of *'fādat an-naẓar* "revision".

The entry of *ta'liya* "Mechanisierung" is a case of reradicalization or, perhaps better, root reconstruction: **'-w-l*, as in *'āla* "apparatus; machine" → **'-l-y* (presumable derivational basis: *'ālī* "mechanic(al); mechanized; automatic"); the nonetymological radical *-y* of the **'-l-y* is, in all probability, due to the *nisba* suffix *-ī* of *'ālī*, or to the *nisba*-abstract suffix *-iya* of *'ālīya* "mechanics; automatism; mechanism").

When viewed from this point of view, the entry *ta'liya* is not correctly located in the *Wörterbuch* and the user, unless guided by a semantic intuition, will hardly find the entry at all.

It must be said, however, that in general, the treatment of 'reconstructed' roots is fully satisfactory:

*r-k-z: rakaza, rakkaza, tarakkaza, markaz →
*m-r-k-z: markaza, tamarkaza.

Some cases of root reconstruction of less frequent occurrence in MWA are unrecorded:

*m-d-n: maddana, tamaddana, . . . madīna →
*m-d-y-n: (madīna, as a derivational basis, with no reference to *madyana, tamadyana, tamadyun).*

Cases of an archaic lexical synthetism of the type *'aš'ama* "sich nach Syrien begeben" (387), even if extremely rare, have no longer place in a lexicon with an emphasis laid on the feature of modernity, like the present one. It is mainly their rare occurrence in the present lexicon that makes them look out of place. In most lexicons of MWA similar classicisms are quite common.

The lexicon contains a truly amazing number of fresh borrowings, like *damqrata* "Demokratisierung" ("democratization"); *binālti* "Strafstoß, Strafwurf, Elfmeter, Penalty" ("penalty"), etc., etc. Some of these loans can hardly be found in current MWA lexicons.

In quoting borrowings, however, it would have been perhaps more advantageous to mark the reading by a Romanized transcription instead of/besides vowelling, since the actual reading may considerably vary from the latter, as in: *tilifizyūn* "Fernsehen, Television" ("television"; Wehr: *tilivizyōn, televizyōn, talavizyōn); tilīfūn* "Telefon; Anruf" ("telephone; telephone call; Wehr: *tilifūn, telefōn, talifōn* (written: *t(i)l(i)fūn, t(i)līfūn)),* etc.

In presenting passive participles most of which simultaneously display a real and a potential value, both values should have been quoted whenever present, as in:

mar'ī "sichtbar" ("visible"); actually: "seen; visible";

mahḍūm "verdaut" ("digested"); actually: "digested; digestible", etc. It must be recognized, however, that the real or actual value is invariably present and the user cannot be misled by this way of quoting. In some other cases both values are explicitly stated, as in:

ma'kūl "gegessen; eßbar" ("eaten up; eatable, edible"), etc.

As a first-hand lexicon, based mostly on original linguistic material, it contains modern and fresh vocabulary and partly phraseology of Modern Written Arabic. The number of words and related expressions equals that usually included in lexicons much grater in size. This gain in economy has been achieved by a completely new approach to the treatment of meaning units which are masterfully restricted to the lexically most essential features, representative of the entries quoted. The reduction

281

of polysemy, as observable in the lexicon, is a premeditated and systematic process that helps the user to find his way through the entangled network of the Arabic lexicon. The methodology adopted could serve as a model for other bilingual lexicons of similar design.

The lexicon, appearing in two parallel editions (VEB Verlag Enzyklopädie, Leipzig, and Lizenzausgabe des Max Hueber Verlags, München), will render invaluable services to all those who have something to do with Modern Written Arabic. By the great number of newly accepted borrowings and native neologisms it will even fill numerous gaps observable in greater lexicons.

Ladislav Drozdík

Reig, D.: *Dictionnaire arabe-français, français-arabe*. Paris, Larousse, As-Sabīl, Collection Saturne 1983. 57—45 (in Arabic) — 6092 numbered Arabic entries — unpaginated French-Arabic index.

As-Sabīl est un dictionnaire arabe-français et français-arabe avec la priorité donnée à l'arabe. La partie arabe-français est rangée selon l'ordre alphabétique des racines. Chaque entrée-base est numérotée de 1 à 6092 et, en cas de la présence des thèmes dits dérivés (*abgeleitete Stämme*), ceux-ci sont numérotés de II à X (rarement XII) en chiffres romains. Dans la partie français-arabe, cette notation permet de trouver le mot cherché au moyen d'un index alphabétique, sans recourir à des manipulations excessives, même chez les racines suivies de dérivés nombreux. Le lexique, contenu dans le dictionnaire, est celui de l'arabe moderne. Il s'élève à plus de 45 000 unités lexicales qui sont présentées, pour la plupart, dans les contextes immédiats où elles ont été rencontrées. Le lexique reflète la réalité arabe d'une manière complexe: du point de vue de la réalité internationale dont elle fait part ainsi que du point de vue des faits socio-culturels arabes, dérivés du *turāt at-taqāfī*. De plus, le lexique, sans aller, naturellement, dans les moindres détailes, offre une quantité considérable des termes techniques et scientifiques.

Les sources principales du dictionnaire sont: (1) les manuels scolaires jusqu'au niveau de l'enseignement secondaire; (2) la presse quotidienne ou hebdomadaire publiée dans le domaine arabophone tout entier, et (3) la littérature arabe moderne dès la moitié du 19ᵉ siècle avec, toutefois, une priorité accordée à la littérature immédiatement contemporaine (1950—1980).

Malgré le fait que le lexique recensé reflète la langue moderne, le lexique classique n'est pas tout à fait négligé. Le minimum nécessaire pour la lecture de la littérature moderne y est copieusement représenté. Le nombre des classicismes inclus est parfois même beaucoup plus élevé que le présent recenseur croit être nécessaire d'inclure dans un dictionnaire de l'arabe moderne. La littérature moderne d'une allure classicisante ne saura nullement pas se passer d'un dictionnaire classique

(comme une source d'information auxiliaire) quelle élevée que soit la quantité des classicismes contenus dans un dictionnaire moderne. Cependant, du point de vue des étudiants qui veulent éviter le passage par le labyrinthe sémantique des dictionnaires classiques, le dernier trait de ce dictionnaire est plutôt un avantage.

L'inclusion des néologismes les plus importants est un des traits les plus caractéristiques du dictionnaire : *'abbara (ta'bīran)*, à côté d'une signification ancienne «féconder les palmiers» est pourvu aussi d'une signification moderne (par rapport au domaine culturel arabe) «pratiquer l'acupuncture», avec un *mu'abbir* pour désigner selui qui la pratique (No 8 II). En dehors de *Wörterbuch Arabisch-Deutsch,* par Krahl er Gharieb (p. 17 : *al-ᶜilāj bi-l-'ibra*), nous n'avons pas réussi de trouver le mot dans aucun dictionnaire moderne.

Les chaînes d'expressions dans lesquelles les unités lexicales, contenues dans le dictionnaire, sont réutilisées, sont plutôt longues que courtes et contiennent une quantité considérable des notions dérivées de la tradition culturelle arabe et islamique, comme par ex. : *'ahl al-kuhūf* «hommes des cavernes» ; *'ahl al-kitāb* «monothéistes», à côté des termes qui se rapportent à la vie quotidienne : *'ahl al-ḥirfa, al-xibra* «gens de métier, d'expérience» ; *'ahl ad-dār, al-bayt* «la famille ; les femmes de la famille» (No 233), etc.

Les emprunts sont abondamment représentés dans le dictionnaire. Le verbe *'awraba* «européaniser», de même que son dérivé réflexif *ta'awraba* «s'européaniser», est apparemment enregistré pour la première fois dans un dictionnaire de l'arabe moderne, v. *tafarnaja* (de *al-'ifranj), istaġraba, tatabbaᶜa bi-ṭābiᶜ 'ūrubbī* (Schregle, *Deutsch-arabisches Wörterbuch,* 378).

Mais, vu les emprunts du type *'asbirīn* «aspirine» (No 108) ; *hīdrūjīn* «hydrogène» (No 5672) ; *hilyūm* «hélium» (No 5758) ; etc., on est un peu surpris par un nombre d'omissions difficiles à expliquer.

Les planètes du système solaire, par exemple, sont présentées dans le dictionnaire d'une manière bien lacuneuse : *ᶜuṭārid* (No 3569) ; *az-zuhara* (No 2873) ; *al-'arḍ* (No 81) ; *mirrīx* (No 5043) ; *al-muštarī* (No 2873) et *zuḥal* (No 2279). Aucune mention de *'ūrānūs* (Wehr : *uranōs*) ; *nibtūn* (Wehr : *nebtūn*) et *blūṭū* (Wehr : *blūṭō*). Aucune mention de *'ūrānyūm, yūrānyūm* (Wehr : *yurāniyum*), un des éléments chimiques les plus discutés dans notre époque.

Le dictionnaire contient un grand nombre de termes administratifs qu'il est bien difficile de trouver ailleurs : *ṣundūq al-wadā'iᶜ wa-l-'amānāt* «caisse des dépôts et consignations» (No 204) ; *tashīlāt i'timāniyya* «facilités de crédit» (No 204), etc.

Les abréviations des organisations diverses aideront l'utilisateur pendant sa lecture de la presse quotidienne, par ex. : *'ūbib* «O. P. E. P. (Organisation des Pays Exporteurs de Pétrole)» ;

'ūbik «OPEC (Organisation of Petroleum Exporting Countries)» ;

'uwābik «OAPEC (Organisation of Arabic Petroleum Exporting Countries)» (No 238) ; *yūnīsif* «UNICEF» (No 6091), etc.

Le dictionnaire contient relativement beaucoup de termes maghrébins: *bellarej* «cigogne» (No 541), suivi, toutefois, du mot classique *laqlaq, laqlāq* (No 4872). Bien que l'index français-arabe se soit avéré digne de confiance, le mot *bellarej* (No 541) ne figure pas sous la «cigogne».

Les synonymes sont, en général, bien marqués dans l'index: hélicoptère: No 3397 (*ṭā'ira ᶜamūdiyya*); No 5757 (*ṭā'ira hilīkubtir* /Wehr: *helikoptar*/), etc.

Comme nous avons déjà dit, le dictionnaire contient un grand nombre de mots et d'expressions classiques dont les définitions rappellent parfois un écho lointain des lexicographes arabes médiévaux: *hirkawla* «belle et grande femme; femme dont les fesses vibrent quand elle marche» (No 5701) (Belot 893: *harkala, hirrakla, hirkaw-la, hurakila* «de belle taille (femme)»); *imra'a baḍḍat al-jurda* «femme à la peau délicate/aux formes pleines» (No 956); etc.

A part les mots classiques on rencontre dans le dictionnaire beaucoup de significations dérivées des applications classiques, par ex.: *mišwār* «lieu où sont exposés les animaux» (Belot 393: "lieu où l'on expose les chevaux"); etc.

Il n'est pas claire pourquoi on cite l'adjectif relatif *'andalusī* «andalou» (No 220). On aurait attendu plutôt *al-'andalus* «Andalousie» comme un point de départ.

Quelques expressions arabes, quoique correctes, sont revêtues d'une diction trop formelle, un peu éloignée de l'application pratique et de la vie quotidienne: *al-fi'a al-mutaqqafa al wāᶜiya* «inteligentsia» (No 3880) au lieu de, disons, *ṭabaqat (fi'at) al-mutaqqafīn* (Doniach, 609: *ṭabaqat al-mutaqqfīn*) ou, tout simplement, *al-mu-taqqafūn*.

Nos remarques ne touchent, bien-entendu, que la périphérie de cet ouvrage magnifique. Son noyau est constitué par le lexique de l'arabe moderne dont la source principale est la langue elle-même (les sources lexicographiques n'ont qu'une valeur secondaire). On a donc enfin un dictionnaire arabe-français d'une taille miraculeusement petite qui contient tout ou presque tout ce qui est nécessaire pour «approcher le monde contemporain à travers la langue arabe». Pour des *termini technici* trop étroits et professionnels de même comme pour certains classicismes, rencontrés parfois dans la littérature moderne, on devra, bien entendu, consulter des dictionnaires spécialisés.

Le *Dictionnaire* de Reig est un dictionnaire de première main. Quand on ne tient pas compte des dictionnaires classiques monumentaux contenant des donées empruntées à la langue moderne (R. Blachère, M. Chouémi, C. Denizeau; C. Pellat: *Dictionnaire arabe-français-anglais (langue classique et moderne)*. Paris, Maisonneuve 1967 —), le présent dictionnaire est le premier grand dictionnaire de l'arabe moderne, destiné à une exploitation pratique, qui ait paru en France depuis Ellious Bocthor (*Dictionnaire français-arabe. Revu et augmenté par A. Caussin de Perceval. Paris 1828—1829*).

Par son caractère innovateur et surtout par son index français-arabe qui fonctionne parfaitement, le dictionnaire peut servir de modèle aux autres dictionnaires de

l'arabe moderne d'une destination pareille. Il rendera des services inappréciables aux arabisants, traducteurs, interprètes et à tous les amateurs et admirateurs de la langue arabe.

Ladislav Drozdík

Eccel, Chris A.: *Egypt, Islam and Social Change: Al-Azhar in Conflict and Accommodation.* Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Bd. 81. Berlin, Klaus Schwarz Verlag 1984. XXIII + 611 pp.

In this penetrating study that covers a spectacular set of problems the author shows how the Azhar came to represent the centre and the principal base of operation for the Muslim religious elite of our days. The book consists of two parts. Part One: Ecological adaptation and Azhar survival; and Part Two: ʿUlamāʾ Al-Azhar and the secularist challenge.

Summarily, the study deals with the following topics: the constitution of Egyptian society prior to Western intervention; the imposition of European economic control; the transformation of Egyptian economic, social and governmental structures; the main formal religious institutions; the impact of the social, economic and political changes upon Muslim religious institutions; Al-Azhar as the principal base of operation for today's Muslim religious elite: the impact of the socio-economic changes upon Muslim religious culture, etc., etc.

Most of these issues are based on exact data and tabular statements: Azhar University enrollment, Azhar budget, Azhar salaries, etc.

The processes of secularization are supported by data displaying the evolution of the Azhar studying programs at all levels of instruction.

By the extremely wide scope of interest as well as by the amount of relevant data, the monograph is a true encylopaedia of the 19th and 20th century Azhar.

Ladislav Drozdík

Mayer, Thomas: *Egypt and the Palestine Question 1936—1945.* Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Bd. 77. Berlin, Klaus Schwarz Verlag 1983. 391 S.

Im vorliegenden Buch untersuchte der Autor die Beziehungen Ägyptens zu seinen arabischen Nachbarn und vor allem zu Palästina in der Zeit von etwa der Mitte der dreißiger Jahre bis zur Gründung der Arabischen Liga in Kairo. Auf Grund seines eingehenden Studiums, einer riesenhaften Menge von Material (von Archivdoku-menten bis zu Zeitungsartikeln) ist es Th. Mayer gelungen zu zeigen, wie sich

285

Ägypten langsam und allmählich in der sog. Palästina-Frage zu engagieren begann, die in einem weiteren Rahmen einen Bestandteil der ägyptischen Außenpolitik in der arabischen Welt bildete. In der hier besprochenen Arbeit legte der Autor großes Gewicht auf die Erläuterung der Zusammenhänge zwischen den innerägyptischen Verhältnissen, den ägyptisch-englischen Beziehungen und den panarabischen (bzw. panislamischen) Gedanken, die nach dem Zerfall des Osmanischen Reiches die politische Theorie und Praxis mehrerer arabischer Staaten in einer neuen Form beherrschte.

Als Ausgangszeitpunkt seiner Analyse wählte der Autor absichtlich das Jahr 1936, in dem es endlich zur Unterzeichnung des anglo-ägyptischen Vertrags gekommen war, und in diesem Jahr ist auch der arabische Aufstand in Palästina ausgebrochen. Von diesem Datum an wird im Buch die diplomatische und ökonomische Politik Ägyptens in der arabischen Welt genauestens untersucht. Der Autor erwähnt die häufigen politischen Reden und Verbalproteste der ägyptischen Staatsmänner und öffentlicher Würdenträger (gegen fremde Einflüsse, gegen den Zionismus u. ä.), hinter denen die tatsächliche und greifbare Zusammenarbeit zwischen den einzelnen arabischen Ländern deutlich zurückgeblieben war. Der Autor kommt zum Schluß, daß den Palästinensern in dieser Zeit außer diverser Erklärungen und verbaler Versicherungen über Solidarität arabischerseits nur sehr wenig wirksamer Hilfe zuteil wurde.

Eine große Aufmerksamkeit widmete der Autor der Gründung der Arabischen Liga (1943—1945), deren Ziel es war gegen die englische und französische Präsenz im Nahen Osten zu kämpfen, und die, seiner Ansicht nach, das Ergebnis eines gewissen Kompromisses zwischen den einzelnen arabischen Ländern und deren Machtansprüchen gewesen war.

Th. Mayers Buch ist ein wichtiger Beitrag zum Studium der neuzeitigen Geschichte Ägyptens, der Palästinenserfrage und der britischen Engagiertheit im Nahen Osten. Es zeigt, daß die politische Entwicklung nach 1945 nur eine logische Fortsetzung der vorangehenden komplizierten Entwicklung gewesen war. Der Eingriff der fremden Mächte bestimmte die politische Landkarte nicht nur des arabischen Vorkriegs-, sondern auch des Nachkriegsostens in einem wesentlichen Maße.

Ján Pauliny

Havemann, Axel: *Rurale Bewegungen im Libanongebirge des 19. Jahrhunderts. Ein Beitrag zur Problematik sozialer Veränderungen.* Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Bd. 79. Berlin, Klaus Schwarz Verlag 1983. 433 S.

Das rezensierte Buch stellt eine sehr erfolgreiche Synthese der bisherigen Forschungen über die ruralen Bewegungen im Mont Libanon zwischen 1821—1861 dar.

Diese Bewegungen sind zwar mehr oder weniger bekannt, doch bislang wurden sie noch nirgendwo so eingehend und so objektiv behandelt. Die systematische Auslegung aller Fakten über die drei Bauernrevolten (die 'āmmīya-Bewegung von 1821; der Aufstand von 1840; die Rebellion in Kisrawān: 1858—1861) gab dem Autor die Möglichkeit zu einer ganzen Reihe allgemeiner Feststellungen über die historische und gesellschaftliche Entwicklung im Libanon des 19. Jahrhunderts zu gelangen.

Neben einer Reihe von Teilschlüssen — wie sich z. B. die 'āmmīya-Bewegungen in der künftigen Konfessionalisierung des Landes, im Anwachsen des Selbstbewußtseins der Bauern, in der Schwächung der muqāṭa'ǧīs, der traditionellen Führungsschicht usw., usw. widerspiegelten — wies der Autor auch auf jene Folgen dieser Bewegungen hin, die auf ihre Weise die Gestalt des neuen Libanon, dessen künftige soziale und politische Ordnung vorherbestimmten.

In der besprochenen Arbeit werden die erwähnten Bauernbewegungen nicht als isoliertes innerpolitisches Problem bewertet, der Autor schließt sie vielmehr in einen weiteren Rahmen ein, er erklärt sie im Zusammenhang mit den Krisenerscheinungen der sog. libanesischen Autonomie im Rahmen des Osmanischen Reiches. Diese Autonomie kam in einer relativ komplizierten Form der Verwaltung Libanons, sowie in einem äußerst komplizierten Steuersystem zum Vorschein.

Für einen jeden Historiker wird gewiß von sehr großem Interesse des Autors ungewohnte Auslegung der Beweggründe dieser Rebellionen sein, die er nicht nur als einen bewußten Widerstand der sozial schwachen Bevölkerungsgruppen gegen die Feudalherren, sondern als Ergebnis vieler Faktoren (sozialer, ökonomischer, politischer und religiöser) aufgefaßt wissen möchte, die in einem unterschiedlichen Maße den Verlauf der einzelnen Aufstände beeinflußt hatten.

Axel Havemanns Buch ist vor allem von einer wissenschaftlichen Prägung, kann aber auch als eine hervorragende Einleitung ins Studium der libanesischen Realität des 19. Jahrhunderts verstanden werden.

Ján Pauliny

Allen, C. — Williams, G. (Eds.): *Sociology of "Developing Societies": Sub-Saharan Africa.* London and Basingstoke, Macmillan 1982. xxi + 217 pp.

This book is the first regional volume of the Sociology of "Developing Societies" series which aims at providing a conceptually structured set of readers to be used mostly at university level. The editors of this collection have concentrated on one aspect of African sociology, that of social structure which is probably the best way to introduce students to all major themes of sociology of contemporary Africa. Although the basic notions of theoretical debate are also discussed by editors and

several authors, most of the extracts present experience acquired by field research and even some full-length authentic "views from within" are included. The brief bibliographic surveys introducing each of the chapters which function also as guides to further reading, point to a rather broad range of sources, not excluding works by African authors whose several novels are of immense sociological interest, especially to beginners in this part of the world.

The book is arranged into six parts, each consisting of several short extracts from the authors' monographs or articles already published elsewhere. The problem, of course, is whether the reader can get the full meaning when he is presented, for example, with only a part of the conclusion to a book. On the other hand, there are several articles, such as Gregory's and Piché's The Causes of Modern Migration in Africa, which prove how much can be said without any waste of paper and time.

The part on women and their roles in production and politics tackles also the question of their emancipation under modernizing influences and two more or less opposing views are confronted here — one pointing to the loss of their traditional roles and status, the other accentuating the gaining of personal freedom and new perspectives. Of much interest here is Mackintosh's analysis of domestic labour, an activity curiously often ignored by scholars, which shows how methods of economic anthropology can help to create a complex and true picture of social reality.

The next chapter devoted to problems of peasants begins with the examination of the roots and causes of their poverty and then shows that with political independence peasants often only went from one form of exploitation, that by local chiefs, to a new subordination to corrupted government officials and a new breed of wealthy farmers.

When discussing the role of religious ideas and movements, the editors and their authors point to the fact that although in several cases these helped to radicalize the fight against colonial conquest, economic exploitation and political oppression, they could also impose limitations on resistance, especially in rural areas where ancestral beliefs often clashed with fully secular interpretation of reality by modern nationalist leaders.

The subsequent set of extracts concerning the urban poor tackles problems such as hidden forms of labour protest and class consciousness, the experience of miners living in compounds, the process of urban class formation, the role of trade unions, social characteristics of the mass of casual, temporarily employed workers and several others.

The last major component of African social structure discussed in the book is bourgeoisie with related themes, such as accumulation, corruption, nationalism and the military being also brought into focus. The chapter which is a rare occasion to confront views of several well-known authors is perhaps the best part of the book, although two objections might be made here. Those of us who see corruption as a phenomenon alienating the majority of ordinary men from their constitutional rights cannot agree with Donald O'Brien's view of corruption as a means of

protection of peasants against the bureaucracy. One may also wonder why such an out-dated contribution as that by Terisa Turner on Nigeria under Gowon has been included when so much has changed in that country since then.

When evaluating books like this, it is always important to avoid blaming them for what they have never intended — to be more than a collection of essays. When we look at this introduction to the sociology of Africa from the point of view of the aims, it has set itself we must admit that it meets them adequately indeed.

Ján Voderadský

Rollins, Jack D.: *A History of Swahili Prose.* Part One: *From Earliest Times to the End of the Nineteenth Century.* Leiden, E. J. Brill 1983. 141 pp., one map.

According to the author, *A History of Swahili Prose*, Part One, which is a slender volume of 141 pp., "is intended to set out in a systematic and comparative framework the backgrounds and earliest development of Swahili prose types" (Preface). The emphasis has been placed on well-known published works, no newly discovered hitherto unpublished prose manuscripts were included.

The core of the book is divided into six chapters, with an introduction and a short conclusion. The book is also equipped with a map showing the Indian Ocean at the end of the nineteenth century and the coastal dialects of Swahili of the period, Note on the Transliteration of the Arabic and the Swahili-Arabic Script, Abbreviations, References and Index.

The very subject of Swahili prose is a very interesting and valuable one. The rather slim size of this volume belies the considerable research which has gone into its writing. Actually, as its author tells us, "Previous historical studies of Swahili literature, different as they were in intent and execution, of course exist, but chiefly they have been focused on the older, intricate poetic genres" (p. 3). Here lies the value of this work.

A few words should be said about the method of presentation analysis and edition of the texts. This becomes clear when one reads Introduction which is some sort of a theoretical and methodological platform-presentation and an analysis of basic notions and terms. Chapter One contains a brief survey of the origins of the Swahili people, their language and orthography. Chapter Two then takes on with a discussion of the Swahili Socio-Linguistic Milieu. The author carefully refutes many notions on early Swahili prose advanced by different Swahili scholars, such as Ali A. Jahadhmy, Dr. Prins or Dr. Knappert, and proposes his own theory of early prose development, Arabic historiography and the Swahili chronicles. Next chapter examines very thoroughly the Swahili memoir, autobiography and early prose fiction, while the following three chapters are dedicated to a detailed discussion and

an analysis of various Swahili literary genres: the Kisa, Hadithi, Hekaya, Kioja and Habari, in Chapter IV, and the Wasifu, Simo, Masimulizi, Neno La Herkima in Chapter V.

The author tries to offer a description of the available epic texts, the internal evidence in order to provide an analysis and construct a theory of evolution and early Swahili literary typology, in order to be able to answer the question concerning the character of early Swahili prose fiction. Having described the majority of Swahili prose genres in terms of their respective constituents in both a linguistic and socio-linguistic milieu, and then having placed the genres' etymons in their respective environments, the study has completed its circles by tracing the development of literary types, where appropriate, from each etymon in its own indigenous literary tradition. In Chapter Six the author attempted to learn to what extent these constituents that made up the Swahili prose genres were compatible with the specimens found on the East African littoral to the end of the 19th century. Finally, he comes to a conclusion: That the very origins of the Swahili language, orthography and prose genres must be seen as having been significantly influenced by Oriental languages, literatures and Islam; that the earliest prose, the chronicles, clearly reflects these influences at various levels; that these same influences appeared to have carried over into other varieties of Swahili prose types such as the memoir, autobiography, and early prose fiction; that through etymological study of each term used for prose type and its subsequent development from an etymon into a literary type — usually in Oriental traditions — Swahili prose genres were seen as developing into either very distinctive or rather amorphous literary types (Conclusion, p. 128).

If Dr. Rollins' work is not all that one might have hoped for in terms of presentation, it is no doubt a very creative incentive for further development of research in this area, and a very valuable contribution in its own right.

Viera Pawliková-Vilhanová

Saad, Elias N.: *Social History of Timbuktu: The Role of Muslim Scholars and Notables 1400—1900.* Cambridge. Cambridge University Press 1983. x+324 pp.

It is interesting to note that out of the old cities developing in West Africa prior to the imposition of colonial rule precisely Timbuktu earned world-wide fame, although, in fact, at different periods of time and from different points of view there existed several others with at least comparable urban standards in this vast region. A legend of Timbuktu, the mysterious and exceptional metropolis flourishing in the desert, has originated and persisted almost till the present times. Nevertheless, relatively recent efforts by Africanists to reconstruct the past of this city and region through serious historical analysis have begun to yield results of which Professor Saad's book is an undeniable proof. Yet, a paradoxical result ensues, for having gone

through the book one gets the feeling of the legend being at least partly confirmed. Out of this extremely well documented study (there are exactly a thousand and one references and notes), there emerges the picture of a city which in its time and place really was an exceptional metropolis. But the mystery which used to surround its existence is no longer present since everything here is seen as a result of a gradual process of continuous historical development. Notwithstanding the fact that the author views the history of Timbuktu predominantly from one angle, that being scholarliness and its role in the city's social structure, and that the substantial lack of sources unavoidably led to many blanks in the historical reconstruction, the overall image he creates attains a considerable degree of wholeness.

The book traces the fortunes of Timbuktu, the city lying in the middle between two worlds (the white nomadic Sahara and the black agriculturalist sudan), from its origins in the twelfth century, stressing the role of the Sahelo-Guinean (namely that of the ancient Ghana and its founders, the Soninke) : rather than the trans-Saharan factor in its formation and development. The main part of the study is devoted to the period from around the beginning of the fifteenth to the late nineteenth century, the central theme of the analysis being the tradition of Islamic learning and the role of scholars and notables in the social structure of the city. Professor Saad shows how in the formative period of Timbuktu as urban centre, common subscription to the tradition of learning and literacy contributed to the integration of the city and how the 'patriciate' of scholars and notables formed the collective leadership of the community.

The core of the book (Chapters 3 to 5) bracketed in the chronological chapters (one on the centuries of growth and development up to the Morrocan conquest in 1951 and the other on the following period) examines the structure of the learned hierarchy and the role of scholars as academicians, informal administrators and influential notables. The author's analysis here revolves around topics such as the basic features of the transmission of learning in Timbuktu, the subjects and contents of education, the role of Judges and *imāms* and the process of their selection to the post, the interdependence of wealth and scholarship in the process of acquiring and preserving the leadership status, the distinctions between military and learned elites, etc.

The chapter on the period from the 17th century onwards, which was characterized by an economic, demographic and cultural decline, shows that in spite of certain erosion of the status of scholars, at the time of the French conquest towards the end of the nineteenth century, the affairs of the city were still dominated by a leadership of the traditional Timbuktu patriciate.

Although the study's achievement rests for the most part in the critical ana'ysis of the impressive amount of primary sources the book reads well nor is the na ration spoiled by the abundance of names whose relationships are systematized by genealogies of the leading Timbuktu families presented in appendices. The book will

be useful to anyone interested in the history of Western Sudan or the social structure of Muslim towns in general.

<div align="right">*Ján Voderadský*</div>

P e e l, J. D. Y.: *Ijeshas and Nigerians: The Incorporation of a Yoruba Kingdom, 1890s—1970s.* Cambridge, Cambridge University Press 1983. xiii + 346 pp.

This book, volume 39 of the already well established African Studies Series, the interdisciplinary collection of monographs produced at the African Studies Centre at Cambridge, is a history of Ilesha, one of the oldest Yoruba towns. The author's attention extends over several decades of change corresponding approximately to the period of British colonial rule and its immediate fore and aftermath, when the Ijesha community had to respond to new social, economic and political pressures which were characterized by the growing necessity for the hitherto relatively closed ethnic community to identify itself within the much broader context of the colonial and national state.

The book is divided into two main sections, the first one (Chapters 2 to 5) being for the most part a geopolitical characteristic of the Ijesha society at the outset of the colonial rule, which creates a background necessary for an understanding of the processes analysed in the following chapters.

The second part of the book (i. e. Chapters 6 to 12) begins with the examination of the coerced political incorporation of the Ijesha into the structure of the Nigerian colonial state through the growing pressure of the British on the traditional authorities which was accompanied and actually facilitated by the latent social divisions within the community then coming to the surface. The 'economic face' of the new colonial era was most conspicuously manifest in the introduction of cash economy and it is the social patterns of growing and trading of cocoa — the region's main cash crop — which come to the focus of the author's interest here. The conflict which arose between the new ambitions of the ascendant wealthy merchants and the inherited power of the traditional Ijesha rulers was of a distinctive class nature, but the author does not define it as such, rather preferring to stress the fact of a temporary "binding of the wealthy and the titled into a joint establishment" by Ijesha traditional ruler Aromoloran.

The discussion about "how the Ijesha discovered Nigeria" concentrates justifiably on two main preconditions of this change — migration and education. It is probably in the analysis of the conflict arising between the growing influence of the educated and the entrenched influence of the chiefs where the arguments and conclusions of Professor Peel's case study can mostly claim to be of general significance.

When examining the period from mid 1950s to mid 1960s, the author shows how life in Ilesha was increasingly dominated by party political struggle which culminated

in the 1964—1965 electoral violence and the ensuing military takeover. However, the persistent looking for causes of these excesses within the Ijesha community and its political traditions somehow obscures one fact — that these were essentially a reaction to and a rejection of a political order brought upon the Ijesha by a foreign power.

On the whole, Professor Peel's study is a serious scholarly work of a historian and social anthropologist. His sources range from an extensive body of primary documents from British and Nigerian archives and private papers of Yoruba families, to data collected by field research in Ilesha conducted for the most part during the author's lecturing period at the University of Ife. The book is well provided with maps, tables and figures which add to its comprehensibility. It will be most appreciated by readers interested in the social, political and economic transformation of African ethnic communities under the colonial and modern nationalistic political pressures.

Ján Voderadský

Ezenwe, U.: *ECOWAS and the Economic Integration of West Africa.* London, C. Hurst and Company 1983. xii + 210 pp.

Economic integration is generally recognized as an important prerequisite of development and it has special significance for countries with narrow primary economic potential of which the sixteen West African states are quite a representative sample. It is true that when looked at from within, West Africa can be characterized as a region of striking diversity but on the other hand, an external view, allowing for comparisons with other parts of the continent, reveals its relative particularity, homogeneity and thus capacity for regional integration. Although Dr. Ezenwe's discussion of the historical development, experience and lessons of economic co-operation in West Africa is set into this broader context, it is quite understandable and appropriate that the pays special attention to ECOWAS — the first all-embracing integration scheme ever attempted in this sub-region.

The book begins with the presentation of the historical and economic background to the subject under study which aims at a realistic appreciation of problems and prospects of economic integration in West Africa. A special treatment is given to the problem of equitable distribution of the costs and benefits of integration among member countries which is seen as a necessary condition for the full co-operation and continued membership of each partner.

Dr. Ezenwe's study is a well balanced composition of both theoretical and empirical considerations and one is not left in doubt that the author is expert in both fields. His analysis of the relevance of the conventional theory of integration to the 'less developed countries', those of West Africa in particular, is very revealing in itself, but it becomes even more convincing when confronted with the experiences

293

and performance of the most important integration schemes existing in the sub-region. Factors such as internal political and economic differences, overblown integration schemes, inadequate physical infrastructure, political instability, external pressure and influences and pre-occupation with the territorial sovereignty of the nation-state emerge here as the biggest hindrances to an orderly development of economic co-operation in West Africa.

Special attention is accorded to an examination of the organizational structure, the possible benefits, problems and perspectives of ECOWAS, the successful formation of which has been considered a breakthrough in the history of economic integration in West Africa. Nevertheless, it is still early to make any far reaching evaluations of the Community's perspectives and the author is right to stress that much will depend on the result of efforts to obliterate the remaining vestiges of the colonial legacy in the relations between the Anglophones and Francophones, as well as on the outcome of the already emerging serious problem of non-implementation of Community's decisions and non-fulfilment of obligations on the part of member states.

The remaining parts of the book offering an appendix-like mixture of different topics lack the coherence of the analysis of the previous six chapters, but on the whole, the study should be appraised as an interesting survey of history, topical problems and perspectives of economic integration in the sub-region of West Africa. It will keep its significance no matter how ECOWAS — its chief focus of interest — will fare in the near future, on entering into its full operational phase. Nevertheless, for comparative purposes, it would be very interesting to have the same theme analysed by equally able authors from other than Nigerian West African contexts, for example one representing the interests and attitudes of the smaller and poorer countries and another one from a leading Francophone member.

Ján Voderadský

Allen, C.—Williams, G. (Eds.): *Sociology of "Developing Societies": Sub-Saharan Africa*. London and Basingstoke, MacMillan 1982. xxi + 217 pp.

Allen, R.: *The Arabic Novel. An Historical and Critical Introduction* (Journal of Semitic Studies, Monograph No. 4). Manchester, University of Manchester 1982. 181 pp.

Balázs, Judit: *Die Türkei. Das Phänomen des abhängigen Kapitalismus*. Budapest, Akadémiai Kiadó 1984. 262 pp.

Borthwick, Meredith: *The Changing Role of Women in Bengal 1849—1905*. Princeton, Princeton University Press 1984. 402 pp.

China Seventy Years after the 1911 Hsin-Hai Revolution. Editel by Hungdah Chiu with Shao-Chuan Leng. Charlottesville, University Press of Virginia 1984. 601 pp.

Ezenwe, U.: *ECOWAS and the Economic Integration of West Africa*. London, C. Hurst and Company 1983. xii + 210 pp.

Faroqhi, Suraiya: *Towns and Townsmen of Ottoman Anatolia*. London, Cambridge University Press 1984. 425 pp.

Kemal Paşa-Oğlu Şemsüddin Ahmed (Ibn-i Kemal): *Tevârih-i Âl-i Osman. II. Defter*. Hrsg. von Şerafettin Turan. Ankara, Türk Tarih Kurumu Basımevi 1983. LII + 265 pp. TTK Yayınları XVIII. Dizi — Sa. 2ª.

Larsen, Stephan: *A Writer and His Gods. A Study of the Importance of Yoruba Myths and Religious Ideas to the Writing of Wole Soyinka*. Stockholm, University of Stockholm 1983. 239 pp.

Lee, Feigon: *Chen Duxiu. Founder of the Chinese Communist Party*. Princeton, New Jersey, Princeton University Press 1983. 279 pp.

McGowan, Bruce W.: *Sirem Sancağı Mufassal Tahrir Defteri*. Ankara, TTK Basımevi 1983. cxxii + 542 pp. 16 maps, charts. Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları XIV. Dizi — Sa. 2.

Das osmanische "Registerbuch der Beschwerden" (Şikâyet Defteri) vom Jahre 1675. Hrsg., eingeleitet und mit siebzehn Fachkollegen gemeinsam übersetzt von Hans Georg Majer. Band I: Einleitung, Reproduktion des Textes, Geographische Indices. Wien, Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften 1984. 68 pp. + 248 tables.

Peel, J. D. Y.: *Ijeshas and Nigerians: The Incorporation of a Yoruba Kingdom, 1890s—1970s*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press 1983. xiii + 346 pp.

Reig, D.: *Dictionnaire arabe-français, français-arabe*. Paris, Larousse, As-Sabīl, Collection Saturne 1983. 57—47 (in Arabic) — 6092 numbered Arabic entries — unpaginated French-Arabic index.

Rollins, Jack D.: *A History of Swahili Prose. Part One: From Earliest Times to the End of the Nineteenth Century*. Leiden, E. J. Brill 1983. 141 pp., one map.

Saad, Elias N.: *Social History of Timbuktu: The Role of Muslim Scholars and Notables 1400—1900*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press 1983. x + 324 pp.

Savage, Victor R.: *Western Impressions of Nature and Landscape in Southeast Asia*. Singapore, Singapore University Press 1984. 456 pp.

Spaar, Wilfried: *Die kritische Philosophie des Li Zhi (1527—1602) und ihre politische Rezeption in der Volksrepublik China*. Veröffentlichungen des Ostasien-Instituts der Ruhr-Universität Bochum, Bd. 30. Wiesbaden, Otto Harrassowitz 1984. 608 pp.

Stoler Miller, Barbora: *Theater of Memory: The Plays of Kalidasa*. New York, Columbia University Press 1984. 387 pp.

Strohmeier, Martin: *Seldschukische Geschichte und türkische Geschichtswissenschaft. Die Seldschuken im Urteil moderner türkischer Historiker*. Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Bd. 97. Berlin, K. Schwarz Verlag 1984. 273 pp.

Weil, J. W.: *Mädchennamen — verrätselt. Hundert Rätsel-Epigramme aus dem adab-Werk Alf ǧāriya wa-ǧāriya (7./13. Jh.).* Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Bd. 85. Berlin, K. Schwarz Verlag 1984. 181 pp.

Woodhead, Christine: *Taᶜlīkī-zāde's Şehnāme-i hümāyūn. A History of the Ottoman Campaign into Hungary 1593—1594.* Islamkundliche Untersuchungen, Bd. 82. Berlin, K. Schwarz Verlag 1983. vii + 421 pp.

ASIAN AND AFRICAN
STUDIES XXII